A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO DOMESTIC VIOLENCE.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that Oregon has adopted a 2 pioneering approach to addressing certain challenges associated 3 with prosecuting domestic violence cases in which the victims are uncooperative. Victims in these cases are often reluctant 4 5 to testify in court and may ignore court subpoenas to appear for This reluctance has been attributed to fear of the 6 perpetrator, consequences threatened by the perpetrator if the 7 8 victim testifies, or more generally to the complicated dynamic 9 of abusive relationships in which the abuser wields power and 10 control over the victim while promising to change and begging 11 for forgiveness between acts of violence. **12** More specifically, the legislature finds that Oregon's 13 rules of evidence provide a limited hearsay exception for a 14 statement made by a victim of domestic violence to a government 15 official within twenty-four hours of a domestic violence attack,

even if the statement is testimonial in nature, as long as the

16

- 1 statement bears "sufficient indicia of reliability", which is a
- 2 determination made by the trial judge.
- 3 The legislature notes that the general prohibition on the
- 4 use of hearsay evidence stems from the federal and state
- 5 constitutional right of a defendant in a criminal trial to
- 6 confront the defendant's accusers. This right was examined at
- 7 length in the United States Supreme Court's opinion in Crawford
- 8 v. Washington, 541 U.S. 36 (2004), and clarified by the Court in
- 9 Davis v. Washington, 547 U.S. 813 (2006). However, a 2017
- 10 article in the Boston College Journal of Law and Social Justice
- 11 noted that Oregon's hearsay exception adequately safeguards a
- 12 defendant's confrontation right by setting a clear time limit
- 13 for the admissible hearsay statement to be made, and that in a
- 14 domestic violence context, victim statements made within twenty-
- 15 four hours of an incident are the most reliable. After this
- 16 window, the willingness of victims to cooperate diminishes, the
- 17 potential for coercion increases, and memories become less
- 18 clear.
- 19 The legislature further notes that Oregon's hearsay
- 20 exception is premised on a policy approach that treats domestic
- 21 violence cases as a form of "ongoing emergency". That is, given

- 1 the statistics showing that incidents of domestic violence tend
- 2 to escalate over time and sometimes culminate in the victim's
- 3 death, the mere fact that a single domestic violence attack has
- 4 ended does not necessarily mean that the emergency has ended.
- 5 The legislature believes that recognition of a domestic violence
- 6 incident as being part of a larger "ongoing emergency" is what
- 7 distinguishes, and makes admissible in certain circumstances,
- 8 what would otherwise be considered an inadmissible hearsay
- 9 statement under Crawford v. Washington, Davis v. Washington, and
- 10 State v. Fields, 115 Hawaii 503 (2007), a Hawaii supreme court
- 11 opinion that discussed the holdings of the two federal cases.
- 12 The legislature further believes that, to effectively prosecute
- 13 domestic violence cases and hold offenders accountable, the
- 14 Hawaii rules of evidence must strike a balance between
- 15 protecting the constitutional rights of defendants while
- 16 promoting the safety of domestic violence victims and the larger
- 17 society.
- 18 Accordingly, the purpose of this Act is to allow a narrow
- 19 hearsay exception for statements made by a domestic violence
- 20 victim to a government official within twenty-four hours of a
- 21 domestic violence attack and prior to the defendant being

- 1 arrested regardless of the availability of the declarant, even
- 2 if the statement is testimonial in nature, as long as the
- 3 statement bears sufficient indicia of reliability.
- 4 SECTION 2. Section 626-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 5 amended by amending rule 803, subsection (b), to read as
- 6 follows:
- 7 "(b) Other exceptions.
- 8 (1) Present sense impression. A statement describing or
- 9 explaining an event or condition made while the
- 10 declarant was perceiving the event or condition or
- immediately thereafter.
- 12 (2) Excited utterance. A statement relating to a
- 13 startling event or condition made while the declarant
- 14 was under the stress of excitement caused by the event
- or condition.
- 16 (3) Then existing mental, emotional, or physical
- 17 condition. A statement of the declarant's then
- 18 existing state of mind, emotion, sensation, or
- 19 physical condition (such as intent, plan, motive,
- design, mental feeling, pain, and bodily health), but
- 21 not including a statement of memory or belief to prove

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

H.B. NO. 4610 H.D. 2

the fact remembered or believed unless it relates to

the execution, revocation, identification, or terms of

declarant's will.

- (4) Statements for purposes of medical diagnosis or treatment. Statements made for purposes of medical diagnosis or treatment and describing medical history, or past or present symptoms, pain, or sensations, or the inception or general character of the cause or external source thereof insofar as reasonably pertinent to diagnosis or treatment.
- (5) Reserved.
- 12 Records of regularly conducted activity. A (6) memorandum, report, record, or data compilation, in 13 any form, of acts, events, conditions, opinions, or 14 diagnoses, made in the course of a regularly conducted 15 activity, at or near the time of the acts, events, 16 conditions, opinions, or diagnoses, as shown by the 17 testimony of the custodian or other qualified witness, 18 19 or by certification that complies with rule 902(11) or a statute permitting certification, unless the sources 20

1	of i	.nformation	or	other	circumstances	indicate	lack	of
2	trus	stworthiness	3 .					

- (7) Absence of entry in records kept in accordance with the provisions of paragraph (6). Evidence that a matter is not included in the memoranda, reports, records, or data compilations, in any form, kept in accordance with the provisions of paragraph (6), to prove the nonoccurrence or nonexistence of the matter, if the matter was of a kind of which a memorandum, report, record, or data compilation was regularly made and preserved, unless the sources of information or other circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness.
- (8) Public records and reports. Records, reports, statements, or data compilations, in any form, of public offices or agencies, setting forth (A) the activities of the office or agency, or (B) matters observed pursuant to duty imposed by law as to which matters there was a duty to report, excluding, however, in criminal cases matters observed by police officers and other law enforcement personnel, or (C) in civil proceedings and against the government in

H.B. NO. 2610 H.D. 2

criminal cases, factual findings resulting from an
investigation made pursuant to authority granted by
law, unless the sources of information or other
circumstances indicate lack of trustworthiness.
Records of vital statistics. Records or data
compilations, in any form, of births, fetal deaths,
deaths, or marriages, if the report thereof was made
to a public office pursuant to requirements of law.
Absence of public record or entry. To prove the
absence of a record, report, statement, or data
compilation, in any form, or the nonoccurrence or
nonexistence of a matter of which a record, report,
statement, or data compilation, in any form, was
regularly made and preserved by a public office or
agency, evidence in the form of a certification in
accordance with rule 902, or testimony, that diligent
search failed to disclose the record, report,
statement, or data compilation, or entry.
Records of religious organizations. Statements of
births, marriages, divorces, deaths, legitimacy,
ancestry, relationship by blood or marriage, or other

H.B. NO. 2610 H.D. 2

1		similar facts of personal or family history, contained
2		in a regularly kept record of a religious
3		organization.
4	(12)	Marriage, baptismal, and similar certificates.
5		Statements of fact contained in a certificate that the
6		maker performed a marriage or other ceremony or
7		administered a sacrament, made by a clergyman, public
8		official, or other person authorized by the rules or
9		practices of a religious organization or by law to
10		perform the act certified, and purporting to have been
11		issued at the time of the act or within a reasonable
12		time thereafter.
13	(13)	Family records. Statements of fact concerning
14		personal or family history contained in family Bibles,
15		genealogies, charts, engravings on rings, inscriptions
16		on family portraits, engravings on urns, crypts, or
17		tombstones, or the like.

(14) Records of documents affecting an interest in

property. The record of a document purporting to

establish or affect an interest in property, as proof

of the content of the original recorded document and

18

19

20

21

1	its execution and delivery by each person by whom it
2	purports to have been executed, if the record is a
3	record of a public office and an applicable statute
4	authorizes the recording of documents of that kind in
5	that office.

- 6 (15) Statements in documents affecting an interest in
 7 property. A statement contained in a document
 8 purporting to establish or affect an interest in
 9 property if the matter stated was relevant to the
 10 purpose of the document, unless the circumstances
 11 indicate lack of trustworthiness.
 - (16) Statements in ancient documents. Statements in a document in existence twenty years or more the authenticity of which is established.
 - (17) Market reports, commercial publications. Market
 quotations, tabulations, lists, directories, or other
 published compilations, generally used and relied upon
 by the public or by persons in particular occupations.
 - (18) Learned treatises. To the extent called to the attention of an expert witness upon cross-examination or relied upon by the witness in direct examination,

H.B. NO. 2610 H.D. 2

1		statements contained in published treatises,
2		periodicals, or pamphlets on a subject of history,
3		medicine, or other science or art, established as a
4		reliable authority by the testimony or admission of
5		the witness or by other expert testimony or by
6		judicial notice. If admitted, the statements may be
7		read into evidence but may not be received as
8		exhibits.
9	(19)	Reputation concerning personal or family history.
10		Reputation among members of the person's family by
11		blood, adoption, or marriage, or among the person's
12		associates, or in the community, concerning a person's
13		birth, adoption, marriage, divorce, death, legitimacy,
14		relationship by blood, adoption, or marriage,
15		ancestry, or other similar fact of the person's
16		personal or family history.
17	(20)	Reputation concerning boundaries or general history.
18		Reputation in a community, arising before the
19		controversy, as to boundaries of or customs affecting
20		lands in the community, and reputation as to events of

H.B. NO. 2610 H.D. 2

1		general history important to the community of state of
2		nation in which located.
3	(21)	Reputation as to character. In proving character or a
4		trait of character under rules 404 and 405, reputation
5		of a person's character among the person's associates
6		or in the community.
7	(22)	Judgment of previous conviction. Evidence of a final
8		judgment, entered after a trial or upon a plea of
9		guilty (but not upon a plea of nolo contendere),
10		adjudging a person guilty of a crime punishable by
11		death or imprisonment in excess of one year, to prove
12	٠	any fact essential to sustain the judgment, but not
13		including, when offered by the government in a
14		criminal prosecution for purposes other than
15		impeachment, judgments against persons other than the
16		accused. The pendency of an appeal may be shown but
17		does not affect admissibility.
18	(23)	Judgment as to personal, family or general history, or

boundaries. Judgments as proof of matters of

personal, family or general history, or boundaries,

19

20

1		essen	tial t	to the judgment, if the same would be		
2		prova	provable by evidence of reputation.			
3	(24)	State	ement]	by a victim of domestic violence.		
4		(A)	A stat	tement that purports to narrate, describe,		
5			repor	t, or explain an incident of domestic		
6			viole	nce, as defined in section 321-471, made by		
7			a vic	tim of that domestic violence within twenty-		
8			four	hours after the incident occurred and prior		
9			to th	e defendant being arrested regardless of the		
10			avail	ability of the declarant, if the statement:		
11			<u>(i)</u>	Was recorded, either electronically or in		
12				writing, or was made to a law enforcement		
13				officer as defined in section 139-1,		
14				corrections officer, youth correction		
15				officer, parole or probation officer,		
16				emergency medical services provider, or		
17				firefighter; and		
18		_((ii)	Has sufficient indicia of reliability.		
19		(B)	In de	termining whether a statement has sufficient		
20			indic	ia of reliability, the court shall consider		
21			all c	rircumstances surrounding the statement. In		

1		dete	rmining whether a statement has sufficient
2		indic	cia of reliability, the court may consider:
3		<u>(i)</u>	The personal knowledge of the declarant;
4		<u>(ii)</u>	Whether the statement is corroborated by
5			evidence other than statements that are
6			subject to admission only pursuant to this
7			paragraph;
8		<u>(iii)</u>	The timing of the statement; and
9		<u>(iv)</u>	Whether the statement was elicited by
10			leading questions.
11		Recantation	on by a declarant is not a sufficient reason
12		for denyi	ng admission of a statement under this
13		paragraph	in the absence of other factors indicating
14		unreliabi	lity.
15	[(24)]	(25) Othe	r exceptions. A statement not specifically
16		covered by	y any of the exceptions in this paragraph (b)
17		but havin	g equivalent circumstantial guarantees of
18		trustwort	hiness, if the court determines that:
19		(A) [the] <u>The</u> statement is more probative on the
20		poin	t for which it is offered than any other

H.B. NO. 2610 H.D. 2

1	evidence which the proponent can procure through
2	reasonable efforts $[\tau]$; and
3	(B) $[\frac{the}{}]$ The general purposes of these rules and the
4	interests of justice will best be served by
5	admission of the statement into evidence.
6	However, a statement may not be admitted under this
7	exception unless the proponent of it makes known to
8	the adverse party sufficiently in advance of the trial
9	or hearing to provide the adverse party with a fair
10	opportunity to prepare to meet it, the proponent's
11	intention to offer the statement and the particulars
12	of it, including the name and address of the
13	declarant."
14	SECTION 3. This Act does not affect rights and duties that
15	matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were
16	begun before its effective date.
17	SECTION 4. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
18	and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
19	SECTION 5. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2050.

Report Title:

Rules of Evidence; Hearsay Exceptions; Domestic Violence

Description:

Allows a narrow hearsay exception for statements made by domestic violence victims to certain government officials within 24 hours of an incident of domestic violence and prior to the arrest of the defendant, even if the statement is testimonial in nature, as long as the statement bears sufficient indicia of reliability. Effective 7/1/2050. (HD2)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.