H.C.R. NO. ⁵S.D. 1

HOUSE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION

ESTABLISHING A JOINT COMMITTEE ON JUDICIAL SELECTION.

WHEREAS, Hawai'i's Judicial Selection Commission was 1 proposed by the 1978 Constitutional Convention as a method of 2 selecting judges based solely on their gualifications and not on 3 political patronage; and 4 5 WHEREAS, this merit-based selection process was intended to 6 assure the public that only the candidates best qualified for a 7 vacancy would be considered for judicial appointment; and 8 9 WHEREAS, doubts have been raised over the years regarding 10 the selection and retention of judges and justices and the 11 closed and confidential operations of the Judicial Selection 12 Commission; and 13 14 WHEREAS, Hawai'i's judicial selection process is shrouded in 15 unlimited secrecy due to strict laws and rules regulating 16 disclosure; and 17 18 WHEREAS, deliberations of the Judicial Selection Commission 19 are further determined to be confidential pursuant to the 20 Constitution of the State of Hawai'i; and 21 22 WHEREAS, to keep deliberations confidential, the rules of 23 the Judicial Selection Commission provide, in perpetuity, 24 blanket confidentiality for information relating to the identity 25 of any applicant, information received from or about current or 26 former applicants and petitioners, and any communications among 27 or votes by commissioners that have transpired in the course of 28 their deliberations on any subject; and 29 30 WHEREAS, the only time an applicant's name is publicly 31 released is upon nomination by the Judicial Selection Commission 32



Page 2

H.C.R. NO. ⁵ S.D. 1

for a vacant judicial position as provided by the Constitution 1 2 of the State of Hawai'i; and 3 WHEREAS, the continued opacity of Hawai'i's judicial 4 selection process may further erode public confidence in the 5 6 judicial selection process and, by extension, the Judiciary; and 7 WHEREAS, Hawai'i's merit-based judicial selection process 8 can only be preserved through public confidence and public 9 confidence requires full disclosure of the process and the need 10 for confidentiality as an inherent part of merit-based judicial 11 selection; and 12 13 WHEREAS, to preserve Hawai'i's merit-based selection 14 process, it is critical that the public has a clear 15 16 understanding of the thorough process utilized by the Judicial Selection Commission in selecting and retaining judges and 17 justices; and 18 19 WHEREAS, the rules of the Judicial Selection Commission do 20 not identify any clear or measurable evaluation standards for 21 applicants or petitioners for judicial office, including 22 standards that address the specific skills that are required for 23 trial or appellate courts and the knowledge required for courts 24 with specialized jurisdiction; and 25 26 27 WHEREAS, establishing clear, defined standards for 28 evaluating applicants and petitioners for judicial office will promote public confidence that the best qualified applicants are 29 30 being selected and quality petitioners are retained in a consistent manner and assure applicants and petitioners that 31 they will be held to predictable and transparent standards; and 32 33 WHEREAS, the efficiency and operations of the Judicial 34 Selection Commission could also be improved with an orientation 35 program for new members of the Commission and annual training 36 for all members of the Commission; and 37 38 WHEREAS, the Judicial Selection Commission's voting process 39 can be streamlined by amending the voting system, voting for 40 41 multiple lists at the same time, or authorizing remote participation; now, therefore, 42 43



H.C.R. NO. 5 S.D. 1

1 2 3 4 5 6	Thirty-fi of 2021, Judicial	T RESOLVED by the House of Representatives of the rst Legislature of the State of Hawai'i, Regular Session the Senate concurring, that the Joint Committee on Selection is requested to be established to work with ial Selection Commission and Judiciary to:
7 8 9	(1)	Develop clear, written standards for evaluating applicants and petitioners for judicial office;
10 11 12	(2)	Develop protocols for training new and existing members of the Judicial Selection Commission;
12 13 14 15	(3)	Streamline the Judicial Selection Commission's voting rules;
16 17 18	(4)	Define the term "deliberations" under article VI, section 4, of the Hawaiʻi State Constitution; and
19 20 21 22	(5)	Create greater transparency as to the rules and procedures applicable to the Judicial Selection Commission; and
22 23 24 25		T FURTHER RESOLVED that the Joint Committee on Judicial is requested to consist of the following members:
26 27 28	(1)	One member appointed by the Speaker of the House of Representatives;
29 30	(2)	One member appointed by the Senate President;
31 32	(3)	One member appointed by the Governor;
33 34 35	(4)	One member appointed by the Chief Justice of the Hawaiʻi Supreme Court;
36 37 38	(5)	One member appointed by the Hawaiʻi State Bar Association; and
39 40	(6)	One member appointed by Hawai'i Women Lawyers; and
41 42		T FURTHER RESOLVED that the Joint Committee on Judicial is requested to work with the Judicial Selection



H.C.R. NO. 5 S.D. 1

Commission to improve recruitment in terms of quantity of 1 2 applicants, in addition to qualifications of applicants; and 3 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislative Reference 4 5 Bureau is requested to assist the Joint Committee on Judicial Selection; and 6 7 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Joint Committee on Judicial 8 Selection, with the assistance of the Legislative Reference 9 Bureau, is requested to submit a report of its findings and 10 11 recommendations, including any proposed legislation, to the Legislature no later than forty days prior to the convening of 12 13 the Regular Session of 2022; and 14 15 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that a certified copy of this Concurrent Resolution be transmitted to the Governor, Speaker of 16 17 the House of Representatives, President of the Senate, Chief

18 Justice of the Hawai'i Supreme Court, Chairperson of the Judicial
19 Selection Commission, Executive Director of the Hawai'i State Bar
20 Association, and Director of the Legislative Reference Bureau.

