

SB690 RELATING TO FISHING

Senate Committee on Water and Land

The Administration of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA) will recommend that the OHA Board of Trustees **OPPOSE** SB690, which would create unnecessary and likely insurmountable hurdles to what has already become an overly burdensome process for Native Hawaiian subsistence communities to establish community-based subsistence fishing areas (CBSFAs), and thereby protect their subsistence resources and lifestyles for current and future generations.

While OHA appreciates the intent of this measure to include community input in the establishment of a CBSFA, OHA notes that the CBSFA designation process already involves extensive community engagement and provides numerous opportunities for public and community comment.¹ Indeed, all CBSFA efforts thus far have incorporated years, if not decades, of community discussion, outreach, and meetings providing ample opportunity for input from any and all interested parties. For example, from 2006-2015, the Hui Maka'āinana o Makana of the Hā'ena community held more than 73 meetings, consulting with area fishers, kama'āina families, commercial operators, local residents, and state agencies, as part of the Hā'ena CBSFA rulemaking effort.² From 2013 to 2016, the Hui Mālama O Mo'omomi held 23 meetings and public outreach efforts involving more than 809 individuals consisting of hui members, landowners, students, mākua, and kūpuna, on the Northwest Coast of Moloka'i CBSFA proposal, which had been in discussion and development since the mid-1990s.³ At the request of the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR), in 2017 the Hui also participated in additional scoping meetings on Moloka'i, Maui, and O'ahu, to address concerns of commercial fishers and others regarding the CBSFA rule proposal. From 2013 to 2016, the Kipahulu 'Ohana held 66 outreach efforts involving approximately 2,651 individuals including members of the East Maui community, DLNR, the general public, students, kūpuna, and legislators, in furtherance of their own CBSFA effort.⁴ It should also be noted that the

https://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dar/files/2017/03/Moomomi_CBSFA_Proposal.rev_.pdf.

¹ See COMMUNITY-BASED SUBSISTENCE FISHING AREA DESIGNATION PROCEDURES GUIDE (2016), available at <u>http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/coralreefs/files/2015/02/CBSFA-Designation-Procedures-Guide_v.1.pdf</u>.

² MANAGEMENT PLAN FOR THE HĀ'ENA COMMUNITY BASED SUBSISTENCE FISHING AREA, KAUA'I 56 (2016), *available at* <u>https://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dar/files/2016/08/Haena_CBSFA_Mgmt_Plan_8.2016.pdf</u>.

³ Mo'omomi North Coast of Moloka'i Community-Based Subsistence Fishing Area Proposal and Management Plan 109 (2017), *available at*

⁴ KĪPAHULU MOKU COMMUNTY-BASED SUBSISTENCE FISHING AREA ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD 42 (2019), *available at* <u>https://kipahulu.org/pdf/Kipahulu_Moku_CBSFA_Administrative_Record_FINAL.pdf</u>.

Ka'ūpūlehu Marine Life Advisory Committee (KMLAC), although not seeking CBSFA designation, also held more than 116 meetings involving approximately 1,411 individuals, including local fishers, DLNR, the West Hawai'i Fishery Council, area residents and families, and students between 2009 and 2016, to support the community-driven designation of the Ka'ūpūlehu Marine Reserve.⁵ The DLNR's CBSFA Designation Procedures Guide also directs communities to engage in five stages of activities in the development of a CBSFA designation proposal, with community outreach playing a vital role in every stage.⁶ It should be noted that these community outreach and engagement efforts are in addition to the public meetings held by the Board of Land and Natural Resources (BLNR) and Small Business Regulatory Review Board (SBRRB) in their approval and review of public hearings for CBSFA rule proposals, as well as the public hearing itself; all members of the public can testify and share their views at these public meetings and hearings for the consideration of the DLNR, BLNR, SBRRB, and Governor. Accordingly, the current CBSFA designation process and all community-driven management efforts have been and will continue to be saturated with community outreach, engagement, and input opportunities, making the additional referenda to be required under this bill unnecessary, duplicative, and prohibitively burdensome.

OHA further notes that although the DLNR has had the authority to designate and establish rules for CBSFAs since 1994,⁷ and despite the efforts of multiple communities to establish CBSFAs since that time, to date only one CBSFA, Hā'ena, currently exists. Notably, the Hā'ena CBSFA was only established after legislative intervention in 2006, followed by another eight years of inconsistent support from the DLNR. Such demonstrable uncertainty and inconsistency in the state's support for CBSFAs would likely discourage many from investing much effort in pursuing CBSFA designation. Nonetheless, in reflection of the importance of their nearshore fisheries to their ways of life, and of their sincere desire to collaborate with the state in protecting these critically important subsistence resources, a growing number of rural Native Hawaiian kīpuka communities have continued to endeavor to develop and seek CBSFA designation and rules. The mandated referenda in this measure, which would be cost prohibitive and which would add yet more uncertainty with regards to the outcomes of their efforts, could effectively shut down what for many communities has been years if not decades of sincere, voluntary, community-led study, research, outreach, discussion, and consensus building, simply to ensure culturally consistent harvesting practices in their local waters for the benefit of present and future generations.

Finally, OHA notes that SB690's definition of "affected community" may be particularly problematic. The 10 mile boundary is not only overly expansive – requiring Moloka'i communities to obtain the approval of residents of Kapalua, Maui, for example – but also neglects numerous other, much more relevant considerations of what should be

http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dar/files/2016/02/Kaupulehu_Administrative_Record_Public.pdf.

⁶ See COMMUNITY-BASED SUBSISTENCE FISHING AREA DESIGNATION PROCEDURES GUIDE (2016), available at <u>http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/coralreefs/files/2015/02/CBSFA-Designation-Procedures-Guide_v.1.pdf</u>.

⁷ HRS § 188-22.6.

⁵ Ka'ūpulehu Administrative Record 45 (2016), available at

considered a "community" of stakeholders with an interest in any particular CBSFA. Indeed, given the potential diversity of populations and stakeholder groups that may or may not be associated with any particular CBSFA, the existing practices and processes for CBSFA designation – including the dozens of meetings and other opportunities reflected in the CBSFA efforts described above – may in fact be the best and most appropriate way to identify and address the concerns of any "community" that may be "affected" by a CBSFA proposal.

Accordingly, for the reasons described above, OHA respectfully urges the Committee to **HOLD** SB690. Mahalo nui loa for the opportunity to testify on this measure.

DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR OF HAWAII





SUZANNE D. CASE CHAIRPERSON BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA

M. KALEO MANUEL DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION BUREAU OF CONVEY ANCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT ENGINEERING FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE HISTORIC PRESERVATION KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION LAND STATE PARKS

STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

POST OFFICE BOX 621 HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

Testimony of SUZANNE D. CASE Chairperson

Before the Senate Committee on WATER AND LAND

Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00 PM State Capitol, Conference Room 229

In consideration of SENATE BILL 690 RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES

Senate Bill 690 proposes to condition the designation of community-based subsistence fishing areas (CBSFAs) upon approval of the affected community. The Department of Land and Natural Resources (Department) appreciates the intent of this measure, and offers the following comments.

The Department, through its Board of Land and Natural Resources (Board), has discretion to establish CBSFAs through the rulemaking process provided in chapter 91, Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS). This process enables the Department to hear from all interested stakeholders and consider their input.

While it makes sense that any CBSFA designation should be supported by the majority of the affected community, the proposed amendments to HRS §188-22.6 are not practical and would not achieve the intended result in some situations. The measure does not prescribe how the fifty percent majority would be calculated. The Department lacks the capacity to contact every resident within 10 miles of a proposed CBSFA to poll their support or opposition. In addition, affected stakeholders often reside beyond 10 miles from where they fish for subsistence. The proposed measure would unfairly exclude them from being considered part of the affected community. The reverse is also true. The proposed bill would essentially give veto power to people based on geographic location, regardless of whether they have any interest in subsistence fishing practices or sustainability of subsistence resources.

The CBSFA designation process involves extensive stakeholder engagement, including multiple informal scoping sessions, a formal public hearing, and two Board meetings where community members and stakeholders can provide input on the proposed CBSFA rules. Through the

existing process, Board members can make an informed assessment of the level of community support of a CBSFA proposal, as well as the underlying reasons for support and opposition. As such, the Department believes the proposed bill is unnecessary.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this measure.





HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

STATE OF HAWAII STATE CAPITOL HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813

Support Testimony for SB 690

<u>COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND</u> Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

Dear Chair Inouye, Vice Chair Keith-Agaran and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land,

Aloha I am State Representative Lynn DeCoite and I represent District 13 (East Maui, Moloka'i, Lana'i, Kaho'olawe and Molokini). I am testifying in strong support for SB 690.

This bill allows each designated CBSFA and the communities that reside in the area to have a say. I support this bill because the majority of these communities want their voices heard. Some of DLNR's CBSFA proposals have created fights between people and Ohana without considering the people's voices. They have blocked testimony during public hearings to have the perception look as though huge support was garnished. In reality outside influence from other islands even out of state were having more of a say then the people from the communities that live near the proposed CBSFA areas. The CBSFA public hearing for Mo'omomi on Moloka'i is an example of this.

Moloka'i, just like all of our island communities, is unique and the concerns of the residents, the people from this area, this island should have a say and not have others speak for them. This bill isn't saying that others won't be able to give input, it just means that the majority of the home community needs to be in support. And if these are true "Community" Based Subsistence Fishing Areas, shouldn't that be the case?

There are other proposed CBSFA's in the state that have the support of their home communities, and I support those. Kipahulu, in my District in Hana, is ready to move forward and I support that.

This bill is helping protect other island communities from the turmoil that the CBSFA process has done to Moloka'i. This process and the proposals have divided our community, our home island. It's not that many do not want to protect the resources at Mo'omomi, they just don't agree with how its being done and what is being proposed. Meanwhile, the supporters of the proposal and within DLNR, keep recruiting support from off island to try to balance out and even try to drown out the voices on island.

The intent of SB 690 is to ensure community voices are heard and will hopefully lead to a more transparent process.

For these reasons I strongly support SB 690!

Mahalo for your consideration!

Q-Cite

Representative DeCoite House District 13

He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve Koʻolaupoko, Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi

Testimony on behalf of He`eia National Estuarine Research Reserve **Strongly Opposing SB 690** Senate Committee on Water and Land

February 2, 2021

Aloha Chair Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land,

Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony for SB 690 relating to Community-based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFAs). As a community leader who helped establish Hā'ena CBSFA, as a researcher who supports communities attemting to engage in co-management initiatives, as as the current manager of the He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve (HeNERR), and as a subsistence fisherman, I strongly oppose this bill.

The letter and intent of HRS 188-22.6 is one of the State's strongest affirmations of Native Hawaiian rights. The proposed amendemnts to this law, as indicated in SB 690, effectively erodes the intent of HRS 188-2.6. It does so by adopting a arbitrary and capricious definition of "community" that does not comport with Hawaiian conceptualizations of community, and sets up logistically insurmountable hurdles to demonstrate community support. Because of the existential threat that this proposed amendment ultimately represents to the intent of HRS 188-22.6, <u>I stongly urge the</u> <u>Committee on Water and Land to kill this bill.</u>

However, if this commitee is dead set on amending HRS 188-22.6 to add a definition of community, I compel you adopt one that is founded in a Hawaiian conceptualization of community, rather than one that is arbitrary and capricious. As we articulated in a recently-published scholarly article in *Pacific Conservation Biology* (attached to this testimony), a Hawaiian conceptualization of community is embodied in the term "*hoa'āina*." "*Hoa'āina*" is a term that was effectively used in the constitution of the Hawaiian Kingdom to represent the community of a Place. It is a term that coalesces those who have ancestors buried in Place and view that land as their *kulāiwi*, those who are born in Place and view that land, and those who are permanant, long-term residents of that Place and are *kupa'āina* to that land into a single group, which we now term as a "community."

Hawai'i Institute of Marine Biology (University of Hawai'i at Mānoa) • Kāko'o 'Õiwi • Paepae o He'eia Ko'olaupoko Hawaiian Civic Club • Ko'olau Foundation • Department of Land and Natural Resources Hawai'i Community Development Authority • National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administation In light of this, if the Committee is intent on amending the definition of community and setting up a metric, I would recommend the following in place of the current amendments under consideration:

- 1. [P. 1, L11-13; P. 2, L19-21] "...provided that the designation shall be approved by a majority of the hoa'āina of the place in question, as determined through the Chapter 91 process."
- 2. [P. 3, L2-4] delete the definition of "affected community" and insert a definition for "hoa'āina" that reads, " 'Hoa'āina' means those who have ancestors buried in the ahupua'a[s] in question, were born in the ahupua'a[s] in question, were raised in the ahupua'a[s] in question, and/or those who primarily reside in the ahupua'a in question."

In addition to this written testimony, I also plan to testify in-person via video conference to address any questions that you may have. Mahalo for your time and consideration,

Kawika Winter, Ph.D. Reserve Manager, He`eia National Estuarine Research Reserve Pacific Conservation Biology https://doi.org/10.1071/PC20009

Perspective

Empowering Indigenous agency through community-driven collaborative management to achieve effective conservation: Hawai'i as an example

Kawika B. Winter ^(D) ^{A,B,C,D,N}, Mehana Blaich Vaughan^{B,E,F}, Natalie Kurashima^{D,G}, Christian Giardina^{D,H}, Kalani Quiocho^(D) ^{B,I}, Kevin Chang^{D,J}, Malia Akutagawa^{E,K,L}, Kamanamaikalani Beamer^{E,K} and Fikret Berkes^M

^AHawai'i Institute of Marine Biology, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Kāne'ohe, HI, USA.

^BNatural Resources and Environmental Management, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu, HL USA.

HI, USA.

^CNational Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalāheo, HI, USA.

^DHawai'i Conservation Alliance, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^EHui 'Āina Momona Program, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^FUniversity of Hawai'i Sea Grant College Program, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^GNatural and Cultural Ecosystems, Kamehameha Schools, Kailua-Kona, HI, USA.

^HInstitute of Pacific Island Forestry, US Forest Service, Hilo, HI, USA.

¹Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^JKua'āina Ulu Auamo, Kāne'ohe, HI, USA.

^KHawai'inuiākea School of Hawaiian Knowledge – Kamakakūokalani Center for Hawaiian Studies, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^LWilliam S. Richardson School of Law – Ka Huli Ao Center for Excellence in Native Hawaiian Law,

University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu, HI, USA.

^MNatural Resources Institute, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada.

^NCorresponding author. Email: kawikaw@hawaii.edu

Abstract. Indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs) around the world are increasingly asserting 'Indigenous agency' to engage with government institutions and other partners to collaboratively steward ancestral Places. Case studies in Hawai'i suggest that 'community-driven collaborative management' is a viable and robust pathway for IPLCs to lead in the design of a shared vision, achieve conservation targets, and engage government institutions and other organisations in caring for and governing biocultural resources and associated habitats. This paper articulates key forms of Indigenous agency embodied within Native Hawaiian culture, such as *kua'āina*, *hoa'āina*, and the interrelated values of *aloha 'āina*, *mālama 'āina*, and *kia 'i 'āina*. We also examine how Hawai'i might streamline the pathways to equitable and productive collaborative partnerships through: (1) a better understanding of laws protecting Indigenous rights and practices; (2) recognition of varied forms of Indigenous agency; and (3) more deliberate engagement in the meaningful sharing of power. We contend that these partnerships can directly achieve conservation and sustainability goals while transforming scientific fields such as conservation biology by redefining research practices and underlying norms and beliefs in Places stewarded by IPLCs. Further, collaborative management can de-escalate conflicts over access to, and stewardship of, resources by providing IPLCs avenues to address broader historical legacies of environmental and social injustice while restoring elements of self-governance. To these ends, we propose that government agencies proactively engage with IPLCs to expand the building of comprehensive collaborative management arrangements. Hawai'i provides an example for how this can be achieved.

Keywords: community-based subsistence fishing area (CBSFA), community-driven collaborative management, Indigenous community conserved area (ICCA), Indigenous people and local communities (IPLC), Native Hawaiian, Place.

Received 5 February 2020, accepted 4 December 2020, published online 14 January 2021

Introduction

Conservation organisations have long held that humans are separate from and inherently destructive to nature (Mace 2014). This perspective is deeply rooted in centuries of racism against Indigenous peoples and continues to be used to justify past and ongoing removals of Indigenous people from their ancestral Places, and to deny access to their Places for gathering and stewardship (Kashwan 2020). Not surprisingly, efforts by Indigenous peoples to assert their rights to access and care for ancestral Places can result in conflicts with government agencies. These struggles have paved the way for more integrated forms of conservation - including ecosystem-based management and various forms of comanagement between government agencies and communities. However, 'comanagement' approaches may be only partially successful in resolving conflicts because of power structures that favour government agencies and limit decision making authority of communities, especially Indigenous communities (Tipa and Welch 2006; Berkes 2009).

Comanagement can mean various things, including 'community-based management', 'cooperative management', and 'collaborative management', each of which exists on a scale of power differential between communities and government agencies. 'Collaborative management' is built on mutual respect for both mainstream and Indigenous knowledge systems, represents negotiated agreements between government agencies and Indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs), and engages all parties in capacity building (Tipa and Welch 2006). This is recognised as a viable conservation approach (Berkes 2009). We propose that 'community-driven collaborative management' represents a subset of approaches to collaborative management that empowers various forms of 'Indigenous agency', which, as described by the UN (2007), is the ability and capacity of Indigenous people to govern themselves in their own self-interest. Approaches founded in Indigenous values and strategies to conservation that bring government agencies, non-government organisations (NGOs) and IPLCs together to collaborate are embraced in international policy (IUCN 2016). Community-driven collaborative management empowers IPLCs, and can be embodied in Indigenous Community Conserved Areas (ICCAs) and Community-based Conserved Areas, which are both internationally recognised ways to achieve globally recognised sustainability goals (Woodley et al. 2012; Worboys 2015). Work on this trajectory also honours some of the goals set forth in the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which recognises Indigenous peoples' right to their 'lands, territories and resources which they have traditionally owned, occupied or otherwise used or acquired' (UN 2007; Hill *et al.* 2020).

Hawai'i's unique history as an independent kingdom governed by its Indigenous people, prior to the illegal overthrow by the American government, provides a strong foundation for collaborative management. Current laws and constitutional provisions have roots in the Kingdom period, and they acknowledge forms of Indigenous agency that deal directly with issues of stewardship, such as conservation and resource management (Akutagawa et al. 2016b). Despite the existence of strong legislation and common law protections, however, Native Hawaiians ('Native Hawaiian' being the legally recognised term for the Indigenous people of Hawai'i) have been made vulnerable to prosecution for criminal trespass on private and government lands when in the course of exercising Indigenous agency relating to protection, conservation, and stewardship of their ancestral and sacred Places (Akutagawa et al. 2016a, 2016b). The implementation of collaborative management agreements that build on Indigenous agency could support efforts to reconcile historical distrust between government agencies and IPLCs while contributing to a future of reduced conflicts and improved resource management.

In 2018, the conservation community in Hawai'i adopted collaborative management as a formal conservation strategy (HCA 2018). This was done, in part, to acknowledge that this approach is gaining momentum across the Hawaiian archipelago and that community-driven collaborative management in rural areas can achieve notable conservation successes, as witnessed in Hā'ena on Kaua'i Island, Ka'ūpūlehu on Hawai'i Island, He'eia on O'ahu Island, and the remote Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument in the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands (Kikiloi et al. 2017; Delevaux et al. 2018, 2019; Winter et al. 2020a) (Table 1). For example, scientific evidence now shows that Community-Based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFAs) and other collaborative marine management arrangements can increase fish stocks (Minton et al. 2018; Rodgers et al. 2018, 2019). Despite the success of these pilots, and favourable international, national and state policies and laws (e.g. Ige 2016; IUCN 2016), IPLC-led collaborative management efforts continue to be challenged by a heavily bureaucratic process, with very limited progress made by agencies to streamline transitions from agency-controlled management to collaborative management

Table 1. Examples of community-driven collaborative management initiatives in Hawai'i that are currently in place

The official acknowledgement and participation of Indigenous people and local communities (IPLC), state government, and federal government is indicated for each example

| Comanagement initiatives | IPLC | State | Federal |
|--|------|-------|---------|
| Hā'ena Community-based Subsistence Fishing Area (Kaua'i Island) | × | × | |
| He'eia National Estarine Research Reserve (O'ahu Island) | × | × | × |
| Pāku'i Watershed Project (Moloka'i Island) | × | × | |
| Ka'ūpūlehu Fish Replenishment Area (Hawai'i Island) | × | × | |
| 'Aha Moku Advisory Committee and Island 'Aha Moku Councils (Main Hawaiian Islands) | × | × | |
| Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument (NW Hawaiian Islands) | × | × | × |
| Hawaiian Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (Main Hawaiian Islands) | × | × | × |

arrangements. This is true even where community-based leadership has secured a formal legal designation that confers some level of decision-making authority over matters of resource stewardship and non-exclusive harvesting. The bureaucratic nature of this process is highlighted by more than 20 years of complex negotiations and delays that hindered the designation of the Hā'ena CBSFA, finally approved in 2018 (Ayers *et al.* 2017, 2018), and continues to hinder designation of other CBSFAs. Indeed, the desire grows as the community of Mo'omomi (Moloka'i Island) continues to navigate political and bureaucratic obstacles and hurdles in an effort to officially adopt a set of draft administrative rules and associated management plan for their CBSFA, a process that initially began more than 30 years ago.

At the writing of this article, an increasing number of rural Hawaiian communities are attempting to assert Indigenous agency to engage in community-driven collaborative management to care for their Places, such as in Kīpahulu on Maui Island, as well as Miloli'i and Ho'okena on Hawai'i Island. A multidecade timeline for community-driven efforts is simply too slow to secure shared decision making over resource management. Long delays in securing a legal comanagement designation create excessive hardships for IPLCs, not to mention also result in decades of lost opportunities for effective conservation and resource management.

One source of conflict, and perhaps an important driver of delays, is the limited understanding government and other institutions have of Place-based resource management and conservation as practiced from a Native Hawaiian perspective, which can be viewed as an engagement process with the 'people of Place'. In contrast with the Indigenous perspective, US government institutions are tasked with engaging 'the public', including all stakeholders who use a place, with the goal of ensuring equal protection for the rights of all users. Past legal interpretations of equal protection by state agencies have been quite narrow, precluding for example community promulgated regulations to require boats fishing along a particular coastline to launch from the area boat ramp. In Hā'ena, the community strongly advocated to codify in their CBSFA rule a long-standing social understanding that the most accessible stretch of reef be reserved for harvest by elders. However, after negotiations, the governing agencies considered this designation preferential and an infringement on the rights of all users, ultimately rejecting the proposed rule (Vaughan et al. 2017). The process of translating policies on collaborative management into rules and action often results in more questions than answers, and the lack of clarity in turn delays formulation and implementation of policy.

Current efforts to procedurally enact comanagement arrangements in Hawai'i are stymied by administrative concerns that become barriers to progress. These concerns relate to questions about who counts as 'community', what are the cultural mechanisms to engage in resource management, how can community management rules be adapted to changing resource abundance once they are formalised into state law, and how are Indigenous rights balanced with those of an undifferentiated public, including all recreational users. State agencies have worked to streamline the designation process for collaborative management arrangements, such as through CBSFAs, but the process requires steps that are burdensome for communities including: the founding of a registered nonprofit; the surveying of all community members; detailed documentation of all meetings with stakeholder groups; identifying and validating geographic boundaries of the applying community; and conducting baseline and repeat ecological surveys of community subsistence harvest and of resource health. State agencies have few resources to assist with these many required steps, as they are under-staffed and under-resourced themselves. However, creating so many requirements erects barriers to the very community partnerships that could address lack of funding and personnel by increasing community's role in management.

This paper's aim is to provide perspectives on how to: (1) advance community-driven collaborative management more effectively and efficiently; and (2) elevate the role of Indigenous environmental stewardship concepts and agency in these community-driven collaborative management arrangements. By articulating Indigenous agency as a concept and approach that supports collaborative management policies we can broaden the conversation about process and more fully achieve effective conservation. Specifically, we will explore the concepts of Native Hawaiian agency based on a relationship to Place (e.g. kua'āina and hoa'āina), which were explicitly used in the policies of the 19th century to empower 'people of Place' when the Hawaiian Kingdom transitioned into a constitutional monarchy and a capitalist economy (Beamer 2014; Oliveira 2014); and other examples of Native Hawaiian agency (e.g. aloha 'āina), which are ancestral concepts that were revitalised in the late 19th century (Pukui and Elbert 1986; Beamer 2014). Additionally, we will explore further concepts of Native Hawaiian agency (e.g. mālama 'āina and kia'i 'āina) that emerged in the Hawaiian renaissance of the late 20th and early 21st centuries (Chang et al. 2019; Gon and Winter 2019).

In this treatment, we use two common nouns as proper nouns – 'Indigenous' and 'Place' – to allow us to speak in general terms while acknowledging that the things we speak of have specific names and distinct histories. The paper starts by exploring collaborative management basics, and then briefly explores Native Hawaiian agency and how Indigenous agency shapes community-driven collaborative management. The paper concludes by presenting perspectives on how agencies and NGOs can engage with Indigenous agency to achieve more effective conservation. This paper includes several Hawaiian words and terms relating to stewardship and environmental management (Table 2).

Conceptual understandings

Forms of Indigenous agency in Hawai'i

Understanding and engaging Indigenous agency will allow for more effective collaborative management between government agencies that have the legal mandate to protect natural resources, NGOs that have a mission to conserve habitats and biodiversity, and the IPLCs who have familial obligations to protect their Places and perpetuate their Indigenous practices. A failure to do this can lead to conflicts, such as those surrounding the approval to construct telescopes within the conservation zone on the sacred mountain, Mauna Kea (Alegado 2019). Native Hawaiian expressions of Indigenous agency take many forms, but are all centred on relationship to Place and among members of a community – human and non-human. Here we describe keystones of

Table 2. Glossary of Hawaiian words and terms used in this paper that are associated with environmental stewardship and resource management

| Hawaiian | Meaning |
|---------------|---|
| 'āina | Land, cultural landscapes; literally, that which feeds |
| aliʻi | Royalty, ruling class |
| aloha 'āina | Kinship-based love for, or reciprocity with, Place |
| haole | Foreign to Place |
| hoa'āina | Companions of Place with shared responsibility for Place |
| kama 'āina | Child of Place |
| kiaʻi ʻāina | Kinship-based guardianship of Place |
| konohiki | An ali 'i-appointed, local resource manager |
| kuaʻāina | Rural citizenry; literally, the backbone of the land |
| kulāiwi | Ancestral land; literally, bones in Place |
| kupa 'āina | Citizen or permanent resident of Place |
| kuleana | Responsibility |
| mālama 'āina | Kinship-based care for Place |
| maka'āinana | Working class; literally, those who tend the land |
| malihini | Visitor or newcomer to Place |
| <i>`</i> oiwi | Ancestral indigeneity to Place; literally, bones of place |
| one hānau | Born of Place; literally, birth sands |

Indigenous agency, including the conceptual frameworks of agency held in Native Hawaiian (Indigenous) and local communities in Hawai'i that convey these relationships to Place.

Kua'āina: the backs of the land

In many sociocultural scenarios, preferential treatment is proportional to one's proximity to the centres of power and governance. However, in a Native Hawaiian worldview, those who existed outside of the centres of power and governance are valued. They are embraced as foundational to the cultural landscapes that feed and sustain the masses, rather than otherwise regarded as, 'out-of-sight, out-of-mind', by conventional decision making. Kua'āina (literally, the backbone of the land) is a venerable term applied to people who live in the rural countryside (McGregor 2007; Oliveira 2014). This term is an example of Indigenous agency in that it empowers rural residents and elevates them to a point where their well-being is given due deference in decisions and the implementation of policy. The mere utterance of this term also serves as a reminder to those in power to act proactively in the benefit of those who live outside the centres of power, and not to marginalise them to the point of obscurity. The term kua 'āina provides the cultural foundation to create policy that acts in the best interests and for the well-being of those who live in remote places.

Hoa'āina: the people of Place

In the *ali* '*i* era (i.e. prior to European contact in the 18th century) the system of governance and resource management was spatially related from *ali* '*i nui* (supreme leader) at the island level to lower-ranking *ali* '*i* at the level of various subdivisions of land. It was connected to the *maka* '*āinana* (those who tend the '*āina*) through the *konohiki* (the *ali* '*i*-appointed local resource manager) (Kurashima et al. 2018). That spatial ladder of management was lost with the creation of a hybridised system of governance after the processes to privatise land were initiated by

K. B. Winter *et al.*



Fig. 1. The concept of '*hoa*'āina' is an example of Indigenous agency in Hawai'i that emerged in the 19th century to encompass all relationships to Place under a unifying term that conveyed a sense of shared *kuleana* (responsibility) to Place, regardless of social class. The concept of *hoa*'āina collectively includes, but is not limited to, those who have the following people-Place relationships (these are not mutually exclusive categories): 'ōiwi (those whose ancestors were Indigenous to Place), *kulāiwi* (the Place where one's ancestors are buried), *one hānau* (the Place one was born in), *kama*'āina (those who were raised in Place), and *kupa*'āina (those who are permanent residents of Place); but does not include *malihini* (those who are new to or visiting Place) nor *haole* (those who are foreign to Place). All of these terms are based on a relationship to Place and are not race-based.

the Hawaiian Kingdom in the first half of the 19th century. This created a gap then filled by newer forms of Indigenous agency. The specific term '*hoa*' $\bar{a}ina$ ' (literally, companion of the land), is the Native Hawaiian conceptualisation of the term, 'people of Place'. It is a term that exemplifies emergent Indigenous agency in the context of the Hawaiian kingdom era.

The term conceptually protected collective rights of the people of Place during the process that allowed for privatisation of land (Andrade 2008; Beamer 2014). Hoa'āina describes the people of Place as a collective while acknowledges the various types of relationships to, and knowledge of, Place (Fig. 1), regardless of social class (e.g. ali'i or royalty, and maka'āinana or working class). Both the Hawaiian Kingdom's constitution of 1840 and later the Māhele – the process that formalised the privatisation of land - had specific legal provisions that recognised the historically vested interest of Native Hawaiians to 'aina, and therefore granted access to 'aina. The law specifically granted access rights for the 'people of Place' to the resources of Place that sustained the nutritional, cultural, and spiritual needs embedded communities for countless generations of (MacKenzie et al. 2015). This was, in part, because the Hawaiian government recognised their citizens' legal rights - being the collective benefit to public trust resources of hoa'āina to their Place. Hence, to be involved in the decision-making and management of Place-based resources was central to hoa'āina-based resource management and conservation. This form of Indigenous agency allowed for hybridised governance that was simultaneously Place-based and centralised, perhaps best viewed as a blend of bottom-up (hoa'āina) and top-down (ali'i) management of public trust resources (Beamer 2014).

Aloha 'āina, mālama 'āina, and kia'i 'āina: the responsibilities of people of Place

' $\bar{A}ina$ (literally, that which feeds; figuratively, land) is the physical foundation for mountains-to-sea social-ecological

Empowering Indigenous agency

systems and Native Hawaiian cultural landscapes (Winter et al. 2018). In a Native Hawaiian worldview, 'āina is the central component of kinship-based values and ethics. This is expressed via the inter-related concepts of aloha 'āina, mālama 'āina, and kia'i 'āina, which convey a kinship-driven kuleana (responsibility) to Place (Fig. 2). These terms represent other forms of Indigenous agency in Hawai'i, and are born out of the worldview that Native Hawaiians are genealogically connected to the 'aina (the Hawaiian Islands themselves) and to its native biodiversity and ecological processes within these systems (Kame'eleihiwa 1992). Aloha 'āina (literally, love for the land) is a term that speaks to the kuleana of hoa 'āina to love the 'āina as they do as a cherished elder. This term is founded on the concept of reciprocity between people and Place. Mālama 'āina (literally, care for the land) is a term that speaks to the kuleana of hoa'āina to care for the 'āina because it is a beloved family member. Kia'i 'āina (literally, guardianship of the land) is a term that speaks to the kuleana of hoa 'āina to protect and defend the 'aina as one would one's own family.

These terms, along with their associated values and principles, are known and understood by IPLCs in Hawai'i. However, State agencies and other land management institutions have had, at times, contentious relationships with IPLCs embracing these forms of agency. As a result, Indigenous agency has played a limited role in the day to day operational environment (e.g. decision making about resource management; design and implementation of state and federal initiatives; policy agendas for agencies and organisations). With a history of operating from a 'resource as commodity' model of centralised management led by professional practitioners who have been trained to view IPLCs as problematic to management, government agencies and other conservation institutions have had difficulty bridging with and sharing decision making authority with IPLCs. Fundamentally different worldviews, operating environments and relationships to Place have all driven conflicts in the pursuit of effective IPLC-led collaborative conservation and resource management. Moving forward, there are some burgeoning initiatives that are bridging Indigenous worldviews across natural resources management institutions, such as the successful stewardship training program Hālau 'Ōhi'a (Kealiikanakaoleohaililani et al. 2018, Kealiikanakaoleohaililani et al. 2019), which trains existing and future resource management professionals in kinship-based Native Hawaiian lifeways.

Discussion

Limitations with command-and-control approaches to resource management have been described by others in detail (e.g. Holling and Meffe 1996; Kikiloi *et al.* 2017). In Hawai'i, commandand-control approaches to conservation predominate, yet funding levels for biodiversity conservation (e.g. invasive species management; fire suppression and mitigation; rare, threatened and endangered species extinction prevention) are far below those needed to cross effectiveness thresholds. Simply put, current neocolonial (colonially derived) agency-based approaches and practices married to a lack of attention to historical injustices associated with colonialism, and within a woefully underfunded conservation context all impose severe limitations on achieving desired conservation outcomes. Furthermore,





Fig. 2. Three interrelated forms of Indigenous agency in Hawai'i that flow from a deep connection to Place, all of which feed into one another. These include *aloha 'āina* (kinship-based love for Place), *mālama 'āina* (kinship-based care for Place), and *kia'i 'āina* (kinship-based protection of Place).

these limitations are being amplified by an increasingly complex and rapidly changing world. Innovative strategies are needed that explicitly foster collaboration, lead to social learning, trustbuilding, and the formation of social networks of communities, researchers, and decision-makers. Over time, mature forms of comanagement may incorporate elements of adaptive management (also known as learning-by-doing) into neocolonial processes. Such adaptive comanagement relies on collaboration, learning, and iterative modification of management practices based on experience and insight (Olsson et al. 2004; Armitage et al. 2007; Kikiloi et al. 2017). Continuous testing and then refining of both policies and actions ideally lead to collaborative management that is adaptive and flexible, tailored to local resource management and conservation, and is broadly supported by both communities and governments at various levels. It brings together diverse perspectives and sources of knowledge, and it may involve negotiations as necessary to steer the social-ecological system towards a collaboratively determined desired state (Kikiloi et al. 2017).

Collaborative management in Hawai'i, as with other Indigenous geographies, is more effective than when decision making over resources is accomplished entirely through a centralised but woefully underfunded process that, at times, seems detached from on-the-ground realities. Collaborative management offers the promise of effective conservation through the honouring of local connections to resources and the enhancing of stewardship capacity by people who live in, and are intimately a part of, the resources being stewarded (Johnson *et al.* 2016; Kikiloi *et al.* 2017). As with most Indigenous cases, Native Hawaiian agency is based on the notion of human relationship with, and responsibility to, the environment, seen as a coupled coexistence model of social–ecological systems (Berkes and Folke 1998; Winter *et al.* 2020*b*).

Biocultural diversity, the diversity of life in all its biological and cultural manifestations, holds that humanity is part of the environment, and recognises symbiotic relationships between societies and their environment (Chang *et al.* 2019). Biocultural approaches emphasise coevolution and encompass Indigenous and local community knowledge, innovations, and practices that developed within a social–ecological context (Johnson *et al.* 2016). As adaptive community-driven collaborative management is a knowledge partnership, such management arrangements in Hawai'i require an understanding of the knowledge, practice, and worldviews of Native Hawaiians.

Conflicts are inherent to conservation, but collaborative management provides avenues for bridging the gaps between worldviews and cultural perspectives that often drive conflicts. As such, collaborative management represents a central component to moving contemporary conservation efforts forward by directly engaging with and resolving sources of conflicts. In Hawai'i, conflicts between government and IPLCs can arise when government agency and/or institution staff - who have a mandate to manage the resources of Place, but are foreign to, or lack a deep relationship with, Place - perceive their legal mandate to manage Place and/or protect biocultural resources as paramount above Indigenous agency. This neocolonial dynamic and underlying perspective could be mitigated through collaborative management that engages Indigenous agency as central to achieving effective resource management and conservation.

Government agencies, NGOs, and people of Place all share a vested interest in the conservation of biocultural resources and associated habitats. However, attempts at Place-based collaborative management that generically identify 'the community' as the focus of engagement, can be delayed or even stalled by competing efforts to define community. In Hawai'i, ambiguity in how 'community' is defined has led some opponents of 'Place-based collaborative management' to claim that all citizens of the State of Hawai'i should be viewed as the 'community', and therefore every citizen - regardless of relationship to Place - has an equally vested interest regarding decision making and stewardship of specific Places. This applies to collaborative management efforts in both terrestrial and marine environments. While there are circumstances under which it would be necessary to engage all citizens regardless of relationship to, or genealogical connection with, Place, two factors should be integrated into government agency and institutional discussions about conservation and management of natural and cultural resources of Place: (1) the involvement of people of Place (i.e. hoa'āina), and (2) the engagement with Indigenous agency.

Specifically, the intergenerational knowledge and understanding of the resources of Place speak to the importance of engaging hoa 'āina in collaborative management of Place-based biocultural resources. Because hoa'āina have a multigenerational kuleana to engage in aloha 'āina, mālama 'āina, and kia'i 'āina of their Place, these forms of Indigenous agency constitute sociocultural components that can harness the energy and capacity of hundreds of thousands of individuals in effective conservation. As well, Indigenous agency can also harness the cultural practices that sustain collective identity and Hawaiian biocultural-based knowledge systems. We contend that this approach is preferable to ignoring or denying Indigenous agency, identity and knowledge, and simply living with perpetual conflicts between government agencies and IPLCs. Such a community-driven collaborative management approach can meet multiobjective conservation goals while make inroads to

addressing the legacy of historical injustices relating to Indigenous peoples.

Transitioning beyond neoclassical forms of governance, and reframing government agency approaches to resource management and conservation does require a collective, organisationlevel self-examination of the norms, beliefs, methods, practices and actions, with the goal of operationally engaging Indigenous agency. As more people understand the depth and the roots of humanity's disconnect with nature, a global movement in support of IPLC empowerment grows. With this movement so do the diversity of biocultural concepts and approaches, like the emerging global jurisprudence in 'Right of Nature' and the recognition of Native Hawaiian Cultural Landscapes (Van Tilburg *et al.* 2017). The international experience in creating legal rights for nature is summarised by O'donnell and Talbot-Jones (2018).

A core feature of a biocultural approach is the integration of Indigenous and local knowledge systems in the pursuit of effective conservation (Chang et al. 2019). Such a reflective, transformative, and responsive process within government agencies can develop an enhanced pathway to collaborative development, coproduction of knowledge, and then implementation of comanagement focused projects. Such an enhanced dialogue within government agencies allows a broader set of core Hawaiian concepts (described above) to form the basis for effective communication among agency representatives and community leaders. Such two-way communication becomes effective at facilitating larger comanagement goals, as well as meeting the more complex and long-term needs of adaptive processes. This context is also relevant for scientific fields, such as conservation biology, as it provides some context with which to engage IPLCs, and conduct research into the efficacy of comanagement in protecting biodiversity, species abundance and habitats.

Conclusions

From an Indigenous perspective, 'conservation' is not about preservation of nature within rapidly degrading protected areas that exclude people; rather, it is about a Place-based stewardship where IPLCs are empowered to conserve biodiversity along with cultural diversity, and habitats within the context of socialecological systems. 'Community-driven collaborative management' fueled by Indigenous agency empowers IPLCs to engage in stewardship over their places and fulfill this vision of conservation and associated goals. Various forms of Indigenous agency exist throughout the world within Place-specific contexts. Within these contexts exist Placed-based solutions for collaborative management arrangements that provide viable means for the recognition of Indigenous and human rights. Innovative and Indigenous-led strategies are needed that explicitly foster collaboration, lead to social learning, trustbuilding, and the formation of a transformative collaborative management. Indigenous agency can fuel collaborative management in manners that allow for hybridised governance that is simultaneously Place-based and centralised, from the perspectives of both IPLCs (i.e. hoa 'āina) and government institutions. The Indigenous concepts that describe the importance of Place for IPLCs can highlight critical management implications for developing and/or maintaining collaborative management strategies.

Empowering Indigenous agency

Community-driven collaborative management is a form of Place-based collaborative management, but incorporates the concepts held by IPLCs, and is an approach that can elevate the role of Indigenous agency in environmental stewardship. To realise this, government agencies must acknowledge, include and seek to understand Indigenous agency within the context of both their own mandates and within the context of the responsibilities IPLC carry to steward their Place. Likewise, IPLCs have forms of agency that derive from Place and should consider the most effective and efficient means of advocacy with govern-

ment institutions. Therefore, in order to realise broad implementation of collaborative management and achieve both social and environmental justice, actors must appropriately broaden participation, encourage learning, maintain and/or increase connectivity and communication, and foster adaptive systems thinking. Doing so will facilitate the cogeneration, coproduction and coapplication of new knowledge needed to navigate through an uncertain future.

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgements

Funding for this research was provided, in part, by the Office for Coastal Management, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, grant number NA19NOS4200078.

References

- Akutagawa, M., Cole, E., Diaz, T. P., Gupta, T. D., Gupta, C., Fa'anunu, A., Kamaka'ala, S., and Tauali'i, M. (2016a). Health impact assessment of the proposed Mo'omomi community-based subsistence fishing area – Island of Moloka'i, Hawai'i. Available at https://scholarspace.manoa. hawaii.edu/bitstream/10125/46016/Moomomi_HIA_FullReport_Web_ Final.pdf
- Akutagawa, M., Kamaka'ala, S., Williams, H., and the Native Hawaiian Rights Clinic (2016b). Appendix 4: Traditional & Customary Practices Report for Mana'e, Moloka'i. Final Environmental Assessment for Pāku'i Watershed Project. Available at https://scholarspace.manoa. hawaii.edu/handle/10125/46017
- Alegado, R. (2019). Opponents of the Thirty Meter Telescope fight the process, not science. *Nature* 572, 7–7. doi:10.1038/D41586-019-02304-1
- Andrade, C. (2008). 'Hā'ena: Through the Eyes of Ancestors.' (University of Hawaii Press: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- Armitage, D., Berkes, F., and Doubleday, N. (Eds) (2007). 'Adaptive Co-Management: Collaboration, Learning, and Multi-Level Governance.' (University of British Columbia Press: Vancouver.)
- Ayers, A. L., Kittinger, J. N., Imperial, M. T., and Vaughan, M. B. (2017). Making the transition to co-management governance arrangements in Hawai 'i: a framework for understanding transaction and transformation costs. *International Journal of the Commons* **11**, 388–421. doi:10.18352/ IJC.709
- Ayers, A. L., Kittinger, J. N., and Vaughan, M. B. (2018). Whose right to manage? Distribution of property rights affects equity and power dynamics in comanagement. *Ecology and Society* 23, 37. doi:10.5751/ ES-10124-230237
- Beamer, K. (2014). 'No Mākou ka Mana: Liberating the Nation.' (Kamehameha Schools Press: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- Berkes, F. (2009). Evolution of co-management: role of knowledge generation, bridging organizations and social learning. *Journal of Environmental Management* 90, 1692–1702. doi:10.1016/J.JENVMAN.2008.12.001

- Berkes, F., and Folke, C. (Eds) (1998). 'Linking Social and Ecological Systems. Management Practices and Social Mechanisms for Building Resilience.' (Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK.)
- Chang, K., Winter, K. B., and Lincoln, N. K. (2019). Hawai'i in focus: navigating pathways in global biocultural leadership. *Sustainability* 11, 283. doi:10.3390/SU11010283
- Delevaux, J., Winter, K., Jupiter, S., Blaich-Vaughan, M., Stamoulis, K., Bremer, L., Burnett, K., Garrod, P., Troller, J., and Ticktin, T. (2018). Linking land and sea through collaborative research to inform contemporary applications of traditional resource management in Hawai'i. *Sustainability* 10, 3147. doi:10.3390/SU10093147
- Delevaux, J. M. S., Stamoulis, K. A., Whittier, R., Jupiter, S. D., Bremer, L. L., Friedlander, A., Kurashima, N., Giddens, J., Winter, K. B., Blaich-Vaughan, M., and Burnett, K. M. (2019). Place-based management can reduce human impacts on coral reefs in a changing climate. *Ecological Applications* 29, e01891. doi:10.1002/EAP.1891
- Gon, S., and Winter, K. (2019). A Hawaiian renaissance that could save the world. American Scientist 107, 232–239. doi:10.1511/2019.107.4.232
- HCA (2018). Making the case for community-based adaptive collaborative management in Hawai'i. A position paper adopted by the Hawai'i Conservation Alliance on 24 July 2018. Available at www.hawaiicon-servation.org/position-papers/
- Hill, R., Adem, Ç., Alangui, W. V., Molnár, Z., Aumeeruddy-Thomas, Y., Bridgewater, P., Tengö, M., Thaman, R., Adou yao, C. Y., Berkes, F., and Carino, J. (2020). Working with indigenous, local and scientific knowledge in assessments of nature and nature's linkages with people. *Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability* **43**, 8–20. doi:10.1016/ J.COSUST.2019.12.006
- Holling, C. S., and Meffe, G. K. (1996). Command and control and the pathology of natural resource management. *Conservation Biology* 10, 328–337. doi:10.1046/J.1523-1739.1996.10020328.X
- Ige, D. (2016). Sustainable Hawai'i Initiative. Policy initiative of the State of Hawai'i, announced at the 2016 World Conservation Congress, 1 September 2016. Available at (https://governor.hawaii.gov/sustainablehawaii-initiative/ [accessed 26 January 2020].
- IUCN (2016). The Hawai'i Commitments at the World Conservation Congress – planet at the crossroads. 1–10 September 2016, Hawaii, USA. Available at https://portals.iucn.org/congress/hawaii-commitments
- Johnson, J. T., Howitt, R., Cajete, G., Berkes, F., Louis, R. P., and Kliskey, A. (2016). Weaving indigenous and sustainability sciences to diversify our methods. *Sustainability Science* 11, 1–11. doi:10.1007/S11625-015-0349-X
- Kame'eleihiwa, L. (1992). 'Native Land and Foreign Desires: Pehea lā e Pono ai. How Shall we Live in Harmony.' (Bishop Museum Press: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- Kashwan, P. (2020). American environmentalism's racist roots have shaped global thinking about conservation. In 'The Conversation', 2 September 2020. Available at https://theconversation.com/american-environmentalisms-racist-roots-have-shaped-global-thinking-about-conservation-143783 [accessed 15 October 2020].
- Kealiikanakaoleohaililani, K., Kurashima, N., Francisco, K. S., Giardina, C. P., Louis, R. P., McMillen, H., *et al.* (2018). Ritual + sustainability science? A portal into the science of aloha. *Sustainability* **10**, 3478. doi:10.3390/SU10103478
- Kealiikanakaoleohaililani, K., McMillen, H., Giardina, C., and Francisco, K. (2019). Cultivating sacred kinship to strengthen resilience. In 'Green Readiness, Response, and Recovery: A Collaborative Synthesis'. (Eds L. K. Campbell, E. Svendsen, N. F. Sonti, S. J. Hines, and D. Maddox.) pp. 188–204. Gen. Tech. Rep. NRS-P-185. (US Department of Agriculture, Forest Service: Newtown Square, PA.) Available at doi:10.2737/NRS-GTR-P-185-PAPER13
- Kikiloi, K., Friedlander, A. M., Wilhelm, A., Lewis, N., Quiocho, K., 'āila, W., Jr, and Kaho'ohalahala, S. (2017). Papahānaumokuākea: integrating culture in the design and management of one of the World's largest

marine protected areas. Coastal Management 45, 436–451. doi:10.1080/08920753.2017.1373450

- Kurashima, N., Jeremiah, J., Whitehead, A., Tulchin, J., Browning, M., and Duarte, T. (2018). Aina Kaumaha: the maintenance of ancestral principles for 21st century Indigenous resource management. *Sustainability* 10, 3975. doi:10.3390/SU10113975
- Mace, G. M. (2014). Whose conservation? *Science* **345**, 1558–1560. doi:10.1126/SCIENCE.1254704
- MacKenzie, M. K., Serrano, S. K., Sproat, D. K., Obrey, A. K. and Poai, A. K. (Eds) (2015). 'Native Hawaiian Law: A Treatise.' (Kamehameha Publishing: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- McGregor, D. (2007). 'Na Kua'aina: Living Hawaiian Culture.' (University of Hawai'i Press: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- Minton, D., Conklin, E., Wiggins, C., Carr, R., Lynch, H., Walsh, C., Rose, J., and Amimoto, R. (2018). 2-year post-closure condition assessment: 2018 Ka'ūpūlehu, Hawai'i Marine Surveys. The Nature Conservancy of Hawai'i Report, 19 November 2018.
- O'donnell, E. L., and Talbot-Jones, J. (2018). Creating legal rights for rivers: lessons from Australia, New Zealand, and India. *Ecology and Society* 23, 7. doi:10.5751/ES-09854-230107
- Oliveira, K. A. R. (2014). 'Ancestral Places: Understanding Kanaka Geographies.' (Oregon State University Press: Corvallis, OR, USA.)
- Olsson, P., Folke, C., and Berkes, F. (2004). Adaptive Comanagement for building resilience in Social–Ecological systems. *Environmental Management* 34, 75–90. doi:10.1007/S00267-003-0101-7
- Pukui, M. K., and Elbert, S. H., (1986). 'Hawaiian Dictionary: Hawaiian– English, English–Hawaiian.' (University of Hawaii Press: Honolulu, HI, USA.)
- Rodgers, K. S., Stender, Y., Richards Donà, A., Tsang, A., and Han, J. H. (2018). Long-term monitoring and assessment of the Hā'ena, Kaua'i community based subsistence fishing area. Prepared for State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Aquatic Resources
- Rodgers, K. S., Stender, Y., Richards Donà, A., Tsang, A., Han, J. H., Graham, A., Stamoulis, K., and Delevaux, J. (2019). Long-term monitoring and assessment of the Hā'ena, Kaua'i community based subsistence fishing area. Prepared for State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Aquatic Resources
- Tipa, G., and Welch, R. (2006). Comanagement of natural resources: issues of definition from an indigenous community perspective. *The Journal* of *Applied Behavioral Science* **42**, 373–391. doi:10.1177/ 0021886306287738
- UN General Assembly (2007). United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples: resolution adopted by the General Assembly, 2 October 2007, A/RES/61/295. Available at: https://www.refworld.org/ docid/471355a82.html [accessed 26 January 2020].

- Van Tilburg, H., Watson, T. K., Faria, K., Hoomanawanui, K., Ho-Lastiama, I., Ritte, W., Maly, K., Nahoopii, M., Horcajo, K., Kaupiko, K., and Ball, D. (2017). A guidance document for characterizing native Hawaiian cultural landscapes. US Department of the Interior, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Pacific OCS Region, Camarillo, CA. OCS Study BOEM 2017-023. Available at https://www.boem.gov/sites/default/files/ environmental-stewardship/Environmental-Studies/Pacific-Region/Studies/2017-023.pdf
- Vaughan, M. B., Thompson, B., and Ayers, A. L. (2017). Pāwehe Ke Kai a 'o Hā'ena: creating state law based on customary indigenous norms of coastal management. *Society & Natural Resources* 30, 31–46. doi:10.1080/08941920.2016.1196406
- Winter, K., Beamer, K., Vaughan, M., Friedlander, A., Kido, M., Whitehead, A., Akutagawa, M., Kurashima, N., and Lucas, M. (2018). The Moku System: managing biocultural resources for abundance within social–ecological regions in Hawai'i. *Sustainability* **10**, 3554. doi:10.3390/SU10103554
- Winter, K. B., Rii, Y. M., Reppun, F. A. W. L., Hintzen, K. D., Alegado, R. A., Bowen, B. W., Bremer, L. L., Coffman, M., Deenik, J. L., Donahue, M. J., Falinski, K. A., Frank, K., Franklin, E. C., Kurashima, N., Lincoln, N. K., Madin, E. M. P., McManus, M. A., Nelson, C. E., Okano, R., Olegario, A., Pascua, P., Oleson, K. L. L., Price, M. R., Rivera, M. A. J., Rodgers, K. S., Ticktin, T., Sabine, C. L., Smith, C. M., Hewett, A., Kaluhiwa, R., Cypher, M., Thomas, B., Leong, J.-A., Kekuewa, K., Tanimoto, J., Kukea-Shultz, K., Kawelo, A., Kotubetey, K., Neilson, B. J., Lee, T. S., and Toonen, R. J. (2020*a*). Collaborative research to inform adaptive comanagement: a framework for the He'eia National Estuarine Research Reserve. *Ecology and Society* 25, 15. doi:10.5751/ES-11895-250415
- Winter, K. B., Lincoln, N. K., Berkes, F., Alegado, R. A., Kurashima, N., Frank, K., Pascua, P., Rii, Y. M., Reppun, F., Knapp, I. S. S., McClatchey, W., Ticktin, T., Smith, C., Franklin, E. C., Oleson, K., Price, M. R., McManus, M. A., Donahue, M. J., Rodgers, K., Bowen, B. W., Nelson, C. E., Thomas, B., Leong, J. A., Madin, E., Rivera, M. A. J., Falinski, K. A., Bremer, L. L., Deenik, J. L., Gon, S. M., III, Neilson, B., Okano, R., Olegario, A., Kawelo, A. H., Kotubetey, K., Kukea-Shultz, J. K., and Toonen, R. J. (2020b). Ecomimicry in Indigenous resource management: optimizing ecosystem services to achieve resource abundance with examples from Hawai'i. *Ecology and Society* 25, 26. doi:10.5751/ES-11539-250226
- Woodley, S., Bertzky, B., Crawhall, N., Dudley, N., Londoño, J. M., MacKinnon, K., Redford, K., and Sandwith, T. (2012). Meeting Aichi Target 11: what does success look like for protected area systems. *Parks* 18, 23–36.
- Worboys, G. L. (2015). Concept, purpose and challenges. In 'Protected Area Governance and Management'. (Eds G. L. Worboys, M. Lockwood, A. Kothari, S. Feary, and I. Pulsford.) pp. 9–42. (ANU Press: Canberra.)

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 10:26:05 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Leimomi Khan | Testifying for Democratic Party of Hawaii, Hawaiian Affairs Caucu | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Transmitted on behalf of Juanita Mahienaena Brown Kawamoto, Chair of the Hawaiian Affairs Caucus, Democratic Party of Hawaii, that opposes SB 690. Either Juanita or me will participate in the zoom hearing. Mahalo, Leimomi Khan, Chair, Legislative Committee, Hawaiian Affairs Caucus, DPH.



Testimony Before The Senate Committee on Water and Land <u>IN OPPOSITION TO SB 690</u> Wednesday, February 3, 2021, 1:00PM, Room 229

Aloha Chair Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land,

My name is Kevin Chang and I am the Co-Director of Kua'āina Ulu 'Auamo (or KUA). KUA works to empower grassroots rural and Native Hawaiian mālama 'āina groups to celebrate their places and pass on their traditions to better Hawai'i and achieve 'āina momona— an abundant, productive ecological system that supports community well-being.

KUA strongly opposes SB 690 suggested amendment as fundamentall corrosive of the CBSFA law's purpose to further the State's constitutional kuleana under Article XII Section 7.

KUA works to empower communities to improve their quality of life through caring for their environmental heritage together. We employ a community-driven approach that currently supports a network of more than 36 mālama 'āina community groups collectively referred to as E Alu Pū (moving forward together), 38 fishpond projects and practitioners called the Hui Mālama Loko I'a, and a growing hui of Limu practitioners all from across our state.

The E Alu Pū Network was founded on Moloka'i based on the effort which inspired the Community-based Subsistence Fishing Area (CBSFA) law and a community movement to mālama Hawai'i from their places. The future of fishery management and sustainable use -its horizon of areas absent of most of humanity having been reached- is in working in the places where humanity is most impactful, aware of and interdependent. This is the only law with potential to build the trust, stewardship and depth of collaboration needed between government, community and place.

CBSFA are also currently the primary initiative that will help the state achieve its 30 x 30 goals. Just as an example, there are some 58 designated/protected marine areas under the state's aegis. Those areas equal only about 6% of the 30% goal. Of those 58 areas only ONE has a management plan; the Hā'ena CBSFA. The only other places with plans are yet to be realized. These include Mo'omomi, Kīpahulu and Miloli'i all CBSFA initiatives. It's pretty clear that the only current state initiatives that will help develop and implement effective management approaches to meet the Holomua 30 x30 goals are those where community efforts exist to lead the way.

KUA opposes this bill for a number of reasons:

1- This amendment manipulates and corrodes the CBSFA law's constitutional "purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion." A fundamental aspect of

subsistence and traditional management practice is that they are informed by views, observations and practices of traditional notions of place (moku, ahupua'a). This amendment dilutes the purpose of law and for the average citizen renders it impracticable. It is doesn't reaffirm constitutional rights but serves as a legislative step toward regulating Native Hawaiian rights out of existence.

- 2- This bill mandates 50% approval of all people within an arbitrary 10-mile radius of a proposed CBSFA area. It provides no funds for what requires input and mobilization equivalent to a ballot initiative. Indeed some proposed areas on one island would overlap communities and districts of other islands. Nor does it prescribe voting qualifications or processes to reach these goals. Nor will this amendment serve to resolve any specific community disagreements if anything it will exacerbate them.
- 3- The bill imposes additional burdens on already over-burdened CBSFA efforts. If we are going to ask this of small rural communities why not ask this of all other government projects or elections? As an example of the current burdensome requirements, communities have already done the following to develop their CBSFA packages:

Hā'ena

From 2006-2015, the Hā'ena the community held more than 73 meetings consulting with more than 217 community members including the fisheries committee, kama'āina families, commercial operators, local residents, and state agencies.

Moʻomomi

From 2013 to 2016, the Hui Mālama O Mo'omomi held 23 meetings and public outreach efforts involving more than 809 individuals consisting of hui members, landowners, students, mākua, and kūpuna, on the Northwest Coast of Moloka'i CBSFA proposal, which had been in discussion and development since the mid-1990s.

At the request of the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR), in 2017 the Hui also participated in additional scoping meetings on Moloka'i, Maui, and O'ahu, to address concerns of commercial fishers and others regarding the CBSFA rule proposal.

Kīpahulu

From 2013-2019, Kīpahulu 'Ohana held 66 outreach efforts (e.g., meetings, events, presentations, etc.) involving approximately 2,651 people including members of the East Maui community, DLNR, general public, students, kūpuna, and legislators.

- 4- During the scoping and Chapter 91 process all interested stakeholders -statewide already have and have had an abundance of opportunities to voice their opinion. There are and have been a number meetings and public hearings for that purpose.
- 5- The CBSFA law, embodies a principle of subsidiarity, the idea that for certain matters like place-based subsistence fishing rules- a centralized authority should play a subsidiary function performing only the activities that can't be accomplished at a more local level and/or ought to be handled by the closest, smallest, lowest or least centralized competent authority where knowledge, accountability, and responsibility exist and impact is most felt. Expanding boundaries to an arbitrary 10 mile radius ignores this principal and injects an insurmountable level requirement and confusion into the CBSFA process. This bill embodies top down governance in an intentionally ground up process.

6- This amendment will discourage if not destroy the very long-term partnerships the state has tried to build with communities that are proactive and have the traditional knowledge and willingness to better care for Hawai'i's nearshore fisheries over the years.

All the community efforts that had the fortitude to push for CBSFA's (Hā'ena, Mo'omomi, Kīpahulu and Miloli'i) have done so since E Alu Pū began and before; over 2 decades – 26 years - now as far as this official law is concerned. People who dreamed up and started these efforts have died and/or are dying off. So has the traditional knowledge, conservation virtues, ethics and skills that become more fragmented and diminished by the day.

Over those almost 3 decades community efforts have had the goal posts moved on them multiple times by policymakers and the administration from requests to draft professional level reports that the state itself couldn't do, to expanding and contracting the "community" to suit certain needs, to requiring communities to cover costs and engage in statewide scoping meetings and then, as now, shrinking or altering the boundaries of what community place-based management is.

We respect the legislative intent to improve this process but the locus of discussion for that are better served by the communities and the administration on the ground. There exist other bills in circulation this session that can be aligned to help build the kind of civic infrastructure we need to increase citizen stewardship of our place from the ground up. These include opportunities to increase resources and capacity for community-to-government efforts, restructure economic and institutional practices, relationships and arrangements around conservation, food systems and tourism among the many issues we are trying to tackle in our times.

Please hold SB 690.

Aloha 'Āina Momona.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 12:01:45 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|---------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Godfrey Akaka | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

My name is Godfrey Akaka Jr. I am the President for the Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association and we support SB-690. Attached is the DLNR report that outlines more people outside the affected district supported CBSFA which more people in the 10 mile radius opposed. So this is evidence that shows the current rules are not fair and work against a community. So again we support SB-690.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 1/30/2021 4:19:50 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Shyla Moon | Testifying for Hunting Farming and Fishing Association | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Aloha Senators,

I live on Kauai in District 16 and rely on fishing as one of my family's food resources. For a few years I volunteered on Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council recreational advisory panel and participated in many community discussions regarding fishing with NOAA, DAR, etc. I'm also a board member of the statewide nonprofit organization Hunting Farming and Fishing Association.

I'd like to suggest that the committee deeply think about the definition change of "affected community" (quoted below) and the island wide effects as a whole in a proposed CBSFA (Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area). A community that utilizes the resource may come from any part of the island and shouldn't be left out of discussions and decisions based on their residency. For example the town I live in has no beach accessible by public so I must drive to another town to gather. Does this leave me at a disadvantage for food? Yes it does.

The proposed sections, "provided that the designation shall be approved by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community." And "Affected community" means within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a community-based subsistence fishing area."

Thank you for your time,

Shyla Moon

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/1/2021 8:15:01 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|--|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Scott Crawford | Testifying for Kipahulu Ohana, Inc. | Oppose | No |

Comments:

On behalf of the Kipahulu Ohana, I am writing to urge your opposition to SB690.

The Kipahulu Ohana is a Hawaiian organization established in 1995 that has over the last 10 years been working on our Malama I Ke Kai shoreline management program, including the designation of Kipahulu moku as a CBSFA. We submitted our application with proposed rules and management plan to DAR in Oct. 2019, and after many years of hard work are hoping that it can receive public hearing and designation this year.

We are opposed to this proposed change in the CBSFA laws for the following reasons, among others:

1) The process to designate a CBSFA is already highly burdensome on communities. There is only one CBSFA designated so far—in Ha'ena—even though the law has been on the books for decades. In Kipahulu, we have been working for nearly a decade to do community outreach, gather input, document traditional practices and knowledge, establish scientific baselines, and come to a very sound, thoroughly researched and considered proposal that makes sense for our area.

The Kipahulu community could not have come to this point without the support of many partners and collaborators, including Haleakala National Park, The Nature Conservancy Maui Marine Program, Kua'aina Ulu 'Auamo (KUA), Texas A&M University Corpus Christi, Maui Nui Makai Network, Maui Nui Marine Resource Council, University of Hawaii researchers, and DAR staff. It is already practically impossible for a community to meaningfully propose a CBSFA designation without a great deal of support from outside agencies, due to the depth and thoroughness required in the process.

If anything, DAR has been and should be finding ways to streamline the process and make it less burdensome on communities. CBSFAs should be a key component of the state's goal to effectively manage 30% of our ocean by 2030. In order to reach the 30 by 30 goal, it would be totally counterproductive for the legislature to impose even greater burdens on communities who are taking the initiative to work in partnership with the state for the proactive management of these areas.

2) The process to design, submit and receive a CBSFA designation already requires many, many opportunities for community and public input, and the incorporation of that input into the end result, both within the community's own process, and in the process of public scoping and public hearings that DAR is required to undertake. There is no need to add an arbitrary layer of approval on top of what is already a very rigorous community process.

3) The very definition of "community" in the proposed legislation is wholly impractical. The whole point of a "community-based" subsistence fishing area is that one size doesn't fit all, and rules can't be imposed from the top that are right for every area. One of the very first parts of the process has to be defining the geographic scope of the project area for designation, and an integral part of the process is also identifying the stakeholders that make up that community, which is much more than just a geographic definition. It is totally contrary to the spirit and purpose of the designation, impractical and nonsensical, for the legislation to propose some arbitrary statutory geographic definition of "community" that must approve of the designation. And even the process for how that approval would take place is undefined and impractical.

To conclude, there has been some conflict in one particular community due to some opposition to a CBSFA proposal. But the solution to that conflict should come within that community, and should be tailered to the situation in that community. It makes no sense to extrapolate the perceived problems in that one community and impose arbitrary requirements on other communities where no such conflict or need may exist.

The best thing you can do is simply table this bill, and instead make sure that DLNR and DAR have sufficient budgetary resources to support communities who are working hard to partner with the state and achieve the goals that we all share, the effective managment of our oceans for the benefit of the ecology, traditional practices, and present and future generations.

Sincerely,

Scott Crawford

Executive Director

Kipahulu Ohana, Inc.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 9:07:39 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Damien Kenison | Testifying for Kauhako Ohana Association | Oppose | No |

Comments:

I oppose the amendment to SB 690 for the following reasons

1. It is an unnecessary addition to an already comprehensive and complex process

2. It will not solve any conflicts between proponents of CBSFA's and those who oppose it.

3. It is an unfair proposal that was hastily written to appease a group of people who have no solutions, only complaints.

The CBSFA process has been vetted at Haena and gives all stakeholders the opportunity to voice their opinion. The CBSFA process requires extreme effort, technically and socially. Those communities who choose to participate have committed an extraordinary amount of time to pursue an idea that is intended to protect resources and promote traditional management practices and cultural traditions. Most of the participants are not paid and devote a substantial part of their personal time to what they believe is pono.

Adding a requirement to survey all of the people living within 10 miles of the proposed protected area will not be fair to an already intensely time consuming process. To ask a person within that zone what they think of the proposed rules regardless of their interest or ability to comprehend the impacts does not make sense and is very unfair to the process possibly resulting in an unfair assessment

This amendment will create more animosity between the residents and stakeholders and will create a potential for fraud and misrepresentation of the issues. The group that campaigns the best and has the ability to influence peoples' thoughts will be the winners, or losers.

Lawmakers hear the word opposition and automatically assume that those who don't agree with the CBSFA have a valid reason. But what is the plan of the opposition? How will they help to manage a resource that is under the control of the DLNR? Self-regulation? That is another way of saying "don't tell us how to manage our resources. We can take care our own place without your help, DLNR."

What will happen as a result of that kind of thinking being allowed to proceed has the potential to end in violence or at the least, unacceptable inappropriate behavior. How will they tell a boatload of fishermen from another island to leave enough opihi, crab, or reef fish for their families?

Finally, what is their plan to regulate unsustainable fishing practices? From my experience of working with government agencies and other organizations I learned that they don't only want to hear complaints, they want to hear solutions. The amendment to SB 690 is not a solution and will hinder the CBSFA process unnecessarily.

Finally, I believe that this bill will encourage people to believe that they can manage their own resources without anyone's help. That is a dangerous concept that has the potential promote violence and inappropriate behavior. Who will be liable then? The lawmakers? DLNR?

Please take my opinion in this matter into consideration and make a choice you feel is pono.

Mahalo, Damien Kenison President- Kauhakŕ Ohana Association PO Box 38, Honaunau, HI. 96726

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 11:26:50 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|---------------|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Kelson Poepoe | Testifying for Hui Malama o Mo'omomi | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Aloha my name is Kelson Poepoe and I do not support SB 690. I understand from the original intent of the CBSFA Bill that the state is looking at ways to fulfill its obligations. By amending this bill it will only weaken our already established traditional and customary fishing practices. Much of the fisheries problems we encounter today is the result of poor management. Poor management starts with the users abusing our resources. Government officials getting in the way of processes as in the case on Molokai where politicians obviously favors one side. Developers with injection wells that pollute our oceans. Bad farming practices, and land based pollution just to name a few, but ultimately it's everyone. Subsistence fishing is the product of this original CBSFA Bill which the State of Hawaii didn't recognize prior. Traditional and customary fishing practices are also added to ensure our culture continue. With this foundation, management of our natural resources by the people of that place becomes automatic. Redefining our boundaries are not acceptable to traditional and customary practices. Our boundaries on land and in the ocean as well as the lani has already been established. I hope we can find Pono solution and not reduce our already threatened traditional and customary practices more than it already have.

Aloha Kelson K. Poepoe Lawai'a Pono

CENTER for BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY

February 2, 2021

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

February 3, 2021 at 1:00 p.m.

Conference Room 229 State Capitol 415 South Beretania Street

Re: TESTIMONY IN STRONG OPPOSITION OF SENATE BILL 690 - RELATING TO FISHING.

Aloha Chair Inouye and Distinguished Members of the Committee,

Please accept these comments submitted by the Center for Biological Diversity (Center) in **strong opposition of SB 690**.

The Center is a non-profit 501(c)(3) membership corporation dedicated to the protection of native, threated, and endangered species and the habitats they depend on to survive. Through science, policy, and environmental law, the Center is actively involved in species and habitat protection issues throughout Hawai'i. The Center has more than 88,000 members throughout the United States, including Hawai'i, with a direct interest in supporting native community efforts in conserving fragile and impacted marine ecosystems and the species that depend on them.

In 1992, a state law was passed which allows for marine areas in Hawai'i to be designated as Community-based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFA), HRS 188-22.6. CBSFAs are intended to protect fishing practices "customarily and traditionally exercised for the purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion." CBSFAs are community-driven initiatives, that represent a bottom-up or grassroots approach to fisheries management. CBSFAs are place-based in nature and community-driven in reality. CBSFAs are incredible tools to aid the DLNR in fulfilling its obligation to protect marine resources, traditional and customary practices, and the public trust.

Sadly, it is a long, hard, and expensive road for communities to establish CBSFAs. The last thing that is needed are additional unnecessary hurdles. As written, this bill would require that all CBSFAs "be approved by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community." This is unnecessary and problematic for a myriad of reasons. First, the proposed language

defines "Affected community" as the community "within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated." Native Hawaiians and local people are increasingly being displaced from our shorelines by outside interests, development, vacation rentals, and folks with the means to pay ever growing property taxes. The reality is that many subsistence fishers are unable to live within this arbitrary boundary. Furthermore, it is improper for the state to define what makes up a community, it is the community that needs to do that. Finally, the proposed bill is silent as to how the "Affected community" would be engaged to establish fifty percent approval. What entity would gather this data? How would the "vote" be conducted? Would this be restricted to landowners only? Who would pay for this added requirement? The list of questions goes on and on.

For these reasons and more the Center requests that this committee not pass SB 690.

Mahalo for your consideration,

<u>/s/ Maxx Phillips</u> Maxx Phillips, Esq. Hawai'i Director and Staff Attorney Center for Biological Diversity 1188 Bishop Street, Suite 2412 Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813 (808) 284-0007 <u>MPhillips@biologicaldiversity.org</u>



Environmental Caucus of The Democratic Party of Hawaiʻi

Wednesday, February 3, 2021 Senate Bill 690 Testifying in Opposition

Aloha Chair Inouye, Vice Chair Keith-Agaran, and Members of the Committee on Water and Land:

The Environmental Caucus of the Democratic Party of Hawaii stands in opposition of SB 473 as it provides that the department of land and natural resources may designate community—based subsistence fishing areas and carry out fishery management strategies for such areas, through administrative rules adopted pursuant to chapter 91, for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion; provided that the designation shall be <u>approved by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community.</u>

The additional requirement to establish a community-based subsistence fishing areas (CBSFAs) of the approval by fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community would create unnecessary and conceivably insurmountable financial burdens to an already overly burdensome process for Native Hawaiian subsistence communities in establish CBSFAs to protect their vastly diminishing subsistence resources and lifestyles.

The Democratic Party of Hawai'i (Party) has adopted at its State Convention in 2018, clear safeguards for Native Hawaiians found in pages 15 - 16 of the Party Platform:

"HONORING NATIVE HAWAIIANS

Native Hawaiians are the indigenous people of Hawai'i and deserve a just relationship with the State and Federal Governments. We support the growth of Native Hawaiian farming, agricultural and healing practices. We value and wish to foster the preservation of our host culture.

We acknowledge the past injustices and the misguided, harmful Federal and State policies and actions based on outdated and discredited values and beliefs that resulted in the destruction of the Hawaiian Nation's economies, social, and religious systems, the taking of their lands, and the creation of intergenerational trauma that exists to this day. We believe that we have a moral and profound duty to honor, respect, and uphold our sacred obligation to the Hawaiian Nation State and the Hawaiian people.

We support proactive actions by the Federal and State governments to enhance Native Hawaiian culture, health, language, and education.

We support the continued engagement and empowerment of the Native Hawaiian community in decisions related to county and state affairs.

We support Native Hawaiians in their efforts to secure justice from our Federal and State governments to repair harms endured by the Hawaiian People and the ' $\bar{a}ina$ since 1893."

In light of our Platform to honor Native Hawaiians, its traditions, and host culture, the Environmental Caucus of Hawai`i opposes the additional requirement contained in SB 690 to achieve a CBSFA designation.

For these reasons, we urge you to defer this bill as the requirement of department of land and natural resources to designate community—based subsistence fishing areas and carry out fishery management strategies for such areas, through administrative rules adopted pursuant to chapter 91, for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion; provided that such designation has been <u>approved by at least fifty</u> per cent of the residents of the affected community creates an unfair and unreasonable burden on the Native Hawaiian community in achieving CBSFAs designed for their benefit.

Mahalo for the opportunity to testify,

/s/ <u>Melodie Aduja</u> Melodie Aduja Co-Chair, Environmental Caucus Democratic Party of Hawai`i

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 10:00:58 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--|--------------------|-----------------------|
| Presley Wann | Testifying for Hui Maka'ainana O Makana | Comments | No |

Comments:

Aloha to all this may concern,

On behalf of the Hui Maka'ainana O Makana of Ha'ena, Kaua'i, we are strongly opposed to SB690 and HB496. We ,as the first Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area in State of Hawai'i, feel that this bill puts another unnessecary hurdle in the community based mangement process and pursuits. We are one template of overcoming many of the current governmental obstacles.

Mahalo Nui Loa, Presley Wann (currently President for the Hui Maka'ainana O Makana)

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/1/2021 9:59:03 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Jenny Yagodich | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

I strongly oppose SB690. Although the idea that people of a place should have the say in their place sounds good from a distance, the reality is that 10 miles in fact goes well beyond the definition of community already defined in the CBSFA law. Just because someone lives within a defined parameter does not automatically make them stakeholders in traditional-based resource management. In some places, other islands would be included in the proposed radius. The CBSFA law has already been vetted and communities have decades of work towards what seems to be an ever-moving goal line.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 6:09:22 AM

Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Kalaniua Ritte | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

I oppose this bill because it allows for ppl who do not live in the area to vote.10 miles on a small island is jus too big of an area.let the ppl of Ho'olehua decide wats best for moomomi .simple as dat.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 8:00:09 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Laa Poepoe | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

The designated community served or 'affected users' should already be identified in the various CBSFA plans. What this bill suggests is an arbitrary radius that does not conform to traditional moku boundaries, inaccurately redefining the 'community' attached to a particular fishery. Furthermore, implementation of the suggested amendments are logistically impractical, costly in both time and money. This bill would once again move the goalposts, particularly for mo'omomi CBSFA, which has already jumped through hoops, stalling and preventing hui malama o mo'omomi from simply reaching the goal of preserving the fishery for subsequent generations.
<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 8:44:37 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Sub | mitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------|------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Willia | m K. Chang | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

I support this bill

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 9:31:27 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Sterling Kanoa Beair | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Aloha, Im a Molokai resident and subsistence fisherman. I am also a native Hawaiian, and this bill takes away my rights as a native of this land. I strongly oppose this bill.

Testimony of Karen Poepoe **Strongly Opposing SB 690** Senate Committee on Water and Land

February 2, 2021

Aloha Chair Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land,

Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony for SB 690, SB 690 relating to Community-based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFAs). I am a 40 year homesteader on Pala'au Moku lands in Ho'olehua, Moloka'i, and I am **strongly opposed to SB 690**.

The purpose and intent of the CBSFA has always and wholly been about the designation for resource management by communities of fishing areas, as SB690 states, "for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion.

It is apparent that government, group and individual entities are losing sight of that very clear purpose through all of the squabbling and politics, misinformation and the taking of sides by a legislator who has gone to extreme measures in unfair interference to block the process. We must not forget what the laws were designed to protect. In keeping with its constitutional obligations, the designation of CBSFAs by the DLNR attempts to uphold HRS ArticleXII Sec 7, which states:

The State reaffirms and shall protect all rights, customarily and traditionally exercised for subsistence, cultural and religious purposes and possessed by ahupua`a tenants who are descendants of native Hawaiians who inhabited the Hawaiian Islands prior to 1778, subject to the right of the State to regulate such rights. [Add Const Con 1978 and election Nov 7, 1978]

Amendments may have a place, and we can appreciate the effort to move forward, but not at the expense of laws and protections in place that the state and lawmakers have an obligation to consider, respect and follow. Recasting the letter of the law and its intent, as is being done in this amendment, for the purpose of accomodating one community group's aspirations over others may have much more far reaching consequences in all communities and may end up cancelling out those protections statutorily set in place.

The CBSFA, which has been determined to be a scientifically and traditionally sound management plan, is about caring for resources which have not been managed well by the state. It includes having communities partner with the state under the CBSFA in an effort to protect those areas and allow for traditional and customary subsistence fishing practices.

- It is NOT a plan to give exclusive rights to a "small group who have not allowed community stakeholders to engage in the process". Responsible lawmakers should go to the CBSFA at dlnr.gov and read it. The document verifies the exhaustive amount of official and inclusive meetings, roundtables and conferences held over 2 decades that includes the invitations and signed attendance of those who say they had no part in the process.
- It is NOT designed with a purpose to please everyone at all times. The CBSFA requires ALL stakeholders to equally sacrifice and save the overfished and commercially gathered species now in order to give a better chance for sustainability in the future. No single person or family benefits over others- that is the basis of a community resource management plan. The opposition to the CBSFA is not a result of the misdeeds of those who support it. Those opposed simply do not want any regulations whatsoever, even ones created together by their own community.
- The introduced amendments are actually more limiting to tenants of the 'ahupua'a and certainly to Hawaiian constitutional laws than is realized. Gerrymandering traditional boundaries is NOT the ethical way to reach the objective of responsible management. Applying an arbitrary percentage rate for "voters" is not a fitting way to address HRS Chapter 12 Sec 7 or the reason why the community management under a the CBSFA was sought after in the first place.

There are currently other communities in the process of designating CBSFA areas. The amendments being introduced in SB690 could profoundly affect other communities whose tenancy is made up of non-Hawaiians, commercial fishers, and others who have aspirations that run counter to the law. How will this particular set of changes affect the outcomes of their efforts?

There are many people who understand what the CBSFA really means and who are in support.

Karen Poepoe Kumu Kula Kaiapuni o Kualapu'u Hawaiian Language Immersion School and Ho'olehua Homesteader

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 11:42:53 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|---------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Caroline K. Adolpho | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

My name is Caroline Adolpho. I support SB690 because it creates the opportunity for residents ONLY to have a say in what occurs on our island. Moomomi is more than a recreational area for our family. For generations, we've benefited from fishing subsistently there and continue to teach future generations to do the same respectfully.

I strongly support SB690 as a resident of Molokai.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 11:46:08 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Carl H Adolpho | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

My name is Carl Adolpho. I support SB690. It creates the opportunity for ONLY residents to have a say in what occurs on our island. Moomomi is more than a recreational area for our family. For generations, we've benefited from fishing subsistently there and continue to teach future generations to do the same respectfully.

I strongly support SB690 as a resident of Molokai.

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 11:51:06 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted B | y Organizatio | on Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|---------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| Mahina Poepo | be Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair

Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

Testimony in OPPOSITION of SB690, I ask that the committee kill this bill.

Aloha Committee Members,

This testimony is written in strong opposition to SB 690, RELATING TO FISHING. Conditioning the designation of community-based subsistence fishing areas upon approval of the affected community.

I find this bill to be arbitrary and without reasonable justification. The impact of this bill, should it pass, would undermine the feasibility and overburden communities wishing to establish Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area designations to the point that this already rigorous and lengthy process may be deemed defunct or too cumbersome an undertaking for community members seeking place based solutions for their respective areas. Furthermore, the existing procedures set out by the DAR and the DLNR are rich with extensive community engagement requirements, ensuring that all interested parties are provided numerous opportunities for participation throughout the entire span of the proposal process.

The proposed language to be added: "provided that the designation shall be approved by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community." And defining it as "Affected community means within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a community-based subsistence fishing area" are incredibly ambiguous and impractical amendments. Who are considered "residents" and how will 51% be calculated? Do these residents also have to be users of the resources? What mechanism for voting will be utilized and will this require voter registration with the state or a separate registration type through the department? What costs are associated and who will be responsible for this cost of implementing and administering polling? Will there be a ballot, if so will it be a simple yes/no option or allow for personal testimony as well? How will personal testimony and rationale, be reflected in the decision making if all that matters is a yes/no vote? Will personal testimony and substance be then made obsolete? How will native Hawaiians who have been dislocated from their ancestral places, that now live outside the 10 mile radius, but continue to exercise traditional and customary practices within the proposed area, be accommodated as stakeholders under this new definition of "affected community"?

Again, please do not pass this bill as it is severely inappropriate and misguided and appears with the intent and purpose to completely derail the CBSFA designation process.

Mahalo nui,

Mahina Poepoe

Molokai Resident

<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 12:37:17 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|-----------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Hannah Kihalani Springer | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Hannah Kihalani Springer 72-3403 MÄ• malahoa Highway Kailua, Kona, Hawai'i * HI 96740 February 2, 2021

Chair Inouye and Members of the Senate Committee On Water and Land, Me ka ha'aha'a,

I am Hannah Kihalani Springer of Ka'ūpÅ«lehu, North Kona, Hawai'i. I vote in Senate District 4. I **oppose SB 690.**

I am a member of the Ka'ūpÅ«lehu Marine Life Advisory Committee, which is engaged in community based marine resources management, although we do not have Community Based Subsistence Fisheries Management Area (CBSFA) status. We entered into the Chapter 91 process via the West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area Rules.

I am very familiar with the hard work and long time commitments, the tremendous focus, demanding patience, and required willingness to listen, adjust, compromise, endure, and to aloha, that community based resources management efforts require. I do not believe that the proposed amendments to Section 188-22.6, Hawai'i Revised Statutes will advance this effort, for the following reasons.

1. The proposed amendment doesn't not define the "affected community" other than it "means within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to designated as a Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area (CBSFA)." Does this mean only persons whose primary residence is within ten miles of the proposed CBSFA? Or will part-time residents, in residence at the time of the polling be counted as well? Will there be an age designation for inclusion in the resident count? How will residents be polled? Who will fund the polling?

2. The more than 50% of residents of the "effected community", required by the proposed amendment, may not be familiar with "the fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for the purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and

religion." How does the proposed amendment improve, enhance, refine, or clarify the purpose of the CBSFA rule to "designate community-based subsistence fishing areas and carry out fisheries management strategies for such areas, through administrative rules adopted pursuant to Chapter 91 for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting" them?

3. The Chapter 91 process already provides all interested and informed stakeholders and the general public the opportunity to submit their opinions at agency meetings and public hearings.

4. The proposed amendment moves important resources management decision making away from the founding principles of the CBSFA rule and towards resources management by popularity poll. The founding principles are: 1) reaffirmation and protection of traditional and customary fishing practices exercised for the purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture, and religion; and 2) preparation of a management plan, containing a description of the specific activities to be conducted in the fishing area, evaluation and monitoring processes, methods of funding and enforcement, and other information necessary to advance the proposal. That the rigor expressly contained in these principles could be negated by a potgentially uninformed majority opinion on the topics, is not good resources management.

5. The proposed amendment cannot legislate any place-based, community discord, disagreement, or distress away. But it may discourage, disconcert, or dishearten other long-standing, hard working place-based communities which have worked long and hard to prepare CBSFA proposals and are poised to enter into the Chapter 91 process.

Mahalo for the opportunity to testify.

'O au nŕ me ka 'oia'i'o, Hannah Kihalani Springer



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|-----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Faith Tuipulotu | Individual | Support | No |

Aloha Senator Inouye,

I am a Hoolehua Homesteader/Organic farmer who live in the 10 mile radius of Moomomi. My family has been gathering from Moomomi since I was young. It was passed down from generation to generation on how to gather and respect the aina so that we always have fish to feed our families and share the extra.

I strongly support SB 690.

Mahalo,

Faith Tuipulotu



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Solomon P. Kaho?ohalahala | Individual | Oppose | No |

Aloha Committee on Water and Land Chair Inouye,

My name is Sol Kahoʻohalahala, kupa 'Ä• ina o LÄ• naʻi.

I STRONGLY DISAGREE WITH AND OPPOSE SB690

The bill is ill-conceived, predicated on hearsay and does nothing to support the management of our precious natural, cultural and marine resources for our preseent and future generations. The bills intent seemingly adds to the already difficult CBSFA criteria. It creates additional burdens to the true keepers of our 'ĕ ina that will make more difficult the already meticulous and thorough vetting processes that CBSFA communities are required to demonstrate and fulfill. This bill adds more layering of responsibilities that our communities are tasked with just to insure the basic survival and sustainabilty of our food resources as practiced by our Kūpuna.

It is shameful that we place such a difficult and high bar for those who seek to care for, protect, restore, replenish, sustain and provide food for future generations, are now saddled with more requirements that do nothing to improve our resources. It apprears that seemingly well intended policy makers, who perhaps spend little time in the 'Ä• ina, mauka to makai, sit in their political towers, conceiving and legislating frivilous laws. Communities do not need more laws, they simply need working and helping hands.

Do what is right for nĕ keiki and for the future benefit of our pae 'Ä• ina, by holding SB690. It is the right thing to do.

'O wau no me ka ha'aha'a,

Sol Kahoʻohalahala



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Carrie DeCoite | Individual | Support | No |

Aloha,

I would like to start off by saying that I am in support of this bill. My name is Carrie DeCoite, and I am born and raised on the island of Molokai. I was raised and continue to raise my own family in Hoolehua within range of where there is currently a proposed CBSFA. My family and I would be directly impacted by this bill. With that said, I hope that my testimony will have a deeper impact in your decision to see it through.

I feel this bill will allow for the community members who will be directly impacted by such designation to have a voice in the matter. This bill will allow for the community who will have to ultimatley live with the decision reguarding CBSFA to be heard and feel valued.

I am happy to provide my testimony in support for a bill that will finally give a voice to the community members of Molokai and throughout the state. Mahalo for thinking of those in our community and mahalo for your time.

-Carrie DeCoite



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Manuel DeSilva- Tollefsen | Individual | Support | No |

Aloha,

My name is Manuel DeSilva-Tollefsen, and I was born and raised on the island of Molokai. I currently live in Kalae where I raise my family and am within range of where there is currently a proposed CBSFA. My family and I would be directly impacted by this bill. With that said, I hope that my testimony will have a deeper impact in your decision to see it through.

This bill will let the people directly impacted by CBSFA designations to have the final vote on the matter. It will allow us "small fish" in Molokai to have a voice concerning our community, management, and it's resources.

Again, I support this bill and most importantly, I support the community in which I raise my children to make the right choice for our aina and it's resources.

Mahalo for thinking of those in our community and mahalo for your time.

-Manuel DeSilva Tollefsen



COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

February, 2, 2021

Aloha Chair Inouye and Vice Chair Keith-Agaran and members of the committee,

My name is Russell DeCoite and I strongly support SB 690, I am born and raised on the island of Molokai and I live in Ho'olehua, Molokai where the CBSFA is being proposed I am a farmer and a rancher and used to go fishing until CBSFA came about. The only access point that Prince Kuhio had set aside for homesteaders to fish and feed our families and our kupuna.

This is a great bill it allows those that live within this ahupua'a to have a say. We don't need the CBSFA if it blocks the very community it supposed to serve, it has only caused division and fights among families, at the present it is set up for the few not the majority of the people that live here. DLNR has not been honest and have proposed community based with block out. If the community supports as this bill specifies than what is the problem for those wanting to oppose. This bill is transparent, and it should allow the voices in this community to be heard. For these reasons I strongly support SB 690.

Mahalo for your consideration!

Russell DeCoite,

Hoolehua, Molokai



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 3:53:07 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Mike Nakachi | Testifying for Moana Ohana | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Do not know why you would introduce a bill like this thay HAS NO MERIT, communities come forward to do a CBSFA with the right to Malama aina, this 50% of the community litterally kills those efforts. NO Make sense, did 50% of your constituency vote for you?

People interested in coming forward and going thru the responsible way of working with agency have done this so far... This Bill smells fishy! Not pono, let the people advocate advocate, let the people oppose oppose but this 50% idea is Stupid!







Department of Land and Natural Resources Hawaii State Aha Moku State of Hawaii Post Office Box 621 Honolulu, Hawaii 96809

> Testimony of Hawaii State Aha Moku

Before the Senate Committee Water and Land

Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00 PM

<u>Comments on Senate Bill 690</u> Relating to Fishing

Aloha Chair Inouye, and Members of the Senate Water and Land Committee,

Thank you for the opportunity to offer **comments** on Senate Bill 690. This bill conditions the designation of community-based subsistence fishing areas (CBSFA) upon approval of the affected community within 10-miles of the proposed site.

Participants in the Hawaii State Aha Moku (Aha Moku) offers comments on this measure.

Under the Hawaii State Aha Moku Process, a traditional land and ocean management system restored from the translation of oral chants of the 9th century, the Pae'Aina, or Islands of Hawai'i Nei retained the site-specific traditional practices of *lawai'a*, ocean and marine fishing methods that are unique to each place because the natural resources are unique to each place. These practices have been kept alive from ancient to current times by the empirical knowledge of the marine resources of each place that have been handed down generation to generation by indigenous native Hawaiian families of the place. In ancient times, survival was often based on subsistence fishing and gathering. In current times of Covid, the same instances apply.

The foundation of the Aha Moku is:

Malama Ke Akua (Honor God) Malama Ka 'Aina (Honor the Land) Malama Na Iwi Hanau O Ka'Aina (Honor the people born of the Land)

This foundation is critical to bringing the voices of the people of an ahupua'a forward to be integrated into government focus. It is also critical in working with the specific protocols of each island, each moku, and each ahupua'a. Each is unique and explicit in their protocols and practices. In the case of SB 690, after consulting with different islands, strong perspectives and concerns were expressed which we share with you.

The amendment to the existing Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS, §188-22.6) provides that the designation shall be approved by at least fifty percent of the residents of the affected community within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a CBSFA. Generally, native Hawaiian lawai'a and those who traditionally gather from the ocean, both near-shore and in the deeper ocean believe in and practice marine sustainability protocols that have been handed down for generations.

Before we list concerns from ahupua'a on the different islands, we would like to stress that the Kupuna Council from Moloka'i, as well as many residents of Ho'olehua adamantly support the amendments in this bill. They believe it is essential that the residents of a place be the ones who decide the fate of a CBSFA.

However, concerns expressed were:

- Fishing and gathering rights are protected constitutionally in the State of Hawaii. The designating of 50% of residents of an affected community who live within 10-miles of a proposed CBSFA is basing the success of a CBSFA on a broad residency base.
- How does one know who 50% of the residents of an affected community are? Do they have the ability and knowledge of the marine resources of a proposed CBSFA site to make proper decisions for fishing and ocean gathering rights which are constitutionally protected?"

Although we understand the needs of our small islands, we are also concerned with the needs of the larger islands. The 50% of an affected community can now hold different challenges. Today, in this time of Covid, many people from around the world are moving to Hawaii. They bring their own mandates and customs with them. And while aloha is widespread throughout the pae'aina, what would give a person who has lived in a community and place for 3 months the benefits of a community member who has lived in the same community and place for thirty generations? This bill, in our opinion, is unbalanced and does not deal with the issues facing the larger islands as we all deal with Covid, community growth, and an unbalanced economy.

The islands consulted were in consensus that Moloka'i be supported. However, there are grave concerns over how this bill, as written, will impact other ahupua'a where the generational practitioners of subsistence gathering and fishing do not, due to a number of different reasons – influx of new residents who are not from the affected area, economic reasons, and development, make up the 50% of an affected community. Without the generational knowledge, expertise and wisdom of those who intimately know the natural and cultural resources of a proposed CBSFA site, managers of the site would not be able to sustain or protect the natural or cultural resources and traditional and customary practices that have always existed there – which is the main reason that the CBSFA was created in the first place.

Thank you for the opportunity to offer comment on HB 690. We believe amendments need to be made to this bill that would be allow all ahupua'a and communities to manage CBSFA's with true community-based criteria.

Respectfully yours,

Frank Kawaikapuokalani Hewett Lehua, Founder Hawaii State Aha Moku Phone: 808-382-6043 Email: <u>kahalelehua@outlook.com</u>

Rocky Kalehiwa, Po'o, Aha Moku Advisory Committee Hawaii State Aha Moku Phone: 808-286-7955 Email: <u>rockykaluhiwa1122@gmail.com</u>

Leimana DaMate Hawaii State Aha Moku Phone: 808-640-1214 Email: Leimana.k.damate@hawaii.gov

<u>COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND</u> Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF HB496/SB690

support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omoomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omoomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

d. Caparida

Signature

February 2, 2021

Date

Phone number or email if you have an email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF HB496/SB690

I Cora Schnackenberg, support HB496/SB690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omoomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omoomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

Cora Schnackenberg Signature February 2, 2021 Date

Phone number or email if you have an email: 808 646-0051

<u>COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND</u> Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

William

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF HB496/SB690

support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omoomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omoomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

K. K. Komo February 2, 2021 Date Signature 1. 808

Phone number or email if you have an email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>Tim Emmamuel</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I am a third generation Hoolehua Homesteader and I live in the 10 mile radius of Moomomi. My wife</u> and I have 2 young sons and we frequently go to Moomomi to catch fish for dinner and if I have extra I usually drop off to my Uncle's on my way home. This is our way of life on Molokai.

I absolutely and strongly support SB 690!!!

Tim Emmanuel

February 2, 2021

Signature

Date

808-6581126

Phone number or email if you have a email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>Lovely Emmamuel</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I am a Hoolehua Homesteader. I also live in 10 miles of Moomomi. My family has always fished and camped at Moomomi. My husband, sons and now my grandsons fish and swim at Moomomi. We are blessed because Moomomi has always been our "Ice Box". We were taught how to gather and take care of our resources. With that said, I SUPPORT SB 690.</u>

Lovely Emmanuel

February 2, 2021

Signature

Date

808-658-1627

Phone number or email if you have a email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>John Emmamuel</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I am a Hoolehua Homesteader who lives in the 10 mile radius of Moomomi. I fish and provide food</u> for my family and neighbors. I strongly support SB 690.

John Emmanuel

February 2, 2021

Signature

Date

808-213-1147

Phone number or email if you have a email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>Isaiah_Emmamuel</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I am a Hoolehua Homesteader</u>. I was raised on the east end of Molokai and married a Hoolehua girl. <u>I have been a resident of Hoolehua for 40 years</u>. I have raised my 4 kids and now my grandsons that we take to Moomomi to gather fish for dinner and enjoy our family time.

I support SB 690.

Isaiah Emmanuel

February 2, 2021

Signature

Date

808-658-9792

Phone number or email if you have a email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>Barbara Sentel</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I was born on Molokai and am a Hoolehua Homesteader</u>. A lot of my childhood was spent at Moomomi. My brothers and cousins all gather fish at Moomomi. All of our birthday parties and graduation parties were supplied with fish from Moomomi and we still have enough fish for our community. Why? Because everyone was taught how to gather and respect that place.

I strongly support SB 690.

Barbara Sentel

Signature

<u>February 2, 2021</u>

Date

808-658-9934

Phone number or email if you have a email.

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I, Sherry U Sasada, support SB 690, which allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), and not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana. This is subsistence for our Ohana, which we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

I really appreciate your attention to this matter!

Mahalo,

Sherry U Sasada Email: <u>sherrysasada@gmail.com</u> Ph: (808) 213-4213 February 2, 2021

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I, Ronald M Sasada, support SB 690, which allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), and not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana. This is subsistence for our Ohana, which we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

I really appreciate your attention to this matter!

Mahalo,

February 2, 2021

Ronald M Sasada Email: rsasada@gmail.com Ph: (808) 336-1340

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>_____Rosie F Davis</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

Rosie F Davis

<u>February 2, 2021</u>

Signature

Date

COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: TIME: PLACE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 1:00P.M. Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF SB 690

I <u>Noah Freeman</u>, support SB 690, it allows only Molokai residents in the designated affected area people to have a voice on (Mo'omomi), not for those who do not live in our area.

Mo'omomi is the only public access point for Ho'olehua and Hawaiian homelands beneficiaries, to gather for our Kupuna and our Ohana, this is subsistence for our Ohana, we continue to pass onto to our children through our generational education, on how to gather, respect the ocean, our tradition, values, and our old ways.

Please support this SB 690 to continue to provide for my Ohana.

<u>I am a Hoolehua Homestead farmer and live in the 10 mile radius of Moomomi. My childhood was</u> <u>spent at Moomomi. My cousin and nephews is teaching my sons how to gather at Moomomi. We are</u> <u>truly blessed to have Moomomi in our backyard. This is how its done on Molokai, you teach the next</u> <u>generation how to gather and respect the place so our "Ice Box" will always be full for the community.</u>

I strongly support SB 690.

Noah Freeman

Signature

Date

February 2, 2021

808-213-1519

Phone number or email if you have a email.



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 6:42:55 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|-----------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| JODEAN KM AKAKA | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

I live in Hoolehua Molokai. I support SB690!



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/2/2021 8:40:32 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|-------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Beatrice Sproat- Augustiro | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

I support this bill because I feel that the people who are directly affected is the ones who should have the say. The 10 mile radius may need to be changed because not all people who depend on the area for fishing live within that radius. It also affects other islands. I speak only for the island of Molokai. I opposed the CBSFA at Mo'omomi. Most of the opposition came from the area. Majority of those who were in support of it was from other islands. So I can see how a bill like this could help for Moomomi CBSFA. For now I am in support of this.



COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND

Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Gilbert S.C. Keith-Agaran, Vice Chair

AMENDED NOTICE OF HEARING

DATE: Wednesday, February 3, 2021 TIME: 1:00P.M. PLACE: Conference Room 229

TESTIMONY IN SUPPORT OF HB545

Gene Ross Davis, **support HB545**, to have Department of Hawaiian Home Lands to digitize its applicant, beneficiary, and lessee records and create a usable digital database no later than 7/1/2022.

Please support this HB 545 to digitize the lessee records.

_Gene Ross Davis_____

_February 2, 2021_____

Signature

Date


Davianna Pōmaika'i McGregor Lot 46 Pu'ukapele St. P.O. Box 48 Ho'olehua, Hawai'i 96729

February 3, 2021

Testimony Before the Senate Committee on Water and Land IN OPPOSITION to SB 690 Wednesday, February 3, 2021, 1:00pm, Room 229

Aloha Chair Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land.

My name is Davianna Pōmaika'i McGregor. I am also a professor of Ethnic Studies at the University of Hawai'i, Mānoa and Director of the Center for Oral History now teaching and working on line from my home in the Ho'olehua Hawaiian Homestead on Moloka'i.

I am testifying in opposition to SB 690 Relating to Fishing because it opposes the intent and would destroy the spirit of community-based fishing areas which were established in HRS 188-22.6 "for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture and religion."

It was our Ho'olehua Hawaiian Homestead community, that designed the Community-Based Subsistence Management Area category of marine management and worked with then Governor John Waihe'e and the legislature to establish the designation in the law.

In 1993 Governor John Waihe'e appointed the Governor's Moloka'i Subsistence Task force which met with Moloka'i communities about the health of Moloka'i's resources for subsistence hunting, fishing, gathering and farming. I was one of the UH researchers, with Jon Matsuoka of the School of Social Work and Luciano Minerbi of the Department of Urban and Regional Planning that conducted the focus groups, community meetings and an islandwide survey. The Kupuna observed that the fish were not as big or plentiful as when they grew up. They said we need to manage our nearshore ocean in the Hawaiian pono way. Stop the commercial sale and reserve our "icebox" for subsistence only.

As we know, the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) manages and enforces rules for the ocean from the high water mark out to three miles. The Ho'olehua Homestead community aspires to co-manage the ocean from 'lli'o Point to Nihoa and out one mile in partnership with the DLNR. Most DLNR fishery management areas are no-take zones, but subsistence fishing and gathering needs to continue along the northwest coast of Moloka'i. So, this is why our Ho'olehua homesteaders came up with a NEW kind of management area – a Community-Based Subsistence Fishing Area (CBSFA) which would utilize traditional Native Hawaiian conservation customs and practices to achieve a sustainable yield, while still being allowed to fish for subsistence purposes "for the purpose of reaffirming and protecting fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture and religion."

I provide this background information as the basis for my opposition to SB 690. The bill would require at least 50% approval of the residents of the affected community. And it defines "affected community" as within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a CBSFA. These definitions are inappropriate for the purposes of the law.

These are concerns that I have:

• Matters relating to subsistence fishing and gathering are the kuleana of those who engage in subsistence fishing and gathering, but is it the kuleana of all the residents of a selected area?

• Not all stakeholders in an area are necessarily residents of the surrounding community. For example, commercial fishers from O'ahu have continuously asserted their concerns about the rules proposed for the Mo'omomi Northwest Coast of Moloka'i.

• Would newcomers have the same basis to participate in an approval process as those whose families have been fishing and gathering, monitoring and caring for the marine resources for generations?

• Are the residents inclusive of all ages? Or just those who are qualified to be voters?

• Who would be responsible for conducting the 50% approval of the residents? Would it be the DLNR? If so, will this bill include funding for the conduct of such an initiative? And if the community is expected to conduct the process, this would place an undue burden on the Native Hawaiian families who are reliant upon subsistence fishing and gathering and thereby seeking this designation. The process of determining 50% approval of the "residents" needs to be explained and funding needs to be provided.

• Why amend the state law to include arbitrary definitions of community? Identifying the community and stakeholders and including them in the process of developing the proposal is already built into the DLNR process to apply for a CBSFA designation.

• As appropriate, the original law was silent on the definition of community to avoid a one size fits all definition that does not take into account the unique geography, connections, needs and practices ahupua'a to ahupua'a and moku to moku. The CBSFA application process requires the description of the community and more importantly each of the stakeholder and their needs. Each community is defined according to the ahupua'a and moku boundaries as evolved over time through practice and custom. It is not bound or defined by 10 miles. It is not limited to curren residents, but inclusive of 'ohana who were born and raised there, whether they still live there or elsewhere. And what does 10 miles mean? Is it a10 mile radius? 10 miles mauka? 10 miles makai? 10 square miles?

I would like to close with this reminder from D. Kanewanui in the introduction to Ka 'Oihana Lawai'a by Kahaulelio which was quoted in the proposal and management plan:

"He kakaikahi loa paha ka poe e lawaia nei i keia mau la i lawa maoli ma keia oihana, a he mea minamina loa hoi ia na makou ka nalo aku o keia ike i huli ia me ka hoomanawanui e na kupuna o kakou."

– D. Kanewanui, Introduction, Ka 'Oihana Lawai'a (Kahaulelio, 2005)

Rare indeed today are those people that are fishing who are truly expert in this field, and it would [be] very regrettable to us if this knowledge, so patiently acquired by our ancestors, should be lost.

Let us not uplift rather than undermine the spirit of the CBSFA designated areas.

Mahalo and Aloha



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|------------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Noa Emmett Aluli | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

Aloha Chair Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land. I am Noa Emmett Aluli, a physician in family practice on Moloka'i and resident of the Ho'olehua Hawaiian Homestead.

I have supported the CBSFA designation for the Northwest Coast of Moloka'i from 'īli'o to Nihoa for the past 25+ years. We have had several community meetings and consultations with input from thousands over the years. Our kupuna in 1993-94 when we first worked with the legislature to establish the CBSFA for the first time were clear, reserve the nearshore for subsistence. Protect our "icebox" from commercial take.

As a physician on Moloka'i, I have conducted traditional diet studies which prove that a diet of fish and marine life with traditional Ä• ina foods (uala, kalo, 'ulu) is key to reducing Native Hawaiian risk factors for diabetes and cardiovascular disease. This is why the CBSFA designation for the Northwest Coast of Moloka'i is critical for our Ho'olehua homestead families, where I live.

SB 690 is designed to undermine the CBSFA process for the Northwest Coast of Moloka'i. The definition of community is arbitrary and is not rooted in the traditional and customary practices that the CBSFA law was created to uphold. The approval of 50% of the residents threshold is vague and would place an unnecessary burden on the community of subsisence fishers and gatherers who are seeking the designation because they rely on the marine resources for the well-being of their families.

With respect, I ask that your committee please hold this bill.

mahalo and aloha,

Noa Emmett Aluli



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2021 11:30:12 AM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Ronald Tam | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

I support SB690. Recommend "resident" be defined; e.g., minimum age requirement and minimum time of residency. Mahalo.



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Walter Ritte | Individual | Oppose | No |

Comments:

I am in strong opposition to this bill.

I am in agreement with the written testimony from the Office of Hawaiian affairs in opposition to this bill.



| SB690 | | | | | |
|---------------------------|--|--|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| Submitted on: 2/3/2020 | Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM | Submitted By/Organization Testifier: Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association | Position: "Support Intent Only" | Present at Hearing: No | Individual: Desiree U'ilani Kiaha |

Aloha my name is Desiree U'ilani Kiaha. With the many voices that have been silenced as I have time and time again expressed my passionate commitment to advocate for Native Hawaiian gathering rights at community meetings, state meetings, county level meetings, other meetings, run by different departments and organizations in support and in opposition to Mo`omomi CBSFA. I support and stand with the Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association's position of opposition to current Mo`omomi CBSFA. That being said, <u>I strongly support the intent of SB690 with recommendations to</u> <u>reword and clarify this bill, in order to protect the intent and protect our</u> <u>resources and our Hawaiian rights</u>.

I support the bill's intent for the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) "may" designate a community-based subsistence fishing area "only if approved" by the "residents of the affected community". Obtaining approval from the "affected community" is vital and any major decisions affecting these aforementioned communities should not pass through without discussion and approval from Native Hawaiians in those communities. Giving guidelines to DLNR helps to protect resources in Hawai'i and the rights of Native Hawaiians. Allowing the community to discuss, plan, and make decisions, especially decisions that will affect the way of life or the environment in which they live and rely on it's resources to sustain.

Recommendations include

- 1) The wording for "by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community" should reflect the word "majority" and should reflect 75% not 50%. Also please note that 50% would not be a majority it would be half, which can present a problem.
 - a) Concerns surrounding this wording would have a major

- b) Affects most communities and affects their way of life or their environment.
- 2) The wording for "residents" should say Native Hawaiian
- 3) The wording for "of the affected community" should not read "within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a community-based subsistence fishing area," it should reflect the island of which it would be affecting (i.e. Mo'omomi area should be Moloka'i Island as the community) or referred to by it's Hawaiian words including Moku and/or ahupua'a
 - a) For example: Moloka'i's current CBSFA for Mo'omomi had numbers showing the majority of Moloka'i island is in opposition of CBSFA, but because the hearing was open to the entire state it showed more people in count for support. Refer to attached count from previous DLNR testimonial count in 2020 **Appendix A (pg. 3-8)**

b) A Sign petition opposing CBSFA change.org. Appendix B Due to the late notice and other factors (i.e. access,electronic access, due to internet issues and awareness of this bill, ect.)

I also believe that this bill needs to be brought before each island and it's "affected communities" to be discussed as it affects many native Hawaiian families who rely on the resources, such as Moloka'i who only have a few grocery stores and rely on shipping and barge to stock their goods. This means that residents sustain themselves through the resources on the land and in the ocean.

I strongly support the intent and ask to make the corrections necessary for this bill to hold DLNR accountable to the process of a majority of 75% or more community (or ahupua'a) approval for any areas they are requesting to do a CBSFA.

Mahalo for the opportunity to submit testimony. Na'u me ka ha'aha'a, D. U'ilani Kiaha

Appendix A (pg. 3-8)

Mo`omomi Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area: Testimony Compilation and Summary

Prepared by the Division of Aquatic Resources

| Total Testimony | 949 (+650*) |
|------------------|------------------|
| Total Support | <mark>561</mark> |
| Molokai Support | 190 |
| Hoolehua Support | <mark>66</mark> |
| Total Oppose | 388 (+650*) |
| Molokai Oppose | 280 |
| Hoolehua Oppose | 109 |

 650 individuals signed an online petition distributed through social media therefore it's been separated from the standard testimony we received.

Testimony in Support:

The Division of Aquatic Resources (DAR) received over 150 individual testimonies that indicated their support based was on the following two reasons:

- 1. Intent to limit commercial fishing and activities
- 2. Give communities the ability to co-manage their areas

General comments/concerns from individual testimony in support:

Traditional management/Community Based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFA) have worked Protection for sustainable fishing and gathering for subsistence

Mitigate decline in resources

Regulations proposed are reasonable

The local community knows best

Need balanced use of the area

Extent of time and effort invested into this proposal (27 years)

"Need to put back not just take"

DAR received testimony in support from the Office of Hawaiian affairs, as well as their Molokai Representative Collette Machado. DAR also received support from Molokai County Council Representative Keani Rawlins.

Dr. Alan Friedlander provided testimony explaining nearshore fish populations and their associated fisheries have declined dramatically around Hawai'i over the past hundred years due to: an increase in the human population; destruction of habitat; introduction of new and unsustainable fishing techniques; and <u>the loss of traditional conservation practices</u>. Dr. Friedlander believes that based on his experience in Hawai'i that locally managed marine areas are highly effective in conserving fisheries resources and more effective than many state managed areas.

Dr. Rob Toonen found that communities following traditional Native Hawaiian practices have the highest harvest rates and densities of limpet stocks, along with a positive population growth. In comparison, areas managed under state rules consistently have the lowest densities and show continued population decline. His results show that where communities remember and follow traditional management practices, those practices simultaneously enable harvest and increase the abundance of natural resources. Dr. Tonnen also found very limited exchange of populations of reef animals between the north, south, east and west-facing shores of Moloka'i. These populations include: corals; 'opihi; lobsters; uhu; moi; kumu; and kole. This supports the need for Mo`omomi to protect its own resources, because Mo`omomi replenishes itself. Subsistence Fishers and Cultural Practitioners provided testimony explaining how proposed rules would not inhibit their Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights, and instead the rules would help to ensure the ability to sustainably gather for subsistence in the future. Community members provided testimony in regards, to kapu (regulations) and how these regulations are reasonable for contemporary times, as the kapu were reasonable in traditional times.

The previous DAR biologist on Molokai also provided testimony that the 1994 demonstration project clearly illuminated the benefits of such a community-based management scheme. The biologist also mentioned the proposal doesn't exclude but asks to comply with long standing customary fishing practices and this proposal is codifying these practices. This is a reasonable approach to appropriate management of marine resources.

Testimony in support also mentioned "Commercial harvest was not a gathering right. Traditional gathering requires it be done in a manner that allows for resource regeneration, which is exactly what this proposal does. Subsistence is a necessity it's survival and ensuring these needs are met, is a focal point abundantly evident throughout this proposal. You're still allowed to take a managed amount of the five threatened species, and there are numerous other species with plentiful populations available to harvest such as enenue, manini, palani, kala, weke, aholehole. This ensures the gathering from a diverse range of species is always available to feed families big and small."

Testimony in support provided instances of how the plan was changed to accommodate comments from opposition, and that while there is opposition, there is no proposed alternative. Community members with opposing views have been invited to join beach clean-ups and community monitoring efforts. Testifiers also mentioned the need for additional meetings and outreach to clarify any misinformation in regard to the proposed regulations.

Testimony in Opposition:

DAR received testimony from over 200 individuals in opposition to the proposal, as well as a Facebook petition with over 650 signatures (received on 8/28). Opposition testimony was based primarily on the following three concerns:

1. The proposal is not community based, because it does not accurately represent the desire of the community, the entire community does

not fully support the proposal

- 2. The proposal will take away Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights
- 3. The resources are not depleted and DLNR should instead focus on the

invasive species of the area General comments/concerns from individual

testimony in opposition:

Too much division in the community and families

Restricting Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights

Only Molokai voices should count (no outside opinions)

The resources are not depleted

The process was unfair, discriminatory, and excluded people

Family connection to Mo`omomi

There was a lack of outreach

There was a small group of people making decisions and driving the process

The proposal offered no protection of resources from outer island fishing

This was a money driven process

Lack of enforcement of proposed rules

Invasive species are depleting and displacing native species

DLNR needs to heal not hurt the community (if resources are good we have time to heal)

Public hearing set up/zoom platform is not an ideal option

DLNR fault - not monitoring process, DLNR continually fails

Testimony was offered indicating that DAR, in proposing a prohibition on SCUBA spearfishing, failed to take into account the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). The testimony was informed by legal counsel who advised "DAR has failed to observe a respiratory condition is an enumerated condition under the ADA". If the proposed rules are accepted, "there would be many divers who have some form of lung disease of lung capacity issue, whom would no longer be allowed to scuba dive as was previously allowed in the areas". A simple and little cost fix would be to allow Scuba spearfishing and prevent a multimillion dollar litigation or lawsuit.

There was also testimony in opposition regarding the take of female uhu's with the argument that the proposed regulation is opposite of the lobster/crustacean rules, the females are the eggs and only takes one male to fertilize the eggs.

There was testimony in opposition from a retired DAR Biologist who stated "it was the Legislature's intent to minimize these community conflicts, while at the same time, being keenly aware of the risks of the proliferation of areas that may become established by: 1) requiring that broad community discussions be built into the process; 2) providing that all existing uses would be accommodated, including commercial uses within the areas; and 3) creating a very complex process that stressed community participation when establishing CBSFA" "DAR received reports of intimidations and threats. during the pilot project, but did not have the resources to directly deal with this problem. To be clear, these threats were not focused only on commercial users but on outsiders and even Moloka'i residents that were viewed as not respecting the area. Because the process was so difficult, the founding members naturally become passionately involved in the area and continued to be very protective of the area long after it sunset. The testifier concluded these conflicts over the ocean resources are social, rather than biological issues. It's more a question of who gets to use the resource and less about how much resources there are. When the State uses its legal authority to resolve these conflicts, it needs to ensure that equal treatment under the law is followed."

There was also testimony in opposition regarding the culpability of the State. "Culpability is based specifically on the *State's decision – to knowingly create a substantial and unjustifiable risk* for boaters and fishermen, by inadvertently and consequently creating a situation for even more vigilantism and Civil Rights violations to occur." A previous response provided to the testifier indicated that the State cannot be held liable for an individual's actions. But the testifier believes "that argument did not hold up for McDonald's when an individual spilled hot coffee in their lap. Education that coffee is hot and can burn you did not negate the culpability of McDonald's negligence."

DAR received testimony regarding a legislative signed Standing Committee Report No. 2695 which amended Bill No.3446. The report also emphasized "that the pilot project should not be expanded or made permanent until a careful evaluation is reported to the legislature". The testifier claims the current Mo`omomi management plan and process is invalid since the ability to recreate the CBSFA expired on July 1, 1997 and that the DLNR has never reported to the Legislature why the Mo`omomi Pilot Project should be expanded or made permanent after the July 1, 1997 sunset date.

The Department of Hawaiian Homelands (DHHL) testified that they have heard from an equal number of people in support and in opposition, and while both have a strong desire to protect the resources, there is no consensus on a path forward. "Another concern is over access to the shoreline, particularly vehicular access. DHHL feels this is an important consideration given the only publicly available road to the northern coastline of Molokai that ends at Mo`omomi beach, a relatively safe shoreline access point, crosses DHHL lands." DHHL has "requested DLNR postpone its rulemaking for Mo`omomi, at least until DHHL has had a chance to develop its Mo`omomi-Anahaki Special Area Plan that may highlight the concerns beneficiaries have regarding access to the proposed CBSFA area and possible community-based solutions."



Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association

| Recipient: | William Aila, Hawaii State Senate, Hawaii State House, Community Based Subsistent Fishing Area |
|------------|---|
| Letter: | Greetings, |
| | Oppose Current Moloka'i Community Base Subsistence Fishing Area (CBSFA). |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Robert Gerard | Aiea, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Michelle Duadua Gonsalves | Pahoa, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Caitlin Kaahanui-Kuala | 96732, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Eddie Reyes | Sacramento, CA | 2020-03-04 |
| Susan J Caberto | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Joliette Keanini | Waipahu, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Laura Gomes | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Latai Soakai | Waialua, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Pedro Venenciano | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| pablo bobe | Argentina | 2020-03-05 |
| Roselani Low | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| KAPUALANIWAIOLA EGAMI | Yakima, WA | 2020-03-05 |
| Kawehilanionapua Rafael-Waialae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Georgeanna Maliu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Lynette e Waialae | Pico Rivera, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Cyra Kalama | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Joseph Wong | Kurtistown, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Britney Hopeau | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Malina Bergau | Pahoa, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Reynold Tamayei | Mililani, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Linda Oducado | Pāhoa, HI | 2020-03-06 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------------------|----------------|------------|
| nainoa semitara-macadangdang | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-19 |
| Diamond Corpuz | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nathan Horner | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sam Kahuhu | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Paula Miranda-Kahue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Elgin Meyer | Hoolehua, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Karlie Martin-Galam | kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Maui Melekiola | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaelynn Day | Hana, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| McKenzie Dudoit | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaylee Rabara | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Daniel Espino | San Jose, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Lanre Kekoa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sabrina Duvauchelle | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Samantha Albino | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nadine Paleka kalua | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Brad Kahana | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Keahilani Hirakawa | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| shampayne kaai | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tobie Blair | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-19 |
| Eddie Harrell | Pearl city, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Rosie Han-Garana | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Dakota Schaefer | Tempe, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Gordon Francisco | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Sudeshna Ghosh | Calcutta, India | 2020-03-03 |
| Eleanor Wong | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Cynthia Gutierres | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Ashley Lapinid-Kamaka | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Doreen Kekino | Federal Way, WA | 2020-03-03 |
| Pearl Sanchez | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Jazmine Tauiliili | Seattle, WA | 2020-03-03 |
| Kim Reyes | Montclair, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Fatema Ahmed | New York, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Prashanthi Kukkadapu | Richland, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Jade Scharnikow | Piscataway, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Lanakila Rita | Yakima, WA | 2020-03-04 |
| Sarah Graham | San Antonio, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Jason Pearson | Littleton, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Michael Clark | Portland, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Rosalee 🛿 Robbins | Brockton, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Alejandro Palacios | Everett, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Deborah Newberry | North Tonawanda, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Marky Yolwa | Honolulu, US | 2020-03-04 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Carrie Gleason | Littleton, CO | 2020-03-02 |
| Solene Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Tori Maliu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Deanna Keanini | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Robert Okuda | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Keoki Baily | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Amy Tavares | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rachel Kapu | Honolulu, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Bradley Nishihira-Aki | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Rozlynn Phillips | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Elizabeth Sinding | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Karleen Kuahuia | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Elae Kapu | Southport, NC | 2020-03-03 |
| marcie kaai | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Justin Savedra | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Lucita Joy Kaupu | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Ariel Graham | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Kasey Calep | Pico Rivera, CA | 2020-03-03 |
| Jarid Pangelinan | Yigo, Guam | 2020-03-03 |
| Bridget Davis | Jonesboro, AR | 2020-03-03 |
| Tristian Bishaw | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| austin ward | Albany, OR | 2020-03-03 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Gyson Aalona | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mahie Almony | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Donalei Cavanaugh | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Taylor Andrade | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Jumar Rodolfo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Brian McOuat | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Talisa Keohuloa | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Heather Place | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Fatabull Gaspar | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Liezl Rodolfo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Maverick Miyagi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Tasha Seefeldt | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Fetu'u Tilini-Monroe | Kealekekua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kahealani Ahquin | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sherri Rufino | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Miles Cabanting | Los Angeles, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Verna Takashima | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shyleen Inouye | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Cory-Lynn Balbas | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Amber Kaholoa'a | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Helene Kaauwai | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaelan Kaneakua | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| Susana Muñoz | Madrid, Spain | 2020-03-02 |
| Cora Schnackenberg | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Laurie Bishaw | US | 2020-03-02 |
| Dee Fiso | Salt Lake City, UT | 2020-03-02 |
| Emmitt Kamaka | Nanakuli, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Kamamalu Nishihira-Asuncion | Alexandria, LA | 2020-03-02 |
| Darlene Steele | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paitaka Miyahira | Makawao, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Tina Slovak | Wichita, KS | 2020-03-02 |
| Chris Zuluaga | Providence, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Stewart Mahiai | Stafford, VA | 2020-03-02 |
| JIMMY LUNSFORD | Memphis, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Cherie Fry | US | 2020-03-02 |
| Calvin Souza | Federal Way, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Jessica Paknik | Beverly, WV | 2020-03-02 |
| Keone Coloma | Princeville, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Diana Gaspar | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Burl Hirashima | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Shannon Puaoi-Navas | Bellevue, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Dale Wallace Kneece | Westmoreland, TN | 2020-03-02 |
| troy takahashi | Waianae, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| David Yokoyama | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------|----------------|------------|
| Kamiki Agliam | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Danielle Rivera | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Gabrielle Park | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Arlene Andrade | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mahailia Rapanot | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lesley Escobar | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lorraine Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Micah Ayau | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Crystal Puaoi-Kawai | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Dustin Maliu | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Nicole Endo | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Maka Arcangel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Dina Diane Maliu | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Jaide Kiaha | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Bronson Kapehe | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| JOCELYN COLLIER | Long Beach, CA | 2020-08-18 |
| Daven Dudoit | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lace Mokiao | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kawena Puhi | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Robin Traxler | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Claudelle Kapuni | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kullen Apostol | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Fangailupe Uluave | Pearl City, US | 2020-08-18 |
| semone morand | dallas, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Lily Grodzins | Cambridge, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Maddie Gilbert | Red Oak, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Tyler Arrowsmith | Alexandria, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Christopher Kamelamela | Sparks, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Diko Bates | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kyli Joe Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kaniala Adolpho | Lake Wales, FL | 2020-08-18 |
| Delvarie Calairo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ku'uleimaile Duvauchelle | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Aimee Shinsato | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Tiare Bermudez | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Leilani Ahina | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ariah Hirashima | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Vincente Venenciano | Henderson, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Eloise Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ale'a Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| May Andrade | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kasidy Lani-Kaakimaka | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Roycee Calairo | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Malia Nishihira | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-----------------------|------------|
| Paitaka REIS MAWAE | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Chanda Green | Victorville, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Nate Napierala | Sausalito, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Deion Wallace | Farmington, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Gloria Ponce | Fort Walton Beach, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Eva Haykin | US | 2020-08-18 |
| Brett Waipa | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kyli Joe Mawae | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Alexis Hardy | Camarillo, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Kahaili Tovey | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| April Augustiro | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| kapua lee | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Hepuakea Falealii | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Nohea Deponte | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Deto McDonald | Copperas Cove, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Talia Ybarbo | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mike Kanada | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Sheryl Miller | Westerville, US | 2020-08-18 |
| 퓦풶퓃표푒 #푒푒 | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Travis mollena | Mesa, AZ | 2020-08-18 |
| Ariel Dougherty | New Cumberland, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Rommel Lachapelle | Stamford, US | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-------------------|------------|
| JODEAN AKAKA | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Donald Dudoit III | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Nolan Crabbe | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-16 |
| Moses Kealamakia | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Chad Place | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Fiataupou Levi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Aidan Han | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Jeffrey Ling | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Carmen Kitashima | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-17 |
| Rae Chong | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| trisha kahoalii | maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lorelei Base | Phoenix, AZ | 2020-08-18 |
| Eurshawn Julien | Calumet City, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Pualalea Barrows | American Fork, UT | 2020-08-18 |
| alexandria agustin | waipahu, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Wyatt Stanley | US | 2020-08-18 |
| Jazmyn Johnson | Auburn, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Aidan stein | Charlotte, NC | 2020-08-18 |
| Dorothy Souza | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Adam Guzman | Corona, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Manu Mendoza | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Gabriela Zuniga | Hutchinson, US | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Kimo Kaiama | Hoolehua, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Beatrice Sproat-Augustiro | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Franklin Augustiro | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Kawai Keaulana | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Elgin Reyes | Puyallup, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Faith Horner | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jessica Akaka | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Layson Hoewaa | Wailuku, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Joey Aruda | Waimanalo, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Sherry Sasada | Kualapuu, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Kamaehu Kawaa | Maui, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Momi Medēros | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Andrew Gomes | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jeremy Bush | kunia, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| David Gomes | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Dustin Bishaw | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paul Tovey | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jerome Nojima | Greenville, NC | 2020-03-02 |
| Keano-Kawaiola Pascua-Kahookano | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ardis Farris | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rebecca Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| Amanda Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Kevin Kamaile | Keaau, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Antonio Valiengo | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| lono koholua iii | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Patricia Sagario | HOOLEHUA, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Precious Medeiros | Kapaau, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Courtney Lawelawe | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Rose Tanner | HONOLULU, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Kuuipo Kanawaliwali | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Sherry Yagin | Kahului, maui, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Malia Waits | Pass Christian, MS | 2020-08-15 |
| Caroline Kaholoaa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Kalani'opu'u Johnston Sr | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-08-15 |
| Patrick Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Shirley Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Tad Makaila | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Stan Curtis Nuuhiwa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Stuart Suemoto | US | 2020-08-15 |
| Shailyn Kaholoaa | Waldorf, MD | 2020-08-15 |
| Lyenne Hoewaa | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Sam Kanahele | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Davelyn Hoewaa | Wailuku, US | 2020-08-16 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|-----------------------------|------------|
| Chayce Solchaga | San Francisco, CA | 2020-03-06 |
| Mahealani Alcon | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-07 |
| Lori Ann Pastrana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-07 |
| Jennah palu | fair oaks, CA | 2020-03-08 |
| Napua Kekahuna | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-10 |
| Larriley Rawlins | Hawai'i, US | 2020-03-11 |
| Sharolynn Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-12 |
| Christine Rawlins | kaunakakai, US | 2020-03-13 |
| Michelle Stanley | Waianae, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Kekaiomalu Adachi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Shonni Kaulili | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Cicinia Kalilikane | P.O.Box 1366 Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Stephanie Ugoji | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-03-15 |
| Pennie Hare | West Falmouth, US | 2020-03-20 |
| JarraeTehani Manasas | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-04-03 |
| Tate Anderson | Orem, UT | 2020-07-04 |
| Tara Rojas | 'Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-07 |
| Gwen Morinaga-Kama | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-07 |
| Robin Keohuloa | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-08 |
| Meleana Enoka | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-10 |
| Maryann Tamoria | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-12 |
| Jolambereen Vendiola | Portland, OR | 2020-08-13 |

Signatures

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Desiree U'ilani Kiaha | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ceriann Espiritu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Stephen and Katherine Misawa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Lena Swan | Monticello, NY | 2020-03-02 |
| Kaulanarose Hoewa'a | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ryan Dugger | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rethysia Horner | South Lyon, MI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paulie Jean Paleka-Ku | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Shenandoah Kaiama | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Genessa Puaoi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Dorothy Alo Souza | Kamuela, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Travis Ota | Kala'e, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Irene Kaahanui | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Melody Alcon | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Hi'ilei Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ivory Espaniola | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Godfrey Akaka III | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Cherie Kiaha | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Joseph Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Katherine Fujimori | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Zelda Kalilikane | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Darlene Makaiwi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joy Poaha | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Lee Arcangel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kai Magdirila | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| June Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| jesseca oswald | Kaunakakai,HI, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Teyani Domingo | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Palani Simon | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Levi Kaakau | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiffany Kaaihue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kirk Kamakani Kiaha | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Becky French | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Dante Batiste | Puyallup, WA | 2020-08-19 |
| Elkan Bishaw-Lopez | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Orva M Gullett | Marion, US | 2020-08-19 |
| arian regino | Leonardtown, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Madison Swartz | Pottsville, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Wayne Davis | New Orleans, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Kim Violanti | Perrysburg, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Lili Boud | Farmington, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Vanessa Casas | Westlake village, US | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Wendy morgan | Brooklyn, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Elisheva Marga | Novi, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Maria Rozens | Westerville, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Carly Walsh | Cleveland, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Janie Lucas | San Francisco, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Genevieve Pickard | Los Angeles, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Hannah Slater | West Grove, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Hana w | Tenino, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Joann Mawae | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| carla garcia | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Dustin Calaustro | Waipahu, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Claude kapuni | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kaenaokala Sproat-Albino-Aki | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Emma Parker | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kaleinani Furtado | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Keoki pupuhi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiera-Lee Bishaw Marquez | Honoluluo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Natalia Kami | Colorado Springs, CO | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiana Levi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ryan King | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joy Stevens | Nampa, ID | 2020-08-19 |
| Keani Rivera | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Isaac Swain | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Oli Cooper | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Ivy Kami | Colorado Springs, CO | 2020-08-19 |
| Israel Kali | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Desiree Dwiggins | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Esther Torres-Umi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Diana Park | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kanoe Stone | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shauna Pule-Kaahanui | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kehau Martinson | Kane'ohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Stacia Demello | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kelcyn Balbas | Kamuela, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Pomaika'i Nakamoto | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Wendell DeCoito Jr | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Macey Harris | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tammie Mokiao-Atimalala | US | 2020-08-19 |
| Daisha kama | Los Angeles, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Cherish Puaoi Kalilikane | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kiona English | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ashlynn Hokoana | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-19 |
| Tom Holloman | Charlestown, IN | 2020-08-19 |
| Dana Bleckinger | Portland, OR | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Jasmine Mawae-Lee | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joseph Mawae III | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nanea Manangan | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kruz Soloria | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nohealani Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ryana Emmanuel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Luana lynn Agliam | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sunny Arashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shannon Pastrana | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Natasha Ariyoshi | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sheldine Poaipuni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| тс | Kaneohe, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Wailea Nishimoto-Kahokuloa | Kilauea, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Thaddeus Albino | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Mariah Dudoit | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kawika Kaupu | Norwalk, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Heavenly Brown | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ku'u Toledo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Mariah Traxler | KAUNAKAKAI, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Bailey Arashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kobe Lynn | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kiani Ocampo | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Tinum Pung | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kanani M Mawae-Idemoto | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nacha Enesa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Josiah Kunipo | Waianae, US | 2020-08-20 |
| sydney rawlins | kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Salina Reyes | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kehau Kahookano | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Cole Nagamine | Ewa beach, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lambert Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Natalie Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Felicity Pastrana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Justyn Takata | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Storm Wilson | Kailua, US | 2020-08-20 |
| Ryan Sproat | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jonathan Koma | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Brandon Phelps | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Pua Miller | South Lyon, MI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jamie Logan | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Janley Purdy | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Chris Vincent | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Autumn Dowling | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dayson Gomes | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|----------------|------------|
| Shea Miyashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Peter Schellhorn | Glenview, IL | 2020-08-20 |
| Kauluna'e Hamakua | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Fera Davis | Portland, OR | 2020-08-20 |
| Tehani Napoleon-Pico | Hilo, US | 2020-08-20 |
| Daylia Tangonan | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Maccyn Samisoni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sasha Ah Loy | Portland, OR | 2020-08-20 |
| Lehua Patnaude | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kahealani Gomes | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Hokuao Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Michael Hikalea | Kula Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Benjimin Lin Kee | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sheldon Rabanes | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Alisha Puaa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Madison Davis | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lisa Kahihikolo | Waimanalo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Rena Leeber | Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Mirai Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Misa Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Judith Rod | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sierra Kanoa | Mililani, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Hanae Yakura | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Penny King | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Maile Puaoi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jp Leeber | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Travis Landford | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Aisha Senas-Childs | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| keawe alapai | keauhou, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lehua Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dann Shinmoto | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jill Piunti | Homewood, IL | 2020-08-20 |
| Alia-Marie Gomes-Madela | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nate Embrey | Bountiful, UT | 2020-08-20 |
| Maihilahila Horswill | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| joanna makekau | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Meleanna Kanawaliwali | Phoenix, AZ | 2020-08-20 |
| Ruby Ranoa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Keaka Kamakana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| brian mimm | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Valerie Brown | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dara Makaiwi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Faith Tuipulotu | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dukey Dudoit | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Name | Location | Date | |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|------------|--|
| Breighton Kitterman | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Tyler Wilcox | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Luke Alcon | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Jayce Chun | Mililani, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Rodney Kahao | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Lahela Kanahele castillo | Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Sade Kahue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Jordyn Paa | Haiku, US | 2020-08-20 | |
| Alia Keohuloa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Moeaki Finau | Auckland, New Zealand | 2020-08-20 | |
| Kalena Dougher | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Isley Pu-Akima | Hana, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Alika Balbas | Hawai'i, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Karley Phillips | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Roilyn Tancayo | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Olivia Louis-Charles | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Amanda Solomon | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| kyle nishioka | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Jessie Keanini | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Joesph Kaiwi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Chelsea Kapuni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 | |
| Cassie Ellis | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 | |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Alexandra Gallegos | Tacoma, WA | 2020-08-20 |
| Cole-Austin Castillo | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nick Reeves | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Justin Landford | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-08-20 |
| James Vinano | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dolly Mawae | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-20 |
| genesis gomez-kahookano | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Athalya-Paige Sunio | Lanai City, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Brandi-Lee Medeiros | Lanai City, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Alaijah Pastrana | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sheryl Rawlins-s-LenWai | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Bobby Low | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Bronson Kalipi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Carla Costa | Ocean Park, WA | 2020-08-21 |
| alicia rincon | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Wailani mollena | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kealohi Holt | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Noelani Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Zelinda Jose | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Davelyn Kainoayap | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Shaina Kalilikane | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Chanel Shimada | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|-------------------|------------|
| Ame Hall | US | 2020-08-21 |
| Reginald Eiland jr | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Khristie Tabora | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Jay N Linda Horie | US | 2020-08-21 |
| Alaka'i Iaea-Russell | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Mackenzie Plunkett | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Samuel Makekau | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Lea Iaea | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Moeata Santos | Haiku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| amber haumealani burdett | San Francisco, US | 2020-08-21 |
| Kaye-Lee Reeves-Iaea | Anchorage, AK | 2020-08-21 |
| Gene Ross Davis Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Alicia Kauwalu | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Ashlynn Kaulili | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sharon Stratton | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Debra Posey | Marysville, WA | 2020-08-21 |
| Elijah Poaha | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| LEE MCGURN Asato | Torrance, CA | 2020-08-21 |
| Audra McDonnell | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| James Kahana | Hauula, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Lee Ann Kalani | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Jonathan Kaahanui | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------------|-------------------|------------|
| Harilyn Wong | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Elisa Peson | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Shannon Kaahanui | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sharon Bullard | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Leilani Kadowaki | Durand, MI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kaprice Hooper-Carvalho | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Divine Brown Davis | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| malia mcgivern | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Charlene Pestrello | Morro Bay, CA | 2020-08-21 |
| Kimberly Kauweloa | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Tj Harper | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Annette Gorospe | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kawehilani Lactaoen | Waimea, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sally Bond | Kailua-Kona, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Keala Kauanui | Kekaha, kauai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Nalauhala Ah Yee | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Destiny Brown | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kerry Sproat | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Titan Aquino | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Tamra Kehano | Portland, OR | 2020-08-21 |
| Cassidy-Rose Makamae Puaa | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Napua Iolana Bicoy | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date | | |
|------------------------|---------------------|------------|--|--|
| Roberta Mawae-Martin | Longview, WA | 2020-08-21 | | |
| andrea bicoy | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Patrick Hiro | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| kekoa cummings | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Luwella Leonardi | Waianae, Hawaii, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Melissa Santa Maria | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Kanoelani Ubando | Haaula, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Tania Yamamoto | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Casey Briere | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Ululani Gouveia | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Sybil Lopez | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Tiani Keohuloa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Joseph Quintua Salavea | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Marcia Mawae | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 | | |
| Marvalee Lin Kee | maui, HI | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Talia Cardines | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Samson Mawae | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-23 | | |
| elle koontz | Hamilton, OH | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Henry Degnan | Richmond, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Sophie Davies | Thousand Oaks, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| James Kevin Kasey Jr | Goldsboro, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| debbie hines | Middleton, US | 2020-08-23 | | |

| Name | Location | Date | | |
|-----------------------|----------------------|------------|--|--|
| Gabrielle Hinds | Huntersville, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Dawn Monarca | Chicago, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Lila Dallas | Loveland, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Kelsi Cumpton | Topeka, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Norah Shiple | Winchester, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Aylin Hernandez-Perez | Hayward, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Edward Castell | Eugene, OR | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Guadalupe Chango | North Plainfield, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| MacKenzie Setser | Dayton, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| breanna main | Moncks Corner, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Merla R. | New York, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Adeline Ferolo | Peoria, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Jada Johnson | Port Richey, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Jasdeep Kaur | Edinboro, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Drew Hicks | St.louis, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Angelica Zillmer | Mundelein, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| stephen jackson | West Haven, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Jessica Baker | Fort Collins, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Samantha Montesdeoca | Harrison, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Sara Semere | Lithonia, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Shauntea Black | Lewistown, US | 2020-08-23 | | |
| Lisa Ulmer | Columbia, US | 2020-08-23 | | |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------|------------------|------------|
| Jadyn Corthell | US | 2020-08-23 |
| Michael Scarpa | Sayreville, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Amanda Jones | Burlington, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Rosalie Tulloch | Portchester, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Emma Panzica | Chicago, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Patricia Gonzales | Oakland, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Ace Tennouji | Vienna, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Ben Scholl | Portland, OR | 2020-08-23 |
| Vinh Mai | West Chester, OH | 2020-08-23 |
| Faith Blalock | Coventry, CT | 2020-08-23 |
| Tehani-Li Johnson | West Linn, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Lila Denning | San Diego, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Liette Corpus | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Genesee Castro | Visalia, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Grace Mejia-Gomez | Tulare, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Caesar Caberto | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Daryl Cardines | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Genoveva Puaa | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Robin Furtado | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-24 |
| Gene Ross Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Rosie Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Jenifer Jenkins | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-24 |

| Name | Location | Date | |
|--------------------------|--------------------|------------|--|
| Rebecca Shipton | Dutch John, UT | 2020-08-24 | |
| Kapua Medeiros | Waimānalo, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Hoku Pilago | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Louise Sausen | Hanalei, US | 2020-08-25 | |
| Megan Wong | Kilauea, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Alicia Kauwalu (Pelekai) | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Steve Silva | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Sean Dela Cruz | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-25 | |
| Edine Clemente | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-26 | |
| Tami Kabua | Aiea, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Kuuipomakamae Scalf | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-26 | |
| Heather Agbayani | Kapolei, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Pamela-Jean Chip | Holualoa, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Lourdes Millan | Waimanalo, HI | 2020-08-26 | |
| Justice Nakagawa | Mililani, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Don Cianelli | Newtown Square, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Lee-Lan Meyer | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-26 | |
| Lana'i Kela | Mililani, US | 2020-08-26 | |
| Lani Tanoai | Kailua-Kona, US | 2020-08-27 | |
| Sally Thrasher | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-27 | |
| Lou Amber Ferreira | Kaneohe, US | 2020-08-27 | |
| Honey Boynton | Canton, US | 2020-08-27 | |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Kawaiola Tamanaha | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Sheri English | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-27 |
| Ben Michals | Chicago, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Brittny Perez | Kalaheo, HI | 2020-08-28 |
| Tajeer Robinson | Maplewood, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Johnny Alvaro | Waimea, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Jon Crane | BOISE, US | 2020-08-28 |
| TaylorEve David | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Blossom Flores | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Brandon Rodriguez | Kapolei, US | 2020-08-29 |
| Azariah Javillonar | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Misty Earnest | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Noreen Reid | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Nicholas Quinn | Halaula, US | 2020-08-30 |
| Anaya Teves | Reno, US | 2020-08-30 |
| Sandy Manubag | Bakersfield, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Genie Ruddle | Waikoloa, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Wayne Arellano | Kailua kona, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Joyce Arcilla | Brentwood, CA | 2020-08-31 |
| Zele Smith | Kohala, US | 2020-09-01 |
| Carolyn Greseth | Minneapolis, MN | 2020-09-01 |
| Lani Cordero | Van Nuys, US | 2020-09-01 |

| Name | Location | Date | |
|---|---------------------|------------|--|
| Nan Lundquist | Kailua Kona, US | 2020-09-01 | |
| will fredericks | Santa Barbara, US | 2020-09-02 | |
| Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association | Hawaii | 2020-09-03 | |
| U'ilani Kiaha | US | 2020-09-03 | |
| Kazuhiko Villasenor | Hawaii, US | 2020-09-04 | |
| Sandy Manubag | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-09-09 | |
| Awesome-Rose Sanchez-Rita | Hilo, US | 2020-09-09 | |
| carleen miyamoto | clinton, US | 2020-09-13 | |
| Shai Rawlins | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-09-13 | |
| NICOLE RIERA | Robion Vaucluse, US | 2020-09-25 | |
| GLENDA WRIGHT | Guston, US | 2020-09-26 | |
| Rachael Kast | Buffalo, US | 2020-09-27 | |
| David Ennis | Quincy, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Cameron Parker | Kalispell, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Lauren Williamson | Chapel Hill, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Princess Collins | Gary, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Yellow Honeysuckle | Arcata, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Janet Indelli | Wayne, US | 2020-09-29 | |
| Justin Kuakahela | Kailua Kona, US | 2020-10-02 | |
| Julie Cannon | Roswell, US | 2020-10-04 | |
| Néha Gupta | Oakland, US | 2020-10-04 | |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------|-------------|------------|
| Ka'iulani Saia | Kahului, HI | 2020-10-06 |





Testimony on Behalf of the Maui Nui Makai Network IN STRONG OPPOSITION TO SB 690

Senate Committee on Water and Land

February 2, 2021

Aloha Chair Lorraine Inouye and members of the Senate Committee on Water and Land:

Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony for SB 690 relating to Community-based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFAs). On behalf of the Maui Nui Makai Network, which includes the communities of Polanui Hiu, Wailuku CMMA, Hui o Mo'omomi, Kipahulu 'Ohana, Nā Mamo O Mū'olea, Maunalei 'Ahupa'a and Ka Hōnua Momona, <u>we collectively, and strongly oppose this bill.</u>

The letter and intent of HRS 188-22.6 is one of the State's strongest affirmations of Native Hawaiian rights. The proposed amendments to this law, specified in SB 690, strips away the very intent.

SB 690 adopts an arbitrary definition of "community" that does not speak to Hawaiian traditional concepts of *hoa'āina* the term used to describe a "community". The kanaka maoli term *one hānau* translates as sands of my birth. If one is born in Kipahulu, Kipahulu will always be his birth right, and therefore he belongs to the community of Kipahulu for his life and those of his decedents. Community should never be measured by distance, but rather by birth right, presence and kuleana.

As a network of 7 Maui Nui communities, we believe the fundamental aspect of subsistence and traditional management practice is that they are informed by views, observations and practices of traditional notions of place. We honor and respect the opinions and experiences of each community as it relates to the current CBSFA law's that reaffirms and protects 'fishing practices customarily and traditionally exercised for purposes of native Hawaiian subsistence, culture and religion." Everyone's opinion matters, not just those within a ten mile radius of any community seeking a CBSFA designation. SB 690 does not reaffirm constitutional rights but serves as a legislative step toward regulating Native Hawaiian rights.

We beg you to be on the right side of history. Do not be the body that plays political games with our serious kuleana to mālama 'āina. Help aloha 'āina and maintain the intent of HRS 188-22.6.

We strongly urge the Committee on Water and Land to kill bill SB 690.

Claudia W Alaola

Claudia Kalaola Network Chair, Maui Nui Makai Network



| SB690 | | | | | |
|---------------------------|--|--|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| Submitted on: 2/3/2020 | Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM | Submitted By/Organization Testifier: Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association | Position: "Support Intent Only" | Present at Hearing: No | Individual: Desiree U'ilani Kiaha |

Aloha,

Our mission is to maintain, perpetuate, educate, protect and advocate for the Native Hawaiian cultural customary practices and gathering rights in Hawaii. NHGRA will be the present and future advocating voices on any restrictions and laws infringing on cultural and gathering rights in Hawaii. NHGRA with council and research with the Kupuna association, homestead association members, community collaborators, along with family & friends of NHGRA strives to educate about native hawaiian cultural practices in Hawaii. We held a community meeting via Zoom on Tuesday Feb. 2nd, 2021 **Meeting Recording:**

Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Community Meeting 020221 Access Passcode: NHGRA020221SBMTG#

that consisted of hawaiian homestead associations leaders, community stakeholders, homestead beneficiary waitlisters,kupuna council members & fisherman.

With the many voices that have been silenced as we have time and time again expressed our passionate commitment to advocate for Native Hawaiian gathering rights at community meetings, state meetings, county level meetings, other meetings, run by different departments and organizations in support and in opposition to Mo`omomi CBSFA. We stand in opposition to current Mo`omomi CBSFA. That being said, <u>We strongly support the intent of SB690 with recommendations to reword and clarify this bill, in order to protect the intent and protect our resources and our Hawaiian rights.</u>

We support the bill's intent for the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) "may" designate a community-based subsistence fishing area "only if approved" by the "residents of the affected community". Obtaining approval from the "affected community" is vital and any major decisions affecting these aforementioned communities should not pass through without discussion and approval from Native Hawaiians in those communities. Giving guidelines to DLNR helps to protect resources in Hawai'i and the rights of Native Hawaiians. Allowing the community to discuss, plan, and make decisions, especially decisions that will affect the way of life or the environment in which they live and rely on it's resources to sustain.

Recommendations include

- 1) The wording for "by at least fifty per cent of the residents of the affected community" should reflect the word "majority" and should reflect 75% not 50%. Also please note that 50% would not be a majority it would be half, which can present a problem.
 - a) Concerns surrounding this wording would have a major
 - b) Affects most communities and affects their way of life or their environment.
- 2) The wording for "residents" should say Native Hawaiian
- 3) The wording for "of the affected community" should not read "within ten miles of the shoreline boundary of the area to be designated as a community-based subsistence fishing area," it should reflect the island of which it would be affecting (i.e. Mo'omomi area should be Moloka'i Island as the community) or referred to by it's Hawaiian words including Moku and/or ahupua'a
 - a) For example: Moloka'i's current CBSFA for Mo'omomi had numbers showing the majority of Moloka'i island is in opposition of CBSFA, but because the hearing was open to the entire state it showed more people in count for support. Refer to attached count from previous DLNR testimonial count in 2020 **Appendix A (pg. 3-8)**
 - b) A Sign petition opposing CBSFA change.org. Appendix B (pg. 9-41)

Due to the late notice and other factors (i.e. access, electronic access, due to internet issues and awareness of this bill, ect.)

We also believe that this bill needs to be brought before each island and it's "affected communities" to be discussed as it affects many native Hawaiian families who rely on the resources, such as Moloka'i who only have a few grocery stores and rely on shipping and barge to stock their goods. This means that residents sustain themselves through the resources on the land and in the ocean.

We strongly support the intent and ask to make the corrections necessary for this bill to hold DLNR accountable to the process of a majority of 75% or more community (or ahupāua'a) approval for any areas they are requesting to do a CBSFA.

Mahalo for the opportunity to submit testimony. Na kākou me ka ha'aha'a,

President Godfrey Kahikina Akaka Vice President Kalehua Sproat-Augustiro Secretary/Treasurer D. U'ilani Kiaha Sergeant at Arms Kimo Kaiama

Appendix A (pg. 3-8)

Mo`omomi Community Based Subsistence Fishing Area: Testimony Compilation and Summary

Prepared by the Division of Aquatic Resources

| Total Testimony | 949 (+650*) |
|------------------|------------------|
| Total Support | <mark>561</mark> |
| Molokai Support | 190 |
| Hoolehua Support | <mark>66</mark> |
| Total Oppose | 388 (+650*) |
| Molokai Oppose | 280 |
| Hoolehua Oppose | 109 |

 650 individuals signed an online petition distributed through social media therefore it's been separated from the standard testimony we received.

Testimony in Support:

The Division of Aquatic Resources (DAR) received over 150 individual testimonies that indicated their support based was on the following two reasons:

- 1. Intent to limit commercial fishing and activities
- 2. Give communities the ability to co-manage their areas

General comments/concerns from individual testimony in support:

Traditional management/Community Based Subsistence Fishing Areas (CBSFA) have worked Protection for sustainable fishing and gathering for subsistence

Mitigate decline in resources

Regulations proposed are reasonable

The local community knows best

Need balanced use of the area

Extent of time and effort invested into this proposal (27 years)

"Need to put back not just take"

DAR received testimony in support from the Office of Hawaiian affairs, as well as their Molokai Representative Collette Machado. DAR also received support from Molokai County Council Representative Keani Rawlins.

Dr. Alan Friedlander provided testimony explaining nearshore fish populations and their associated fisheries have declined dramatically around Hawai'i over the past hundred years due to: an increase in the human population; destruction of habitat; introduction of new and unsustainable fishing techniques; and <u>the loss of traditional conservation practices</u>. Dr. Friedlander believes that based on his experience in Hawai'i that locally managed marine areas are highly effective in conserving fisheries resources and more effective than many state managed areas.

Dr. Rob Toonen found that communities following traditional Native Hawaiian practices have the highest harvest rates and densities of limpet stocks, along with a positive population growth. In comparison, areas managed under state rules consistently have the lowest densities and show continued population decline. His results show that where communities remember and follow traditional management practices, those practices simultaneously enable harvest and increase the abundance of natural resources. Dr. Tonnen also found very limited exchange of populations of reef animals between the north, south, east and west-facing shores of Moloka'i. These populations include: corals; 'opihi; lobsters; uhu; moi; kumu; and kole. This supports the need for Mo`omomi to protect its own resources, because Mo`omomi replenishes itself. Subsistence Fishers and Cultural Practitioners provided testimony explaining how proposed rules would not inhibit their Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights, and instead the rules would help to ensure the ability to sustainably gather for subsistence in the future. Community members provided testimony in regards, to kapu (regulations) and how these regulations are reasonable for contemporary times, as the kapu were reasonable in traditional times.

The previous DAR biologist on Molokai also provided testimony that the 1994 demonstration project clearly illuminated the benefits of such a community-based management scheme. The biologist also mentioned the proposal doesn't exclude but asks to comply with long standing customary fishing practices and this proposal is codifying these practices. This is a reasonable approach to appropriate management of marine resources.

Testimony in support also mentioned "Commercial harvest was not a gathering right. Traditional gathering requires it be done in a manner that allows for resource regeneration, which is exactly what this proposal does. Subsistence is a necessity it's survival and ensuring these needs are met, is a focal point abundantly evident throughout this proposal. You're still allowed to take a managed amount of the five threatened species, and there are numerous other species with plentiful populations available to harvest such as enenue, manini, palani, kala, weke, aholehole. This ensures the gathering from a diverse range of species is always available to feed families big and small."

Testimony in support provided instances of how the plan was changed to accommodate comments from opposition, and that while there is opposition, there is no proposed alternative. Community members with opposing views have been invited to join beach clean-ups and community monitoring efforts. Testifiers also mentioned the need for additional meetings and outreach to clarify any misinformation in regard to the proposed regulations.

Testimony in Opposition:

DAR received testimony from over 200 individuals in opposition to the proposal, as well as a Facebook petition with over 650 signatures (received on 8/28). Opposition testimony was based primarily on the following three concerns:

1. The proposal is not community based, because it does not accurately represent the desire of the community, the entire community does

not fully support the proposal

- 2. The proposal will take away Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights
- 3. The resources are not depleted and DLNR should instead focus on the

invasive species of the area General comments/concerns from individual

testimony in opposition:

Too much division in the community and families

Restricting Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights

Only Molokai voices should count (no outside opinions)

The resources are not depleted

The process was unfair, discriminatory, and excluded people

Family connection to Mo`omomi

There was a lack of outreach

There was a small group of people making decisions and driving the process

The proposal offered no protection of resources from outer island fishing

This was a money driven process

Lack of enforcement of proposed rules

Invasive species are depleting and displacing native species

DLNR needs to heal not hurt the community (if resources are good we have time to heal)

Public hearing set up/zoom platform is not an ideal option

DLNR fault - not monitoring process, DLNR continually fails

Testimony was offered indicating that DAR, in proposing a prohibition on SCUBA spearfishing, failed to take into account the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). The testimony was informed by legal counsel who advised "DAR has failed to observe a respiratory condition is an enumerated condition under the ADA". If the proposed rules are accepted, "there would be many divers who have some form of lung disease of lung capacity issue, whom would no longer be allowed to scuba dive as was previously allowed in the areas". A simple and little cost fix would be to allow Scuba spearfishing and prevent a multimillion dollar litigation or lawsuit.

There was also testimony in opposition regarding the take of female uhu's with the argument that the proposed regulation is opposite of the lobster/crustacean rules, the females are the eggs and only takes one male to fertilize the eggs.

There was testimony in opposition from a retired DAR Biologist who stated "it was the Legislature's intent to minimize these community conflicts, while at the same time, being keenly aware of the risks of the proliferation of areas that may become established by: 1) requiring that broad community discussions be built into the process; 2) providing that all existing uses would be accommodated, including commercial uses within the areas; and 3) creating a very complex process that stressed community participation when establishing CBSFA" "DAR received reports of intimidations and threats. during the pilot project, but did not have the resources to directly deal with this problem. To be clear, these threats were not focused only on commercial users but on outsiders and even Moloka'i residents that were viewed as not respecting the area. Because the process was so difficult, the founding members naturally become passionately involved in the area and continued to be very protective of the area long after it sunset. The testifier concluded these conflicts over the ocean resources are social, rather than biological issues. It's more a question of who gets to use the resource and less about how much resources there are. When the State uses its legal authority to resolve these conflicts, it needs to ensure that equal treatment under the law is followed."

There was also testimony in opposition regarding the culpability of the State. "Culpability is based specifically on the *State's decision – to knowingly create a substantial and unjustifiable risk* for boaters and fishermen, by inadvertently and consequently creating a situation for even more vigilantism and Civil Rights violations to occur." A previous response provided to the testifier indicated that the State cannot be held liable for an individual's actions. But the testifier believes "that argument did not hold up for McDonald's when an individual spilled hot coffee in their lap. Education that coffee is hot and can burn you did not negate the culpability of McDonald's negligence."

DAR received testimony regarding a legislative signed Standing Committee Report No. 2695 which amended Bill No.3446. The report also emphasized "that the pilot project should not be expanded or made permanent until a careful evaluation is reported to the legislature". The testifier claims the current Mo`omomi management plan and process is invalid since the ability to recreate the CBSFA expired on July 1, 1997 and that the DLNR has never reported to the Legislature why the Mo`omomi Pilot Project should be expanded or made permanent after the July 1, 1997 sunset date.

The Department of Hawaiian Homelands (DHHL) testified that they have heard from an equal number of people in support and in opposition, and while both have a strong desire to protect the resources, there is no consensus on a path forward. "Another concern is over access to the shoreline, particularly vehicular access. DHHL feels this is an important consideration given the only publicly available road to the northern coastline of Molokai that ends at Mo`omomi beach, a relatively safe shoreline access point, crosses DHHL lands." DHHL has "requested DLNR postpone its rulemaking for Mo`omomi, at least until DHHL has had a chance to develop its Mo`omomi-Anahaki Special Area Plan that may highlight the concerns beneficiaries have regarding access to the proposed CBSFA area and possible community-based solutions."



Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association

| Recipient: | William Aila, Hawaii State Senate, Hawaii State House, Community Based Subsistent Fishing Area |
|------------|---|
| Letter: | Greetings, |
| | Oppose Current Moloka'i Community Base Subsistence Fishing Area (CBSFA). |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Robert Gerard | Aiea, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Michelle Duadua Gonsalves | Pahoa, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Caitlin Kaahanui-Kuala | 96732, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Eddie Reyes | Sacramento, CA | 2020-03-04 |
| Susan J Caberto | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Joliette Keanini | Waipahu, HI | 2020-03-04 |
| Laura Gomes | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Latai Soakai | Waialua, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Pedro Venenciano | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| pablo bobe | Argentina | 2020-03-05 |
| Roselani Low | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| KAPUALANIWAIOLA EGAMI | Yakima, WA | 2020-03-05 |
| Kawehilanionapua Rafael-Waialae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Georgeanna Maliu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Lynette e Waialae | Pico Rivera, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Cyra Kalama | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Joseph Wong | Kurtistown, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Britney Hopeau | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Malina Bergau | Pahoa, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Reynold Tamayei | Mililani, HI | 2020-03-05 |
| Linda Oducado | Pāhoa, HI | 2020-03-06 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------------------|----------------|------------|
| nainoa semitara-macadangdang | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-19 |
| Diamond Corpuz | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nathan Horner | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sam Kahuhu | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Paula Miranda-Kahue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Elgin Meyer | Hoolehua, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Karlie Martin-Galam | kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Maui Melekiola | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaelynn Day | Hana, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| McKenzie Dudoit | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaylee Rabara | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Daniel Espino | San Jose, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Lanre Kekoa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sabrina Duvauchelle | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Samantha Albino | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nadine Paleka kalua | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Brad Kahana | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Keahilani Hirakawa | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| shampayne kaai | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tobie Blair | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-19 |
| Eddie Harrell | Pearl city, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Rosie Han-Garana | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Dakota Schaefer | Tempe, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Gordon Francisco | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Sudeshna Ghosh | Calcutta, India | 2020-03-03 |
| Eleanor Wong | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Cynthia Gutierres | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Ashley Lapinid-Kamaka | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Doreen Kekino | Federal Way, WA | 2020-03-03 |
| Pearl Sanchez | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Jazmine Tauiliili | Seattle, WA | 2020-03-03 |
| Kim Reyes | Montclair, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Fatema Ahmed | New York, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Prashanthi Kukkadapu | Richland, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Jade Scharnikow | Piscataway, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Lanakila Rita | Yakima, WA | 2020-03-04 |
| Sarah Graham | San Antonio, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Jason Pearson | Littleton, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Michael Clark | Portland, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Rosalee 🛿 Robbins | Brockton, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Alejandro Palacios | Everett, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Deborah Newberry | North Tonawanda, US | 2020-03-04 |
| Marky Yolwa | Honolulu, US | 2020-03-04 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Carrie Gleason | Littleton, CO | 2020-03-02 |
| Solene Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Tori Maliu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Deanna Keanini | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Robert Okuda | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Keoki Baily | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Amy Tavares | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rachel Kapu | Honolulu, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Bradley Nishihira-Aki | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-03-03 |
| Rozlynn Phillips | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Elizabeth Sinding | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Karleen Kuahuia | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Elae Kapu | Southport, NC | 2020-03-03 |
| marcie kaai | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Justin Savedra | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Lucita Joy Kaupu | Hilo, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Ariel Graham | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| Kasey Calep | Pico Rivera, CA | 2020-03-03 |
| Jarid Pangelinan | Yigo, Guam | 2020-03-03 |
| Bridget Davis | Jonesboro, AR | 2020-03-03 |
| Tristian Bishaw | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-03 |
| austin ward | Albany, OR | 2020-03-03 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Gyson Aalona | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mahie Almony | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Donalei Cavanaugh | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Taylor Andrade | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Jumar Rodolfo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Brian McOuat | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Talisa Keohuloa | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Heather Place | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Fatabull Gaspar | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Liezl Rodolfo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Maverick Miyagi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Tasha Seefeldt | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Fetu'u Tilini-Monroe | Kealekekua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kahealani Ahquin | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sherri Rufino | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Miles Cabanting | Los Angeles, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Verna Takashima | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shyleen Inouye | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Cory-Lynn Balbas | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Amber Kaholoa'a | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Helene Kaauwai | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shaelan Kaneakua | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| Susana Muñoz | Madrid, Spain | 2020-03-02 |
| Cora Schnackenberg | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Laurie Bishaw | US | 2020-03-02 |
| Dee Fiso | Salt Lake City, UT | 2020-03-02 |
| Emmitt Kamaka | Nanakuli, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Kamamalu Nishihira-Asuncion | Alexandria, LA | 2020-03-02 |
| Darlene Steele | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paitaka Miyahira | Makawao, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Tina Slovak | Wichita, KS | 2020-03-02 |
| Chris Zuluaga | Providence, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Stewart Mahiai | Stafford, VA | 2020-03-02 |
| JIMMY LUNSFORD | Memphis, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Cherie Fry | US | 2020-03-02 |
| Calvin Souza | Federal Way, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Jessica Paknik | Beverly, WV | 2020-03-02 |
| Keone Coloma | Princeville, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Diana Gaspar | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Burl Hirashima | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Shannon Puaoi-Navas | Bellevue, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Dale Wallace Kneece | Westmoreland, TN | 2020-03-02 |
| troy takahashi | Waianae, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| David Yokoyama | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------|----------------|------------|
| Kamiki Agliam | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Danielle Rivera | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Gabrielle Park | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Arlene Andrade | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mahailia Rapanot | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lesley Escobar | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lorraine Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Micah Ayau | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Crystal Puaoi-Kawai | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Dustin Maliu | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Nicole Endo | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Maka Arcangel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Dina Diane Maliu | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Jaide Kiaha | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Bronson Kapehe | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| JOCELYN COLLIER | Long Beach, CA | 2020-08-18 |
| Daven Dudoit | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lace Mokiao | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kawena Puhi | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Robin Traxler | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Claudelle Kapuni | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kullen Apostol | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Fangailupe Uluave | Pearl City, US | 2020-08-18 |
| semone morand | dallas, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Lily Grodzins | Cambridge, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Maddie Gilbert | Red Oak, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Tyler Arrowsmith | Alexandria, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Christopher Kamelamela | Sparks, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Diko Bates | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kyli Joe Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kaniala Adolpho | Lake Wales, FL | 2020-08-18 |
| Delvarie Calairo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ku'uleimaile Duvauchelle | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Aimee Shinsato | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Tiare Bermudez | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Leilani Ahina | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ariah Hirashima | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Vincente Venenciano | Henderson, NV | 2020-08-18 |
| Eloise Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Ale'a Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| May Andrade | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kasidy Lani-Kaakimaka | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Roycee Calairo | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Malia Nishihira | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-----------------------|------------|
| Paitaka REIS MAWAE | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Chanda Green | Victorville, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Nate Napierala | Sausalito, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Deion Wallace | Farmington, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Gloria Ponce | Fort Walton Beach, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Eva Haykin | US | 2020-08-18 |
| Brett Waipa | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Kyli Joe Mawae | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Alexis Hardy | Camarillo, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Kahaili Tovey | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| April Augustiro | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| kapua lee | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Hepuakea Falealii | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Nohea Deponte | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Deto McDonald | Copperas Cove, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Talia Ybarbo | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Mike Kanada | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Sheryl Miller | Westerville, US | 2020-08-18 |
| 퓦풶퓃표푒 #푒푒 | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Travis mollena | Mesa, AZ | 2020-08-18 |
| Ariel Dougherty | New Cumberland, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Rommel Lachapelle | Stamford, US | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-------------------|------------|
| JODEAN AKAKA | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Donald Dudoit III | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Nolan Crabbe | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-16 |
| Moses Kealamakia | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Chad Place | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Fiataupou Levi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Aidan Han | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Jeffrey Ling | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Carmen Kitashima | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-17 |
| Rae Chong | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| trisha kahoalii | maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Lorelei Base | Phoenix, AZ | 2020-08-18 |
| Eurshawn Julien | Calumet City, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Pualalea Barrows | American Fork, UT | 2020-08-18 |
| alexandria agustin | waipahu, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Wyatt Stanley | US | 2020-08-18 |
| Jazmyn Johnson | Auburn, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Aidan stein | Charlotte, NC | 2020-08-18 |
| Dorothy Souza | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Adam Guzman | Corona, US | 2020-08-18 |
| Manu Mendoza | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-18 |
| Gabriela Zuniga | Hutchinson, US | 2020-08-18 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Kimo Kaiama | Hoolehua, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Beatrice Sproat-Augustiro | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Franklin Augustiro | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Kawai Keaulana | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Elgin Reyes | Puyallup, WA | 2020-03-02 |
| Faith Horner | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jessica Akaka | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Layson Hoewaa | Wailuku, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Joey Aruda | Waimanalo, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Sherry Sasada | Kualapuu, US | 2020-03-02 |
| Kamaehu Kawaa | Maui, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Momi Medēros | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Andrew Gomes | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jeremy Bush | kunia, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| David Gomes | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Dustin Bishaw | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paul Tovey | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Jerome Nojima | Greenville, NC | 2020-03-02 |
| Keano-Kawaiola Pascua-Kahookano | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ardis Farris | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rebecca Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| Amanda Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Kevin Kamaile | Keaau, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Antonio Valiengo | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| lono koholua iii | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Patricia Sagario | HOOLEHUA, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Precious Medeiros | Kapaau, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Courtney Lawelawe | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Rose Tanner | HONOLULU, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Kuuipo Kanawaliwali | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-14 |
| Sherry Yagin | Kahului, maui, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Malia Waits | Pass Christian, MS | 2020-08-15 |
| Caroline Kaholoaa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Kalani'opu'u Johnston Sr | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-08-15 |
| Patrick Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Shirley Han | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Tad Makaila | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Stan Curtis Nuuhiwa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-15 |
| Stuart Suemoto | US | 2020-08-15 |
| Shailyn Kaholoaa | Waldorf, MD | 2020-08-15 |
| Lyenne Hoewaa | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Sam Kanahele | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-16 |
| Davelyn Hoewaa | Wailuku, US | 2020-08-16 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|-----------------------------|------------|
| Chayce Solchaga | San Francisco, CA | 2020-03-06 |
| Mahealani Alcon | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-07 |
| Lori Ann Pastrana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-07 |
| Jennah palu | fair oaks, CA | 2020-03-08 |
| Napua Kekahuna | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-10 |
| Larriley Rawlins | Hawai'i, US | 2020-03-11 |
| Sharolynn Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-12 |
| Christine Rawlins | kaunakakai, US | 2020-03-13 |
| Michelle Stanley | Waianae, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Kekaiomalu Adachi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Shonni Kaulili | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Cicinia Kalilikane | P.O.Box 1366 Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-14 |
| Stephanie Ugoji | Kualapuu, <mark>H</mark> I | 2020-03-15 |
| Pennie Hare | West Falmouth, US | 2020-03-20 |
| JarraeTehani Manasas | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-04-03 |
| Tate Anderson | Orem, UT | 2020-07-04 |
| Tara Rojas | 'Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-07 |
| Gwen Morinaga-Kama | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-07 |
| Robin Keohuloa | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-08 |
| Meleana Enoka | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-10 |
| Maryann Tamoria | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-12 |
| Jolambereen Vendiola | Portland, OR | 2020-08-13 |

Signatures

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Desiree U'ilani Kiaha | Wailuku, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ceriann Espiritu | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Stephen and Katherine Misawa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Lena Swan | Monticello, NY | 2020-03-02 |
| Kaulanarose Hoewa'a | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ryan Dugger | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Rethysia Horner | South Lyon, MI | 2020-03-02 |
| Paulie Jean Paleka-Ku | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Shenandoah Kaiama | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Genessa Puaoi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Dorothy Alo Souza | Kamuela, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Travis Ota | Kala'e, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Irene Kaahanui | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Melody Alcon | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Hi'ilei Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Ivory Espaniola | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Godfrey Akaka III | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Cherie Kiaha | Kailua Kona, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Joseph Akaka | Honolulu, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Katherine Fujimori | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-03-02 |
| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Zelda Kalilikane | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Darlene Makaiwi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joy Poaha | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Lee Arcangel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kai Magdirila | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| June Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| jesseca oswald | Kaunakakai,HI, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Teyani Domingo | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Palani Simon | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Levi Kaakau | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiffany Kaaihue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kirk Kamakani Kiaha | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Becky French | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Dante Batiste | Puyallup, WA | 2020-08-19 |
| Elkan Bishaw-Lopez | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Orva M Gullett | Marion, US | 2020-08-19 |
| arian regino | Leonardtown, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Madison Swartz | Pottsville, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Wayne Davis | New Orleans, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Kim Violanti | Perrysburg, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Lili Boud | Farmington, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Vanessa Casas | Westlake village, US | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Wendy morgan | Brooklyn, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Elisheva Marga | Novi, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Maria Rozens | Westerville, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Carly Walsh | Cleveland, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Janie Lucas | San Francisco, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Genevieve Pickard | Los Angeles, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Hannah Slater | West Grove, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Hana w | Tenino, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Joann Mawae | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| carla garcia | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Dustin Calaustro | Waipahu, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Claude kapuni | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kaenaokala Sproat-Albino-Aki | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Emma Parker | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kaleinani Furtado | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Keoki pupuhi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiera-Lee Bishaw Marquez | Honoluluo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Natalia Kami | Colorado Springs, CO | 2020-08-19 |
| Tiana Levi | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ryan King | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joy Stevens | Nampa, ID | 2020-08-19 |
| Keani Rivera | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Isaac Swain | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Oli Cooper | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Ivy Kami | Colorado Springs, CO | 2020-08-19 |
| Israel Kali | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Desiree Dwiggins | Aiea, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Esther Torres-Umi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Diana Park | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kanoe Stone | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shauna Pule-Kaahanui | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kehau Martinson | Kane'ohe, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Stacia Demello | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kelcyn Balbas | Kamuela, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Pomaika'i Nakamoto | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Wendell DeCoito Jr | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Macey Harris | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Tammie Mokiao-Atimalala | US | 2020-08-19 |
| Daisha kama | Los Angeles, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Cherish Puaoi Kalilikane | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kiona English | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ashlynn Hokoana | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-08-19 |
| Tom Holloman | Charlestown, IN | 2020-08-19 |
| Dana Bleckinger | Portland, OR | 2020-08-19 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Jasmine Mawae-Lee | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Joseph Mawae III | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nanea Manangan | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kruz Soloria | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Nohealani Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ryana Emmanuel | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Luana lynn Agliam | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sunny Arashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Shannon Pastrana | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Natasha Ariyoshi | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Sheldine Poaipuni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| тс | Kaneohe, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Wailea Nishimoto-Kahokuloa | Kilauea, US | 2020-08-19 |
| Thaddeus Albino | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Mariah Dudoit | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kawika Kaupu | Norwalk, CA | 2020-08-19 |
| Heavenly Brown | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Ku'u Toledo | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Mariah Traxler | KAUNAKAKAI, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Bailey Arashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-19 |
| Kobe Lynn | Ho'olehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kiani Ocampo | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Tinum Pung | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kanani M Mawae-Idemoto | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nacha Enesa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Josiah Kunipo | Waianae, US | 2020-08-20 |
| sydney rawlins | kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Salina Reyes | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kehau Kahookano | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Cole Nagamine | Ewa beach, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lambert Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Natalie Mawae | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Felicity Pastrana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Justyn Takata | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Storm Wilson | Kailua, US | 2020-08-20 |
| Ryan Sproat | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jonathan Koma | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Brandon Phelps | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Pua Miller | South Lyon, MI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jamie Logan | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Janley Purdy | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Chris Vincent | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Autumn Dowling | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dayson Gomes | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------------|----------------|------------|
| Shea Miyashiro | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Peter Schellhorn | Glenview, IL | 2020-08-20 |
| Kauluna'e Hamakua | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Fera Davis | Portland, OR | 2020-08-20 |
| Tehani Napoleon-Pico | Hilo, US | 2020-08-20 |
| Daylia Tangonan | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Maccyn Samisoni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sasha Ah Loy | Portland, OR | 2020-08-20 |
| Lehua Patnaude | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Kahealani Gomes | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Hokuao Arce | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Michael Hikalea | Kula Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Benjimin Lin Kee | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sheldon Rabanes | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Alisha Puaa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Madison Davis | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lisa Kahihikolo | Waimanalo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Rena Leeber | Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Mirai Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Misa Mawae | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Judith Rod | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sierra Kanoa | Mililani, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Hanae Yakura | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Penny King | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Maile Puaoi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jp Leeber | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Travis Landford | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Aisha Senas-Childs | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| keawe alapai | keauhou, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lehua Duvauchelle | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dann Shinmoto | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jill Piunti | Homewood, IL | 2020-08-20 |
| Alia-Marie Gomes-Madela | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nate Embrey | Bountiful, UT | 2020-08-20 |
| Maihilahila Horswill | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| joanna makekau | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Meleanna Kanawaliwali | Phoenix, AZ | 2020-08-20 |
| Ruby Ranoa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Keaka Kamakana | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| brian mimm | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Valerie Brown | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dara Makaiwi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Faith Tuipulotu | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dukey Dudoit | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|------------|
| Breighton Kitterman | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Tyler Wilcox | Pearl City, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Luke Alcon | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jayce Chun | Mililani, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Rodney Kahao | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Lahela Kanahele castillo | Maui, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Sade Kahue | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jordyn Paa | Haiku, US | 2020-08-20 |
| Alia Keohuloa | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Moeaki Finau | Auckland, New Zealand | 2020-08-20 |
| Kalena Dougher | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Isley Pu-Akima | Hana, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Alika Balbas | Hawai'i, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Karley Phillips | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Roilyn Tancayo | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Olivia Louis-Charles | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Amanda Solomon | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| kyle nishioka | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Jessie Keanini | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Joesph Kaiwi | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Chelsea Kapuni | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Cassie Ellis | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-20 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------------|----------------|------------|
| Alexandra Gallegos | Tacoma, WA | 2020-08-20 |
| Cole-Austin Castillo | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Nick Reeves | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Justin Landford | Kaunakakai, US | 2020-08-20 |
| James Vinano | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-20 |
| Dolly Mawae | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-20 |
| genesis gomez-kahookano | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Athalya-Paige Sunio | Lanai City, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Brandi-Lee Medeiros | Lanai City, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Alaijah Pastrana | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sheryl Rawlins-s-LenWai | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Bobby Low | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Bronson Kalipi | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Carla Costa | Ocean Park, WA | 2020-08-21 |
| alicia rincon | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Wailani mollena | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kealohi Holt | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Noelani Rawlins | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Zelinda Jose | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Davelyn Kainoayap | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Shaina Kalilikane | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Chanel Shimada | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|-------------------|------------|
| Ame Hall | US | 2020-08-21 |
| Reginald Eiland jr | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Khristie Tabora | Kahului, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Jay N Linda Horie | US | 2020-08-21 |
| Alaka'i Iaea-Russell | Hilo, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Mackenzie Plunkett | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Samuel Makekau | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Lea Iaea | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Moeata Santos | Haiku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| amber haumealani burdett | San Francisco, US | 2020-08-21 |
| Kaye-Lee Reeves-Iaea | Anchorage, AK | 2020-08-21 |
| Gene Ross Davis Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Alicia Kauwalu | Waianae, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Ashlynn Kaulili | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sharon Stratton | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Debra Posey | Marysville, WA | 2020-08-21 |
| Elijah Poaha | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| LEE MCGURN Asato | Torrance, CA | 2020-08-21 |
| Audra McDonnell | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| James Kahana | Hauula, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Lee Ann Kalani | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Jonathan Kaahanui | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---------------------------|-------------------|------------|
| Harilyn Wong | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Elisa Peson | Molokai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Shannon Kaahanui | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sharon Bullard | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Leilani Kadowaki | Durand, MI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kaprice Hooper-Carvalho | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Divine Brown Davis | Maunaloa, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| malia mcgivern | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Charlene Pestrello | Morro Bay, CA | 2020-08-21 |
| Kimberly Kauweloa | Kaneohe, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Tj Harper | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Annette Gorospe | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kawehilani Lactaoen | Waimea, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Sally Bond | Kailua-Kona, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Keala Kauanui | Kekaha, kauai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Nalauhala Ah Yee | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Destiny Brown | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Kerry Sproat | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Titan Aquino | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Tamra Kehano | Portland, OR | 2020-08-21 |
| Cassidy-Rose Makamae Puaa | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |
| Napua Iolana Bicoy | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-21 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Roberta Mawae-Martin | Longview, WA | 2020-08-21 |
| andrea bicoy | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Patrick Hiro | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| kekoa cummings | Kualapuu, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Luwella Leonardi | Waianae, Hawaii, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Melissa Santa Maria | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Kanoelani Ubando | Haaula, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Tania Yamamoto | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Casey Briere | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Ululani Gouveia | Makawao, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Sybil Lopez | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Tiani Keohuloa | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Joseph Quintua Salavea | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Marcia Mawae | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-22 |
| Marvalee Lin Kee | maui, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Talia Cardines | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Samson Mawae | Wailuku, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| elle koontz | Hamilton, OH | 2020-08-23 |
| Henry Degnan | Richmond, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Sophie Davies | Thousand Oaks, US | 2020-08-23 |
| James Kevin Kasey Jr | Goldsboro, US | 2020-08-23 |
| debbie hines | Middleton, US | 2020-08-23 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-----------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Gabrielle Hinds | Huntersville, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Dawn Monarca | Chicago, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Lila Dallas | Loveland, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Kelsi Cumpton | Topeka, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Norah Shiple | Winchester, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Aylin Hernandez-Perez | Hayward, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Edward Castell | Eugene, OR | 2020-08-23 |
| Guadalupe Chango | North Plainfield, US | 2020-08-23 |
| MacKenzie Setser | Dayton, US | 2020-08-23 |
| breanna main | Moncks Corner, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Merla R. | New York, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Adeline Ferolo | Peoria, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Jada Johnson | Port Richey, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Jasdeep Kaur | Edinboro, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Drew Hicks | St.louis, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Angelica Zillmer | Mundelein, US | 2020-08-23 |
| stephen jackson | West Haven, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Jessica Baker | Fort Collins, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Samantha Montesdeoca | Harrison, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Sara Semere | Lithonia, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Shauntea Black | Lewistown, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Lisa Ulmer | Columbia, US | 2020-08-23 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|-------------------|------------------|------------|
| Jadyn Corthell | US | 2020-08-23 |
| Michael Scarpa | Sayreville, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Amanda Jones | Burlington, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Rosalie Tulloch | Portchester, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Emma Panzica | Chicago, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Patricia Gonzales | Oakland, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Ace Tennouji | Vienna, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Ben Scholl | Portland, OR | 2020-08-23 |
| Vinh Mai | West Chester, OH | 2020-08-23 |
| Faith Blalock | Coventry, CT | 2020-08-23 |
| Tehani-Li Johnson | West Linn, US | 2020-08-23 |
| Lila Denning | San Diego, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Liette Corpus | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Genesee Castro | Visalia, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Grace Mejia-Gomez | Tulare, CA | 2020-08-23 |
| Caesar Caberto | Wahiawa, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Daryl Cardines | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-23 |
| Genoveva Puaa | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Robin Furtado | Seattle, WA | 2020-08-24 |
| Gene Ross Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Rosie Davis | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-24 |
| Jenifer Jenkins | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-24 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| Rebecca Shipton | Dutch John, UT | 2020-08-24 |
| Kapua Medeiros | Waimānalo, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Hoku Pilago | Waipahu, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Louise Sausen | Hanalei, US | 2020-08-25 |
| Megan Wong | Kilauea, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Alicia Kauwalu (Pelekai) | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Steve Silva | Kailua, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Sean Dela Cruz | Kaunakakai, HI | 2020-08-25 |
| Edine Clemente | Ewa Beach, HI | 2020-08-26 |
| Tami Kabua | Aiea, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Kuuipomakamae Scalf | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-26 |
| Heather Agbayani | Kapolei, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Pamela-Jean Chip | Holualoa, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Lourdes Millan | Waimanalo, HI | 2020-08-26 |
| Justice Nakagawa | Mililani, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Don Cianelli | Newtown Square, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Lee-Lan Meyer | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-26 |
| Lana'i Kela | Mililani, US | 2020-08-26 |
| Lani Tanoai | Kailua-Kona, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Sally Thrasher | Honolulu, HI | 2020-08-27 |
| Lou Amber Ferreira | Kaneohe, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Honey Boynton | Canton, US | 2020-08-27 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|--------------------|-----------------|------------|
| Kawaiola Tamanaha | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Sheri English | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-08-27 |
| Ben Michals | Chicago, US | 2020-08-27 |
| Brittny Perez | Kalaheo, HI | 2020-08-28 |
| Tajeer Robinson | Maplewood, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Johnny Alvaro | Waimea, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Jon Crane | BOISE, US | 2020-08-28 |
| TaylorEve David | Honolulu, US | 2020-08-28 |
| Blossom Flores | Lahaina, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Brandon Rodriguez | Kapolei, US | 2020-08-29 |
| Azariah Javillonar | Kamuela, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Misty Earnest | Kihei, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Noreen Reid | Kapolei, HI | 2020-08-29 |
| Nicholas Quinn | Halaula, US | 2020-08-30 |
| Anaya Teves | Reno, US | 2020-08-30 |
| Sandy Manubag | Bakersfield, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Genie Ruddle | Waikoloa, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Wayne Arellano | Kailua kona, US | 2020-08-31 |
| Joyce Arcilla | Brentwood, CA | 2020-08-31 |
| Zele Smith | Kohala, US | 2020-09-01 |
| Carolyn Greseth | Minneapolis, MN | 2020-09-01 |
| Lani Cordero | Van Nuys, US | 2020-09-01 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|---|---------------------|------------|
| Nan Lundquist | Kailua Kona, US | 2020-09-01 |
| will fredericks | Santa Barbara, US | 2020-09-02 |
| Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association | Hawaii | 2020-09-03 |
| U'ilani Kiaha | US | 2020-09-03 |
| Kazuhiko Villasenor | Hawaii, US | 2020-09-04 |
| Sandy Manubag | Las Vegas, NV | 2020-09-09 |
| Awesome-Rose Sanchez-Rita | Hilo, US | 2020-09-09 |
| carleen miyamoto | clinton, US | 2020-09-13 |
| Shai Rawlins | Hoolehua, HI | 2020-09-13 |
| NICOLE RIERA | Robion Vaucluse, US | 2020-09-25 |
| GLENDA WRIGHT | Guston, US | 2020-09-26 |
| Rachael Kast | Buffalo, US | 2020-09-27 |
| David Ennis | Quincy, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Cameron Parker | Kalispell, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Lauren Williamson | Chapel Hill, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Princess Collins | Gary, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Yellow Honeysuckle | Arcata, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Janet Indelli | Wayne, US | 2020-09-29 |
| Justin Kuakahela | Kailua Kona, US | 2020-10-02 |
| Julie Cannon | Roswell, US | 2020-10-04 |
| Néha Gupta | Oakland, US | 2020-10-04 |

| Name | Location | Date |
|----------------|-------------|------------|
| Ka'iulani Saia | Kahului, HI | 2020-10-06 |



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2021 1:49:44 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|--------------|--------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| SYBIL LOPEZ | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

On behalf of the Kalama'ula Mauka Homestead Association, we are in support as we are in the 10 mile radius as stated in the proposed legislation. I support the efforts of the Native Hawaiian Gathering Rights Association (NHGRA). As participating in the discussion of the NHGRA zoom meeting on February 2, 2021, I agree that my portion of discussion shall be part of my testimony.



<u>SB-690</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2021 2:58:28 PM Testimony for WTL on 2/3/2021 1:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Present at Hearing |
|-----------------|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Teresa L Nakama | Testifying for BIFA | Oppose | No |

Comments:

I Teresa L. Nakama hereby state that I'm strongly opposed to SB69. We live on Islands in the middle of the Pacific Ocean and although the intent of the bill means well for the smaller Islands, it does not fit our Island of Moku O'Keawe---- for it is our customary right to gather our marine resource. We have voiced our opposition time and time again at every public hearing regarding this issue. Please protect our rights for we have self-managed ourselves to fish recreationally and responsibly to feed our ohana. There are no substantial unbiased reports to state that our marine species are on the decline. The fact is I have seen balls and schools of fish in our Hawaiian waters that DAR refuses to disclose.