# A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO FACE SURVEILLANCE.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that the unregulated use

2 of face surveillance poses a unique and significant threat to

3 the civil rights and liberties of residents and visitors of

4 Hawaii, especially with regard to the rights quaranteed by the

5 First, Fourth, and Fourteenth Amendments of the Constitution of

6 the United States and article I, sections 4, 5, 6, and 7 of the

7 Hawaii State Constitution.

10

15

8 The legislature further finds that a study published in

9 2019 by the National Institute of Standards and Technology found

that the majority of face surveillance technology systems are

11 far less accurate in identifying the faces of women, elderly

12 people, children, and people of color. These inaccuracies place

13 certain persons at an elevated risk of harmful "false positive"

14 identifications. Multiple studies and a growing base of experts

have had similar findings. Additionally, numerous studies have

16 shown that many of the databases to which face surveillance

- 1 technology is applied are plagued by racial and other biases,
- 2 which generate copycat biases in face surveillance data.
- 3 The legislature also finds that the broad application of
- 4 face surveillance in public spaces is the functional equivalent
- 5 of requiring every person to carry and display a personal photo
- 6 identification card at all times and carry a government global
- 7 positioning system tracking device, which constitutes an
- 8 unacceptable mass violation of privacy without probable cause.
- 9 The legislature further believes that the benefits of using
- 10 unregulated face surveillance can be outweighed by its harms.
- 11 One known advantage of face surveillance in Hawaii is that some
- 12 county police departments have used face surveillance technology
- 13 in a limited capacity, in coordination with the Hawaii criminal
- 14 justice data center in the department of the attorney general.
- 15 In the police departments, surveillance images of a crime are
- 16 compared against mugshots already existing in the Hawaii
- 17 criminal justice data center's database. The face surveillance
- 18 program is intended to identify possible suspects by generating
- 19 investigative leads for detectives. While the face surveillance
- 20 program is relatively new and has been used relatively few
- 21 times, the results of the program have been promising. The

- 1 legislature believes that county police departments should be
- 2 allowed to continue to use face surveillance for this limited
- 3 purpose. However, until the technology matures and proper
- 4 protections are put in place, the legislature finds further uses
- 5 of face recognition technology should be vetted and approved by
- 6 the legislature.
- 7 The legislature further finds that the increasing
- 8 prevalence and sophistication of face surveillance technology
- 9 for commercial purposes poses a unique threat to the civil
- 10 rights and liberties of the State's residents and visitors.
- 11 Commercial venues are beginning to incorporate face surveillance
- 12 technology to support in-store tracking of individuals. The
- 13 technology identifies individuals entering stores or, if the
- 14 precise identity of an individual is yet unknown, surveys the
- 15 individual's face to determine the individual's age and gender.
- 16 The legislature finds that this information is being sold
- 17 to third parties or provided to foreign governments for purposes
- 18 that are wholly inconsistent with the State's public policy and
- 19 democratic principles. At least one foreign government is said
- 20 to already have complete facial recognition profiles on all its
- 21 citizens, which it uses to suppress free speech and invade the

# H.B. NO. 4745

1	privacy of people within its borders without restraint.
2	Hawaii's citizens should not be subject to such violation of
3	privacy.
4	The purpose of this Act is to place a moratorium on:
5	(1) Government use of face surveillance other than
6	existing police department use; and
7	(2) Private use of face surveillance unless the subject of
8	the face surveillance has given clear, discrete,
9	written consent,
10	to ensure the legislature can properly vet future uses of the
11	rapidly evolving technology and prevent unintended consequences
12	from befalling Hawaii residents and their privacy and freedom.
13	SECTION 2. The Hawaii Revised Statutes is amended by
14	adding a new chapter to be appropriately designated and to read
15	as follows:
16	"CHAPTER
<b>17</b>	FACE SURVEILLANCE
18	§ -1 Definitions. As used in this chapter:
19	"Face surveillance" means an automated or semiautomated

20

process that:

14

15

# H.B. NO. 2745 H.D. 1

1	(1)	Assists in identifying or verifying an individual or
2		capturing information about an individual based on the
3		physical characteristics of the individual's face; or

- 4 (2) Uses characteristics of an individual's face, head, or body to infer emotion, associations, activities, or the location of the individual.
- 7 "Face surveillance system" means any computer software or 8 application that performs face surveillance.
- 9 "Government" means the State, or any of its political
  10 subdivisions, departments, agencies, and instrumentalities,
  11 corporate or otherwise.
- "Government official" means any person or entity acting on behalf of the State, or any of its political subdivisions,

subcontractor, or vendor.

- "Private entity" means any individual, partnership,
  corporation, limited liability company, association, or other
  group, however organized.
- 19 "Written release" means informed written consent.

including any officer, employee, agent, contractor,

- 20 § -2 Restriction on government use of face surveillance.
- 21 (a) Except as provided in subsection (b), it shall be unlawful

## H.B. NO. 2745 H.D. 1

- 1 for the government or any government official to obtain, retain,
- 2 access, or use:
- 3 (1) Any face surveillance system; or
- 4 (2) Any information obtained from a face surveillance
- 5 system.
- 6 (b) A face surveillance system or information obtained
- 7 from a face surveillance system shall only be obtained,
- 8 retained, accessed, or used:
- 9 (1) By law enforcement agency personnel trained in the use
- of a face surveillance system;
- 11 (2) To compare surveillance photographs or videos to
- arrest booking photographs from the Hawaii criminal
- justice data center;
- 14 (3) In a photo lineup conducted pursuant to section
- 15 801K-2; and
- 16 (4) By driver's license and civil identification card
- issuing agencies to satisfy the requirements of the
- 18 federal REAL ID Act of 2005.
- 19 Information obtained from a face surveillance system shall not
- 20 constitute probable cause for an arrest.

1	§ ·	-3 Restriction on private use of face surveillance
2	without pe	ermission. (a) It shall be unlawful for any private
3	entity to	obtain, retain, access, or use any face surveillance
4	system or	any information obtained through a face surveillance
5	system, u	nless the private entity first:
6	(1)	Informs the subject or the subject's legally
7		authorized representative in writing that the private
8		entity wishes to obtain, retain, access, or use a face
9		surveillance system or information obtained through a
10		<pre>face surveillance system;</pre>
11	(2)	Informs the subject or the subject's legally
12		authorized representative in writing of the specific
13		purpose and length of term for which the private
14		entity wishes to obtain, retain, access, or use a face
15		surveillance system or information obtained through a
16		face surveillance system; and
17	(3)	Receives a clear, discrete, written release, which is
18		not a part of or otherwise combined with any other
19	,	permission granting instrument or function, executed
20		by the proposed subject of the face surveillance

system or information obtained through a face

21

1	surveillance system or that subject's legally
2	authorized representative, granting permission to
3	obtain, retain, access, or use a face surveillance
4	system or information obtained through a face
5	surveillance system with respect to that subject.
6	(b) In the absence of a clear, discrete, written release
7	to do so, no private entity in possession of a face surveillance
8	system or information obtained through a face surveillance
9	system may sell, share, lease, trade, or otherwise profit from
10	information obtained through a face surveillance system.
11	(c) No private entity in possession of a face surveillance
12	system or information obtained through a face surveillance
13	system may disclose, redisclose, or otherwise disseminate
14	information obtained through a face surveillance system unless
15	the subject of the face surveillance system or information
16	obtained through the face surveillance system or the subject's
17	legally authorized representative consents to the disclosure,
18	redisclosure, or dissemination pursuant to the standards
19	contained in subsection (a).
20	(d) A private entity in possession of a face surveillance

system or information obtained through a face surveillance

21

#### H.B. NO. 2745 H.D. 1

- 1 system shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure all
- 2 information obtained through a face surveillance system:
- 3 (1) Using the reasonable standard of care within the
- 4 private entity's industry; and
- 5 (2) In a manner that is the same as or more protective
- 6 than the manner in which the private entity stores,
- 7 transmits, and protects other confidential and
- 8 sensitive information.
- 9 (e) Nothing in this section shall be construed to prohibit
- 10 private entities from using cameras for internal security
- 11 related purposes; provided that any information collected from a
- 12 camera used for internal security related purposes shall not be
- 13 sold, shared, leased, traded, or otherwise profited from as
- 14 provided in this section.
- 15 § -4 Enforcement. (a) Notwithstanding any other law to
- 16 the contrary, no data collected or derived from any use of a
- 17 face surveillance system in violation of this chapter and no
- 18 evidence derived therefrom may be received in evidence in any
- 19 trial, hearing, or other proceeding in or before any court,
- 20 grand jury, department, officer, agency, regulatory body,
- 21 legislative committee, or other authority subject to the

### H.B. NO. 2745 H.D. 1

- 1 jurisdiction of this State. Face surveillance data collected or
- 2 derived in violation of this chapter shall be considered
- 3 unlawfully obtained and shall be deleted upon discovery.
- 4 (b) Any violation of this chapter constitutes an injury
- 5 and any person may institute proceedings for injunctive relief,
- 6 declaratory relief, or writ of mandate in any court of competent
- 7 jurisdiction to enforce this chapter. An action instituted
- 8 under this subsection shall be brought against the respective
- 9 private entity or respective government, and, if necessary to
- 10 effectuate compliance with this chapter, any other governmental
- 11 agency with possession, custody, or control of data subject to
- 12 this chapter.
- 13 (c) Any person who has been subjected to face surveillance
- 14 in violation of this chapter or about whom information has been
- 15 obtained, retained, accessed, or used in violation of this
- 16 chapter, may institute proceedings in any court of competent
- 17 jurisdiction against the private entity or government and shall
- 18 be entitled to recover actual damages, but not less than
- 19 liquidated damages of \$100 for each violation or \$1,000,
- 20 whichever is greater.

- 1 (d) A court shall award costs and reasonable attorneys'
- 2 fees to a plaintiff who is the prevailing party in an action
- 3 brought under subsection (b) or (c).
- 4 (e) Violations of this chapter by an employee of the
- 5 government shall result in consequences that may include
- 6 retraining, suspension, or termination, subject to due process
- 7 requirements and the employee's collective bargaining
- 8 agreement."
- 9 SECTION 3. This Act does not affect rights and duties that
- 10 matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were
- 11 begun before its effective date.
- 12 SECTION 4. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2050.

#### Report Title:

Face Surveillance; Government Use; Private Use; Consent

#### Description:

Limits the government use of face surveillance except in certain circumstances. Limits the private use of face surveillance unless the subject of the face surveillance has given consent. Takes effect on 7/1/2050. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.