SB2725



LINDA LINGLE



CHIYOME LEINAALA FUKINO, M.D.

In reply, please refer to

Senate Committee on Health

S.B. 2725, RELATING TO CONFIDENTIALITY OF FORENSIC MENTAL HEALTH EXAMINATION REPORTS

Testimony of Chiyome Leinaala Fukino, M.D. Director of Health

February 8, 2010 2:45 p.m.

- Department's Position: The Department strongly supports this Administration-sponsored proposal.
- 2 Fiscal Implications: None
- 3 Purpose and Justification: This bill requires each forensic examiner to provide the original and three
- 4 copies of each report to the court that ordered the forensic examination. The clerk of court is required to
- 5 attach a copy of each report to the dispositive order issued pursuant to chapter 704, and deliver the
- 6 dispositive order with attached report(s) to the director of health. Other than disclosure of the reports to
- 7 prosecutor, defense counsel and the director of health, the reports are confidential and would not be
- 8 disclosed by any person without an appropriate court order. A definition of "dispositive order" is
- 9 provided.
- The court may order a mental health examination of a defendant in a criminal action in various
- circumstances pursuant to Hawaii Revised Statute (HRS) sections 704-404 (initial pre-trial report
- 12 concerning fitness to stand trial and/or penal responsibility), 704-406 (pre-trial report related to
- substantial likelihood of regaining fitness to proceed), 704-411(3) (post-acquittal report concerning
- dangerousness), and 704-414 (post-acquittal report concerning application for discharge, conditional
- 15 release, or modification of conditional release).

Currently, the courts in all judicial circuits except for the Second Circuit file the mental health examination in the public record of the defendant's case, which is available for public review. The courts in the Second Circuit seal the examinations in a locked cabinet, and the reports are not available for review by the general public. Mental health examinations are sealed in other judicial circuits occasionally on a case by case basis.

The examination reports contain information which, in any other context, would be considered protected health information, and are personal, private, and sensitive. Reports routinely list the name of the defendant, defendant's mental health and medical histories, histories of mental health and medical treatment, diagnoses, names and locations of friends and family members, numbers of children, employers and employment history, social security numbers, criminal history, and the nature and circumstances of the current charge. While the defendant opens the door to otherwise confidential personal history information by seeking a mental health examination, the examinations may be required over the defendant's objection in some cases, and in all cases the reports include a great deal of highly personal history information. In all other circumstances the information is protected to various degrees by state and federal confidentiality laws and regulations. The limitation of dissemination to the court, the prosecutor, the defense, DOH, and others only upon court order will limit the release of the information to those who have an immediate need for access to the information.

The DOH needs a copy of each report for two purposes; (1) to optimize timely treatment of the defendant committed to DOH after acquittal, or ordered to receive DOH outpatient services, and (2) quality review of the examination reports by the DOH that are submitted to the court by independent examiners.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify on this bill.