A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO CONFIDENTIALITY OF FORENSIC MENTAL HEALTH EXAMINATION REPORTS.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

- 1 SECTION 1. The purpose of this Act is to amend the law
- 2 governing the confidentiality of the reports of examinations of
- 3 defendants with respect to physical or mental disease, disorder,
- 4 or defect, fitness to proceed, and penal responsibility.
- 5 SECTION 2. Section 704-404, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 6 amended to read as follows:
- 7 "S704-404 Examination of defendant with respect to physical
- 8 or mental disease, disorder, or defect. (1) Whenever the
- 9 defendant has filed a notice of intention to rely on the defense
- 10 of physical or mental disease, disorder, or defect excluding
- 11 responsibility, or there is reason to doubt the defendant's
- 12 fitness to proceed, or reason to believe that the physical or
- 13 mental disease, disorder, or defect of the defendant will or has
- 14 become an issue in the case, the court may immediately suspend
- 15 all further proceedings in the prosecution. If a trial jury has
- 16 been empanelled, it shall be discharged or retained at the

- 1 discretion of the court. The discharge of the trial jury shall
- 2 not be a bar to further prosecution.
- 3 (2) Upon suspension of further proceedings in the
- 4 prosecution, the court shall appoint three qualified examiners
- 5 in felony cases and one qualified examiner in nonfelony cases to
- 6 examine and report upon the physical and mental condition of the
- 7 defendant. In felony cases the court shall appoint at least one
- 8 psychiatrist and at least one licensed psychologist. The third
- 9 member may be a psychiatrist, licensed psychologist, or
- 10 qualified physician. One of the three shall be a psychiatrist
- 11 or licensed psychologist designated by the director of health
- 12 from within the department of health. In nonfelony cases the
- 13 court may appoint either a psychiatrist or a licensed
- 14 psychologist. All examiners shall be appointed from a list of
- 15 certified examiners as determined by the department of health.
- 16 The court, in appropriate circumstances, may appoint an
- 17 additional examiner or examiners. The examination may be
- 18 conducted on an out-patient basis or, in the court's discretion,
- 19 when necessary the court may order the defendant to be committed
- 20 to a hospital or other suitable facility for the purpose of the
- 21 examination for a period not exceeding thirty days, or such
- 22 longer period as the court determines to be necessary for the

- 1 purpose. The court may direct that one or more qualified
- 2 physicians or psychologists retained by the defendant be
- 3 permitted to witness the examination. As used in this section
- 4 the term "licensed psychologist" includes psychologists exempted
- from licensure by section 465-3(a)(3).
- 6 (3) An examination performed under this section may employ
- 7 any method that is accepted by the professions of medicine or
- 8 psychology for the examination of those alleged to be affected
- 9 by a physical or mental disease, disorder, or defect; provided
- 10 that each examiner shall form and render diagnoses and opinions
- 11 upon the physical and mental condition of the defendant
- 12 independently from the other examiners, and the examiners, upon
- 13 approval of the court, may secure the services of clinical
- 14 psychologists and other medical or paramedical specialists to
- 15 assist in the examination and diagnosis.
- 16 (4) The report of the examination shall include the
- 17 following:
- (a) A description of the nature of the examination;
- 19 (b) A diagnosis of the physical or mental condition of the
- 20 defendant;

1	(c)	An opinion as to the defendant's capacity to understand
2		the proceedings against the defendant and to assist in
3		the defendant's own defense;
4	(b)	An opinion as to the extent, if any, to which the
5		capacity of the defendant to appreciate the
6		wrongfulness of the defendant's conduct or to conform
7		the defendant's conduct to the requirements of law was
8		impaired at the time of the conduct alleged;
9	(e)	When directed by the court, an opinion as to the
10		capacity of the defendant to have a particular state
11		of mind that is required to establish an element of
12		the offense charged; and
13	(f)	Where more than one examiner is appointed, a statement
14		that the diagnosis and opinion rendered were arrived
15		at independently of any other examiner, unless there
16		is a showing to the court of a clear need for
17		communication between or among the examiners for
18		clarification. A description of the communication
19		shall be included in the report. After all reports
20		are submitted to the court, examiners may confer
21		without restriction.

- 1 (5) If the examination cannot be conducted by reason of
- 2 the unwillingness of the defendant to participate therein, the
- 3 report shall so state and shall include, if possible, an opinion
- 4 as to whether such unwillingness of the defendant was the result
- 5 of physical or mental disease, disorder, or defect.
- 6 (6) [Three] An original and three copies of the report of
- 7 the examination, including any supporting documents, shall be
- 8 filed with the clerk of the court, who shall cause copies to be
- 9 delivered to the prosecuting attorney and to counsel for the
- 10 defendant. The clerk of the court shall cause a copy of each
- 11 dispositive order concerning proceedings under this chapter and
- 12 section 706-607 to be delivered to the director of health, and
- 13 shall attach the third copy of the report, including any
- 14 supporting documents, to the director of health's copy of each
- 15 dispositive order that results from a hearing pursuant to this
- 16 chapter and section 706-607.
- 17 (7) Any examiner shall be permitted to make a separate
- 18 explanation reasonably serving to clarify the examiner's
- 19 diagnosis or opinion.
- 20 (8) The court shall obtain all existing medical, mental
- 21 health, social, police, and juvenile records, including those
- 22 expunged, and other pertinent records in the custody of public



1 agencies, notwithstanding any other statutes, and make such 2 records available for inspection by the examiners. If, pursuant 3 to this section, the court orders the defendant committed to a hospital or other suitable facility under the control of the 4 5 director of health, then the county police departments shall 6 provide to the director of health and the defendant copies of 7 all police reports from cases filed against the defendant which have been adjudicated by the acceptance of a plea of quilty or 9 no contest, a finding of quilt, acquittal, acquittal pursuant to 10 section 704-400, or by the entry of plea of quilty or no contest 11 made pursuant to chapter 853, so long as the disclosure to the **12** director of health and the defendant does not frustrate a 13 legitimate function of the county police departments, with the 14 exception of expunded records, records of or pertaining to any 15 adjudication or disposition rendered in the case of a juvenile, 16 or records containing data from the United States National Crime 17 Information Center. The county police departments shall 18 segregate or sanitize from the police reports information that 19 would result in the likelihood or actual identification of 20 individuals who furnished information in connection with its investigation, or who were of investigatory interest. 21

shall not be re-disclosed except to the extent permitted by law.

2010-1086 SB2725 SD1 SMA.doc

22

1 The compensation of persons making or assisting in the (9) examination, other than those retained by the nonindigent 2 defendant, who are not undertaking the examination upon 3 designation by the director of health as part of their normal 4 5 duties as employees of the State or a county, shall be paid by 6 the State. Except as provided in this section, physical or 7 mental health examination reports and supporting documents 8 submitted to the court pursuant to this section shall be kept 9 10 confidential and shall not be disclosed by any person. If the physical or mental health examination report or testimony by any 11 of the examiners is admitted into evidence in a contested 12 13 hearing held pursuant to sections 704-405 and 704-410, the report shall not be deemed confidential and shall be maintained 14 in the public record. Any criminal or civil court may direct 15 **16** disclosure of a confidential physical or mental health examination report submitted pursuant to this section to persons 17 or entities other than those identified in this section upon a 18 19 showing of good cause. (11) For purposes of this section, "dispositive orders" 20 21 means as any orders that affect the legal status of the

defendant, including orders for examination, orders finding the

2010-1086 SB2725 SD1 SMA.doc

22

1	defendant	fit to proceed, orders finding the defendant unfit to		
2	proceed,	orders acquitting the defendant pursuant to section		
3	704-411,	orders concerning discharge, conditional release, and		
4	modificat	ion of conditional release, after acquittal, and		
5	commitmen	commitment pursuant to sections 704-412, 704-413, 704-414, and		
6	704-415, and order of civil commitment in lieu of prosecution or			
7	sentence pursuant to section 706-607."			
8	SECT	ION 3. Section 704-411, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is		
9	amended b	y amending subsection (3) to read as follows:		
0	"(3)	When ordering a hearing pursuant to subsection (2):		
1	(a)	In nonfelony cases, the court shall appoint a		
2		qualified examiner to examine and report upon the		
3		physical and mental condition of the defendant. The		
4		court may appoint either a psychiatrist or a licensed		
15		psychologist. The examiner may be designated by the		
6		director of health from within the department of		
17		health. The examiner shall be appointed from a list		
8		of certified examiners as determined by the department		
19		of health. The court, in appropriate circumstances,		
20		may appoint an additional examiner or examiners; and		
21	(b)	In felony cases, the court shall appoint three		
	(~)			

. 1		physical and mental condition of the defendant. In	
2		each case, the court shall appoint at least one	
3		psychiatrist and at least one licensed psychologist.	
4		The third member may be a psychiatrist, a licensed	
5		psychologist, or a qualified physician. One of the	
6		three shall be a psychiatrist or licensed psychologist	
7		designated by the director of health from within the	
8		department of health. The three examiners shall be	
9		appointed from a list of certified examiners as	
10		determined by the department of health.	
11	To facilitate the examination and the proceedings thereon, the		
12	court may cause the defendant, if not then confined, to be		
13	committed to a hospital or other suitable facility for the		
14	purpose of examination for a period not exceeding thirty days or		
15	such longer period as the court determines to be necessary for		
16	the purpose upon written findings for good cause shown. The		
17	court may direct that qualified physicians or psychologists		
18	retained by the defendant be permitted to witness the		
19	examination. The examination and report and the compensation o		
20	persons making or assisting in the examination shall be in		
21	accord with section 704-404(3), (4)(a) and (b), (6), (7), (8),		
22	[and, (9).	(9), and (10). As used in this section, the term	
	2010-1086	SB2725 SD1 SMA.doc	

- 1 "licensed psychologist" includes psychologists exempted from
- 2 licensure by section 465-3(a)(3)."
- 3 SECTION 4. Section 704-414, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
- 4 amended to read as follows:
- 5 "§704-414 Procedure upon application for discharge,
- 6 conditional release, or modification of conditions of release.
- 7 Upon filing of an application pursuant to section 704-412 for
- 8 discharge or conditional release, or upon the filing of an
- 9 application pursuant to section 704-413 for discharge or for
- 10 modification of conditions of release, the court shall appoint
- 11 three qualified examiners in felony cases and one qualified
- 12 examiner in nonfelony cases to examine and report upon the
- 13 physical and mental condition of the defendant. In felony cases
- 14 the court shall appoint at least one psychiatrist and at least
- 15 one licensed psychologist. The third member may be a
- 16 psychiatrist, a licensed psychologist, or a qualified physician.
- 17 One of the three shall be a psychiatrist or licensed
- 18 psychologist designated by the director of health from within
- 19 the department of health. The examiners shall be appointed from
- 20 a list of certified examiners as determined by the department of
- 21 health. To facilitate the examination and the proceedings
- thereon, the court may cause the defendant, if not then



- 1 confined, to be committed to a hospital or other suitable
- 2 facility for the purpose of the examination and may direct that
- 3 qualified physicians or psychologists retained by the defendant
- 4 be permitted to witness the examination. The examination and
- 5 report and the compensation of persons making or assisting in
- 6 the examination shall be in accord with section 704-404(3),
- 7 (4)(a) and (b), (6), (7), (8), [and] (9)[-], and (10). As used
- 8 in this section, the term "licensed psychologist" includes
- 9 psychologists exempted from licensure by section 465-3(a)(3)."
- 10 SECTION 5. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
- 11 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 12 SECTION 6. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.

13

Report Title:

Confidentiality of Forensic Mental Health Examination Reports

Description:

Requires courts to maintain mental health examination reports as confidential documents, subject to certain specific exceptions for limited distribution of the reports. (SD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.