## A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

- 1 SECTION 1. Act 281, Session Laws of Hawaii 2019, is 2 amended by amending section 2 to read as follows: "SECTION 2. The Hawaii Revised Statutes is amended by 3 4 adding a new chapter to be appropriately designated and to read 5 as follows: 6 "CHAPTER 7 EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES 8 -1 Definitions. As used in this chapter, unless the 9 context clearly requires otherwise: 10 "Administrator" means the person conducting the photo lineup, live lineup, or showup for law enforcement.
- 11
- "Blind" means the administrator does not know the identity 12
- 13 of the suspect in the identification procedure.
- 14 "Blinded" means the administrator may know who the suspect
- 15 is, but by virtue of the use of procedures or technology, does
- 16 not know which lineup member is being viewed by the eyewitness.

- 1 "Contamination" means the alteration, replacement, or
- 2 impairment of an eyewitness' memory of a person or event as a
- 3 result of exposure to extrinsic information related to that
- 4 person or event.
- 5 "Eyewitness" means a person who observes another person at
- 6 or near the scene of an offense.
- 7 "Filler" means either a person or a photograph of a person
- 8 who is not suspected of an offense and is included in an
- 9 identification procedure.
- 10 "Identification" means the identification by the eyewitness
- 11 of a specific person as the possible perpetrator.
- "Identification procedure" means a live lineup, a photo
- 13 lineup, or a showup.
- "Law enforcement" means any law enforcement entity
- 15 conducting an investigation.
- 16 "Live lineup" means an identification procedure in which a
- 17 group of persons, including the suspect and other persons acting
- 18 as fillers, is displayed to an eyewitness for the purpose of
- 19 determining whether the eyewitness identifies the suspect as the
- 20 possible perpetrator.

1	"Photo lineup" means an identification procedure in which
2	an array of photographs, including a photograph of the suspect
3	and additional photographs of other persons not suspected of the
4	offense, is displayed to an eyewitness either in hard copy form
5	or via computer or other electronic means for the purpose of
6	determining whether the eyewitness identifies the suspect as the
7	possible perpetrator.
8	"Showup" means an identification procedure in which an
9	eyewitness is presented in-person with a single suspect for the
10	purpose of determining whether the eyewitness identifies this
11	individual as the possible perpetrator.
12	"Suspect" means the person believed by law enforcement to
13	be the possible perpetrator of the crime.
14	§ -2 Eyewitness identification procedures for live
15	lineups and photo lineups. (a) Any law enforcement entity
16	conducting eyewitness identification procedures shall adopt
17	specific procedures for conducting photo lineups and live
18	lineups that comply with the following requirements:
19	(1) [Prior to] Before a photo lineup or live lineup, law
20	enforcement shall record in writing as complete a

description as possible of the possible perpetrator

1		provided by the eyewitness in the eyewitness' own
2		words. This statement shall also include information
3		regarding the conditions under which the eyewitness
4		observed the possible perpetrator including location,
5		time, distance, obstructions, lighting, weather
6		conditions, and other impairments, including but not
7		limited to alcohol, drugs, stress, and visual or
8		auditory disabilities;
9	(2)	The eyewitness shall [also] be asked if the
10		eyewitness' vision needs correction by glasses or

- eyewitness shall [also] be asked if the
  eyewitness' vision needs correction by glasses or
  contact lenses and whether the eyewitness was wearing
  them at the time of the offense. The administrator
  shall note whether the eyewitness was wearing glasses
  or contact lenses at the time of the identification
  procedure;
- (3) All live lineups and photo lineups shall be conducted blind unless to do so would place an undue burden on law enforcement or the investigation; and
- (4) The eyewitness shall be instructed, without other eyewitnesses present, [prior to] before any live lineup or photo lineup, that:

1		(4)	The suspect may or may not be among the persons
2			in the identification procedure;
3		(B)	The administrator does not know the identity of
4			the suspect, if applicable;
5		(C)	The eyewitness should not feel compelled to make
6			an identification;
7		(D)	The investigation will continue whether or not an
8			identification is made;
9		(E)	The procedure requires the administrator to ask
10			the eyewitness to make a statement, in the
11			eyewitness' own words, if the eyewitness makes an
12			identification; and
13		(F)	Speaking with other witnesses or the media may
14			hinder prosecution.
15	(b)	The	administrator shall comply with the following:
16	(1)	In a	photo lineup, any photograph of the suspect
17		[ <del>sha</del>	ll be contemporary and] shall resemble the
18		susp	ect's appearance at the time of the offense;
19	(2)	In a	photo lineup, to the extent practicable, there
20		shal	l be no characteristics of the photographs
21		them	selves or the background context in which they are

T		ртас	ed that makes any of the photographs undury stand
2		out;	
3	(3)	A pho	oto lineup or live lineup shall be composed so
4		that	the fillers generally resemble the eyewitness'
5		desc	ription of the possible perpetrator, while
6		ensu	ring that the suspect does not unduly stand out
7		from	the fillers;
8	(4)	In a	photo lineup or live lineup, the administrator
9		shal	l comply with the following:
10		(A)	All fillers selected shall resemble the
11			eyewitness' description of the possible
12			perpetrator in significant features including but
13			not limited to face, weight, build, and skin
14			tone;
15		(B)	At least five fillers shall be included in a
16			photo lineup in addition to the suspect;
17		(C)	At least four fillers shall be included in a live
18			lineup in addition to the suspect; and
19		(D)	If the eyewitness has previously viewed a photo
20			lineup or live lineup in connection with the
21			identification of another nerson suspected of

## H.B. NO. H.D. 1

T		involvement in the offense, the fillers in the
2		lineup in which the instant suspect participates
3		shall be different from the fillers used in any
4		prior lineups;
5	(5)	In a live lineup, no identifying actions, such as
6		[speech,] gestures[,] or other movements, shall be
7		performed by lineup participants;
8	(6)	In a live lineup, all lineup participants shall be out
9		of view of the eyewitness [prior to] before the
10		identification procedure;
11	(7)	In a photo lineup or live lineup, nothing shall be
12		said to the eyewitness regarding the suspect's
13		position in the lineup; and
14	(8)	In a photo lineup or live lineup, nothing shall be
15		said to the eyewitness that might influence the
16		eyewitness' identification of any particular lineup
17		member.
18	(c)	If there are multiple eyewitnesses, the administrator
19	shall com	ply with the following:
20	(1)	Each eyewitness shall view photo lineups or live
21		lineups separately;

1	(2)	The suspect shall be [randomly positioned] permitted
2		to select their position in the live lineup or photo
3		lineup for each eyewitness; and

- 4 (3) The eyewitnesses shall not be permitted to communicate
  5 with each other until all identification procedures
  6 have been completed.
- 7 (d) In any identification procedure, no writings or
  8 information concerning [the current investigation or] any
  9 previous arrest, indictment, or conviction of the suspect shall
  10 be visible or made known to an eyewitness.
- (e) When there are multiple suspects, each identificationprocedure shall include only one suspect.
- (f) In any identification procedure where an eyewitness

  makes an identification, the administrator shall seek and

  document a clear statement from the eyewitness of the

  eyewitness' confidence in the identification at the time of the

  identification in the eyewitness' own words.
- 18 (g) In any identification procedure where an eyewitness
  19 makes an identification, the eyewitness shall not be provided
  20 with any information concerning the person identified before the

1	administrator obtains the eyewitness' statement about the
2	identification.
3	(h) Law enforcement shall make a record of each
4	identification procedure, including all identification and non-
5	identification results obtained, undertaken during all
6	investigations. Each identification procedure record shall be
7	signed by the relevant eyewitness.
8	(i) When it is impracticable for a blind administrator to
9	conduct a lineup, the investigator shall state in writing, in
10	the identification procedure record, the reason therefor.
11	§ -3 Eyewitness identification procedures for showups.
12	(a) The administrator shall comply with the following in
13	conducting a showup:
14	(1) [Where possible, Except as provided in this
15	subsection, the administrator shall perform a live
16	lineup or photo lineup instead of a showup;
17	(2) A showup shall only be performed using a live suspect
18	and only in exigent circumstances [that require the
19	immediate display of a suspect to an eyewitness; ].
20	For purposes of this paragraph, "exigent

circumstances" means circumstances that involve the

1		temporary detention or arrest of a suspect at or near
2		the scene of an offense, or during the suspect's
3		flight therefrom, pending procedures that attempt to
4		verify the identity of the suspect;
5	[ <del>(3)</del>	All showups shall be conducted blind unless to do so
6		would place an undue burden on law enforcement or the
7		investigation;
8	<del>(4)</del> ]	(3) An administrator shall not conduct a showup with
9		a photograph[. If investigators wish to determine if
10		an eyewitness can make an identification using a
11		<pre>photograph, a photo lineup shall be used;</pre>
12		suspect is someone already familiar to the eyewitness,
13		including a spouse, partner, child, relative,
14		coworker, or neighbor;
15	[ <del>(5)</del>	Prior to any showup, law enforcement shall record in
16		writing as complete a description as possible of the
17		possible perpetrator provided by the eyewitness in the
18		eyewitness' own words. This record shall also include
19		information regarding the conditions under which the
20		eyewitness observed the possible perpetrator including
21		location, time, distance, obstructions, lighting,

1		weather conditions, and other impairments including
2		but not-limited to alcohol, drugs, stress, and visual
3		or auditory disabilities;
4	<del>(6)</del> ]	(4) The eyewitness shall also be asked if the
5		eyewitness' vision needs correction by glasses or
6		contact lenses and whether the eyewitness was wearing
7		them at the time of witnessing the offense. The
8		administrator shall note whether the eyewitness was
9		wearing glasses or contact lenses at the time of the
10		identification procedure;
11	[ <del>-(7)-</del> ]	(5) The eyewitness shall be [transported to a
12		neutral, non-law enforcement] escorted to the location
13		where the suspect is being detained for the purposes
14		of a showup;
15	[ <del>(8)</del> ]	(6) The eyewitness shall be instructed, without other
16		eyewitnesses present, [prior to] before any showup
17		that:
18		(A) The suspect may or may not be the person that is
19		presented to the eyewitness;
20		(B) The administrator does not know the identity of
21		the suspect, if applicable;

1		(C)	The eyewitness should not feel compelled to make
2			an identification;
3		(D)	The investigation will continue whether or not an
4			identification is made;
5		(E)	The procedure requires the administrator to ask
6			the eyewitness to make a statement, in the
7			eyewitness' own words, if the eyewitness makes an
8			identification; and
9		(F)	Speaking with other witnesses or the media may
10			hinder prosecution.
11	(b)	At a	ny showup, in order to reduce potentially damaging
12	or prejud	icial	inferences that may be drawn by the eyewitness,
13	the admin	istra	tor shall:
14	(1)	Refr	ain from suggesting, through statements or
15		nonv	erbal conduct, that the suspect is or may be the
16		perp	etrator of the crime;
17	(2)	Refr	ain from removing the suspect from a squad car in
18		fron	at of the eyewitness; and
19	(3)	When	practicable, present the suspect to the
20		eyew	vitness without handcuffs.

1	(c)	When there are multiple eyewitnesses, [the following
2	procedure	shall apply:
3	<del>(1)</del>	Only one eyewitness at a time shall be present
4		at [the location of] the showup [to participate in the
5		showup; and
6	<del>(2)</del>	If a positive identification is made and an arrest is
7		justified, subsequent eyewitnesses shall be shown live
8		lineups or photo lineups].
9	(d)	If there are multiple suspects, the suspects shall be
10	separated	and participate in separate showups.
1	(e)	If an eyewitness makes an identification, the
12	administr	ator shall seek and document a clear statement from the
13	eyewitnes	s[7] of the eyewitness' confidence in the
14	identific	ation at the time of the identification and in the
15	eyewitnes	s' own words.
16	(f)	The administrator shall photograph each suspect or
17	cause the	suspect to be photographed at the time and place of
18	the showu	p to preserve a record of the appearance of the suspect

at the time of the showup.

1	(g)	When it is impracticable for a blind administrator to
2	conduct a	showup, the investigator shall state in writing the
3	reason the	erefor.
4	§ .	-4 Video record of identification procedures;
5	impractica	ability; alternative record. (a) Unless
6	impractica	able, a video record of each identification procedure
7	shall be	made that includes the following information:
8	(1)	All identification and non-identification results
9		obtained during the identification procedure, signed
10		by each eyewitness;
11	(2)	The names of all persons present at the identification
12		procedure, including the name of the administrator and
13		whether the administrator was blind, blinded, or non-
14		blind;
15	(3)	If an administrator other than a blind administrator
16		was used, the reason therefor;
17	(4)	The date and time of the identification procedure;
18	(5)	In a photo lineup or live lineup, any eyewitness
19		identifications of fillers; and
20	(6)	In a photo lineup or live lineup, the names of the

lineup members and other relevant identifying

# H.B. NO. H.D. 1

1	information, and the sources of all photographs or
2	persons used in the lineup.
3	(b) If a video record of the identification procedure is
4	impracticable, the administrator shall document the reason
5	therefor, and an audio record of the identification procedure
6	shall be made. The audio record shall be supplemented by the
7	following:
8	(1) All of the photographs used in a photo lineup; and
9	(2) Photographs of all of the individuals used in a live
10	lineup or showup.
11	[(c) If both a video and audio record of the
12	identification procedure are impracticable, the administrator
13	shall document in writing the reason therefor, and a written
14	record of the identification procedure shall be made. The
15	written record shall be supplemented by the following:
16	(1) All of the photographs used in a photo-lineup; and
17	(2) Photographs of all of the individuals used in a liv
18	lineup or showup.]
19	§ -5 Training by law enforcement entities. Law
20	enforcement entities shall include in their training programs
21	for law enforcement officers and recruits information on the

- 1 methods, technical aspects, and scientific findings regarding
- 2 the basis of the eyewitness identification practices and
- 3 procedures referenced in this chapter.
- 4 § -6 Noncompliance. (a) Noncompliance with the
- 5 requirements imposed by this chapter does not require the
- 6 exclusion of eyewitness identification evidence.
- 7 (b) An impermissibly suggestive eyewitness identification
- 8 procedure alone does not require the exclusion of identification
- 9 evidence.
- 10 (c) No eyewitness identification shall be deemed
- 11 inadmissible in any trial, hearing, or other proceeding in any
- 12 court of this State unless a court determines that the
- 13 identification lacks sufficient reliability, under the totality
- 14 of the circumstances, to be admissible in evidence."
- 15 SECTION 2. Act 281, Session Laws of Hawaii 2019, is
- 16 amended by amending section 4 to read as follows:
- "SECTION 4. This Act shall take effect on [June 1, 2020.]
- 18 September 1, 2020."

## H.B. NO. H.D. 1

- 1 SECTION 3. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
- 2 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 3 SECTION 4. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2050.

#### Report Title:

Honolulu Prosecuting Attorney Package; Criminal Procedure; Eyewitness Identification

#### Description:

Amends Act 281, Session Laws of Hawaii 2019 (Act 281), to provide clarification and flexibility in eyewitness identification procedures. Amends the effective date of Act 281 to 9/1/2020. Takes effect on 7/1/2050. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.