HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES THIRTIETH LEGISLATURE, 2020 STATE OF HAWAII

4

9

19

H.C.R. NO. 200

HOUSE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION

URGING THE DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES, DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, AND HAWAII CATTLEMEN'S COUNCIL, INC., TO FORM A STATE PASTURE AND FOREST LANDS TASK FORCE AND TO INCLUDE ANY ADDITIONAL STAKEHOLDERS IN THEIR DISCUSSIONS.

1 WHEREAS, the proper management of the State's agricultural 2 lands is critically important to the health and welfare of the 3 residents of Hawaii; and

5 WHEREAS, there are competing measures in the Regular 6 Session of 2020 relating to the management of the State's 7 agricultural lands by the Department of Land and Natural 8 Resources (DLNR) and Department of Agriculture (DOA); and

WHEREAS, House Bill No. 2358, and its companion measure 10 Senate Bill No. 2914, represents the position of DLNR, while the 11 position of DOA and the cattle ranchers is presented by House 12 Bill No. 2035, its companion measure Senate Bill No. 2415, and 13 House Bill No. 2577, and its companion measure Senate Bill No. 14 2812, regarding implementation of Act 90, Session Laws of Hawaii 15 2003 (Act 90), relating to the issue of transferring a large 16 number of agricultural parcels then under DLNR's control to DOA; 17 18 and

WHEREAS, from one viewpoint, this body is tasked with deciding which state agency is best suited to manage lands currently being used for the production of beef cattle, which ostensibly was resolved by the enactment of Act 90 in 2003; and

WHEREAS, since 2003, a different perspective has evolved where the discussion has now shifted, in part, to what is the best use of these lands from the standpoint of public purpose in a time where global warming and climate change are recognized as an existential challenge to the Earth; and



1 WHEREAS, the State should study and understand its island 2 3 history over the last three hundred or so years and align that understanding with the new challenges of climate change; and 4 5 WHEREAS, the ecological system of the Hawaiian islands 6 evolved in the absence of human beings until the last millennium 7 8 and was largely shaped by the forests of the islands; and 9 WHEREAS, the Hawaiian islands' ecological system, including 10 the forests, has been tremendously damaged and degraded over the 11 last three centuries; and 12 13 WHEREAS, prior to Western contact, the indigenous Hawaiian 14 culture established an isolated but ecologically sensitive 15 relationship with the land and waters of Hawaii that left the 16 native forests largely intact; and 17 18 19 WHEREAS, subsequent to Western contact and the imposition 20 of an exploitative Western agricultural system involving clearing of vast tracts of the forest for plantations of 21 primarily sugar cane and pineapple, the native forests 22 flourished; and 23 24 WHEREAS, the unique isolation of the Hawaiian archipelago 25 required the islands to produce most of its own food resources, 26 including meat protein, predominantly from imported ungulates, 27 28 such as cattle, domestic sheep, and goats; and 29 WHEREAS, in the modern world with huge and speedy ships, 30 31 airplanes, refrigerated containers, and a sophisticated transport system, Hawaii obtains most of its food, including 32 most of its beef, from outside its borders; and 33 34 WHEREAS, while the sugar cane and pineapple plantations are 35 largely gone, the cherished paniolo beef cattle ranching culture 36 has persisted; and 37 38 39 WHEREAS, the State should consider the history of the destruction of the indigenous culture and ecology by the imposed 40 Western practices; and 41 42



WHEREAS, in 1990, the book entitled Alteration of Native 1 Hawaiian Vegetation, found that: "Zoning and tax laws have 2 3 contributed to the conversion of native vegetation to ranchland in Hawaii. Much biologically important forest and shrubland was 4 zoned Agricultural before its true value was recognized. 5 If privately owned, even Conservation-zoned forests are not immune 6 7 to development for ranches and other agricultural uses"; and 8

9 WHEREAS, that book further stated that, "The tax laws in 10 Hawai'i encourage the clearing of forest and conversion to 11 cattle grazing by assessing such "low-grade pasture" at a lower 12 value than uncleared forest, so clearing forests may result in 13 lower taxes, increased real estate values and salability"; and 14

15 WHEREAS, the book also pointed out that continued, "Much 16 upper-elevation rangeland was essentially native forest when 17 ranching commenced. As late as the 1960s nearly one-third of 18 the State's grazing land was actually forest, and State forest 19 land was considered by the Division of Forestry to have great 20 potential for live-stock production in a multiple-use approach 21 to forest resources"; and

23 WHEREAS, "State lands have been heavily impacted by cattle even though they were included in the State Forest Reserve 24 Although fencing of reserves was an important element 25 System. in the protection of watersheds in the first few decades of the 26 27 1900s, by mid-century many fences separating reserves from 28 ranches and grazing lands had been allowed to deteriorate, and little new fencing was undertaken. The subsequent ingress of 29 cattle and other alien animals has resulted in the degradation 30 31 of native vegetation and the loss of watershed values in many forest reserves"; and 32

- 34 WHEREAS, "The ability of cattle (whether feral or domestic) 35 to degrade vegetation and reduce native forest to grassland 36 pastures was recognized soon after large-scale ranching began 37 during the last century"; and
- 38

33

22

39 WHEREAS, according to Alteration of Native Hawaiian
40 Vegetation, "the role of cattle in opening up native forests and
41 reducing their value as watershed was recognized and decried by
42 a number of foresters in the early decades of the 20th century.



Judd (1927) estimated that only 25 [percent] of the Hawaiian 1 Island was still covered by forest in the late 1920's, a small 2 3 remnant of the original distribution before cattle"; and 4 5 WHEREAS, there has been a resurgence of energy and concern from Native Hawaiians about the restoration of lands and waters 6 degraded or disrupted by the Western agriculture and economic 7 8 customs imposed upon them; and 9 WHEREAS, the new recognition of the effects of climate 10 change mandates a reevaluation of the best public purpose for 11 the lands and waters of Hawaii; and 12 13 14 WHEREAS, the 2003 joint committee report from the Committee 15 on Agriculture and Committee on Water, Land Use, and Hawaiian Affairs regarding Senate Bill No. 1034, enacted as Act 90, 16 17 stated "[y]our Committees note that serious concerns were raised regarding the proceeds from DLNR's leases on ceded lands. 18 Currently, 20 percent of such proceeds are transferred to the 19 20 Office of Hawaiian Affairs for the betterment of the conditions of native Hawaiians. However, with the transfer of agricultural 21 22 ceded lands to DOA and the potential of lower lease rents levied by DOA, the funding for OHA may be reduced. Your Committees 23 recognize this potential problem and support future legislative 24 efforts to address this issue"; and 25 26 WHEREAS, most of the lands proposed to be transferred from 27 DLNR to DOA are in fact ceded lands, and the history of DOA 28 leases, including thirty-day revocable leases, support the 29 ongoing concern that the Office of Hawaiian Affairs will not 30 31 receive compensation commensurate with the value of the lands leased; and 32 33 WHEREAS, the proposed transfer from DLNR to DOA of the 34 subject lands is justified as it proposes to enhance the State's 35 food supply; and 36 37 38 WHEREAS, since the enactment of Act 90 in 2003, more and 39 more ranches have become cow-calf operations that ship most of 40 their calves to the mainland, which ultimately provides little food to the State; and 41 42



WHEREAS, although beef cattle is the focus of the modern 1 livestock industry in Hawaii, domestic sheep ranching was 2 3 formerly important; and 4 5 WHEREAS, commercial domestic sheep production began in the Hawaiian islands in the 1840s and 1850s and peaked in 1884 with 6 7 121,000 animals; and 8 9 WHEREAS, while domestic sheep may also be destructive if not managed and rotated, they are less likely to damage 10 established trees compared to cattle or goats; and 11 12 WHEREAS, domestic sheep can be finished on grass of even 13 poor quality and, therefore, need not be shipped to the 14 continental United States for finishing, thereby greatly 15 contributing to the food supply of Hawaii; and 16 17 WHEREAS, domestic sheep would be more compatible with 18 19 reforestation of the lands under consideration for transfer by 20 DLNR to DOA, while still providing a substantial contribution to the local food supply; and 21 22 WHEREAS, the dairy industry of Hawaii was once robust due 23 to Hawaii's isolation and provided all the milk needs of the 24 State; however, the local dairy industry has largely 25 disappeared; and 26 27 28 WHEREAS, even as the world has recognized the importance of forests as treasure houses of species diversity, forest 29 destruction has only accelerated in places such as the Amazon 30 31 and in Indonesia; and 32 WHEREAS, the environmental and economic conditions leading 33 to prioritizing ranching on lands in the State should be re-34 evaluated since it has been found that the two-lined spittle bug 35 and invasion of weeds reduce the productivity of these lands as 36 37 pasture; and 38 39 WHEREAS, the latest challenge to Hawaii's forests is rapid ohia death which threatens the predominant native forest trees 40 of the State; and 41 42



1 2 3 4 5 6	WHEREAS, DLNR supports House Bill No. 2358, and its companion measure Senate Bill No. 2914 (2020), which give D greater flexibility to deal with pasture leases by extendin such leases and allowing DLNR to issue new leases on lands already in use as pasture; and		
7 8 9	favorable	EAS, those measures also allow DLNR to provide rates to ranchers, who protect public trust natural ral resources; and	
10 11 12 13 14	measure,	EAS, the pasture lessees are in support of an alternate Senate Bill No. 2812 (2020), which, if enacted, would he transfer of most of DLNR's pasture lands to DOA; and	
15 16 17 18	WHEREAS, this body finds that natural resource protection and local food production are both important to the State's economic welfare; now, therefore,		
19 20 21 22 23 24 25	BE IT RESOLVED by the House of Representatives of the Thirtieth Legislature of the State of Hawaii, Regular Session of 2020, the Senate concurring, that the Department of Land and Natural Resources, Department of Agriculture, and Hawaii Cattlemen's Council, Inc., are urged to form a State Pasture and Forest Lands Task Force and to include any additional stakeholders, in its discussions; and		
26 27 28 29	BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the task force include in its discussions the following:		
30	(1)	A representative of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs;	
31 32 33 34 35	(2)	Dean of the College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources of the University of Hawaii at Manoa, or the Dean's designees;	
36 37 38 39	(3)	Dean of the College of Forestry, Agriculture and Natural Resources Management of the University of Hawaii, or the Dean's designees;	
40 41 42	(4)	A representative of the Department of Land and Natural Resource's Na Ala Hele Trails System;	



1 2 3	(5)	A representative of the Hawaiʻi Association of Watershed Partnerships;
4 5 6	(6)	A representative of the State Game Management Advisory Commission;
7 8 9	(7)	A representative of the Hawaii Forest Industry Association;
10 11 12	(8)	A representative of the Hawaii Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force; and
13 14 15 16	(9)	Any other stakeholders, whose participation is important, as unanimously agreed upon by the Department of Land and Natural Resources, Department of Agriculture, and Hawaii Cattlemen's Council, Inc.;
17 18 19 20		s the competing demands for the use and stewardship of ture lands; and
21 22 23		I FURTHER RESOLVED that the State Pasture and Forest k Force meet at least monthly to:
24 25 26	(1)	Identify the public benefits of lands in use as pasture for local food production and protection of natural and cultural public trust resources;
27 28 29 30	(2)	Discuss alternative views on the best plan for managing state pasture lands;
31 32 33	(3)	Work collaboratively to resolve differences of opinion regarding such management;
33 34 35 36 37 38	(4)	Identify possible policy solutions that the Task Force could endorse regarding appraisals of rent for pasture leases, lease extensions, new leases, and natural resource protection; and
39 40 41	(5)	Address any related issues the Task Force may identify; and



H.C.R. NO. 200

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the State Pasture and Forest Lands Task Force submit an annual report on its findings and recommendations, including any proposed legislation, to the Legislature no later than twenty days prior to the convening of each regular session, commencing with the Regular Session of 2021; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that certified copies of this 8 9 Concurrent Resolution be transmitted to Chairperson of the Board of Land and Natural Resources; Chairperson of the Board of 10 Agriculture; Chairperson of the Board of Trustees of the Office 11 of Hawaiian Affairs; Dean of the College of Forestry, 12 13 Agriculture and Natural Resources Management of the University of Hawaii; Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of 14 Forestry and Wildlife, Na Ala Hele Trails System; Chairperson of 15 the Hawai'i Association of Watershed Partnerships; Chairperson of 16 the State Game Management Advisory Commission; President of the 17 Hawaii Forest Industry Association; Chairperson of the Hawaii 18 19 Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force; and President of the Hawaii Cattlemen's Council, Inc. 20

21

7

22

23

OFFERED BY:

MAR 0 5 2020

