

### The Judiciary, State of Hawai'i

#### Testimony to the Thirty-Second State Legislature, 2024 Regular Session

#### **House Committee on Finance**

Representative Kyle T. Yamashita, Chair Representative Lisa Kitagawa, Vice Chair

Thursday, February 22, 2024 at 11:30 a.m. State Capitol, Conference Room 308 & Videoconference

by:
Rodney A. Maile
Administrative Director of the Courts

#### WRITTEN TESTIMONY ONLY

**Bill No. and Title:** House Bill No. 2509, H.D. 1 – Proposing an Amendment to Article VI, Section 3 of the Hawai'i State Constitution to Increase the Mandatory Retirement Age for State Justices and Judges.

## Judiciary's Position:

The Hawai'i State Judiciary supports House Bill No. 2509, H.D. 1, which proposes an amendment to article VI, section 3 of the Hawai'i State Constitution to raise the mandatory retirement age for state justices and judges.

Judges and justices are able to perform their judicial duties past the age of 70, and many judges and justices that were forced to retire as a result of the mandatory retirement age for state judges and justices continue to be very active in the legal community and other community-based endeavors. We believe that extending the mandatory retirement age for judges and justices from age 70 to age 75 is a reasonable balance.

Thank you for allowing us to testify on House Bill No. 2509, H.D. 1.

## LATE Trestimony submitted late may not be considered by the Committee for decision making purposes.

DEFENDER COUNCIL 1130 NORTH NIMITZ HIGHWAY SUITE A-254 HONOLULU, HAWAI'1 96817

HONOLULU OFFICE 1130 NORTH NIMITZ HIGHWAY SUITE A-254 HONOLULU, HAWAI'I 96817

APPELLATE DIVISION

DISTRICT COURT DIVISION

FAMILY COURT DIVISION TEL. No. (808) 586-2300

FELONY DIVISION TEL. No. (808) 586-2200

> FACSIMILE (808) 586-2222



# STATE OF HAWAI'I OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC DEFENDER

**February 21, 2024** 

HILO OFFICE

275 PONAHAWAI STREET SUITE 201 HILO, HAWAI'1 96720 TEL. NO. (808) 974-4571 FAX NO. (808) 974-4574

KONA OFFICE

75-1000 HENRY STREET SUITE #209 KAILUA-KONA HI 96740 TEL. NO. (808) 327-4650 FAX NO. (808) 327-4651

KAUA'I OFFICE 3060 EIWA STREET SUITE 206 LIHUE, HAWAI'I 96766 TEL. NO. (808) 241-7128 FAX NO. (808) 274-3422

MAU'I OFFICE

81 N. MARKET STREET WAILUKU, HAWAI'I 96793 TEL. NO. (808) 984-5018 FAX NO. (808) 984-5022

# TESTIMONY OF THE OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC DEFENDER STATE OF HAWAI'I TO THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

H.B. No. 2509: PROPOSING AN AMENDMENT TO ARTICLE VI, SECTION 3 OF

THE HAWAII STATE CONSTITUTION TO INCREASE THE MANDATORY RETIREMENT AGE OF STATE JUSTICES AND

JUDGES.

February 22, 2024 at 11:30 a.m.

Chair Kyle T. Yamashita Vice Chair Lisa Kitagawa Honorable Committee Members

The Office of the Public Defender (OPD) supports this bill.

In recent years a number of judges and justices have been forced to retire at age 70. These judges and justices were competent, contributing members of the judiciary and were retired not due to an inability to perform their duties at the highest levels but simply because they had reached mandatory retirement age. The fact that many of the retired judges and justices continue to be active in the legal community evidences that they should not have been forced into retirement simply because of age. Indeed, older judges and justices bring invaluable experience and knowledge to the bench. If the mandatory retirement age is not raised from 70 to 75, some current judges and justices will similarly be forced to retire in the upcoming years simply due to age and not due to competency.

The OPD supports this bill. Thank you for the opportunity to comment on H.B. No. 2509.

#### HB-2509-HD-1

Submitted on: 2/20/2024 12:21:16 PM

Testimony for FIN on 2/22/2024 11:30:00 AM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Michael Golojuch Jr	Stonewall Caucus of the Democratic Party of Hawai'i	Support	Remotely Via Zoom

#### Comments:

Aloha Representatives,

The Stonewall Caucus of the Democratic Party of Hawai'i; Hawai'i's oldest and largest policy and political LGBTQIA+ focused organization fully supports HB 2509 HD 1.

We hope you all will support this important piece of legislation.

Mahalo nui loa,

Michael Golojuch, Jr. (he/him) Chair and SCC Representative Stonewall Caucus for the DPH

### COMMUNITY ALLIANCE ON PRISONS

P.O. Box 37158, Honolulu, HI 96837-0158

Phone/E-Mail: (808) 927-1214 / kat.caphi@gmail.com



#### **COMMITTEE ON FINANCE**

Representative Kyle T. Yamashita, Chair Representative Lisa Kitagawa, Vice Chair Thursday, February 22, 2024 Room 308 & Videoconference 11:30 AM

# STRONG SUPPORT FOR HB 2509 HD1 - RETIREMENT AGE OF JUSTICES AND JUDGES

Aloha Chair Yamashita, Vice Chair Kitagawa, and Members of the Committee!

My name is Kat Brady and I am the Coordinator of Community Alliance on Prisons, a community initiative promoting smart justice policies in Hawai`i for more than two decades. This testimony is respectfully offered on behalf of the 3,866 Hawai`i individuals living behind bars¹ and under the "care and custody" of the Department of Public Safety/Corrections and Rehabilitation on February 12, 2024. We are always mindful that 858 - 25% of the male imprisoned population - of Hawai`i's imprisoned people are serving their sentences abroad -- thousands of miles away from their loved ones, their homes and, for the disproportionate number of incarcerated Kanaka Maoli, far, far from their ancestral lands.

Community Alliance on Prisons appreciates this opportunity to testify in **strong support of HB 2509 HD1** that proposes a constitutional amendment to increase the mandatory retirement age for state justices and judges from 70 years to 75 years.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> DPS/DCR Weekly Population Report, February 12, 2024. https://dcr.hawaii.gov/wp-content/uploads/2024/01/Pop-Reports-Weekly-2024-02-12.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> University of Vermont, Legislative Research Shop, Mandatory Retirement Age of Judges. https://www.uvm.edu/sites/default/files/Department-of-Political-Science/vlrs/PoliticsGovernment/Mandatory retirement age for judges.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Mandatory judicial retirement ages by state *as of March 14, 2022.* https://ballotpedia.org/Mandatory\_retirement\_

Research published by the University of Vermont's Legislative Research Shop on the Mandatory Retirement Age of Judges from 2000 gives a good overview of what other jurisdictions are doing:

"...In a number of states conditional provisions have been accompanied with mandatory retirement ages. For example, in the state of Florida appellate judges who turn 70 at the midpoint of a six-year term are allowed to serve out his or her term and retire at 73 (FLA Constitution. art V, sections 8). In Ohio any voluntarily retired judge or any judge retired at 70 may be assigned, with his consent, by the Chief Justice or acting Chief Justice of the Supreme Court to active duty as a judge and while serving will receive compensation in addition to any retirement benefits to which he may be entitled (OHIO CONST. art. IV section 6). And, in Minnesota the legislature may provide for the extension of the term of any judge who becomes eligible for retirement within three years after the expansion of the term for which he is selected; a retired judge may also be assigned to hear and decide any case over which the court to which he is assigned has jurisdiction. (MINN CONST.art IV.section 9 and 10).

The following map displays the states in which no mandatory retirement exists, states in which there is a mandatory retirement age but conditional provisions, and states that have mandatory retirement ages set at 70-75 years of age.<sup>2</sup>



References Makar, Scott D. 1997. "In Praise of Older Judges: Raise the Mandatory Retirement Age?" Florida Bar Journal. April 1997 v71 n4 p.48(3). Florida Constitution, article V, section 8. Ohio Constitution, article IV, section 6. Minnesota Constitution, article IV, sections 9 and 10. Parker, Deanna L. National Center for State Courts, Knowledge Management Department. Williamsburg VA.

Here is a list of states from Ballotpedia in  $2022.^3$ 

## **List of states**

State	Mandatory retirement age	Additional information
<u>Alabama</u>	70[3]	Judges may finish the final term during which they turn 70.[3]
<u>Alaska</u>	70[4]	
<u>Arizona</u>	70[5]6]	
<u>Arkansas</u>	Judges who do not retire at 70 lose all earned retirement benefits.[7]	No retirement age; however, judges lose their earned retirement be election past age 70. <sup>[8]</sup>
<u>California</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Colorado</u>	72 <sup>9</sup>	
<u>Connecticut</u>	70[10]	
<u>Delaware</u>	-	No retirement age
District of Columbia	74[11]	
<u>Florida</u>	75 <sup>[12]</sup>	Judges may finish the final term if more than one-half has been ser
<u>Georgia</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Hawaii</u>	70 <sup>[13]</sup>	
<u>Idaho</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Illinois</u>	-	Used to be 75, but law was struck down by Illinois Supreme Court i
<u>Indiana</u>	75 <sup>[16]</sup>	No limit for superior court and county court judges.[17]
<u>lowa</u>	72 <sup>[18]</sup>	
<u>Kansas</u>	75 <sup>[19]</sup>	Judges may finish the final term during which they turn 75 <sup>[19]</sup>
<u>Kentucky</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Louisiana</u>	70[20]	Judges may finish the final term during which they turn 70 <sup>[20]</sup>
<u>Maine</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Maryland</u>	70[21]	
<u>Massachusetts</u>	70[22]	
<u>Michigan</u>	70[23]	Judges may finish the final term during which they turn 70.[23]

	II.	И
<u>Minnesota</u>	70[24]	Judges must retire the last day of the month in which they have tur
<u>Mississippi</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Missouri</u>	70/75[25][26]	Judges other than municipal judges must retire at 70.[25] Municipal j
<u>Montana</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Nebraska</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Nevada</u>	-	No retirement age
New Hampshire	70[27]	
New Jersey	70[28]	Judges serving as Administrative Director of the Courts may apply
New Mexico	-	No retirement age
New York	70[30]	Judges may finish out year they turn 70. There is no retirement lim
North Carolina	72[31]	Judges must retire the last day of the month in which they have tur
North Dakota	Judges who do not retire at 73 lose all earned retirement benefits. [32]	No retirement age; however, judges lose their earned retirement be retirement before turning 73.[33]
<u>Ohio</u>	70[34]	Judges may finish the final term during which they turn 70[34]
<u>Oklahoma</u>	-	No retirement age; limit may be established by statute.[35]
<u>Oregon</u>	75 <sup>[36]</sup>	Limit may be reduced to as low as 70 by statute or initiative.[36]
<u>Pennsylvania</u>	75 <sup>[37]</sup>	Judges may finish out year they turn 75.[37]
Rhode Island	-	No retirement age <sup>[38]</sup>
South Carolina	72[39]	No limit for Probate or Municipal Court judges.[39]
South Dakota	70[40]	Judges that turn 70 may serve until the first Tuesday following a M state legislature election. [40]
<u>Tennessee</u>	-	No retirement age
<u>Texas</u>	75 <sup>[41][42]</sup>	Conditions may vary. See <u>Article 5</u> for more information <sup>[41]</sup>
<u>Utah</u>	75 <sup>[43]</sup>	
Vermont	90[44]	Judges may finish out year they turn 90.[44]
<u>Virginia</u>	73[45]	Judge will be retired 20 days after the regular session of the Gener
Washington	75 <sup>[46]</sup>	Judges may finish out year they turn 75.[46]
West Virginia	-	No retirement age
Wisconsin	-	The Wisconsin Blue Book 2005-2006 states: "Wisconsin used to be judges and justices. From 1955 to 1978, judges and justices had to Wisconsin Constitution has authorized the legislature to impose a the legislature has not done so." [47]
Wyoming	70[48]	
	ļ	

Community Alliance on Prisons is concerned about losing all that institutional knowledge that justices and judges have acquired through the years and, therefore, we urge the committee to pass this constitutional amendment so that the community can weigh in on this question.

## HB-2509-HD-1

Submitted on: 2/20/2024 1:12:30 PM

Testimony for FIN on 2/22/2024 11:30:00 AM

<b>Submitted By</b>	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mike Golojuch, Sr.	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

### Comments:

I support HB2509. Judges should be allowed to serve until 75 if they wish. Please pass this bill. Mike Golojuch, Sr.

## HB-2509-HD-1

Submitted on: 2/21/2024 7:41:19 PM

Testimony for FIN on 2/22/2024 11:30:00 AM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John Begg	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

It's beyond the time for these senior citizens to enter a different role than remining on the job. There are other ways for these people to contribute and it is time to get new blood into the courts.