S.B. NO. 2524

JAN 1-9 2024

#### A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO ALGORITHMIC DISCRIMINATION.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1	SECTION 1. The Hawaii Revised Statutes is amended by
2	adding a new chapter to be appropriately designated and to read
3	as follows:
4	"CHAPTER
5	ALGORITHMIC DISCRIMINATION
6	<b>§ -1 Definitions.</b> As used in this chapter:
7	"Adverse action" means a denial, cancellation, or other
8	adverse change or assessment regarding an individual's
9	eligibility for, opportunity to access, or terms of access to
10	important life opportunities.
11	"Algorithmic eligibility determination" means a
12	determination based in whole or in significant part on an
13	algorithmic process that utilizes machine learning, artificial
14	intelligence, or similar techniques to determine an individual's
15	eligibility for, or opportunity to access, important life
16	opportunities.



1

### S.B. NO. 2524

a determination based in whole or in significant part on an 2 algorithmic process that utilizes machine learning, artificial 3 intelligence, or similar techniques to determine an individual's 4 5 receipt of advertising, marketing, solicitations, or offers for an important life opportunity. 6 7 "Covered entity" means any individual, firm, corporation, 8 partnership, cooperative, association, or any other 9 organization, legal entity, or group of individuals however 10 organized, including entities related by common ownership or 11 corporate control, that either makes algorithmic eligibility determinations or algorithmic information availability 12 13 determinations, or relies on algorithmic eligibility 14 determinations or algorithmic information availability 15 determinations supplied by a service provider, and that meets 16 one or more of the following criteria: 17 Possesses or controls personal information on more (1) 18 than twenty-five thousand residents of the State; 19 (2) Has more than \$15,000,000 in average annualized gross 20 receipts for the three years preceding the most recent 21 fiscal year;

"Algorithmic information availability determination" means



Page 3

1 (3) Is a data broker, or other entity, that derives fifty
2 per cent or more of its annual revenue by collecting,
3 assembling, selling, distributing, providing access
4 to, or maintaining personal information, and some
5 proportion of the personal information concerns a
6 resident of the State who is not a customer or an
7 employee of that entity; or

8 (4) Is a service provider.

9 "Important life opportunities" means access to, approval
10 for, or offer of credit, insurance, education, employment,
11 housing, or place of public accommodation as defined in section
12 489-2.

13 "Personal information" means any information held by a 14 covered entity, regardless of how the information is collected, 15 inferred, derived, created, or obtained, that is linked or 16 reasonably linkable to an individual, household, or personal device. "Personal information" includes but is not limited to: 17 18 (1) Individually identifiable information such as a real 19 name, alias, signature, date of birth, union membership number, postal address, unique personal 20 21 identifier, online identifier, internet protocol



# S.B. NO. 2524

1		address, media access control address, unique device
2		identifier, email address, phone number, account name,
3		social security number, military identification
4		number, driver's license number, vehicle
5		identification number, passport number, or other
6		similar identifiers;
7	(2)	A person's race, national origin, religious
8		affiliation, gender identity, sexual orientation,
9		marital status, or disability;
10	(3)	Commercial information, including records of personal
11		property; products or services purchased, obtained, or
12		considered; or other purchasing or consuming histories
13		or tendencies;
14	(4)	Real-time historical geolocation data more specific
15		than a fifty-mile radius;
16	(5)	Education records, as defined in title 34, Code of
17		Federal Regulations section 99.3 or any successor
18		regulation;
19	(6)	Biometric data, including voice signatures, facial
20		geometry, fingerprints, and retina or iris scans; and



## S.B. NO. 2524

Inferences drawn from any of the information 1 (7) identified in paragraphs (1) through (6) to create a 2 3 profile about an individual reflecting the 4 individual's predispositions, behavior, habits, attitudes, intelligence, abilities, and aptitudes. 5 "Reasonably linkable to an individual, household, or 6 7 personal device" means personal information that can be used on 8 its own or in combination with other information reasonably 9 available to the covered entity, regardless of whether the other 10 information is held by the covered entity, to identify an individual, household, or personal device. 11 12 "Service provider" means any entity that performs algorithmic eligibility determinations or algorithmic 13 14 information availability determinations on behalf of another 15 entity. -2 Prohibited practices; exemptions. (a) 16 A covered S 17 entity shall not make an algorithmic eligibility determination 18 or an algorithmic information availability determination on the 19 basis of an individual's or class of individuals' actual or perceived race, color, religion, national origin, sex, gender 20

21 identity or expression, sexual orientation, familial status,



Page 6

source of income, or disability in a manner that segregates,
 discriminates against, or otherwise makes important life
 opportunities unavailable to an individual or class of
 individuals.

5 (b) Any practice that has the effect or consequence of
6 violating subsection (a) shall be deemed to be an unlawful
7 discriminatory practice.

8 (c) Nothing in subsection (a) shall prohibit covered
9 entities from using individuals' personal information as part of
10 an affirmative action plan adopted pursuant to state or federal
11 law.

12 S -3 Relationships with service providers. Any covered 13 entity that relies in whole or in part on a service provider to 14 conduct an algorithmic eligibility determination or an 15 algorithmic information availability determination shall require 16 by written agreement that the service provider implement and 17 maintain measures reasonably designed to ensure that the service 18 provider complies with this chapter.

19 § -4 Right to notice and disclosure. (a) A covered
20 entity shall:



Page 7

1	(1)	Deve	lop a notice that explains how the covered entity
2		uses	personal information in algorithmic eligibility
3		dete	rminations and algorithmic information
4		avai	lability determinations, including:
5		(A)	What personal information the covered entity
6			collects, generates, infers, uses, and retains;
7		(B)	What sources the covered entity uses to collect,
8			generate, or infer personal information;
9		(C)	Whether the personal information is shared, sold,
10			leased, or exchanged with any service providers
11			for any kind of consideration, and if so, the
12			names of those service providers, including
13			subsidiaries of the service providers;
14		(D)	A brief description of the relationship between
15			the personal information and the algorithmic
16			eligibility or algorithmic information
17			availability determinations;
18		(E)	How long the covered entity will hold the
19			personal information; and
20		(F)	The rights provided under this chapter;



# S.B. NO. 2524

1	(2)	Ensure that the notice developed and made available
2		under paragraph (1) of this subsection:
3		(A) Is clear, concise, and complete;
4		(B) Does not contain unrelated, confusing, or
5		contradictory materials; and
6		(C) Is in a format that is:
7		(i) Prominent and easily accessible;
8		(ii) Capable of fitting on one printed page; and
9		(iii) Provided in English, as well as in any non-
10		English language spoken by at least five
11		hundred individuals in the State population;
12	(3)	Within thirty days after changing its collection or
13		use practices or policies in a way that affects the
14		content of the notice required by paragraph (1) of
15		this subsection, update that notice;
16	(4)	Make the notice required under paragraph (1) of this
17		subsection continuously and conspicuously available:
18		(A) On the covered entity's website or mobile
19		application, if the covered entity maintains a
20		website or mobile application; and



1		(B)	At the physical place of business or any offline
2			equivalent the covered entity maintains; and
3	(5)	Send	the notice required under paragraph (1) of this
4		subs	section to an individual before the first
5		algo	orithmic information availability determination it
6		make	es about the individual by:
7		(A)	Mail, if the personal information was gathered
8			through the individual contacting or contracting
9			with the covered entity through mail;
10		(B)	Email, if the personal information was gathered
11			through the individual contacting or contracting
12			with the covered entity through email, or if the
13			covered entity has the individual's email address
14			for another reason;
15		(C)	Informing individuals through a "pop-up"
16			notification upon navigation to the covered
17			entity's website or within the covered entity's
18			mobile application; or
19		(D)	Providing a clear and conspicuous link on the
20			covered entity's website's homepage, or the home



## S.B. NO. 2524

1 screen of its mobile application, leading to the 2 notice.

3 (b) A covered entity need not provide the notice described
4 under subsection (a) of this section if another covered entity
5 has provided notice to the same individual for the same action
6 as part of a contracted arrangement with the covered entity.

7 (c) A covered entity that is subject to subsection (a)(1),
8 with respect to any individual whose personal information the
9 covered entity holds as described in that subsection, shall not
10 use any personal information of the individual in an algorithmic
11 eligibility determination unless the covered entity has provided
12 the individual with notice consistent with that subsection.

(d) If a covered entity takes any adverse action with respect to any individual that is based in whole or in part on the results of an algorithmic eligibility determination, the covered entity shall provide the individual a written or electronic disclosure that includes:

18 (1) The covered entity's name, address, email address, and
19 telephone number;

20 (2) The factors the determination depended on; and

21 (3) An explanation that the individual may:



1	(A)	) Access any personal information pertaining to
2		that individual that the covered entity used to
3		make the determination;
4	(B)	) Submit corrections to that information; and
5	(C)	) If the individual submits corrections, request
6		that the covered entity conduct a reasoned
7		reevaluation of the relevant algorithmic
8		eligibility determination, conducted by a human,
9		based on the corrected data.
10	§ -5	Auditing for discriminatory processing and
11	reporting real	quirement. (a) A covered entity shall annually
11 12		quirement. (a) A covered entity shall annually
	audit its al	
12	audit its alg	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic
12 13	audit its algorithms and audit its algorithms and a second	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic availability determination practices to:
12 13 14	audit its algorithms and information and (1) Degotion discrete the discrete term of term o	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic availability determination practices to: termine whether the processing practices
12 13 14 15	audit its algorithms and audit its algorithms algorithms and algorithms algorithms algorithms and algorithms algor	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic availability determination practices to: termine whether the processing practices scriminate in a manner prohibited under -2;
12 13 14 15 16	audit its alg information a (1) De dia (2) Ana el:	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic availability determination practices to: termine whether the processing practices scriminate in a manner prohibited under -2; alyze disparate-impact risks of algorithmic
12 13 14 15 16 17	audit its alg information a (1) De dia (2) Ana el: ava	gorithmic eligibility determination and algorithmic availability determination practices to: termine whether the processing practices scriminate in a manner prohibited under -2; alyze disparate-impact risks of algorithmic igibility determinations and algorithmic information



1		fami	lial status, genetic information, source of
2		inco	me, or disability;
3	(3)	Crea	te and retain for at least five years an audit
4		trai	l that records, for each algorithmic eligibility
5		dete	rmination:
6		(A)	The type of algorithmic eligibility determination
7			made;
8		(B)	The data used in the determination, including the
9			source of the data;
10		(C)	The methodology used by the entity to establish
11			the algorithm;
12		(D)	The algorithm used to make the determination;
13		(E)	Any data or sets of data used to train the
14			algorithm;
15		(F)	Any testing and results for model performance
16			across different subgroups or for discriminatory
17			effects;
18		(G)	The methodology used to render the determination;
19			and
20		(H)	The ultimate decision rendered;
21	(4)	Cond	uct annual impact assessments of:



Page 13

1		(A) Existing systems that render algorithmic
2		eligibility determinations and algorithmic
3		information availability determinations; and
4		(B) Prior to implementation, new systems that render
5		algorithmic eligibility determinations and
6		algorithmic information availability
7		determinations;
8	(5)	Conduct the audits under paragraphs (1), (2), and (3)
9		of this subsection in consultation with third parties
10		who have substantial information about or participated
11		in the covered entity's algorithmic eligibility
12		determinations and algorithmic information
13		availability determinations, including service
14		providers; and
15	(6)	Identify and implement reasonable measures to address
16		risks of an unlawful disparate impact identified in
17		the audits and impact assessments conducted under
18		paragraphs (1), (2), and (3) of this subsection,
19		including the risks posed by determinations made by
20		the covered entity's service providers.

## S.B. NO. 2524

1	(b)	A covered entity shall annually submit a report
2	containin	g the results of the audit mandated under this section
3	to the de	partment of the attorney general on a form provided by
4	the depar	tment of the attorney general. The report shall
5	contain t	he following information:
6	(1)	The types of algorithmic eligibility determinations
7		and algorithmic information availability
8		determinations that the covered entity makes;
9	(2)	The data and methodologies that the covered entity
10		uses to establish the algorithms;
11	(3)	The optimization criteria of the algorithms used to
12		make the determinations;
13	(4)	Any data or sets of data used to train the algorithms,
14		and the source or sources of the data;
15	(5)	The methodologies the covered entity uses to render
16		the determinations;
17	(6)	Any performance metrics the entity uses to gauge the
18		accuracy of the assessments, including accuracy,
19		confidence intervals, and how those assessments are
20		obtained;



# S.B. NO. 2524

1	(7)	The frequency, methodology, and results of the impact
2		assessments or risk assessments that the entity has
3		conducted;
4	(8)	Within the description of each of the decisions in
5		paragraphs (1) through (7), the rationale for each
6		decision;
7	(9)	Whether the covered entity has received complaints
8		from individuals regarding the algorithmic eligibility
9		determinations and algorithmic information
10		availability determinations it has made; and
11	(10)	If the covered entity has determined that one or more
12		of the exemptions referred to in section -2(c)
13		apply to practices that would otherwise violate
14		section -2(a), a declaration and explanation of the
15		covered entity's reliance on those exemptions.
16	(c)	To the extent consistent with federal law or state
17	law, a co	vered entity may, in place of the report required by
18	subsection	n (a), submit to the department of the attorney general
19	a report j	previously submitted to a federal, state, or other
20	governmen	t entity, if that report contains the required
21	informatio	on or is supplemented with missing information.



## S.B. NO. 2524

(d) The attorney general may adopt rules pursuant to
 chapter 91 necessary to implement the reporting provisions of
 this section.

S -6 Enforcement; penalties. (a) In any case in which
the attorney general has reason to believe that any person has
used, is using, or intends to use any method, act, or practice
in violation of this chapter or rule adopted under this chapter,
or has failed to provide a notice, a disclosure, or a report
required by this chapter, the attorney general may commence
appropriate civil action for:

11 (1) A temporary or permanent injunction;

12 (2) Penalties as described in subsection (c) of this13 section;

14 (3) Damages or restitution; or

15 (4) Any other relief that the court considers appropriate. 16 In the course of an investigation to determine whether (b) 17 to seek relief, the attorney general may subpoena witnesses; 18 administer oaths; examine an individual under oath; require 19 sworn written responses to written questions; and compel 20 production of records, books, papers, contracts, and other 21 documents.



(c) Any covered entity or service provider that violates
 this chapter shall be liable for a civil penalty of not more
 than \$10,000 for each violation, which may be recovered in a
 civil action brought by the attorney general.

5 (d) Any civil penalty assessed for a violation of this
6 chapter, and the proceeds of any settlement of an action brought
7 pursuant to this section, shall be deposited in the litigation
8 deposits trust account under section 28-16.

9 (e) Any person aggrieved by a violation of this chapter 10 may bring a civil action in any court of competent jurisdiction, 11 and the court may award an amount not less than \$100 and not 12 greater than \$10,000 per violation or actual damages, whichever 13 is greater.

14 (f) In a civil action brought under either subsection (c) 15 or (e) of this section in which the plaintiff prevails, the 16 court may also award:

17 (1) Punitive damages;

18 (2) Reasonable attorney's fees and litigation costs; and
19 (3) Any other relief, including equitable or declaratory
20 relief, that the court determines appropriate.



1 (g) In a civil action brought under subsection (e) of this 2 section, a violation of this chapter or a rule adopted under 3 this chapter with respect to an individual constitutes a concrete and particularized injury to that individual." 4 5 SECTION 2. This Act shall take effect upon its approval. Kal Rhad 6

INTRODUCED BY:



#### Report Title:

Department of the Attorney General; Algorithmic Discrimination; Artificial Intelligence

#### Description:

Prohibits users of algorithmic decision-making from utilizing algorithmic eligibility determinations in a discriminatory manner. Requires users of algorithmic decision-making to send corresponding notices to individuals whose personal information is used. Requires users of algorithmic decision-making to submit annual reports to the Department of the Attorney General. Provides for appropriate means of civil enforcement.

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

