#### THE SENATE TWENTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE, 2009 STATE OF HAWAII

S.B. NO. 996

JAN 26 2009

#### A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO LANDS CONTROLLED BY THE STATE.

#### BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

SECTION 1. In 1978, the Constitution of the State of
 Hawai`i was amended to include article XII, sections 4, 5, and
 6, which established the office of Hawaiian affairs and its
 board of trustees.

5 Sections 4, 5, and 6 of the state constitution provide: 6 SECTION 4. The lands granted to the State of 7 Hawaii by Section 5(b) of the Admission Act and 8 pursuant to Article XVI, Section 7, of the State 9 Constitution, excluding therefrom lands defined as 10 "available lands" by Section 203 of the Hawaiian Homes 11 Commission Act, 1920, as amended, shall be held by the 12 State as a public trust for native Hawaiians and the 13 general public.

SECTION 5. There is hereby established an Office of Hawaiian Affairs. The Office of Hawaiian Affairs shall hold title to all the real and personal property now or hereafter set aside or conveyed to it which

18 shall be held in trust for native Hawaiians and SB LRB 09-1430.doc

### S.B. NO. 996

There shall be a board of trustees for the 1 Hawaiians. Office of Hawaiian Affairs elected by qualified voters 2 who are Hawaiians, as provided by law. The board 3 members shall be Hawaiians. There shall be not less 4 than nine members of the board of trustees; provided 5 6 that each of the following Islands have one representative: Oahu, Kauai, Maui, Molokai and 7 8 Hawaii. The board shall select a chairperson from its 9 members.

10 The board of trustees of the Office SECTION 6. 11 of Hawaiian Affairs shall exercise power as provided by law: to manage and administer the proceeds from 12 13 the sale or other disposition of the lands, natural resources, minerals and income derived from whatever 14 15 sources for native Hawaiians and Hawaiians, including 16 all income and proceeds from that pro rata portion of 17 the trust referred to in section 4 of this article for 18 native Hawaiians; to formulate policy relating to 19 affairs of native Hawaiians and Hawaiians; and to 20 exercise control over real and personal property set 21 aside by state, federal or private sources and

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

# S.B. NO. 996

1	transferred to the board for native Hawaiians and
2	Hawaiians. The board shall have the power to exercise
3	control over the Office of Hawaiian Affairs through
4	its executive officer, the administrator of the Office
5	of Hawaiian Affairs, who shall be appointed by the
6	board.
7	In Act 354, Session Laws of Hawaii 1993, the legislature
8	stated:
9	Until the provisional government was recognized by
10	John L. Stevens, the Kingdom of Hawaii was recognized as an
11	independent nation by the United States, France, and Great
12	Britain. Many native Hawaiians and others view the
13	overthrow of 1893 and subsequent actions by the United
14	States, such as supporting establishment of the provisional
15	government and later the Republic of Hawaii, the
16	designation of the crown and government lands as public
17	lands, annexation, and the ceding of public lands to the
18	federal government without the consent of native Hawaiians,
19	as illegal. Because the actions taken by the United States
20	were viewed as illegal and done without the consent of
21	native Hawaiians, many native Hawaiians feel there is a

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

OHA-04

з

1	valid legal claim for reparations. Many native Hawaiians		
2	believe that the lands taken without their consent should		
3	be returned and if not, monetary reparations made, and that		
4	they should have the right to sovereignty, or the right to		
5	self-determination and self-government as do other native		
6	American peoples.		
7	The legislature has also acknowledged that the		
8	actions by the United States were illegal and immoral,		
9	and pledges its continued support to the native		
10	Hawaiian community by taking steps to promote the		
11	restoration of the rights and dignity of native		
12	Hawaiians.		
13	In Act 359, Session Laws of Hawaii 1993, the legislature		
14	stated:		
15	(4) Throughout the 19th century and until 1893, the United		
16	States:		
17	(A) Recognized the independence of the Hawaiian		
18	Nation;		
19	(B) Extended full and complete diplomatic recognition		
20	to the Hawaiian government; and		

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

1		(C) Entered into treaties with the Hawaiian
2		government to govern commerce and navigation in
3		1826, 1842, 1849, 1875 and 1887;
4		· · · ·
5	(6)	In pursuit of that conspiracy, the United States
6		Minister and the naval representative of the United
7		States caused armed forces of the United States to
8		invade the sovereign Hawaiian Nation in support of the
9		overthrow of the indigenous and lawful government, and
10		the United States Minister thereupon extended
11		diplomatic recognition to a provisional government
12		formed by the conspirators without the consent of the
13		native Hawaiian people or the lawful Government of
14		Hawaii in violation of treaties between the two
15		nations and of international law;
16		• • • •
17	(9)	In 1898, Hawaii was annexed to the United States
18		through the Newlands Resolution without the consent of
19		or compensation to the indigenous people of Hawaii or
20		their sovereign government. As a result, the
21		indigenous people of Hawaii were denied the mechanism

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

1	for expression of their inherent sovereignty through		
2	self-government and self-determination, their lands		
3	and their ocean resources.		
4	In 1993, Congress passed Public Law 103-150, the Apology		
5	Resolution, which stated:		
6	Whereas, from 1826 until 1893, the United States		
7	recognized the independence of the Kingdom of Hawaii,		
8	extended full and complete diplomatic recognition to		
9	the Hawaiian Government, and entered into treaties and		
10	conventions with the Hawaiian monarchs to govern		
11	commerce and navigation in 1826, 1842, 1849, 1875, and		
12	1887;		
13	Whereas, on July 4, 1894, the Provisional		
14	Government declared itself to be the Republic of		
15	Hawaii;		
16	Whereas, through the Newlands Resolution, the		
17	self-declared Republic of Hawaii ceded sovereignty		
18	over the Hawaiian Islands to the United States;		
19	Whereas, the Republic of Hawaii also ceded		
20	1,800,000 acres of crown, government and public lands		
21	of the Kingdom of Hawaii, without the consent of or		

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

1	compensation to the Native Hawaiian people of Hawaii
2	or their sovereign government;
3	Whereas the Congress, through the Newlands
4	Resolution, ratified the cession, annexed Hawaii as
5	part of the United States, and vested title to the
6	lands in Hawaii in the United States;
7	Whereas the indigenous Hawaiian people never
8	directly relinquished their claims to their inherent
9	sovereignty as a people or over their national lands
10	to the United States, either through their monarchy or
11	through a plebiscite or referendum;
12	· · · ·
13	SECTION 1. ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND APOLOGY.
14	The Congress -
15	(1) On the occasion of the 100th anniversary of the
16	illegal overthrow of the Kingdom of Hawaii on January
17	17, 1893, acknowledges the historical significance of
18	this event which resulted in the suppression of the
19	inherent sovereignty of the Native Hawaiian people;
20	

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

### S.B. NO. 996

1	(3)	Apologizes to Native Hawaiians on behalf of the people
2		of the United States for the overthrow of the Kingdom
3		of Hawaii on January 17, 1893 with the participation
4		of agents and citizens of the United States, and the
5		deprivation of the rights of Native Hawaiians to self-
6		determination;
7	(4)	Expresses its commitment to acknowledge the
8		ramifications of the overthrow of the Kingdom of
9		Hawaii, in order to provide a proper foundation for
10		reconciliation between the United States and the
11		Native Hawaiian people; and
12	(5)	Urges the President of the United States to also
13		acknowledge the ramifications of the overthrow of the
14		Kingdom of Hawaii and to support reconciliation
15		efforts between the United States and the Native
16		Hawaiian people.
17	In 1	993, the legislature also adopted House Concurrent
18	Resolution	n No. 179 that included almost all of the parts of the
19	Apology R	esolution including the finding that: "Whereas the
20	indigenou	s Hawaiian people never directly relinquished their

21 claims to their inherent sovereignty as a people or over their

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

national lands to the United States, either through their
 monarchy or through a plebiscite or referendum".

In 1997, the legislature enacted Act 329, Session Laws of
Hawaii 1997, which stated:

The legislature finds that the events of history 5 6 relating to Hawaii and Native Hawaiians, including those set forth in [the Apology Resolution] continue 7 8 to contribute today to a deep sense of injustice among 9 many Native Hawaiians and others. The legislature 10 recognizes that the lasting reconciliation so desired 11 by all people of Hawaii is possible only if it fairly 12 acknowledges the past while moving into Hawaii's 13 future.

14 The legislature further finds that over the last 15 few decades, the people of Hawaii through amendments 16 to their state constitution, the acts of their 17 legislature, and other means, have moved substantially 18 toward this permanent reconciliation. Foremost among 19 these achievements have been the creation of the 20 [O]ffice of Hawaiian [A]ffairs and the allocation by 21 legislative action to the [O]ffice of Hawaiian

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

## S.B. NO. 996

[A] ffairs of substantial funds out of a portion of the public land[s] trust established by section 5(f) of the Admission Act. The overriding purpose of this Act is to continue this momentum, through further executive and legislative action in conjunction with the people of Hawaii, toward a comprehensive, just, and lasting resolution.

8 In 2001, S. 746, the federal legislation commonly referred 9 to as the "Akaka Bill" was passed out of the Senate Committee on 10 Indian Affairs. Senate Committee Report No. 107-66, on the 11 Akaka Bill explains that its purpose "is to authorize a process 12 for the reorganization of a Native Hawaiian government and to 13 provide for the recognition of the Native Hawaiian government by 14 the United States for the purpose of carrying on a government-15 to-government relationship." The Akaka Bill, authorizes the 16 federal government to negotiate with the State and the 17 reorganized native Hawaiian government for a transfer of land 18 and resources to a native Hawaiian government. The native 19 Hawaiian government would thus have a land base and resources 20 and a status similar to that of other native peoples in the 21 United States. The Committee Report on the Akaka Bill explains

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

## S.B. NO. 996

1	that "it is the Committee's intent that the references to 'land,
2	resources, and assets dedicated to [n]ative Hawaiian use'
3	include, but not be limited to lands set aside under the
4	Hawaiian Homes Commission Act and ceded lands."
5	In 2007, H.R. 505, the latest version of the Akaka Bill,
6	passed the U.S. House of Representatives. Section 8 of H.R. 505
7	also includes a provision authorizing the United States and
8	State of Hawai`i to "enter into negotiations with the Native
9	Hawaiian governing entity designed to lead to an agreement
10	addressing such matters as the transfer of lands, natural
11	resources, and other assets, and the protection of existing
12	rights related to such lands or resources[;]."
13	In January 2008, the Hawai`i supreme court in Office of
14	Hawaiian Affairs v. Housing And Community Development
15	Corporation Of Hawai'i, 117 Hawai'i 174, 177 P.3d 884 (2008) (OHA
16	v. HCDCH), enjoined the State from selling or otherwise
17	transferring to third parties any ceded lands from the public
18	lands trust until the claims of the native Hawaiian people to
19	the ceded lands have been resolved. The plaintiffs in the OHA
20	v. HCDCH case and the legislature agree that based on the
21	language of the OHA v. HCDCH decision, the Hawaii supreme court

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

# S.B. NO. 996

1	intended that the injunction would remain in place until the		
2	native Hawaiian claim to the ceded lands is resolved unless,		
3	prior to any such resolution, the legislature no longer desires		
4	reconciliation between the State and the native Hawaiian people.		
5	In other words, if prior to any resolution, the legislature no		
6	longer desired reconciliation, regardless of the Apology		
7	Resolution, the injunction would no longer be appropriate.		
8	In October 2008, the United States Supreme Court granted		
9	the State's petition for certiorari in the OHA v. HCDCH case.		
10	The legislature supports this Act as a means of preserving		
11	the status quo and ensuring that the public lands trust is		
12	preserved in order to ensure a fair and just settlement leading		
13	to reconciliation with the native Hawaiian people.		
14	SECTION 2. Chapter 171, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is		
15	amended by adding two new sections to be appropriately		
16	designated and to read as follows:		
17	" <u>§171-A</u> Sale of lands in the public land trust.		
18	Notwithstanding any law to the contrary, no sale in fee simple		
19	shall be made of:		
20	(1) Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of		
21	Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation,		

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

1		approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired in
2		exchange for lands so ceded, and granted to the State
3		of Hawaii by virtue of section 5(b) of the Admission
4		<u>Act of 1959; or</u>
5	(2)	Lands retained by the United States under section 5(c)
6		and (d) of the Admission Act of 1959 and later
7		conveyed to the State under section 5(e) or under the
8		Act of December 23, 1964 (Pub. Law 88-233, 77 Stat.
9		<u>472).</u>
10	<u>§171</u>	-B Exchange of lands in the public land trust for
11	<u>private l</u>	and. (a) Notwithstanding any law to the contrary, no
11 12		<b>and.</b> (a) Notwithstanding any law to the contrary, no shall be made of:
12	exchange	shall be made of:
12 13	exchange	shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of
12 13 14	exchange	shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation,
12 13 14 15	exchange	shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation, approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired in
12 13 14 15 16	exchange	<pre>shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation, approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired in exchange for lands so ceded, and granted to the State</pre>
12 13 14 15 16 17	exchange	<pre>shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation, approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired in exchange for lands so ceded, and granted to the State of Hawaii by virtue of section 5(b) of the Admission</pre>
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	<u>exchange</u> (1)	<pre>shall be made of: Lands ceded to the United States by the Republic of Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation, approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired in exchange for lands so ceded, and granted to the State of Hawaii by virtue of section 5(b) of the Admission Act of 1959; or</pre>

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

<b>1</b>	Act of December 23, 1964 (Pub. Law 88-233, 77 Stat.
2	<u>472).</u> "
3	SECTION 3. Section 171-13, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
4	amended to read as follows:
5	"§171-13 Disposition of public lands. Except as otherwise
6	provided by law and subject to other provisions of this chapter,
7	the board may:
8	(1) Dispose of public land in fee simple, by lease, lease
9	with option to purchase, license, or permit[ <del>; and</del> ] <u>,</u>
10	except dispositions that result in or may result in
11	alienation of the fee of lands:
12	(A) Ceded to the United States by the Republic of
13	Hawaii under the joint resolution of annexation,
14	approved July 7, 1898 (30 Stat. 750), or acquired
15	in exchange for lands so ceded, and granted to
16	the State of Hawaii by virtue of section 5(b) of
17	the Admission Act of 1959; or
18	(B) Lands retained by the United States under section
19	5(c) and (d) of the Admission Act of 1959 and
20	later conveyed to the State under section 5(e) or
21	under the Act of December 23, 1964 (Pub. Law 88-

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

1		233, 77 Stat. 472), are subject to sections 171-A
2		and 171-B; and
3	(2)	Grant easement by direct negotiation or otherwise for
4		particular purposes in perpetuity on such terms as may
5		be set by the board, subject to reverter to the State
6		upon termination or abandonment of the specific
7		purpose for which it was granted, provided the sale
8		price of such easement shall be determined pursuant to
9		section 171-17(b).
10	No person	shall be eligible to purchase or lease public lands,
11	or to be	granted a license, permit, or easement covering public
12	lands, wh	o has had during the five years preceding the date of
13	dispositi	on a previous sale, lease, license, permit, or easement
14	covering	public lands cancelled for failure to satisfy the terms
15	and condi	tions thereof."

16 SECTION 4. This Act does not affect the state practice of 17 transferring remnants, and issuing licenses, permits, easements 18 and leases.

19 SECTION 5. This Act shall remain in effect until the 20 claims of the native Hawaiian people to the public land trust 21 lands have been resolved or until the legislature finds that the

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

OHA-04

#### S.B. NO. 996

1 State no longer supports reconciliation between the State and 2 the native Hawaiian people. 3 SECTION 6. In codifying the new sections added by section 4 2 of this Act, the revisor of statutes shall substitute 5 appropriate section numbers for the letters used in designating 6 the new sections in this Act. 7 SECTION 7. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed 8 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. 9 SECTION 8. This Act shall take effect upon its approval. 10 INTRODUCED BY:

By Request

SB LRB 09-1430.doc

s.b. NO. **196** 

Report Title:

Office of Hawaiian Affairs; Ceded Lands

#### Description:

Prohibits the disposition in fee simple of ceded lands.

