H.B. NO.

A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO DOMESTIC VIOLENCE.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

SECTION 1. The legislature finds that Oregon has adopted a 1 pioneering approach to addressing certain challenges associated 2 with prosecuting domestic violence cases in which the victims 3 are uncooperative. Victims in these cases are often reluctant 4 to testify in court and may ignore court subpoenas to appear for 5 This reluctance has been attributed to fear of the 6 trial. perpetrator, consequences threatened by the perpetrator if the 7 victim testifies, or more generally to the complicated dynamic 8 9 of abusive relationships in which the abuser wields power and 10 control over the victim while promising to change and begging 11 for forgiveness between acts of violence.

More specifically, the legislature finds that Oregon's rules of evidence provide a limited hearsay exception for a statement made by a victim of domestic violence to a government official within twenty-four hours of a domestic violence attack, even if the statement is testimonial in nature, as long as the

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

statement bears "sufficient indicia of reliability", which is a
 determination made by the trial judge.

The legislature notes that the general prohibition on the 3 use of hearsay evidence stems from the federal and state 4 constitutional right of a defendant in a criminal trial to 5 confront the defendant's accusers. This right was examined at 6 length in the United States Supreme Court's opinion in Crawford 7 v. Washington, 541 U.S. 36 (2004), and clarified by the Court in 8 9 Davis v. Washington, 547 U.S. 813 (2006). However, a 2017 10 article in the Boston College Journal of Law and Social Justice 11 noted that Oregon's hearsay exception adequately safeguards a 12 defendant's confrontation right by setting a clear time limit 13 for the admissible hearsay statement to be made, and that in a domestic violence context, victim statements made within twenty-14 four hours of an incident are the most reliable. After this 15 16 window, the willingness of victims to cooperate diminishes, the potential for coercion increases, and memories become less 17 18 clear.

19 The legislature further notes that Oregon's hearsay 20 exception is premised on a policy approach that treats domestic 21 violence cases as a form of "ongoing emergency". That is, given

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

Page 2

H.B. NO. ²⁶¹⁰ H.D. 2

the statistics showing that incidents of domestic violence tend 1 to escalate over time and sometimes culminate in the victim's 2 death, the mere fact that a single domestic violence attack has 3 ended does not necessarily mean that the emergency has ended. 4 The legislature believes that recognition of a domestic violence 5 incident as being part of a larger "ongoing emergency" is what 6 distinguishes, and makes admissible in certain circumstances, 7 what would otherwise be considered an inadmissible hearsay 8 statement under Crawford v. Washington, Davis v. Washington, and 9 10 State v. Fields, 115 Hawaii 503 (2007), a Hawaii supreme court 11 opinion that discussed the holdings of the two federal cases. The legislature further believes that, to effectively prosecute 12 13 domestic violence cases and hold offenders accountable, the 14 Hawaii rules of evidence must strike a balance between 15 protecting the constitutional rights of defendants while 16 promoting the safety of domestic violence victims and the larger 17 society.

18 Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to allow a narrow 19 hearsay exception for non-testimonial statements made by a 20 domestic violence victim within not more than a twenty-four hour 21 period of a domestic violence attack and prior to the defendant

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

1	being arrested regardless of the availability of the declarant,				
2	if the statement is non-testimonial in nature, provided that the				
3	statement is determined to bear sufficient indicia of				
4	reliability.				
5	SECTION 2. Section 626-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is				
6	amended by amending rule 803, subsection (b), to read as				
7	follows:				
8	"(b)	Other exceptions.			
9	(1)	Present sense impression. A statement describing or			
10		explaining an event or condition made while the			
11		declarant was perceiving the event or condition or			
12		immediately thereafter.			
13	(2)	Excited utterance. A statement relating to a			
14		startling event or condition made while the declarant			
15		was under the stress of excitement caused by the event			
16		or condition.			
17	(3)	Then existing mental, emotional, or physical			
18		condition. A statement of the declarant's then			
19		existing state of mind, emotion, sensation, or			
20		physical condition (such as intent, plan, motive,			
21		design, mental feeling, pain, and bodily health), but			

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

not including a statement of memory or belief to prove
 the fact remembered or believed unless it relates to
 the execution, revocation, identification, or terms of
 declarant's will.

5 (4) Statements for purposes of medical diagnosis or
6 treatment. Statements made for purposes of medical
7 diagnosis or treatment and describing medical history,
8 or past or present symptoms, pain, or sensations, or
9 the inception or general character of the cause or
10 external source thereof insofar as reasonably
11 pertinent to diagnosis or treatment.

12 (5) Reserved.

Records of regularly conducted activity. A 13 (6) memorandum, report, record, or data compilation, in 14 15 any form, of acts, events, conditions, opinions, or diagnoses, made in the course of a regularly conducted 16 activity, at or near the time of the acts, events, 17 conditions, opinions, or diagnoses, as shown by the 18 testimony of the custodian or other qualified witness, 19 or by certification that complies with rule 902(11) or 20 a statute permitting certification, unless the sources 21

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

Page 5

H.B. NO. ²⁶¹⁰ H.D. 2

of information or other circumstances indicate lack of 1 2 trustworthiness. Absence of entry in records kept in accordance with 3 (7)the provisions of paragraph (6). Evidence that a 4 matter is not included in the memoranda, reports, 5 records, or data compilations, in any form, kept in 6 accordance with the provisions of paragraph (6), to 7 prove the nonoccurrence or nonexistence of the matter, 8 9 if the matter was of a kind of which a memorandum, report, record, or data compilation was regularly made 10 and preserved, unless the sources of information or 11 other circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness. 12 (8) Public records and reports. Records, reports, 13 statements, or data compilations, in any form, of 14 public offices or agencies, setting forth (A) the 15 activities of the office or agency, or (B) matters 16 observed pursuant to duty imposed by law as to which 17 matters there was a duty to report, excluding, 18 however, in criminal cases matters observed by police 19 officers and other law enforcement personnel, or (C) 20 in civil proceedings and against the government in 21

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

H.B. NO. ²⁶¹⁰ H.D. 2 S.D. 2

criminal cases, factual findings resulting from an 1 investigation made pursuant to authority granted by 2 law, unless the sources of information or other 3 circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness. 4 Records of vital statistics. Records or data 5 (9) compilations, in any form, of births, fetal deaths, 6 deaths, or marriages, if the report thereof was made 7 to a public office pursuant to requirements of law. 8 Absence of public record or entry. To prove the 9 (10)absence of a record, report, statement, or data 10 compilation, in any form, or the nonoccurrence or 11 nonexistence of a matter of which a record, report, 12 statement, or data compilation, in any form, was 13 14 regularly made and preserved by a public office or agency, evidence in the form of a certification in 15 accordance with rule 902, or testimony, that diligent 16 search failed to disclose the record, report, 17 statement, or data compilation, or entry. 18 Records of religious organizations. Statements of 19 (11)births, marriages, divorces, deaths, legitimacy, 20 ancestry, relationship by blood or marriage, or other 21

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

8

similar facts of personal or family history, contained 1 in a regularly kept record of a religious 2 3 organization. Marriage, baptismal, and similar certificates. 4 (12)Statements of fact contained in a certificate that the 5 maker performed a marriage or other ceremony or 6 administered a sacrament, made by a clergyman, public 7 official, or other person authorized by the rules or 8 practices of a religious organization or by law to 9 perform the act certified, and purporting to have been 10 issued at the time of the act or within a reasonable 11 12 time thereafter. Family records. Statements of fact concerning 13 (13) personal or family history contained in family Bibles, 14 genealogies, charts, engravings on rings, inscriptions 15 on family portraits, engravings on urns, crypts, or 16 tombstones, or the like. 17 (14) Records of documents affecting an interest in 18 property. The record of a document purporting to 19 establish or affect an interest in property, as proof 20 of the content of the original recorded document and 21

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

Page 8

its execution and delivery by each person by whom it 1 purports to have been executed, if the record is a 2 record of a public office and an applicable statute 3 authorizes the recording of documents of that kind in 4 that office. 5 (15) Statements in documents affecting an interest in 6 property. A statement contained in a document 7 purporting to establish or affect an interest in 8 property if the matter stated was relevant to the 9 purpose of the document, unless the circumstances 10 indicate lack of trustworthiness. 11 Statements in ancient documents. Statements in a 12 (16) document in existence twenty years or more the 13 authenticity of which is established. 14 Market reports, commercial publications. Market 15 (17)quotations, tabulations, lists, directories, or other 16 published compilations, generally used and relied upon 17 by the public or by persons in particular occupations. 18 Learned treatises. To the extent called to the 19 (18)attention of an expert witness upon cross-examination 20 or relied upon by the witness in direct examination, 21

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

Page 9



statements contained in published treatises, 1 2 periodicals, or pamphlets on a subject of history, medicine, or other science or art, established as a 3 reliable authority by the testimony or admission of 4 the witness or by other expert testimony or by 5 judicial notice. If admitted, the statements may be 6 read into evidence but may not be received as 7 8 exhibits. Reputation concerning personal or family history. 9 (19)Reputation among members of the person's family by 10 blood, adoption, or marriage, or among the person's 11 associates, or in the community, concerning a person's 12 birth, adoption, marriage, divorce, death, legitimacy, 13 relationship by blood, adoption, or marriage, 14 ancestry, or other similar fact of the person's 15 personal or family history. 16 (20) Reputation concerning boundaries or general history. 17 Reputation in a community, arising before the 18 controversy, as to boundaries of or customs affecting 19 20 lands in the community, and reputation as to events of

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

H.B. NO. ²⁶¹⁰ H.D. 2

general history important to the community or state or 1 nation in which located. 2 3 (21)Reputation as to character. In proving character or a trait of character under rules 404 and 405, reputation 4 5 of a person's character among the person's associates or in the community. 6 Judgment of previous conviction. Evidence of a final 7 (22)judgment, entered after a trial or upon a plea of 8 9 quilty (but not upon a plea of nolo contendere), adjudging a person guilty of a crime punishable by 10 death or imprisonment in excess of one year, to prove 11 12 any fact essential to sustain the judgment, but not 13 including, when offered by the government in a 14 criminal prosecution for purposes other than impeachment, judgments against persons other than the 15 16 accused. The pendency of an appeal may be shown but 17 does not affect admissibility. Judgment as to personal, family or general history, or 18 (23) boundaries. Judgments as proof of matters of 19 20 personal, family or general history, or boundaries,

,



1		essential to the judgment, if the same would be			
2		provable by evidence of reputation.			
3	(24)	Statement by a victim of domestic violence.			
4		(A) A statement that purports to narrate, describe,			
5		report, or explain an incident of domestic			
6		violence, as defined in section 321-471, made by			
7		a victim of that domestic violence within a			
8		period of not more than twenty-four hours after			
9		the incident occurred and prior to the defendant			
10		being arrested regardless of the availability of			
11		the declarant, if the statement:			
12		(i) Is non-testimonial and made during an			
13			ongoing emergency;		
14		<u>(ii)</u>	Was recorded, either electronically or in		
15			writing, or was made to a law enforcement		
16			officer as defined in section 139-1,		
17			corrections officer, youth correction		
18			officer, parole or probation officer,		
19			emergency medical services provider, or		
20			firefighter; and		
21		(iii)	Has sufficient indicia of reliability.		



1		(B) In determining wh	ether a statement has sufficient	
2		indicia of reliability, the court shall consider		
3		all circumstances surrounding the statement. In		
4		determining whether a statement has sufficient		
5		indicia of reliability, the court may consider:		
6		(i) The personal	knowledge of the declarant;	
7		(ii) Whether the	statement is corroborated by	
8		evidence_oth	er than statements that are	
9		subject to a	dmission only pursuant to this	
10		paragraph;		
11		<u>(iii)</u> The timing o	f the statement; and	
12		(iv) Whether the	statement was elicited by	
13		leading ques	tions.	
14		Recantation by a declarant is not a sufficient reason		
15		for denying admission of a statement under this		
16		paragraph in the absence of other factors indicating		
17		unreliability.		
18	[(24)]	(25) Other exceptions. A statement not specifically		
19		covered by any of the exceptions in this paragraph (b)		
20		but having equivalent circumstantial guarantees of		
21		trustworthiness, if the court determines that:		

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc

H.B. NO. ²⁶¹⁰ H.D. 2 S.D. 2

1	(A) [the] <u>The</u> statement is more probative on the					
2	point for which it is offered than any other					
3	evidence which the proponent can procure through					
4	reasonable efforts $[\tau]$; and					
5	(B) [the] <u>The</u> general purposes of these rules and the					
6	interests of justice will best be served by					
7	admission of the statement into evidence.					
8	However, a statement may not be admitted under this					
9	exception unless the proponent of it makes known to					
10	the adverse party sufficiently in advance of the trial					
11	or hearing to provide the adverse party with a fair					
12	opportunity to prepare to meet it, the proponent's					
13	intention to offer the statement and the particulars					
14	of it, including the name and address of the					
15	declarant."					
16	SECTION 3. This Act does not affect rights and duties that					
17	matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were					
18	begun before its effective date.					
10						

19 SECTION 4. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed20 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.

21 SECTION 5. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.

2020-2281 HB2610 SD2 SMA.doc



Report Title:

Rules of Evidence; Hearsay Exceptions; Domestic Violence

Description:

Allows a narrow hearsay exception for non-testimonial statements made by domestic violence victims to certain government officials within 24 hours of an incident of domestic violence and prior to the arrest of the defendant, as long as the statement bears sufficient indicia of reliability. (SD2)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

