## A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO PROPERTY FORFEITURE.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 The legislature finds that Hawai'i's civil asset SECTION 1. 2 forfeiture process allows law enforcement agencies to seize and keep property based on suspicion that the property is connected 3 to criminal activity. Property, such as vehicles, houses, cash, 4 5 and jewelry, can be taken without the property owner having been 6 convicted of a crime or even being formally accused of one, and 7 the burden of proof to recover the seized property is shifted 8 from the State to the property owner.

9 The legislature also finds that there is a potential 10 incentive to improperly seize property for forfeiture, as state 11 and county law enforcement agencies are permitted to retain all 12 proceeds from the sale of the forfeited property. According to 13 the Institute for Justice, a nonprofit civil liberties law firm, 14 between 2001 and 2018, Hawai'i generated at least \$20,000,000 in 15 forfeiture revenue under state law and an additional \$29,000,000 16 under the federal equitable sharing program where state or local law enforcement agencies partner with federal agencies and share 17



in the proceeds. The estimated value of property seized by
 Hawai'i law enforcement agencies was \$1,050,463 in fiscal year
 2018-2019, \$963,055 in fiscal year 2019-2020, and \$483,506 in
 fiscal year 2020-2021.

5 The legislature further finds that the Institute for 6 Justice recommends abolishing civil forfeiture entirely, which 7 four states have already done: Maine in 2021, Nebraska in 2016, New Mexico in 2015, and North Carolina in 1985. In those four 8 9 states a criminal conviction is required prior to someone's 10 assets being seized. The legislature takes note of the 11 Institute of Justice's "D-" (D minus) rating of Hawai'i's civil 12 forfeiture laws and the characterization that the State's laws 13 "are among the nation's worst".

14 Furthermore, the legislature finds that the Institute for 15 Justice recommends other reforms to make the forfeiture process 16 just, beginning with eliminating potential financial incentives 17 to seize and keep forfeited property and instead changing the 18 law to direct any proceeds to the general revenue fund or other 19 neutral fund. Currently, eight jurisdictions prohibit law 20 enforcement from keeping the proceeds from forfeited property, 21 and eight prevent participation in the federal equitable sharing

## 2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

#### **S.B. NO.** <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1 program. Another suggested reform is to adopt a high standard 2 of proof to establish a civil asset forfeiture, such as "beyond 3 a reasonable doubt". Eighteen jurisdictions have a standard 4 higher than Hawai'i's "preponderance of the evidence" standard, 5 and for ten of those jurisdictions, it is equivalent to beyond a 6 reasonable doubt. The third suggested reform, that a number of 7 jurisdictions have already enacted, involves requiring law 8 enforcement to prove that owners consented to or possessed knowledge of the crime that led to the seizure of their 9 10 property, restoring the presumption of innocence used in 11 criminal proceedings. The legislature finds that none of these 12 recommendations have been implemented in Hawai'i.

Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to make the State'scivil asset forfeiture process more just by:

15 (1) Restricting civil asset forfeiture to cases involving
16 the commission of a felony offense where the property
17 owner has been convicted of an underlying felony
18 offense;

19 (2) Directing any forfeiture proceeds to the general fund;
20 (3) Amending the allowable expenses for moneys in the
21 criminal forfeiture fund;



### **S.B. NO.** <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1	(4)	Requiring the attorney general to adopt rules
2		necessary to carry out the purposes of the Hawaiʻi
3		omnibus criminal forfeiture act; and
4	(5)	Amending the deadline for the attorney general to
5		report to the legislature on the use of the Hawaiʻi
6		omnibus criminal forfeiture act.
7	SECT	ION 2. Chapter 712A, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
8	amended b	y adding two new sections to be appropriately
9	designate	d and to read as follows:
10	" <u>§71</u>	2A- Equitable sharing program; restrictions.
11	Notwithst	anding the provisions of section 712A-7, a seizing
12	agency or	prosecuting attorney shall not enter into an agreement
13	to transf	er or refer property seized under section 712A-6,
14	unless th	e seized property includes United States currency in
15	excess of	\$100,000, to a federal agency directly, indirectly,
16	through a	doption, through an intergovernmental joint task force,
17	or by oth	er means that circumvent the provisions of this
18	section.	
19	<u>§712</u>	A- Records of forfeited property. (1) Each seizing
20	agency an	d prosecuting attorney shall maintain records showing:



### S.B. NO. <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1	<u>(a)</u>	The authority under which the forfeited property was
2		forfeited;
3	<u>(b)</u>	The date on which each item of forfeited property was
4		<pre>forfeited;</pre>
5	<u>(c)</u>	The department or agency that has possession of the
6		forfeited property;
7	(d)	A description of each item of forfeited property; and
8	<u>(e)</u>	The estimated value of each item of forfeited
9		property.
10	(2)	The seizing agency shall maintain all records of
11	forfeited	property and shall make the records open to
12	inspection	n. The seizing agency shall post the records on a
13	publicly a	accessible website."
14	SECT	ION 3. Section 712A-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
15	amended to	o read as follows:
16	"§71	2A-5 Property subject to forfeiture; exemption. (1)
17	The follo	wing is subject to forfeiture:
18	(a)	Property described in a statute authorizing
19		forfeiture;
20	(b)	Property used or intended for use in the commission
21		of, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to commit a

2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

Page 6

1		covered offense, or [ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u> facilitated or
2		assisted [ <del>such</del> ] <u>the</u> activity;
3	(c)	Any firearm [ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u> is subject to forfeiture
4		under any other subsection of this section or [ <del>which</del> ]
5		is carried during, visible, or used in furtherance of
6		the commission, attempt to commit, or conspiracy to
7		commit a covered offense, or any firearm found in
8		proximity to contraband or to instrumentalities of an
9		offense;
10	(d)	Contraband or untaxed cigarettes in violation of
11		chapter 245, shall be seized and summarily forfeited
12		to the State without regard to the procedures set
13		forth in this chapter;
14	(e)	Any proceeds or other property acquired, maintained,
15		or produced by means of or as a result of the
16		commission of the covered offense;
17	(f)	Any property derived from any proceeds [ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u>
18		were obtained directly or indirectly from the
19		commission of a covered offense;
20	(g)	Any interest in, security of, claim against, or
21		property or contractual right of any kind affording a

2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

Page 7

.

1		source of influence over any enterprise [ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u>
2		has been established, participated in, operated,
3		controlled, or conducted in order to commit a covered
4		offense; and
5	(h)	All books, records, bank statements, accounting
6		records, microfilms, tapes, computer data, or other
7		data [ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u> are used, intended for use, or
8		[ <del>which</del> ] <u>that</u> facilitated or assisted in the commission
9		of a covered offense, or [which] that document the use
10		of the proceeds of a covered offense.
11	[ <del>-(2)</del> -	Except-that:
12	<del>(a)</del> -	Real property, or an interest therein, may be
13		forfeited under the provisions of this chapter only in
14		cases in which the covered offense is chargeable as a
15		felony offense under state law;]
16	(2)	The following is not subject to forfeiture; provided
17	that noth	ing in this subsection shall be construed to prevent
18	the seizu	re of property before conviction pursuant to section
19	<u>712A-6:</u>	
20	[ <del>-(b)</del>	] <u>(a)</u> No property shall be forfeited under this chapter
21		[ <del>to the extent of an interest of an owner,</del> ] by reason



1	of [ <del>any act or omission established by that owner to</del>
2	have been committed or omitted without the knowledge
3	and consent of that owner;] the commission of any
4	covered offense unless:
5	(i) The covered offense is chargeable as a felony
6	offense under state law; and
7	(ii) The owner has been convicted of the covered
8	offense by a verdict or plea, including a no
9	contest plea or a deferred acceptance of guilty
10	plea or no contest plea, all appeals have been
11	exhausted, and all deadlines to appeal have
12	expired;
13	(b) No property shall be forfeited under this chapter by
14	reason of any act or omission established by the owner
15	to have been committed or omitted without the
16	knowledge and consent of the owner;
17	(c) No conveyance used by any person as a common carrier
18	in the transaction of a business as a common carrier
19	is subject to forfeiture under this section unless it
20	appears that the owner or other person in charge of

2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

# **S.B. NO.** <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1		the conveyance is a consenting party or privy to a	
2		violation of this chapter;	
3	(d)	No conveyance is subject to forfeiture under this	
4		section by reason of any act or omission established	
5		by the owner thereof to have been committed or omitted	
6		without the owner's knowledge or consent; and	
7	(e)	A forfeiture of a conveyance encumbered by a bona fide	
8		security interest is subject to the interest of the	
9		secured party if the secured party neither had	
10		knowledge of nor consented to the act or omission.	
11	(3)	This chapter shall not apply to the forfeiture of an	
12	animal pr	ior to disposition of criminal charges pursuant to	
13	section 711-1109.2.		
14	(4)	This section shall not prohibit or restrict	
15	forfeitur	es authorized by law other than this chapter."	
16	SECT	ION 4. Section 712A-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is	
17	amended t	o read as follows:	
18	"§71	2A-16 Disposition of property forfeited. (1) All	
19	property	forfeited to the State under this chapter shall be	
20	transferr	ed to the attorney general <u>,</u> who:	

# 2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

# **S.B. NO.** <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1	[ <del>(a)</del>	May	transfer property, other than currency, which
2		<del>shal</del>	l be distributed in accordance with subsection (2)
3		<del>to a</del>	ny local or state government entity, municipality,
4		<del>or-l</del> a	aw enforcement agency within the State;
5	<del>(b)</del> ]	<u>(a)</u>	May sell forfeited property to the public by
6		publ	ic sale; provided that for leasehold real
7		prop	erty:
8		(i)	The attorney general shall first offer the holder
9			of the immediate reversionary interest the right
10			to acquire the leasehold interest and any
11			improvements built or paid for by the lessee for
12			the then fair market value of the leasehold
13			interest and improvements. The holder of the
14			immediate reversionary interest shall have thirty
15			days after receiving written notice within which
16			to accept or reject the offer in writing;
17			provided that the offer shall be deemed to be
18			rejected if the holder of the immediate
19			reversionary interest has not communicated
20			acceptance to the attorney general within the
21			thirty-day period. The holder of the immediate



1		reversionary interest shall have thirty days
2		after acceptance to tender to the attorney
3		general the purchase price for the leasehold
4		interest and any improvements, upon which tender
5		the leasehold interest and improvements shall be
6		conveyed to the holder of the immediate
7		reversionary interest [-];
8	(ii)	If the holder of the immediate reversionary
9		interest fails to exercise the right of first
10		refusal provided in subparagraph (i), the
11		attorney general may proceed to sell the
12		leasehold interest and any improvements by public
13		<pre>sale[-]; and</pre>
14	(iii)	Any dispute between the attorney general and the
15		holder of the immediate reversionary interest as
16		to the fair market value of the leasehold
17		interest and improvements shall be settled by
18		arbitration pursuant to chapter 658A;
19	( <u>d)</u> [ <del>(b)</del> ]	May sell or destroy all raw materials, products,
20	and	equipment of any kind used or intended for use in
21	manu	facturing, compounding, or processing a controlled



1		substance or any untaxed cigarettes in violation of
2		chapter 245;
3	[ <del>(d)</del>	](c) May compromise and pay valid claims against
4		property forfeited pursuant to this chapter; or
5	[ <del>(e)</del>	](d) May make any other disposition of forfeited
6		property authorized by law.
7	(2)	All forfeited property and the sale proceeds thereof,
8	[ <del>up to a</del>	maximum of three million dollars per year, not
9	<del>previousl</del>	y transferred pursuant to [subsection] (1)(a) of this
10	section,	shall,] after payment of expenses of administration and
11	sale, [ <del>b</del> e	distributed as follows:
12	<del>(a)</del>	One quarter shall be distributed to the unit or units
13		of-state or local government [whose] officers or
14		employees conducted the investigation and caused the
15		arrest of the person whose property was forfeited or
16		seizure of the property for forfeiture;
17	<del>(d)</del>	One quarter shall be distributed to the prosecuting
18		attorney who instituted the action producing the
19		forfeiture; and
20	<del>(c)</del>	One half shall be deposited into the criminal
21		forfeiture fund established by this chapter.

2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

1	(3) Property and money distributed to units of state and
2	local government shall be used for law enforcement purposes, and
3	shall complement but not supplant the funds regularly
4	appropriated for such purposes.] including reimbursement for any
5	costs incurred by the department of the attorney general related
6	to the seizure or storage of seized property, shall be deposited
7	to the credit of the state general fund.
8	[-(4)] (3) There is established in the department of the
9	attorney general a special fund to be known as the criminal
10	forfeiture fund, hereinafter referred to as the "fund" $[\frac{in}{}]$
11	into which shall be deposited [ <del>one half of the proceeds of a</del>
12	forfeiture and any penalties paid pursuant to section 712A-
13	$\frac{10(6)}{10}$ a portion of the proceeds of each sale made pursuant to
14	this section that is sufficient to cover expenses of
15	administration and sale. All moneys in the fund shall be
16	expended by the attorney general and are hereby appropriated for
17	the [following purposes:
18	<del>(a)</del> The] payment of any expenses necessary to seize,
19	detain, appraise, inventory, safeguard, maintain,
20	advertise, or sell property seized, detained, or
21	forfeited pursuant to this chapter or of any other



1		necessary expenses incident to the seizure, detention,
2		or forfeiture of [ <del>such</del> ] property and [ <del>such</del> ] contract
3		services and payments to reimburse any federal, state,
4		or county agency for any expenditures made to perform
5		the foregoing functions $[+]$ .
6	( <del>d)</del> ]	The payment of awards for information or assistance
7		leading to a civil or criminal proceeding;
8	<del>(c)</del>	The payment of supplemental sums to state and county
9		agencies for law enforcement purposes;
10	<del>(d)</del>	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
11		programs for training and education of law enforcement
12		officers; and
13	<del>(e)</del>	The payment of expenses arising in connection with
14		enforcement pursuant to the drug nuisance abatement
15		unit in the department of the attorney general.
16	<del>(5)</del> ]	(4) The attorney general [may; without regard to the
17	requireme	<del>nts of chapter 91, promulgate</del> ] <u>shall adopt</u> rules [ <del>and</del>
18	regulatio	ns] necessary to carry out the purpose of this chapter,
19	including	rules concerning the disposition of property, the use
20	of the fu	nd, and compromising and paying valid claims against
21	property	forfeited [ <del>pursuant to this chapter</del> ].

# 2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

1	[ <del>(6)</del>	] <u>(5)</u> Not less than [ <del>twenty</del> ] <u>forty</u> days [ <del>prior to</del> ]				
2	before th	e convening of each regular session, the attorney				
3	general s	general shall provide to the legislature a report on the use of				
4	the Hawai	i omnibus criminal forfeiture act during the fiscal				
5	year prec	eding the legislative session. The report shall				
6	include:					
7	(a)	The total amount and type of property seized by law				
8		enforcement agencies;				
9	(b)	The total number of administrative and judicial				
10		actions filed by prosecuting attorneys and the				
11		disposition thereof[+] for each action;				
12	(c)	The total number of claims or petitions for remission				
13		or mitigation filed in administrative actions and the				
14		dispositions thereof [+] for each action;				
15	(d)	The total amount and type of property forfeited and				
16		the sale proceeds thereof;				
17	(e)	The total amount and type of property distributed to				
18		units of state and local government;				
19	(f)	The amount of money deposited into the [ <del>criminal</del>				
20		<pre>forfeiture] fund; [and]</pre>				

2024-1236 SB3274 SD1 SMA.docx

#### **S.B. NO.** <sup>3274</sup> S.D. 1

1 (g) The amount of money deposited into the general fund; 2 and 3 [<del>(g)</del>](h) The amount of money expended by the attorney general from the criminal forfeiture fund under 4 5 subsection  $\left[\frac{(5)}{(4)}\right]$  (4) and the reason for the 6 expenditures." 7 SECTION 5. Section 712A-19, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 8 repealed. 9 ["[§712A-19] Construction. It is the intent of the 10 legislature that this chapter be liberally construed so as to 11 effect the purposes of this chapter."] 12 SECTION 6. This Act does not affect rights and duties that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were 13 14 begun before its effective date. 15 SECTION 7. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. 16 17 SECTION 8. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.



Report Title: Civil Asset Forfeiture; Property Forfeiture

#### Description:

Restricts civil asset forfeiture to cases involving the commission of a felony offense where the property owner has been convicted of an underlying felony offense. Directs forfeiture proceeds to the general fund. Amends the allowable expenses for moneys in the Criminal Forfeiture Fund. Requires the Attorney General to adopt rules necessary to carry out the purpose of the Hawaii Omnibus Criminal Forfeiture Act. Amends the deadline for the Attorney General to report to the Legislature on the use of the Hawaii Omnibus Criminal Forfeiture Act. Limits the transfer of certain forfeiture property to federal agencies. Establishes records requirements. (SD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

