ON THE FOLLOWING MEASURE:

S.B. NO. 2539, RELATING TO CHILD CARE.

BEFORE THE:

SENATE COMMITTEE ON HUMAN SERVICES

DATE: Monday, February 5, 2018 **TIME:** 3:45 p.m.

LOCATION: State Capitol, Room 16

TESTIFIER(S): Russell A. Suzuki, Acting Attorney General, or

Michelle M.L. Puu, Deputy Attorney General

Chair Green and Members of the Committee:

The Department of the Attorney General supports the spirit of this bill while noting the following legal concerns.

This bill seeks to convict child care providers of a misdemeanor offense when they fail to properly care for a child and as a result, that child is injured or killed. First, this wording is vague as the range between injury and death is extremely broad—a minor scratch should not be treated to be as severe as a death. Second, it is unclear why a caretaker deemed responsible for an injury would receive the same misdemeanor consequence as another deemed culpable in a child's death. Third, this conviction may foreclose prosecutions of the same conduct for more serious offenses (e.g., felony assault or manslaughter). See State v. Modica, 58 Hawaii 249 (1977), and section 701-109(2), Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS). More specifically, Modica requires the lesser offense to be charged when the same conduct amounts to both a lesser and a higher level offense. Also, Hawaii law bars the prosecution from subjecting an individual to separate trials for multiple offenses which arise from the same conduct. See section 701-109(2), HRS.

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:41:55 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Troy Wurtz		Support	No

Comments:

Hello. My name is Troy Wurtz. My daughter Zoë Wurtz died while under the care or her licensed babysitter on July 21, 2015. She was only only 6 months old. We could not seek justice through the criminal court because what happened to our daughter did not fit the definitions of any possible criminal charges pertaining to a person causing the death of another person. No laws exist for where and what happened to her. We could not persue her in the civil court because she claimed bankruptcy. Today, she is babysitting 4 children in her home. Our daughter died and there was no punishment. I strongly support SB 2539. This law is absolutely necessary to protect the lives and well being of our keiki in the care of others. The bill would establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause the death of children. We must instill accountability where there is currently none.

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 10:35:55 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Clarice		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 10:36:19 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kimberlee Pagan		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 10:36:23 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kristen Yoshikane		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 10:41:00 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Claire Nance		Comments	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u>

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 10:41:55 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Frank Nance		Comments	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/2/2018 11:12:15 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Katie Flanagan		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u>

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 5:01:52 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kimberly Fujita		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 5:54:05 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
susan henness	private citizen	Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 6:06:56 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing	
william muir		Support	No	

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2018 7:14:56 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Jane Fujita		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 7:45:29 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Jim Hayden		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 8:31:27 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Steve Montgomery		Support	No

Comments:

I strongly support SB2539. This law is absolutely necessary to protect children's lives and well-being when in the care of others. The bill would establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause the death of children. We must instill accountability with those who accept responsibility for these children. Currently there is no accountability & so no pressure to take the time or trouble to do things safely & carefully.

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 8:38:52 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Fernando R Pizarro		Comments	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 9:18:59 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Terumi Benson		Support	No

Comments:

I believe in this bill. I strongly support SB2539. This law is necessary to protect the lives and

well being of our children. The bill wuld establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for

State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause

the death of children. We must instill accountability where there is currently none.

Terumi Benson

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 9:23:49 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Hedda Balch		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 10:18:39 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Marilyn King		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 10:26:14 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Rosemary Malvey		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2018 11:22:57 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Marigold Zoll		Support	No

Comments:

I strongly support SB2539 as it would ensure accountability for daycare providers where there currently is none.

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 11:45:49 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kenneth King		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 12:17:43 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Adam Dorr		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 12:23:36 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kristen Teranishi		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u>

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 12:49:34 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Jennifer K Camp		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 1:41:54 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
William Haines		Support	No

Comments:

I was born and raised in Hawaii, and I strongly support SB2539. This law is absolutely necessary to protect the lives and well-being of our keiki in the care of others. The bill would establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause the death of children. We must instill accountability where there is currently none.

Mahalo, Will Haines

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2018 2:26:28 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
John Vetter	Individual	Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 4:28:14 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Michael Richardson	Climb Aloha	Support	No

Comments:

Dear Committee Members,

I strongly support SB2539. This law is absolutely necessary to protect the lives and well-being of our keiki in the care of others. The bill would establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause the death of children. We must instill accountability where there is currently none.

Thank you,

Michael Richardson

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 4:34:36 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
afsheen siddiqi		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 7:33:24 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Lisa Nicchitta		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 7:34:18 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
emily king		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/3/2018 8:12:09 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Margaret J.S. Koehler		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2018 10:20:24 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Emma Yuen		Support	No

Comments:

Aloha Committee Members,

Please pass this bill. This will provide real consequences for those who put the lives of our children in danger by violating day care laws. Mahalo.

Emma Yuen

1350 Ala Moana Blvd.

Honolulu HI 96814

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 6:00:19 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Angela Clement		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 6:01:43 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
David Itano		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 6:39:01 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Carl Meyer		Support	Yes

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 8:21:09 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Adam Vorsino		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:26:29 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Leila Wheeler		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:36:58 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Christine Umipeg- Apilado		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:40:19 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Derrick Apilado		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:50:00 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Craig Nelson		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:50:38 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
james faumuina		Support	No

Comments:

The care and safety of our keiki require and should automatically be prioritized by government. As this service member has dedicated her life and service to well being of our country and state so should of been the laws that protect her family. Unfortunately, thru negligence it failed her daughter, please make right what is wrong and ensure our children are protected.

Lt Col James E Faumuina

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:54:33 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Barbie Jane cabusao		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2018 9:54:33 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Wendy Umipeg-Wurtz		Support	Yes

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 10:21:48 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Kim Gushikuma		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 11:08:04 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Cynthia King		Support	Yes

Comments:

My name is Cynthia King and I am an individual citizen in strong support of SB2539. The bill would establish the potential for misdemeanor charge for those State licensed day care providers who violate state laws pertaining to child safety, and as a result, cause the injury or death of a child.

My son Wiley Muir, was not quite four months old when he passed away under the care of a State licensed day care provider, Therese Manu-Lee in February 2014. Manu-Lee provided conflicting stories about the circumstances surrounding his death. We now know that she was caring more than two times the legal number of children at the time of Wiley's death. We also now know that she had two adult men living in the house who were not approved by DHS to be present with the children. They were her sons, but they had not undergone the standard background checks and approvals. Other parents have also since told us that she would at times leave her house to run errands, leaving the children with only an assistant and/or her sons.

Following Wiley's death, Manu-Lee's State license was suspended while DHS conducted an investigation regarding the circumstances of this death. Despite the license suspension, Manu-Lee opened up a day care at another location and continued watching children. Over this same period, Manu-Lee took deposits from new parents, and did not disclose that her license was suspended. She did not provide child care services to those parents, and many never received their money back. Despite complaints about this behavior being reported to DHS, her license was reinstated once the investigation regarding Wiley's death was closed.

In July of 2015, Manu-Lee was shut down once again. Based on a tip, DHS completed a surprise inspection of her home, and she was caught with 14 children in her care, 8 of which were infants. According to her records, a total of 18 children were receiving care, though they were not all present at the time of the inspection. Her license was again suspended, this time on the grounds of physical neglect of children.

But the reason my husband and I learned all of this, is not because DHS or the police informed us. We were never called and told that the woman under whose care my baby passed away was found to be warehousing children. The reason I found out, is that I saw her in a new job, at Wilson Home Care. This is a trusted assisted living home health care service for the elderly on Oahu. A company that runs criminal and abuse

background checks. But, after my baby died under suspicious circumstances in her care, after she committing fraud innumerable times (and eventually filed for bankrupty), and after she was caught neglecting four times the legal number of infants, Therese Manu-Lee still has nothing to show for it on her record.

I believe it time to change this incredibly broken system, and instill real accountability. Our high quality day care providers want to see this policy gap filled as much as I do. They love children and care about the safety of our children above all else. Most day care providers are not like Therese Man-Lee. But if there are *any* other providers out there who make choices that put our children at risk, whether intentionally or out of sheer ignorance of safety standards that they should be versed in, there should be an option to charge them with a misdemeanor, in the hopes that such injury will not be repeated again in the future.

<u>SB-2539</u>

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 12:02:45 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Jarrod Quon		Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 11:21:39 AM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Melanie	Hawaii Air National Guard	Support	No

Comments:

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 12:02:46 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Stanley Sato		Support	No

Comments:

Aloha,

I strongly support SB2539. My close friend's 6 month old infant died in the hands of her baby sitter. Besides the loss of a perfectly healthy child, the emotional damaged it caused was immeasureable and will forever haunt my friend, her other children and her spouse. This law is absolutely necessary to protect the lives and well-being of our keiki in the care of others. The bill would establish a misdemeanor charge as an option for State licensed day care providers who violate day care laws and endanger, injure or cause the death of children. We must instill accountability where there is currently none.

Thank you for your support.

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 12:58:52 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Elzadia Kaina		Support	No

Comments:

I strongly support SB2539.

Submitted on: 2/4/2018 2:36:18 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
amy sullivan		Support	No

Comments:

<u>SB-2539</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2018 3:37:18 PM

Testimony for HMS on 2/5/2018 3:45:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	Testifier Position	Present at Hearing
Karl Magnacca		Support	No

Comments:

I strongly support SB2539. We have had largely unregulated child care in the state, at the cost of many injuries and some deaths among our keiki. This is an important enforcement tool for accountability in the system.