

A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO BAIL.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

- 1 SECTION 1. The legislature finds that the presumption of
- 2 innocence is the primary principle that must guide
- 3 determinations of pretrial release and detention. A defendant
- 4 may not be convicted of a crime unless and until the government
- 5 proves guilt beyond a reasonable doubt, without any burden
- 6 placed on the defendant to prove the defendant's innocence. The
- 7 underlying principle that there is a presumption of innocence in
- 8 favor of the defendant is firmly rooted in the most basic
- 9 constitutional principles. In the United States of America,
- 10 liberty is the norm and detention should be the very limited
- 11 exception.
- A defendant must be accorded due process before being
- 13 subjected to preventative detention. In the criminal pretrial
- 14 context, the United States Supreme Court has long recognized a
- 15 distinction between punitive measures that may not
- 16 constitutionally be imposed prior to a determination of guilt
- 17 and regulatory restraints that may be imposed. The bail process



1	must he	limited	for	1100	under	a	legitimate	regulatory	nurnoge
L	must be	TIMILLEG	LOT	use	unaer	а	Tegicimace	requiatory	purpose

- 2 and not as a pretrial punishment or to incapacitate an
- 3 individual for an alleged crime. Bail cannot be used to
- 4 circumvent due process protections required throughout the
- 5 preventive detention process. Federal courts have held that:
- 6 (1) A defendant's financial circumstances and possible
- 7 alternative release conditions must be considered
- 8 prior to pretrial detention;
- 9 (2) The bail determination must be based on
- individualized, case-specific reasons;
- 11 (3) A meaningful bail hearing must take place promptly
- 12 after arrest; and
- 13 (4) If a court concludes that an amount of bail the
- defendant is unable to pay is required to ensure the
- defendant's future court appearances, it may impose
- 16 that amount only upon a determination by clear and
- 17 convincing evidence that no less restrictive
- alternative will satisfy that purpose.
- 19 Pretrial release and detention practices also implicate
- 20 equal protection principles. Since liberty is a fundamental
- 21 right, traditional equal protection analysis requires the

1 government to ensure that pretrial release and detention laws do 2 not treat similar persons dissimilarly and to show that these 3 laws are necessary to achieve a compelling or overriding state 4 interest. Recently, civil rights organizations have begun suing counties in federal court on the theory that local bail laws are 5 6 treating similar persons dissimilarly based on their wealth, and 7 correlatively their race. The analysis can be boiled down to 8 the following illustration: two misdemeanor arrestees are 9 identical in every way, except that one arrestee is wealthy and 10 the other arrestee is indigent. Without an individualized 11 assessment, both arrestees will probably receive identical 12 secured bail amounts. The wealthy arrestee is able to post 13 bond, while the indigent arrestee is not. This results in the 14 wealthy arrestee being less likely to plead guilty, more likely 15 to receive a shorter sentence or be acquitted, and less likely **16** to bear the social costs of incarceration. The indigent **17** arrestee, by contrast, must bear the brunt of all of these 18 outcomes, simply because the arrestee has less money than the 19 arrestee's wealthy counterpart. This system appears to violate 20 the equal protection clause. Consequently, courts around the 21 nation have increasingly mandated, on due process and equal

- 1 protection grounds, individualized considerations of a
- 2 defendant's personal and financial circumstances prior to the
- 3 setting of bail.
- 4 The purpose of this Act is to achieve a more efficient and
- 5 just pretrial system that upholds Hawaii's laws while preserving
- 6 our community principles and local values by adopting the
- 7 recommendations of the criminal pretrial task force established
- 8 by House Concurrent Resolution No. 134, 2017 Regular Session.
- 9 SECTION 2. Section 804, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 10 amended by adding two new sections to part I to be appropriately
- 11 designated and to read as follows:
- 12 "\$804- Right to prompt hearing. Upon formal charge and
- 13 detention, the defendant shall have a right to a prompt hearing
- 14 concerning release or detention and whether any condition or
- 15 combination of conditions will reasonably assure the defendant's
- 16 appearance as required and the safety of any other person and
- 17 the community. At the hearing, the defendant shall have the
- 18 right to be represented by counsel, and, if financially unable
- 19 to obtain representation, to have counsel appointed. The
- 20 defendant shall be afforded an opportunity to testify, present
- 21 witnesses, cross-examine witnesses who appear at the hearing,

1	and prese	nt information by proffer or otherwise. The rules
2	concernin	g admissibility of evidence in criminal trials shall
3	not apply	to the presentation and consideration of information
4	at the he	aring. The defendant may be detained pending
5	completio	n of the hearing.
6	<u>§804</u>	- Monetary bail; non-violent offenders. (a) Any
7	defendant	arrested and charged with a traffic offense,
8	violation	, nonviolent petty misdemeanor offense, or nonviolent
9	misdemean	or offense shall be released on the defendant's own
10	recogniza	nce conditioned upon the defendant's appearance in
11	court and	any other least restrictive nonfinancial condition
12	necessary	to assure the defendant's appearance in court and
13	protect t	he public; provided that this subsection shall not
14	apply if:	
15	(1)	The offense involves assault, terroristic threatening,
16		sexual assault, abuse of family and household members,
17		violation of a temporary restraining order, violation
18		of an order for protection, driving under the
19		influence, negligent homicide, or any other crime of
20		violence; or
21	(2)	One or more of the following apply:

1	(A)	The defendant has a history of non-appearance
2		within the last twenty-four months;
3	<u>(B)</u>	The defendant has at least one prior conviction
4		for a misdemeanor or felony crime of violence;
5	(C)	The defendant is pending trial or sentencing at
6		the time of arrest;
7	(D)	The defendant is on probation, parole, or
8		conditional release at the time of arrest;
9	<u>(E)</u>	The defendant is also concurrently charged with a
10		violent petty misdemeanor, violent misdemeanor,
11		or any felony offense arising from the same or
12	2	separate incident; or
13	<u>(F)</u>	The defendant presents a risk of danger to any
14		other person or the community.
15	(b) If a	ny of the exceptions in subsection (a) apply,
16	monetary bail	may be set in a reasonable amount. If the
17	defendant is u	nable to post bail as ordered, the defendant shall
18	be entitled to	a prompt bail hearing."
19	SECTION 3	. Section 353-10, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
20	amended by ame	nding subsection (b) to read as follows:
21	"(h) The	centers shall.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1	(1)	Provide	orientation,	quidance,	and	technical	services;
_							

- (2) Provide social-medical-psychiatric-psychological diagnostic evaluation;
- Conduct internal pretrial risk assessments and prepare (3) and provide a bail report to the court on adult offenders within [three] two working days of admission to a community correctional center [which shall then be provided to the court for its consideration]; provided that this paragraph shall not apply to persons subject to county or state detainers, holds, or persons detained without bail, persons detained for probation violation, persons facing revocation of bail or supervised release, and persons who have had a pretrial risk assessment completed prior to admission to a community correctional center. For purposes of this [+] paragraph[+], "pretrial risk assessment" means an objective, research-based, validated assessment tool that measures a defendant's risk of flight [and], risk of criminal conduct, and risk of violence or harm to any person or the general public while on pretrial release pending adjudication[+]. The pretrial risk

1		assessment tool and procedures associated with its
2		administration shall be periodically reviewed and
3		subject to further validation at least every five
4		years to evaluate the effectiveness of the tool and
5		the procedures associated with its administration.
6		The findings of any review shall be publicly reported;
7	(4)	Provide correctional prescription program planning and
8		security classification;
9	(5)	Provide other personal and correctional services as
10		needed for both detained and committed persons;
11	(6)	Monitor and record the progress of persons assigned to
12		correctional facilities who undergo further treatment
13		or who participate in prescribed correctional
14		programs;
15	(7)	Provide continuing supervision and control of persons
16	2	ordered to be placed on pretrial supervision by the
17		court and persons ordered by the director; [and]
18	(8)	Make inquiry with the defendant concerning their
19		financial circumstances and report any information in
20		the bail report; and

1	[-(8) -]	(9)	Provide pretrial bail reports within two working
2		days	to the courts on adult offenders that are
3		cons	ented to by the defendant or that are ordered by
4		the o	court. A complete copy of the executed pretrial
5		risk	assessment delineating the scored items, the
6		tota	l score, any administrative scoring overrides
7		appl	ied, and written explanations for administrative
8		scor	ing overrides shall be included in the report.
9		The j	pretrial bail reports shall be confidential and
10		shal	l not be deemed to be public records. A copy of a
11		pret:	rial bail report shall be provided only:
12		(A)	To the defendant or defendant's counsel;
13		(B)	To the prosecuting attorney;
14		(C)	To the department of public safety;
15		(D)	To any psychiatrist, psychologist, or other
16			treatment practitioner who is treating the
17			defendant pursuant to a court order;
18		(E)	Upon request, to the adult client services
19			branch; and
20		(F)	In accordance with applicable laws, persons, or
21			entities doing research."

1	SECT	ION 4. Section 803-6, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
2	amended by	y amending subsection (b) to read as follows:
3	" (b)	In any case in which it is lawful for a police
4	officer to	o arrest a person without a warrant for a <u>nonviolent</u>
5	class C fo	elony, any misdemeanor, any petty misdemeanor, or
6	violation	, the police officer may[, but need not,] exercise
7	discretion	n and issue a citation in lieu of the requirements of
8	[+] subsec	tion[+] (a), if the police officer finds and is
9	reasonably	y satisfied that the person:
10	(1)	Will appear in court at the time designated;
11	(2)	Has no outstanding arrest warrants which would justify
12		the person's detention or give indication that the
13		person might fail to appear in court; [and]
14	(3)	That the offense is of such nature that there will be
15		no further police contact on or about the date in
16		question, or in the immediate future[-]; and
17	(4)	The offense does not involve domestic violence, sexual
18		assault, robbery, or any other offense enumerated in
19		chapter 707."

- 1 SECTION 5. Section 804-3, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 2 amended by amending subsections (a), (b), and (c) to read as
- 3 follows:
- 4 "(a) For purposes of this section, "serious crime" means
- 5 murder or attempted murder in the first degree, murder or
- 6 attempted murder in the second degree, [or] a class A [or B]
- 7 felony, [except forgery in the first degree and failing to
- 8 render aid under section 291C-12, or a class B or C felony
- 9 involving violence or threat of violence to any person; and
- 10 "bail" includes release on one's own recognizance, supervised
- 11 release, and conditional release.
- 12 (b) [Any person charged with a criminal offense shall be
- 13 bailable by sufficient sureties; provided that bail may be
- 14 denied where the charge is for a serious crime, and:] There
- 15 shall be a rebuttable presumption that any person charged with a
- 16 criminal offense, other than a serious crime, shall be released
- 17 or admitted to bail under the least restrictive conditions
- 18 required to ensure their appearance and protect the public,
- 19 unless the prosecution demonstrates by clear and convincing
- 20 evidence:
- 21 (1) There is a serious risk that the person will flee;



1	(2)	There is a serious risk that the person will obstruct
2		or attempt to obstruct justice, or therefore, injure,
3		or intimidate, or attempt to thereafter, injure, or
4		intimidate, a prospective witness or juror;
5	(3)	There is a serious risk that the person poses a danger
6		to any person or the community; or
7	(4)	There is a serious risk that the person will engage in
8		illegal activity.
9	If the pr	osecution demonstrates by clear and convincing evidence
10	one or mo	re of the serious risks listed in paragraphs (1)
11	through (4) exists, the defendant shall be detained if the court
12	finds tha	t no condition or combination of conditions is
13	sufficien	t to reasonably eliminate, reduce, or mitigate the
14	risks pre	sented.
15	(c)	Under subsection (b)(1) a rebuttable presumption
16	arises th	at there is a serious risk that the person will flee or
17	will not	appear as directed by the court where the person is
18	charged w	with a criminal offense punishable by imprisonment for
19	life with	or without possibility of parole. For purposes of
20	subsection	on (b)(3) and (4) a rebuttable presumption arises that

1	the perso	n poses a serious danger to any person or community or
2	will enga	ge in illegal activity where the court determines that:
3	(1)	The defendant has been previously convicted of a
4		serious crime involving violence or threat of violence
5		against a person within the ten-year period preceding
6		the date of the charge against the defendant;
7	(2)	The defendant is [already on bail on] pending trial or
8		sentencing for a felony charge involving violence or
9		threat of violence against a person; or
10	(3)	The defendant is on probation or parole for a serious
11		crime involving violence or threat of violence to a
12		person."
13	SECT	ION 6. Section 804-4, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
14	amended t	o read as follows:
15	"§80	4-4 When a matter of right. (a) If the charge is for
16	an offens	e for which bail is allowable under section 804-3, the
17	defendant	may be admitted to bail before conviction as a matter
18	of right[-] and under the least restrictive conditions required
19	to ensure	the defendant's appearance and to protect the public.
20	Except fo	r section 712-1207(7), bail shall be allowed for any
21	person ch	arged under section 712-1207 only subject to the

- 1 mandatory condition that the person observe geographic
- 2 restrictions that prohibit the defendant from entering or
- 3 remaining on public property, in Waikiki and other areas in the
- 4 State designated by county ordinance during the hours from 6
- 5 p.m. to 6 a.m.; and provided further that nothing contained in
- 6 this subsection shall be construed as prohibiting the imposition
- 7 of stricter geographic restrictions under section 804-7.1. The
- 8 right to bail shall continue after conviction of a misdemeanor,
- 9 petty misdemeanor, or violation, and release on bail may
- 10 continue, in the discretion of the court, after conviction of a
- 11 felony until the final determination of any motion for a new
- 12 trial, appeal, habeas corpus, or other proceedings that are
- 13 made, taken, issued, or allowed for the purpose of securing a
- 14 review of the rulings, verdict, judgment, sentence, or other
- 15 proceedings of any court or jury in or by which the defendant
- 16 has been arraigned, tried, convicted, or sentenced; provided
- 17 that:
- 18 (1) No bail shall be allowed after conviction and prior to
- 19 sentencing in cases where bail was not available under
- 20 section 804-3, or where bail was denied or revoked
- 21 before conviction;

1	(2)	No bail shall be allowed pending appeal of a felony
2		conviction where a sentence of imprisonment has been
3		imposed; and

- (3) No bail shall be allowed pending appeal of a conviction for a violation of section 712-1207, unless the court finds, based on the defendant's record, that the defendant may be admitted to bail subject to the mandatory condition that the person observe geographic restrictions that prohibit the defendant from entering or walking along the public streets or sidewalks of Waikiki or other areas in the State designated by county ordinance pursuant to section 712-1207 during the hours from 6 p.m. to 6 a.m.
- Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, any person who violates these bail restrictions shall have the person's bail revoked after hearing and shall be imprisoned forthwith.
- 18 (b) The court shall order that a person who has been found
 19 guilty of an offense and sentenced to a term of imprisonment,
 20 and who has filed an appeal or a petition for a writ of
- 21 certiorari, be detained, unless the court finds:



1	(1)	By clear and convincing evidence that the person is
2		not likely to flee or pose a danger to the safety of
3		any other person or the community if released; and
4	(2)	That the appeal is not for purpose of delay and raises
5		a substantial question of law or fact likely to result
6		in reversal or an order for a new trial.
7	If the co	urt makes these findings, the court shall order the
8	release o	f the person in accordance with section 804-7.1[+]
9	under the	least restrictive conditions required to ensure the
10	defendant	's appearance and protect the public. No defendant
11	entitled	to bail, whether bailed or not, shall be subject,
12	without t	he defendant's written consent, to the operation of any
13	sentence	passed upon the defendant, while any proceedings to
14	procure a	review of any action of the trial court or jury in the
15	premises	are pending and undetermined, except as provided in
16	section 6	41-14(a) or section 712-1207."
17	SECT	ION 7. Section 804-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
18	amended t	o read as follows:
19	"§80	4-5 By whom allowed. In cases where the punishment
20	for the o	ffense charged may be imprisonment for life not subject
21	to parole	, or imprisonment for a term more than ten years with

- 1 or without fine, a judge or justice of a court of record,
- 2 including a district judge, shall be competent to admit the
- 3 accused to bail, in conformity with sections 804-3 to 804-6. In
- 4 all other cases, the accused may be so admitted to bail by any
- 5 judge or justice of a court of record, including a district
- 6 judge, and in cases, except under section 712-1207, where the
- 7 punishment for the offense charged may not exceed two years'
- 8 imprisonment with or without fine, the sheriff, the sheriff's
- 9 deputy, the chief of police or any person named by the chief of
- 10 police, or the sheriff of Kalawao, regardless of the circuit
- 11 within which the alleged offense was committed, may admit the
- 12 accused person to bail. The court may impose conditions of
- 13 release or bail which are the least restrictive conditions
- 14 required to ensure the defendant's appearance and protect the
- 15 public."
- 16 SECTION 8. Section 804-7, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 17 amended to read as follows:
- 18 "§804-7 Release after bail. [When bail is offered and
- 19 taken the prisoner shall be discharged from custody or
- 20 imprisonment.] Any defendant for whom a monetary amount of bail
- 21 has been set by the police, other law enforcement agency, or the



- 1 court shall be permitted to post said bail amount at the police
- 2 department, law enforcement agency, or county correctional
- 3 center where the defendant is detained. Said monetary bail
- 4 shall be payable seven days a week on a twenty-four-hour basis.
- 5 Upon posting or payment of bail, the defendant or the
- 6 defendant's representative or agent shall be provided a bail
- 7 receipt and the defendant shall be released from custody
- 8 forthwith."
- 9 SECTION 9. Section 804-7.1, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 10 amended to read as follows:
- 11 "§804-7.1 Conditions of release on bail, recognizance, or
- 12 supervised release. Upon a showing that there exists a danger
- 13 that the defendant will commit a serious crime or will seek to
- 14 intimidate witnesses, or will otherwise unlawfully interfere
- 15 with the orderly administration of justice, the judicial officer
- 16 named in section 804-5 may deny the defendant's release on bail,
- 17 recognizance, or supervised release.
- 18 Upon the defendant's release on bail, recognizance, or
- 19 supervised release, however, the court may enter an order:
- 20 (1) Prohibiting the defendant from approaching or
- 21 communicating with particular persons or classes of



1		persons, except that no such order should be deemed to
2		prohibit any lawful and ethical activity of
3		defendant's counsel;
4	(2)	Prohibiting the defendant from going to certain
5		described geographical areas or premises;
6	(3)	Prohibiting the defendant from possessing any
7		dangerous weapon, engaging in certain described
8		activities, or indulging in intoxicating liquors or
9		certain drugs;
10	(4)	Requiring the defendant to report regularly to and
11		remain under the supervision of an officer of the
12		court;
13	(5)	Requiring the defendant to maintain employment, or, if
14		unemployed, to actively seek employment, or attend an
15		educational or vocational institution;
16	(6)	Requiring the defendant to comply with a specified
17		curfew;
18	(7)	Requiring the defendant to seek and maintain mental
19		health treatment or testing, including treatment for
20		drug or alcohol dependency, or to remain in a
21		specified institution for that purpose;

1	(8)	Requiring the defendant to remain in the jurisdiction
2		of the judicial circuit in which the charges are
3		pending unless approval is obtained from a court of
4		competent jurisdiction to leave the jurisdiction of
5		the court;
6	(9)	Requiring the defendant to satisfy any other condition
7		reasonably necessary to assure the appearance of the
8		person as required and to assure the safety of any
9		other person or community; or
10	(10)	Imposing any combination of conditions listed above[+]
11		or any other least restrictive nonfinancial conditions
12		required to assure the defendant's appearance and
13		protect the public.
14	The	judicial officer may revoke a defendant's bail upon
15	proof that the defendant has breached any of the conditions	
16	imposed."	
17	SECTION 10. Section 804-9, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is	
18	amended to read as follows:	
19	"§804-9 Amount. The amount of bail rests in the	
20	discretion of the justice or judge or the officers named in	
21	section 804-5(+ but) and shall be set in reasonable amounts	

- 1 based upon all available information, including the offense
- 2 alleged, possible punishment upon conviction, and the offender's
- 3 financial ability to afford bail. Bail amounts should be so
- 4 determined as not to suffer the wealthy to escape by the payment
- 5 of a pecuniary penalty, nor to render the privilege useless to
- 6 the poor. [In all cases, the officer letting to bail should
- 7 consider the punishment to be inflicted on conviction, and the
- 8 pecuniary circumstances of the party accused.] "
- 9 SECTION 11. This Act does not affect rights and duties
- 10 that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that
- 11 were begun before its effective date.
- 12 SECTION 12. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
- 13 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 14 SECTION 13. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.

15

INTRODUCED BY:

Resulting

HB HMS 2019-1476



Report Title:

Bail; Criminal Pretrial Task Force

Description:

Incorporates the statutory revisions suggested by the Criminal Pretrial Task Force established by House Concurrent Resolution No. 134, 2017 Regular Session.

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.