A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM DISABILITY RETIREMENT.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

1	SECTION 1. The Employees' Retirement System of the State
2	of Hawaii's ("ERS") service-connected disability retirement and
3	accidental death provisions are intended to provide benefits
4	different than those of Hawaii's workers' compensation program.
5	The paramount purpose of Hawaii's workers' compensation law is
6	to provide compensation for an employee for all work-connected
7	injuries, regardless of questions of negligence, and the
8	legislature has decided that work injuries are among the costs
9 .	of production that industry is required to bear. Accordingly,
10	the workers' compensation statute is to be construed liberally
11	in favor of awarding compensation, and specifically creates a
12	presumption that an employee's claim is for a covered work
13	injury, in exchange for providing an employer with exclusion of
14	all other liability on account of a work injury (except for
15	sexual harassment, sexual assault and infliction of emotional
16	distress, or invasion of privacy).
17	There are no similar policies or purposes behind the ERS's

service-connected disability retirement and accidental death

18

- 1 provisions. Consequently, the ERS's service-connected
- 2 disability retirement and accidental death provisions do not
- 3 contain a presumption favoring coverage, and should not be
- 4 construed liberally in favor of awarding compensation for all
- 5 injuries and death occurring in the workplace, regardless of
- 6 questions of ERS membership position, negligence, proximate
- 7 cause, the difference between an accident and injury/incapacity,
- 8 and the burden of proof. Courts in the cases of Pasco v. Bd. of
- 9 Trustees of the Employees' Ret. Sys., 142 Haw. 373, 420 P.3d 304
- 10 (2018), as corrected (May 29, 2018), as corrected (June 4,
- 11 2018), as corrected (June 15, 2018), Stout v. Bd. of Trustees of
- 12 the Employees' Ret. Sys., 140 Haw. 177, 398 P.3d 766,
- 13 reconsideration denied, 141 Haw. 90, 404 P.3d 1279 (2017),
- 14 Panado v. Bd. of Trustees, Employees' Ret. Sys., 134 Haw. 1, 332
- 15 P.3d 144 (2014), and Fores v. Bd. of Trustees of the Employees'
- 16 Ret. Sys., Civ. 14-1-1270-06, Circuit Court of the First
- 17 Circuit, recently rendered rulings awarding ERS service-
- 18 connected disability retirement and accidental death benefits
- 19 beyond the legislature's original intent.
- These rulings have required the ERS to provide service-
- 21 connected disability retirement and accidental death benefits
- 22 that were never contemplated in determining employer

- 1 contributions, employee contributions, and employee benefits
- 2 (including monthly retirement allowance benefits to be provided
- 3 for an extended duration and at a higher rate, plus the refund
- 4 of employee contributions), and consequently, increased the
- 5 State's unfunded liability as a whole. Furthermore, ERS members
- 6 are not foreclosed from collecting ERS service retirement, ERS
- 7 ordinary disability retirement, ERS ordinary death, workers'
- 8 compensation, or social security disability; the ERS's service-
- 9 connected disability retirement and accidental death programs
- 10 should therefore not be awarded in a manner similar to an award
- 11 of ERS service retirement, ERS ordinary disability retirement,
- 12 ERS ordinary death, workers' compensation, and social security
- 13 disability benefits.
- 14 If there is any perceived ambiguity regarding the
- 15 legislative intent of the ERS's service-connected disability
- 16 retirement and accidental death statutes, as reflected in recent
- 17 court decisions, this bill addresses such perceived ambiguities.
- 18 SECTION 2. Section 88-21, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 19 amended as follows:
- 20 (1) By adding new definitions to be appropriately inserted
- 21 and to read as follows:
- ""Accident":

1	(1)	Means	s a single traumatic unlooked-for mishap or
2		unto	ward event which:
3		(A)	Is not expected or designed;
4		<u>(B)</u>	Is not a risk inherent in the member's
5			performance of routine or normal job duties;
6		<u>(C)</u>	Interrupts the member's performance of routine or
7			normal job duties; and
8		<u>(D)</u>	Precedes and precipitates:
9			(i) Medical condition, injury, disability, or
10			symptom of the foregoing that naturally and
11			proximately results in the member's
12			permanent incapacity for duty; or
13		(ii) Death of the member; and
14	(2)	Does	not include:
15		(A)	A medical condition, injury, disability, mental
16			or physical incapacity, symptom of the foregoing,
17			or death itself; and
18		<u>(B)</u>	An unexpected result of a routine performance of
19			duty, without external force, unusual stress or
20			strain.
21	<u>"Act</u>	cual p	erformance of duty": means the performance of
22	duty:		

1	(1)	Of the position, appointment, or office on which the
2		member's membership in the system is based, and for
3		which all contributions required to be made to the
4		system by the employee or the employer, or both, have
5		been made;
6	(2)	During the working hours of such the position,
7		appointment, or office; and
8	(3)	<pre>At either:</pre>
9		(A) The work premises of such the position,
10		appointment, or office; or
11		(B) Wherever the member's duties of such the
12		position, appointment, or office require the
13		member to be.
14	<u>"Inc</u>	apacitated for duty" and "incapacitated for the further
15	<u>performan</u>	ce of duty":
16	(1)	Means incapacitated for duties prescribed in the
17		official position description, or actual job duties,
18		of the position, appointment, or office on which the
19		member's membership in the system is based, and for
20		which all contributions required to be made to the
21		system by the employee or the employer, or both, have
22		been made; and

1	(2)	Does not include incapacitated for duties under
2		environmental conditions particular to the member's
3		position, appointment, or office, but not
4		incapacitated for duties of the position, appointment,
5		or office as a whole, such as an incapacitated for
6		duties at a particular location, in proximity to or
7		under the supervision of particular individuals, or
8		under other particular environmental conditions.
9	<u>"Occ</u>	upational hazard":
10	(1)	Means danger or risk inherent in, and concomitant to,
11		a particular occupation, the causative factors of
12		which are not ordinarily incident to employment in
13		general, and are different in character from those
14		found in the general run of occupations; and
15	(2)	Does not include:
16		(A) A job-related condition that results in
17		incapacitation for the further performance of
18		duty or death, without a danger or risk inherent
19		in, and concomitant to, a particular occupation;
20		(B) Work activities that are common to many
21		occupations, such as repetitive motion of hands
22		and arms, lifting, and carrying; and

1		(C) Dangers or risks that are particular to a
2		member's workplace, but not particular to the
3		member's occupation as a whole, such as a lack of
4		proper tools or malfunctioning equipment at the
5		workplace.
6	"Some	e definite time and place": means
7	(1)	A specific time or time period that is identified and
8		is of a limited and short duration, and
9	(2)	A specific place or geographic location that is
10		identified and is of a limited and small size, and
11	(3)	Does not include a time period more than a single work
12		shift."
13	(2)	By amending the definition of "accidental death" to
14	read as f	ollows:
15	""Ac	cidental death": means death that is the natural and
16	proximate	result of an accident occurring at some definite time
17	and place	while the member [was employed in a position in the
18	system wh	ich all contributions required to be made to the
19	employees	' retirement system by the employee or the employer, or
20	both, hav	e been made, was in the actual performance of duty, or
21	due to th	e result of some occupational hazard, and not caused by
22	wilful ne	gligence on the part of the member."

1 SECTION 3. Section 88-79, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 2 amended to read as follows: 3 "§88-79 Service-connected disability retirement. 4 Under rules the board of trustees may adopt, upon 5 application of a member, or the person appointed by the family 6 court as guardian of an incapacitated member, any member while 7 employed in a position in which all contributions required to be 8 made to the employees' retirement system by the employee or the 9 employer, or both, have been made, who has been permanently 10 incapacitated for duty as the natural and proximate result of an 11 accident occurring while in the actual performance of duty at 12 some definite time and place, or as the cumulative result of 13 some occupational hazard, through no wilful negligence on the 14 member's part, may be retired by the system for service-15 connected disability; provided that: 16 In the case of an accident occurring after July 1, (1)**17** 1963, the employer shall file with the system a copy 18 of the employer's report of the accident submitted to 19 the director of labor and industrial relations; 20 An application for retirement is filed with the system (2) 21 within two years of the date of the accident, or the

1		date upon which workers' compensation benefits cease,
2		whichever is later;
3	(3)	Certification is made by the head of the agency in
4		which the member is employed, stating the time, place,
5		and conditions of the service performed by the member
6		resulting in the member's disability and that the
7		disability was not the result of wilful negligence on
8		the part of the member; and
9	(4)	The medical board or other entity designated by the
10		board of trustees certifies that the member is
11		incapacitated for the further performance of duty at
12		the time of application and that the member's
13		incapacity is likely to be permanent.
14	<u>(b)</u>	The member or applicant initiating the proceeding
15	shall hav	e the burden of proof, including the burden of
16	producing	evidence as well as the burden of persuasion. The
17	degree or	quantum of proof shall be a preponderance of the
18	evidence.	The member or applicant shall have the responsibility
19	of furnis	hing all medical evidence available or which can be
20	made avai	lable to the member or applicant pertaining to the
21	member's	death or disability. Any determination of the
22	disabilit	y compensation division of the department of labor and

1

H.B. NO. 2314

industrial relations, the labor and industrial relations appeals 2 board, and the Social Security Administration relating to the 3 same incapacity for which the applicant or member is claiming a 4 disability or death benefit may be taken into consideration; 5 however, that determination shall not be binding upon the 6 medical board. The medical board may or may not, at its 7 discretion, subject the member to a physical examination in 8 arriving at its certifications and findings on all matters 9 referred to it; provided the burden of proof is not shifted to 10 the medical board, and the member or applicant has the burden of 11 proof. 12 [+b+] (c) In the case of firefighters, police officers, 13 and sewer workers, the effect of the inhalation of smoke, toxic 14 gases, chemical fumes, and other toxic vapors on the heart, 15 lungs, and respiratory system shall be construed as an injury 16 received or disease contracted while in the performance of their 17 duty and as the result of some occupational hazard for the purpose of determining occupational disability retirement under 18 19 this section. 20 Notwithstanding any other law to the contrary, any 21 condition of impairment of health caused by any disease of the 22 heart, lungs, or respiratory system, resulting in permanent

- 1 incapacity to a firefighter, police officer, or sewer worker,
- 2 shall be presumed to have been suffered in the actual
- 3 performance of duty at some definite time and place through no
- 4 wilful negligence on the firefighter's, police officer's, or
- 5 sewer worker's part, and as a result of the inherent
- 6 occupational hazard of exposure to and inhalation of smoke,
- 7 toxic gases, chemical fumes, and other toxic vapors, unless the
- 8 contrary be shown by competent evidence; provided that such
- 9 firefighter, police officer, or sewer worker shall have passed a
- 10 physical examination on entry into such service or subsequent to
- 11 such entry, which examination failed to reveal any evidence of
- 12 such condition.
- 13 $\left[\frac{(c)}{(c)}\right]$ (d) The system may waive strict compliance with the
- 14 time limits within which a report of the accident and an
- 15 application for service-connected disability retirement must be
- 16 filed with the system if it is satisfied that the failure to
- 17 file within the time limited by law was due to ignorance of fact
- 18 or law, inability, or to the fraud, misrepresentation, or deceit
- 19 of any person, or because the applicant was undergoing treatment
- 20 for the disability or was receiving vocational rehabilitation
- 21 services occasioned by the disability.

1 $[\frac{d}{d}]$ (e) The system may determine whether or not the 2 disability is the result of an accident occurring while in the 3 actual performance of duty at some definite time and place and that the disability was not the result of wilful negligence on 4 5 the part of the member. The system may accept as conclusive: The certification made by the head of the agency in 6 7 which the member is employed; or 8 (2) A finding to this effect by the medical board or other 9 entity designated by the board of trustees. 10 $[\frac{(e)}{(e)}]$ (f) Upon approval by the system, the member shall be 11 eligible to receive a service-connected disability retirement 12 benefit after the member has terminated service. Retirement 13 shall become effective on the first day of a month, except for 14 the month of December when retirement on the first or last day of the month shall be allowed." 15 SECTION 4. Section 88-82, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 16 17 amended to read as follows: 18 "§88-82 Petition for contested case hearing regarding 19 disability retirement or accidental death benefits; attorney's 20 fees and costs. (a) A member or applicant who is not satisfied 21 with the preliminary decision of the board to grant or deny an 22 application for disability retirement benefits or accidental

1 death benefits based on the certifications and findings of the 2 medical board may file a petition for contested case hearing 3 with the board within sixty days after receiving written 4 notification of the preliminary decision of the board. 5 (b) Permanent incapacity that is primarily caused by the 6 natural deterioration, degeneration, or progression of a preexisting condition is not the natural and proximate result of an 7 8 accident occurring while in the actual performance of duty at 9 some definite time and place. Permanent incapacity that is 10 primarily caused by the natural deterioration, degeneration, or 11 progression of a pre-existing condition is not the cumulative 12 result of some occupational hazard, unless the pre-existing 13 condition itself was caused by the occupational hazard. In the 14 case of an application for service-connected disability 15 retirement, where there is evidence that the member claiming 16 permanent incapacity had a pre-existing condition, the member **17** shall have the burden of proving by a preponderance of the 18 evidence that the member's permanent incapacity was not primarily caused by the pre-existing condition. 19 20 [(b)] (c) If the member or applicant is the prevailing 21 party in the contested case, and disability retirement or 22 accidental death benefits are awarded to the member or applicant

- 1 by the board or court of the appropriate jurisdiction under
- 2 section 88-75, 88-79, 88-85, 88-284, 88-285, 88-286(c), 88-334,
- 3 88-336, or 88-339, the member or applicant shall be paid
- 4 reasonable attorney's fees together with any costs payable by
- 5 the system. The attorney's fees and costs shall be subject to
- 6 the approval of the board or approval by a court of appropriate
- 7 jurisdiction after evidence has been provided by the member or
- 8 applicant regarding the reasonableness of the claimed attorney's
- 9 fees and costs."
- 10 SECTION 5. Section 88-85, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 11 amended to read as follows:
- 12 "\$88-85.5 Applications for accidental death benefits;
- 13 approval by the system. (a) Under rules the board of trustees
- 14 may adopt, an application for service-connected accidental death
- 15 benefits may be filed with the system by or on behalf of the
- 16 claimant pursuant to section 88-85, 88-286, or 88-339, on a form
- 17 provided by the system. The application shall be filed no later
- 18 than three years from the date of the member's death.
- 19 (b) After the claimant files an application for service-
- 20 connected accidental death benefits, the system shall obtain the
- 21 following:

1	(1)	A copy of the employer's report of the accident
2		submitted by the employer to the department of labor
3		and industrial relations, workers' compensation
4		division, and other reports relating to the accident;
5	(2)	A certified statement from the head of the department
6		in which the deceased member was employed, stating the
7		date, time, and place of the accident, and the nature
8		of the service being performed when the accident
9		occurred. The statement shall also include an opinion
10		as to whether or not the accident was the result of
11		wilful negligence on the deceased member's part;
12	(3)	A copy of the latest position description of the
13		deceased member's duties and responsibilities;
14	(4)	A certified copy of the death certificate; and
15	(5)	A copy of an autopsy report, if performed.
16	(c)	Upon the system's receipt of the application and
17	documents	specified in subsection (b), the medical board or
18	other ent	ity designated by the board of trustees shall determine
19	and certi	fy to the system whether the member's death was an
20	accidenta	l death as defined in section 88-21.
21	<u>(d)</u>	Death that is primarily caused by the natural
22	deteriora	tion, degeneration, or progression of a pre-existing

1 condition is not the natural and proximate result of an accident 2 occurring while in the actual performance of duty at some 3 definite time and place. Death that is primarily caused by the 4 natural deterioration, degeneration, or progression of a pre-5 existing condition is not the cumulative result of some 6 occupational hazard, unless the pre-existing condition itself 7 was caused by the occupational hazard. In the case of an 8 application for accidental death benefits, where there is 9 evidence that the member had a pre-existing condition, the 10 applicant shall have the burden of proving by a preponderance of 11 the evidence that the member's death was not primarily caused by 12 the pre-existing condition. 13 $[\frac{d}{d}]$ (e) The system may accept as conclusive as to 14 whether or not the member's death was caused by wilful 15 negligence on the part of the member: 16 (1) A certification made by the head of the agency in 17 which the member is employed; or 18 A finding by the medical board or other entity (2) 19 designated by the board of trustees. **20** [(e)] (f) After the medical board or other entity 21 designated by the board of trustees submits its certification to 22 the system, the system shall approve or disapprove the

22

H.B. NO. 2314

1 application. Upon approval of an application, benefits shall be 2 paid as provided in section 88-85, 88-286, or 88-339." 3 SECTION 6. Section 88-261, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 4 amended by amending subsection (a) to read as follows: 5 The following words and phrases as used in this part "(a) 6 shall have the same meanings as defined in section 88-21, unless 7 a different meaning is plainly required by the context: "accident"; "accidental death"; "accumulated 8 9 contributions"; "actual performance of duty"; "actuarial 10 equivalent"; "average final compensation"; "beneficiary"; 11 "board"; "county"; "employee"; "medical board"; "occupational 12 hazard"; "retirant"; "retirement allowance"; "service"; "some 13 definite time and place"; and "system"." 14 SECTION 7. Section 88-336, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 15 amended to read as follows: 16 "\$88-336 Service-connected disability retirement. (a) 17 Under rules the board of trustees may adopt, upon application of **18** a class H member, or the person appointed by the family court as 19 guardian of an incapacitated member, any class H member who has 20 been permanently incapacitated for duty as the natural and 21 proximate result of an accident occurring while in the actual

performance of duty at some definite time and place, or as the

1	cumulative	e result of some occupational hazard, through no wilful
2	negligence	e on the member's part, may be retired by the system
3	for servi	ce-connected disability; provided that:
4	(1)	In the case of an accident occurring after July 1,
5		1963, the employer shall file with the system a copy
6		of the employer's report of the accident submitted to
7		the director of labor and industrial relations;
8	(2)	An application for retirement is filed with the system
9		within two years of the date of the accident, or the
10		date upon which workers' compensation benefits cease,
11		whichever is later;
12	(3)	Certification is made by the head of the agency in
13		which the member is employed, stating the time, place,
14		and conditions of the service performed by the member
15		resulting in the member's disability and that the
16		disability was not the result of wilful negligence on
17		the part of the member; and
18	(4)	The medical board or other entity designated by the
19		board of trustees certifies that the member is
20		incapacitated for the further performance of duty at
21		the time of application and that the member's
22		incapacity is likely to be permanent.

1 (b) Permanent incapacity that is primarily caused by the 2 natural deterioration, degeneration, or progression of a pre-3 existing condition is not the natural and proximate result of an 4 accident occurring while in the actual performance of duty at 5 some definite time and place. Permanent incapacity that is 6 primarily caused by the natural deterioration, degeneration, or 7 progression of a pre-existing condition is not the cumulative 8 result of some occupational hazard, unless the pre-existing 9 condition itself was caused by the occupational hazard. In the 10 case of an application for service-connected disability retirement, where there is evidence that the member claiming 11 12 permanent incapacity had a pre-existing condition, the member 13 shall have the burden of proving by a preponderance of the 14 evidence that the member's permanent incapacity was not 15 primarily caused by the pre-existing condition. 16 $\left[\frac{b}{a}\right]$ (c) In the case of sewer workers, the effect of the 17 inhalation of smoke, toxic gases, chemical fumes, and other toxic vapors on the heart, lungs, and respiratory system shall 18 19 be construed as an injury received or disease contracted while 20 in the performance of their duty and as the result of some 21 occupational hazard for the purpose of determining occupational 22 disability retirement under this section.

1 Notwithstanding any other law to the contrary, any condition of impairment of health caused by any disease of the 2 3 heart, lungs, or respiratory system resulting in permanent incapacity to a sewer worker shall be presumed to have been 4 5 suffered in the actual performance of duty at some definite time 6 and place through no wilful negligence on the sewer worker's 7 part, and as a result of the inherent occupational hazard of 8 exposure to the inhalation of smoke, toxic gases, chemical 9 fumes, and other toxic vapors, unless the contrary be shown by 10 competent evidence; provided that the sewer worker shall have 11 passed a physical examination on entry into such service or 12 subsequent to such entry, which examination failed to reveal any 13 evidence of such condition. 14 [(c)] (d) The system may waive strict compliance with the 15 time limits within which a report of the accident and an 16 application for service-connected disability retirement must be 17 filed with the system if it is satisfied that the failure to 18 file within the time limited by law was due to ignorance of fact 19 or law, inability, or the fraud, misrepresentation, or deceit of 20 any person, or because the applicant was undergoing treatment 21 for the disability, or was receiving vocational rehabilitation 22 services occasioned by the disability.

1	[(d)] <u>(e)</u> The system may determine whether the disability
2	is the result of an accident occurring while in the actual
3	performance of duty at some definite time and place and that the
4	disability was not the result of wilful negligence on the part
5	of the member. The system may accept as conclusive:
6	(1) The certification made by the head of the agency in
7	which the member is employed; or
8	(2) A finding to this effect by the medical board or other
9	entity designated by the board of trustees.
10	$[\frac{(e)}{(f)}]$ Upon approval by the system, the member shall be
11	eligible to receive a service-connected disability retirement
12	benefit after the member has terminated service. Retirement
13	shall be effective on the first day of a month, except for the
14	month of December when retirement on the first or last day of
15	the month shall be allowed."
16	SECTION 8. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
17	and stricken. New statutory material is underscored
18	SECTION 9. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.
19	
20	INTRODUCED BY:
21	BY REQUEST
	JAN 2 1 2020

BUF-14(20)

Report Title:

Employees' Retirement System; Service-Connected Disability; Accidental Death

Description:

Clarifies the Employees' Retirement System's eligibility requirement definitions for service-connected disability and accidental death benefits.

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

JUSTIFICATION SHEET

DEPARTMENT:

Budget and Finance

TITLE:

A BILL FOR AN ACT RELATING TO EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM DISABILITY RETIREMENT.

PURPOSE:

This bill supports the legislative intent and clarifies the requirements of serviceconnected disability retirement and accidental death benefits of the Employees'

Retirement System ("ERS")

MEANS:

Amend sections 88-21, 88-79, 88-82, 88-85.5, 88-261(a), and 88-336, Hawaii Revised Statutes.

JUSTIFICATION:

The ERS's service-connected disability retirement and accidental death provisions do not contain a presumption favoring coverage, and should not be construed liberally in favor of awarding compensation for all injuries and death occurring in the workplace, regardless of questions of ERS membership position, negligence, proximate cause, the difference between an accident and injury/incapacity, and the burden of proof.

Courts in several cases recently rendered rulings awarding ERS service-connected disability retirement and/or accidental death benefits beyond the legislature's original intent.

These rulings have required the ERS to provide service-connected disability retirement and/or accidental death benefits which were never contemplated in determining employer contributions, employee contributions, and employee benefits (including monthly retirement allowance benefits to be provided for an extended duration and at a higher rate, plus the refund of employee contributions), and

consequently, increased the State's unfunded liability as a whole.

Furthermore, ERS members are not foreclosed from collecting ERS service retirement, ERS ordinary disability retirement, ERS ordinary death, workers' compensation, or social security disability.

By amending sections 88-21, 88-79, 88-82, 88-85.5, 88-261, 88-336, and 88-339, HRS, this bill clarifies the definitions and requirements of ERS service-connected disability and death benefits in order to preserve them as originally intended.

Impact on the public: None.

Impact on the department and other agencies:
None.

GENERAL FUND:

None.

OTHER FUNDS:

None.

PPBS PROGRAM

DESIGNATION:

BUF-141/Retirement.

OTHER AFFECTED

AGENCIES:

None.

EFFECTIVE DATE:

Upon approval.