A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO PROPERTY FORFEITURE.

1

12

13

15

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

SECTION 1. The legislature finds that Hawaii's civil asset

2 forfeiture process allows law enforcement agencies to seize and

3 keep property based on suspicion that the property is connected

4 to criminal activity. Property, such as vehicles, houses, cash,

5 and jewelry, can be taken without the property owner having been

6 convicted of a crime or even being formally accused of one, and

7 the burden of proof to recover the seized property is shifted

8 from the State to the property owner.

9 The legislature also finds that there is a potential

10 incentive to improperly seize property for forfeiture, as state

11 and county law enforcement agencies are permitted to retain all

proceeds from the sale of the forfeited property. According to

the Institute for Justice, a nonprofit civil liberties law firm,

14 between 2001 and 2018, Hawaii generated at least \$20,000,000 in

forfeiture revenue under state law and an additional \$29,000,000

16 under the federal equitable sharing program where state or local

17 law enforcement agencies partner with federal agencies and share

- 1 in the proceeds. The estimated value of property seized by
- 2 Hawaii law enforcement agencies was \$1,050,463 in fiscal year
- 3 2018-2019; \$963,055 in fiscal year 2019-2020; and \$483,506 in
- 4 fiscal year 2020-2021.
- 5 The legislature further finds that the Institute for
- 6 Justice recommends abolishing civil forfeiture entirely, which
- 7 four states have already done, Maine in 2021, Nebraska in 2016,
- 8 New Mexico in 2015, and North Carolina in 1985. In those four
- 9 states a criminal conviction is required prior to someone's
- 10 assets being seized. The legislature takes note of the
- 11 Institute of Justice's "D-" (D minus) rating of Hawaii's civil
- 12 forfeiture laws and the characterization that the State's laws
- 13 "are among the nation's worst".
- 14 Furthermore, the legislature finds that the Institute for
- 15 Justice recommends other reforms to make the forfeiture process
- 16 just, beginning with eliminating potential financial incentives
- 17 to seize and keep forfeited property and instead changing the
- 18 law to direct any proceeds to the general revenue fund or other
- 19 neutral fund. Currently, eight jurisdictions prohibit law
- 20 enforcement from keeping the proceeds from forfeited property,
- 21 and eight prevent participation in the federal equitable sharing

- 1 program. Another reform is to adopt a high standard of proof to
- 2 establish a civil asset forfeiture, such as "beyond a reasonable
- 3 doubt". Eighteen jurisdictions have a standard higher than
- 4 Hawaii's "preponderance of the evidence" standard, and for ten
- 5 of those jurisdictions, it is equivalent to beyond a reasonable
- 6 doubt. The third suggested reform, that a number of
- 7 jurisdictions have already enacted, involves requiring law
- 8 enforcement to prove that owners consented to or possessed
- 9 knowledge of the crime that led to the seizure of their
- 10 property, restoring the presumption of innocence used in
- 11 criminal proceedings. The legislature finds that none of these
- 12 recommendations have been implemented in Hawaii.
- Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to make the State's
- 14 civil asset forfeiture process more just by:
- 15 (1) Limiting the transfer of certain forfeiture property
- 16 to federal agencies;
- 17 (2) Establishing records requirements;
- 18 (3) Restricting civil asset forfeiture to cases involving
- the commission of a felony offense where the property
- owner has been convicted of an underlying felony
- 21 offense;

1	(4)	Directing any forfeiture proceeds to the general fund;	
2	(5)	Amending the allowable expenses for moneys in the	
3		criminal forfeiture fund;	
4	(6)	Requiring the attorney general to adopt rules	
5		necessary to carry out the purposes of the Hawaii	
6		omnibus criminal forfeiture act; and	
7	(7)	Amending the deadline for the attorney general to	
8		report to the legislature on the use of the Hawaii	
9		omnibus criminal forfeiture act.	
10	SECTION 2. Chapter 712A, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is		
11	amended by adding two new section to be appropriately designated		
12	and to read as follows:		
13	" <u>§71</u>	2A- Equitable sharing program; restrictions.	
14	Notwithst	anding the provisions of section 712A-7, a seizing	
15	agency or	prosecuting attorney shall not enter into an agreement	
16	to transf	er or refer property seized under section 712A-6,	
17	unless th	e seized property includes United States currency in	
18	excess of	\$100,000, to a federal agency directly, indirectly,	
19	through a	doption, through an intergovernmental joint task force	
20	or by oth	er means that circumvent the provisions of this	
21	section.		

1	<u>§712</u>	A- Records of forfeited property. (1) Each seizing
2	agency an	d prosecuting attorney shall maintain records showing:
3	<u>(a)</u>	The authority under which the forfeited property was
4		<pre>forfeited;</pre>
5	(b)	The date on which each item of forfeited property was
6		<pre>forfeited;</pre>
7	<u>(c)</u>	The department or agency that has possession of the
8		<pre>forfeited property;</pre>
9	<u>(d)</u>	A description of each item of forfeited property; and
10	<u>(e)</u>	The estimated value of each item of forfeited
11		property.
12	(2)	The seizing agency shall maintain all records of
13	forfeited	property and shall make the records open to
14	inspection	n. The seizing agency shall post the records on a
15	publicly a	accessible website."
16	SECT	ION 3. Section 712A-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
17	amended to	o read as follows:
18	"§71	2A-5 Property subject to forfeiture; exemption. (1)
19	The follow	wing is subject to forfeiture:
20	(a)	Property described in a statute authorizing
21		forfeiture;

1

2		of, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to commit a
3		covered offense, or [which] that facilitated or
4		assisted such activity;
5	(c)	Any firearm [which] that is subject to forfeiture
6		under any other subsection of this section or [which]
7		is carried during, visible, or used in furtherance of
8		the commission, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to
9		commit a covered offense, or any firearm found in
10		proximity to contraband or to instrumentalities of an
11		offense;
12	(d)	Contraband or untaxed cigarettes in violation of
13		chapter 245, which shall be seized and summarily
14		forfeited to the State without regard to the
15		procedures set forth in this chapter;
16	(e)	Any proceeds or other property acquired, maintained,
17		or produced by means of or as a result of the
18		commission of the covered offense;
19	(f)	Any property derived from any proceeds [which] that
20		were obtained directly or indirectly from the
21		commission of a covered offense;

(b) Property used or intended for use in the commission

1	(9)	Any interest in, security or, chaim against, or
2		property or contractual right of any kind affording a
3		source of influence over any enterprise [which] that
4		has been established, participated in, operated,
5		controlled, or conducted in order to commit a covered
6		offense; and
7	(h)	All books, records, bank statements, accounting
8		records, microfilms, tapes, computer data, or other
9		data [which] that are used, intended for use, or
10		[which] that facilitated or assisted in the commission
11		of a covered offense, or [which] that document the use
12		of the proceeds of a covered offense.
13	[(2) -	- Except that:
14	(a)	Real property, or an interest therein, may be
15		forfeited under the provisions of this chapter only in
16		cases in which the covered offense is chargeable as a
17		felony offense under state law;
18	(2)	The following is not subject to forfeiture; provided
19	that noth	ing in this paragraph shall be construed to prevent the
20	seizure o	f property before conviction pursuant to section
21	712A-6:	

1	[-(a)-]	(a) No property shall be forfeited under this chapter
2		[to the extent of an interest of an owner,] by reason
3		of [any act or omission established by that owner to
4		have been committed or omitted without the knowledge
5		and consent of that owner;] the commission of any
6		covered offense unless:
7		(i) The covered offense is chargeable as a felony
8		offense under state law; and
9		(ii) The owner has been convicted of the covered
10		offense by a verdict or plea, including a no
11		contest plea or a deferred acceptance of guilty
12		plea or no contest plea;
13	<u>(b)</u>	No property shall be forfeited under this chapter by
14		reason of any act or omission established by the owner
15		to have been committed or omitted without the
16		knowledge and consent of the owner;
17	(c)	No conveyance used by any person as a common carrier
18		in the transaction of a business as a common carrier
19		is subject to forfeiture under this section unless it
20		appears that the owner or other person in charge of

1		the conveyance is a consenting party or privy to a
2		violation of this chapter;
3	(d)	No conveyance is subject to forfeiture under this
4		section by reason of any act or omission established
5		by the owner thereof to have been committed or omitted
6		without the owner's knowledge or consent; and
7	(e)	A forfeiture of a conveyance encumbered by a bona fide
8		security interest is subject to the interest of the
9		secured party if the secured party neither had
10		knowledge of nor consented to the act or omission.
11	(3)	This chapter shall not apply to the forfeiture of an
12	animal pr	ior to disposition of criminal charges pursuant to
13	section 7	11-1109.2.
14	(4)	This section shall not prohibit or restrict
15	forfeiture	es authorized by law other than this chapter."
16	SECT	ION 4. Section 712A-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
17	amended to	o read as follows:
18	"§71 :	2A-16 Disposition of property forfeited. (1) All
19	property	forfeited to the State under this chapter shall be
20	transferre	ed to the attorney general who:

1	[\a)	may clamster property, other chair currency, which
2		shall be distributed in accordance with subsection (2)
3		to any local or state government entity, municipality,
4		or law enforcement agency within the State;
5	(b)]	(a) May sell forfeited property to the public by
6		public sale; provided that for leasehold real
7		property:
8		(i) The attorney general shall first offer the holder
9		of the immediate reversionary interest the right
10		to acquire the leasehold interest and any
11		improvements built or paid for by the lessee for
12		the then fair market value of the leasehold
13		interest and improvements. The holder of the
14		immediate reversionary interest shall have thirty
15		days after receiving written notice within which
16		to accept or reject the offer in writing;
17		provided that the offer shall be deemed to be
18		rejected if the holder of the immediate
19		reversionary interest has not communicated
20		acceptance to the attorney general within the
21		thirty-day period. The holder of the immediate

S.B. NO. \$1.0.1

		reversionary interest shall have thirty days
		after acceptance to tender to the attorney
		general the purchase price for the leasehold
		interest and any improvements, upon which tender
		the leasehold interest and improvements shall be
		conveyed to the holder of the immediate
		reversionary interest[-];
i)	Li)	If the holder of the immediate reversionary
		interest fails to exercise the right of first
		refusal provided in subparagraph (i), the
		attorney general may proceed to sell the
		leasehold interest and any improvements by public
		sale[-] <u>; and</u>
(ii	_i)	Any dispute between the attorney general and the
		holder of the immediate reversionary interest as
		to the fair market value of the leasehold
		interest and improvements shall be settled by
		arbitration pursuant to chapter 658A;
[(c)]	(b)	May sell or destroy all raw materials, products,
ā	and	equipment of any kind used or intended for use in
n	nanu	facturing, compounding, or processing a controlled
	(ii	[(c)] <u>(b)</u> and

S.B. NO. 400 S.D. 1

1		substance or any untaxed cigarettes in violation of
2		chapter 245;
3	[-(d)-]	(c) May compromise and pay valid claims against
4		property forfeited pursuant to this chapter; or
5	[(e)]	(d) May make any other disposition of forfeited
6		property authorized by law.
7	(2)	All forfeited property and the sale proceeds thereof,
8	(up to a	maximum of three million dollars per year, not
9	previousl	y transferred pursuant to [subsection] (1)(a) of this
10	section,	shall, after payment of expenses of administration and
11	sale, [be	distributed as follows:
12	(a)	One quarter shall be distributed to the unit or units
13		of state or local government [whose] officers or
14		employees conducted the investigation and caused the
15		arrest of the person whose property was forfeited or
16		seizure of the property for forfeiture;
17	(b)	One quarter shall be distributed to the prosecuting
18		attorney who instituted the action producing the
19		forfeiture; and
20	(c)	One half shall be deposited into the criminal
21		forfeiture fund established by this chapter.



1	(3) Property and money-distributed to units of state and
2	local government shall be used for law enforcement purposes, and
3	shall complement but not supplant the funds regularly
4	appropriated for such purposes.] including reimbursement for any
5	costs incurred by the department of the attorney general related
6	to the seizure or storage of seized property, shall be deposited
7	to the credit of the state general fund.
8	$[\frac{(4)}{(3)}]$ There is established in the department of the
9	attorney general a special fund to be known as the criminal
10	forfeiture fund, hereinafter referred to as the "fund" $_{\underline{\prime}}$ [in]
11	into which shall be deposited [one-half of the proceeds of a
12	forfeiture and any penalties paid pursuant to section 712A
13	10(6).] a portion of the proceeds of each sale made pursuant to
14	this section that is sufficient to cover expenses of
15	administration and sale. All moneys in the fund shall be
16	expended by the attorney general and are appropriated for the
17	[following purposes:
18	(a) The] payment of any expenses necessary to seize,
19	detain, appraise, inventory, safeguard, maintain,
20	advertise, or sell property seized, detained, or
21	forfeited pursuant to this chapter or of any other

1		necessary expenses incluent to the serzure, detention,
2		or forfeiture of [such] property and [such] contract
3		services and payments to reimburse any federal, state,
4		or county agency for any expenditures made to perform
5		the foregoing functions[+].
6	[-(b)-	The payment of awards for information or assistance
7		leading to a civil or criminal proceeding;
8	(c)	The payment of supplemental sums to state and county
9		agencies for law enforcement purposes;
10	(d)	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
11		programs for training and education of law enforcement
12		officers;
13	(e)	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
14		enforcement pursuant to the drug nuisance abatement
15		unit in the department of the attorney general; and
16	(£)	The payment of expenses arising in connection with the
17		law enforcement officer independent review board-in
18		the department of the attorney general.
19	(5)]	(4) The attorney general [may, without regard to the
20	requireme	nts of chapter 91, promulgate] shall adopt rules [and
21	regulation	as] necessary to carry out the purpose of this chapter,

S.B. NO. 400 s.D. 1

- 1 including rules concerning the disposition of property, the use
- 2 of the fund, and compromising and paying valid claims against
- 3 property forfeited [pursuant to this chapter].
- 4 [(6)] (5) Not less than [twenty] forty days [prior to]
- 5 before the convening of each regular session, the attorney
- 6 general shall provide to the legislature a report on the use of
- 7 the Hawaii omnibus criminal forfeiture act during the fiscal
- 8 year preceding the legislative session. The report shall
- 9 include:
- (a) The total amount and type of property seized by lawenforcement agencies;
- 12 (b) The total number of administrative and judicial
 13 actions filed by prosecuting attorneys and the
 14 disposition thereof[+] for each action;
- 15 (c) The total number of claims or petitions for remission 16 or mitigation filed in administrative actions and the 17 dispositions thereof[7] for each action;
- 18 (d) The total amount and type of property forfeited and 19 the sale proceeds thereof;
- (e) The total amount and type of property distributed tounits of state and local government;

S.B. NO. 400 s.D. 1

- 1 (f) The amount of money deposited into the [criminal forfeiture] fund; [and]
- 3 (g) The amount of money deposited into the general fund;4 and
- 5 [\(\frac{(g)}{g}\)] \(\frac{(h)}{g}\) The amount of money expended by the attorney
 6 general from the criminal forfeiture fund under
 7 subsection [\(\frac{(5)}{1}\)] \(\frac{(4)}{2}\) and the reason for the
 8 expenditures."
- 9 SECTION 5. Section 712A-19, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 10 repealed.
- ["[\$712A-19] Construction. It is the intent of the
 legislature that this chapter be liberally construed so as to
 effect the purposes of this chapter."]
- SECTION 6. This Act does not affect rights and duties that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were begun before its effective date.
- 17 SECTION 7. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed 18 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 19 SECTION 8. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2023.

Report Title:

Civil Asset Forfeiture; Property Forfeiture

Description:

Restricts civil asset forfeiture to cases involving the commission of a felony offense where the property owner has been convicted of an underlying felony offense. Directs forfeiture proceeds to the general fund. Amends the allowable expenses for moneys in the Criminal Forfeiture Fund. Requires the Attorney General to adopt rules necessary to carry out the purpose of the Hawaii Omnibus Criminal Forfeiture Act. Amends the deadline for the Attorney General to report to the Legislature on the use of the Hawaii Omnibus Criminal Forfeiture Act. Limits the transfer of certain forfeiture property to federal agencies. Establishes records requirements. (SD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.