A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO MEDICAL TORTS.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

- 1 SECTION 1. Chapter 671, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended 2 by adding a new part to be appropriately designated and to read 3 as follows: 4 "PART . PATIENT ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE SERVICES 5 6 §671-A Findings and purpose. (a) The legislature finds 7 that our current civil justice system is adversely affecting 8 patient access to health care services, better patient care, and 9 cost-efficient health care, in that the health care liability 10 system is a costly and ineffective mechanism for resolving 11 claims of health care liability and compensating injured 12 patients, and is a deterrent to the sharing of information among 13 health care professionals which impedes efforts to improve 14 patient safety and quality of care. 15 (b) The purpose of this Act is to implement reasonable, comprehensive, and effective health care liability reforms 16
 - HB HMIA 86-2007

designed to:

1	(1)	Improve the availability of health care services							
2		in cases in which health care liability actions							
3		have been shown to be a factor in the decreased							
4		availability of services;							
5	(2)	Reduce the incidence of "defensive medicine" and							
6		lower the cost of health care liability							
7		insurance, all of which contribute to the							
8		escalation of health care costs;							
9	(3)	Ensure that persons with meritorious health care							
10		injury claims receive fair and adequate							
11		compensation, including reasonable noneconomic							
12		damages;							
13	(4)	Improve the fairness and cost-effectiveness of							
14		our current health care liability system to							
15		resolve disputes over, and provide compensation							
16		for, health care liability by reducing							
17		uncertainty in the amount of compensation							
18		provided to injured individuals; and							
19	(5)	Provide an increased sharing of information in							
20		the health care system which will reduce							
21		unintended injury and improve patient care.							

```
1
         §671-B Definitions. As used in this part, unless the
2
    context clearly requires otherwise:
3
         "Alternative dispute resolution" means a system that
4
    provides for the resolution of medical tort lawsuits in a manner
5
    other than through a civil action brought in a state or federal
6
    court.
7
         "Claimant" means any person who brings a medical tort
8
    lawsuit, including a person who asserts or claims a right to
9
    legal or equitable contribution, indemnity, or subrogation,
10
    arising out of a health care liability claim or action, and any
11
    person on whose behalf such a claim is asserted or such an
12
    action is brought, whether deceased, incompetent, or a minor.
13
         "Collateral source benefits" means any amount paid or
14
    reasonably likely to be paid in the future to or on behalf of
15
    the claimant or any service, product, or other benefit provided
16
    or reasonably likely to be provided in the future to or on
17
    behalf of the claimant, as a result of the injury or wrongful
18
    death, pursuant to:
19
                  Any state or federal health, sickness, income-
              (1)
20
                   disability, accident, or workers' compensation
21
                   law;
```

1	(2)	Any health, sickness, income-disability, or
2		accident insurance that provides health benefits
3		or income-disability coverage;
4	(3)	Any contract or agreement of any group,
5		organization, partnership, or corporation to
6		provide, pay for, or reimburse the cost of
7		medical, hospital, dental, or income disability
8		benefits; and
9	(4)	Any other publicly or privately funded program.
10	"Compensa	tory damages" means objectively verifiable
11	monetary losse	s incurred as a result of the provision of, use
12	of, or payment	for (or failure to provide, use, or pay for)
13	health care se	rvices or medical products, such as past and
14	future medical	expenses, loss of past and future earnings, cost
15	of obtaining d	omestic services, loss of employment, and loss of
16	business or em	ployment opportunities, damages for physical and
17	emotional pain	, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment,
18	mental anguish	, disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss
19	of society and	companionship, loss of consortium (other than
20	loss of domest	ic service), hedonic damages, injury to
21	reputation, an	d all other nonpecuniary losses of any kind or
22	nature. The te	rm "compensatory damages" includes economic
	TID TIMEN OF OO	7

- 1 damages and noneconomic damages, as those terms are defined in
- 2 this section.
- 3 "Contingent fee" includes all compensation to any person or
- 4 persons that is payable only if a recovery is effected on behalf
- 5 of one or more claimants.
- 6 "Economic damages" means objectively verifiable monetary
- 7 losses incurred as a result of the provision of, use of, or
- 8 payment for (or failure to provide, use, or pay for) health care
- 9 services or medical products, such as past and future medical
- 10 expenses, loss of past and future earnings, cost of obtaining
- 11 domestic services, loss of employment, and loss of business or
- 12 employment opportunities.
- "Health care goods or services" means any goods or
- 14 services, provided by a health care organization, provider, or
- 15 by any individual working under the supervision of a health care
- 16 provider, that relate to the diagnosis, prevention, or treatment
- 17 of any human disease or impairment or the assessment of the
- 18 health of human beings.
- 19 "Health care liability action" means a civil action brought
- 20 in a state or federal court or pursuant to an alternative
- 21 dispute resolution system, against a health care provider, a
- 22 health care organization, or the manufacturer, distributor,



- 1 supplier, marketer, promoter, or seller of a medical product,
- 2 regardless of the theory of liability on which the claim is
- 3 based or the number of plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties
- 4 or the number of causes of action in which the claimant alleges
- 5 a health care liability claim.
- 6 "Health care liability claim" means a demand by any person,
- 7 regardless of whether pursuant to alternative dispute
- 8 resolution, against a health care provider, health care
- 9 organization, or the manufacturer, distributor, supplier,
- 10 marketer, promoter, or seller of a medical product, including
- 11 third-party claims, cross-claims, counter-claims, or
- 12 contribution claims that are based upon the provision of, use
- of, or payment for (or the failure to provide, use, or pay for)
- 14 health care services or medical products, regardless of the
- 15 theory of liability on which the claim is based or the number of
- 16 plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties or the number of causes
- 17 of action.
- 18 "Health care organization" means any person or entity which
- 19 is obligated to provide or pay for health benefits under any
- 20 health plan, including any person or entity acting under a
- 21 contract or arrangement with a health care organization to
- 22 provide or administer any health benefit.

- 1 "Health care provider" means any person or entity required
- 2 by state or federal laws or regulations to be licensed,
- 3 registered, or certified to provide health care services and
- 4 being either so licensed, registered, or certified, or exempted
- 5 from such requirement by other statute or regulation.
- 6 "Malicious intent to injure" means intentionally causing or
- 7 attempting to cause physical injury other than providing health
- 8 care goods or services.
- 9 "Medical product" means a drug or device intended for
- 10 humans, and the terms "drug" and "device" have the meanings
- 11 given these terms in sections 201(g)(1) and 201(h) of the
- 12 Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act (21 U.S.C. 321),
- 13 respectively, including any component or raw material used in
- 14 those sections, but excluding health care services.
- "Medical tort lawsuit" means any health care liability
- 16 claim concerning the provision of health care goods or services
- 17 affecting interstate commerce, or any health care liability
- 18 action concerning the provision of health care goods or services
- 19 affecting interstate commerce, brought in a state or federal
- 20 court or pursuant to an alternative dispute resolution system,
- 21 against a health care provider, a health care organization, or
- 22 the manufacturer, distributor, supplier, marketer, promoter, or

- 1 seller of a medical product, regardless of the theory of
- 2 liability on which the claim is based or the number of
- 3 claimants, plaintiffs, defendants, or other parties or the
- 4 number of claims or causes of action in which the claimant
- 5 alleges a health care liability claim.
- 6 "Noneconomic damages" means damages for physical and
- 7 emotional pain, suffering, inconvenience, physical impairment,
- 8 mental anguish, disfigurement, loss of enjoyment of life, loss
- 9 of society and companionship, loss of consortium (other than
- 10 loss of domestic service), hedonic damages, injury to
- 11 reputation, and all other nonpecuniary losses of any kind or
- 12 nature.
- "Punitive damages" means damages awarded for the purpose of
- 14 punishment or deterrence, and not solely for compensatory
- 15 purposes, against a health care provider, health care
- 16 organization, or a manufacturer, distributor, or supplier of a
- 17 medical product. Punitive damages are neither economic nor
- 18 noneconomic damages.
- 19 "Recovery" means the net sum recovered after deducting any
- 20 disbursements or costs incurred in connection with prosecution
- 21 or settlement of the claim, including all costs paid or advanced
- 22 by any person. Costs of health care incurred by the plaintiff



- 1 and the attorneys' office overhead costs or charges for legal
- 2 services are not deductible disbursements or costs for such
- 3 purpose.
- 4 §671-C Compensating patient injury. (a) In any medical
- 5 tort lawsuit, the full amount of a claimant's economic loss may
- 6 be fully recovered without limitation.
- 7 (b) In any medical tort lawsuit, the amount of noneconomic
- 8 damages recovered may be as much as \$250,000, regardless of the
- 9 number of parties against whom the action is brought or the
- 10 number of separate claims or actions brought with respect to the
- 11 same occurrence.
- 12 (c) In any medical tort lawsuit, an award for future
- 13 noneconomic damages shall not be discounted to present value.
- 14 The jury shall not be informed about the maximum award for
- 15 noneconomic damages. An award for noneconomic damages in excess
- 16 of \$250,000 shall be reduced either before the entry of judgment
- 17 or by amendment of the judgment after entry of judgment, and the
- 18 reduction shall be made before accounting for any other
- 19 reduction in damages required by law. If separate awards are
- 20 rendered for past and future noneconomic damages and the
- 21 combined awards exceed \$250,000, the future noneconomic damages
- 22 shall be reduced first.



1 In any medical tort lawsuit, each party shall be (d) 2 liable for that party's several share of any damages only and 3 not for the share of any other person. Each party shall be 4 liable only for the amount of damages allocated to the party in 5 direct proportion to the party's percentage of responsibility. A 6 separate judgment shall be rendered against each party for the 7 amount allocated to the party. For purposes of this section, the 8 trier of fact shall determine the proportion of responsibility 9 of each party for the claimant's harm. 10 (a) §671-D Maximizing patient recovery. In any medical 11 tort lawsuit, the court shall supervise the arrangements for 12 payment of damages to protect against conflicts of interest that **13** may have the effect of reducing the amount of damages awarded 14 that are actually paid to claimants. In particular, in any 15 medical tort lawsuit in which the attorney for a party claims a **16** financial stake in the outcome by virtue of a contingent fee, 17 the court shall have the power to restrict the payment of a 18 claimant's damage recovery to such attorney and to redirect the 19 damages to the claimant based upon the interests of justice and 20 principles of equity. In no event shall the total of all 21 contingent fees for representing all claimants in a medical tort 22 lawsuit exceed the following limits:

1	(1) Forty per cent of the first \$50,000 recovered by
2	the claimants;
3	(2) 33 1/3 per cent of the next \$50,000 recovered by
4	the claimants;
5	(3) Twenty-five per cent of the next \$500,000
6	recovered by the claimants; and
7	(4) Fifteen per cent of any amount by which the
8	recovery by the claimants is in excess of \$600,000.
9	(b) The limitations in this section shall apply whether
10	the recovery is by judgment, settlement, mediation, arbitration,
11	or any other form of alternative dispute resolution. In a
12	medical tort lawsuit involving a minor or incompetent person, a
13	court retains the authority to authorize or approve a fee that
14	is less than the maximum permitted under this section.
15	§671-E Additional health benefits. In any medical tort
16	lawsuit, any party may introduce evidence of collateral source
17	benefits. If a party elects to introduce such evidence, any
18	opposing party may introduce evidence of any amount paid or
19	contributed or reasonably likely to be paid or contributed in
20	the future by or on behalf of the opposing party to secure the
21	right to such collateral source benefits. No provider of
22	collateral source benefits shall recover any amount against the

- 1 claimant or receive any lien or credit against the claimant's
- 2 recovery or be equitably or legally subrogated to the right of
- 3 the claimant in a medical tort lawsuit. This section shall apply
- 4 to any medical tort lawsuit that is settled as well as a medical
- 5 tort lawsuit that is resolved by a fact finder.
- 6 §671-F Punitive damages. (a) Punitive damages, if
- 7 otherwise permitted by applicable state or federal law, may be
- 8 awarded against any person in a medical tort lawsuit only if it
- 9 is proven by clear and convincing evidence that the person acted
- 10 with malicious intent to injure the claimant or that the person
- 11 deliberately failed to avoid unnecessary injury that the person
- 12 knew the claimant was substantially certain to suffer. In any
- 13 medical tort lawsuit where no judgment for compensatory damages
- 14 is rendered against such person, no punitive damages may be
- 15 awarded with respect to the claim in such lawsuit. No demand for
- 16 punitive damages shall be included in a medical tort lawsuit as
- 17 initially filed. A court may allow a claimant to file an amended
- 18 pleading for punitive damages only upon a motion by the claimant
- 19 and after a finding by the court, upon review of supporting and
- 20 opposing affidavits or after a hearing, after weighing the
- 21 evidence, that the claimant has established by a substantial
- 22 probability that the claimant will prevail on the claim for



1	punitive damages. At the request of any party in a medical tort								
2	lawsuit, the trier of fact shall consider in a separate								
3	proceeding:								
4	(1) Whether punitive damages are to be awarded and								
5	the amount of the award; and								
6	(2) The amount of punitive damages following a								
7	determination of punitive liability.								
8	If a separate proceeding is requested, evidence relevant only to								
9	the claim for punitive damages, as determined by applicable law,								
10	shall be inadmissible in any proceeding to determine whether								
11	compensatory damages are to be awarded.								
12	(b) In determining the amount of punitive damages, the								
13	trier of fact shall consider only the following:								
14	(1) The severity of the harm caused by the conduct of								
15	the party;								
16	(2) The duration of the conduct or any concealment of								
17	it by the party;								
18	(3) The profitability of the conduct to the party;								
19	(4) The number of products sold or medical procedures								
20	rendered for compensation, as the case may be, by								
21	the party, of the kind causing the harm								
22	complained of by the claimant;								

1	(5) Any criminal penalties imposed on the party, as a
2	result of the conduct complained of by the
3	claimant; and
4	(6) The amount of any civil fines assessed against
5	the party as a result of the conduct complained
6	of by the claimant.
7	(c) The amount of punitive damages awarded in a medical
8	tort lawsuit may be up to as much as two times the amount of
9	economic damages awarded or \$250,000, whichever is greater. The
10	jury shall not be informed of this limitation.
11	(d) No punitive damages may be awarded against the
12	manufacturer or distributor of a medical product based on a
13	claim that the product caused the claimant's harm if:
14	(1) The medical product was subject to premarket
15	approval or clearance by the Food and Drug
16	Administration with respect to the safety of the
17	formulation or performance of the aspect of the
18	medical product that caused the claimant's harm
19	or the adequacy of the packaging or labeling of
20	the medical product; and
21	(A) The medical product was so approved or
22	cleared; or

1		(B)	The medical product is generally
2			recognized among qualified experts as
3			safe and effective pursuant to
4			conditions established by the Food and
5			Drug Administration and applicable Food
6			and Drug Administration regulations,
7			including without limitation those
8			related to packaging and labeling,
9			unless the Food and Drug Administration
10			has determined that the medical product
11			was not manufactured or distributed in
12			substantial compliance with applicable
13			Food and Drug Administration statutes
14			and regulations.
15	(2)	A health	care provider who prescribes a drug or
16		device (i	ncluding blood products) approved by the
17		Food and	Drug Administration shall not be named
18		as a part	y to a product liability lawsuit
19		involving	the drug or device and shall not be
20		liable to	a claimant in a class action lawsuit
21		against t	he manufacturer, distributor, or product

seller of the drug or device.

1	(3)	In a medical tort lawsuit for harm that is
2		alleged to relate to the adequacy of the
3		packaging or labeling of a drug that is required
4		to have tamper-resistant packaging under
5		regulations of the Secretary of Health and Human
6		Services (including labeling regulations related
7		to the packaging), the manufacturer or product
8		seller of the drug shall not be held liable for
9		punitive damages unless the packaging or labeling
10		is found by the trier of fact by clear and
11		convincing evidence to be substantially out of
12		compliance with such regulations.
13	§671-G Au	thorization of payment of future damages to
14	claimants in m	medical tort lawsuits. (a) In any medical tort
15	lawsuit, if an	award of future damages, without reduction to
16	present value,	equaling or exceeding \$50,000 is made against a
17	party with suf	ficient insurance or other assets to fund a
18	periodic payme	ent of the judgment, the court, at the request of
19	any party, sha	all enter a judgment ordering that the future
20	damages be pai	d by periodic payments in accordance with the
21	applicable law	<i>.</i>

1 (b) This section applies to all actions that have not been 2 first set for trial or retrial before the effective date of this 3 part." 4 SECTION 2. Section 657-7.3, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is 5 amended to read as follows: 6 "§657-7.3 Medical torts; limitation of actions; time. (a) 7 No action for injury or death against a chiropractor, clinical 8 laboratory technologist or technician, dentist, naturopath, 9 nurse, nursing home administrator, dispensing optician, 10 optometrist, osteopath, physician or surgeon, physical therapist, podiatrist, psychologist, or veterinarian duly 11 12 licensed or registered under the laws of the State, or a 13 licensed hospital as the employer of any such person, based upon 14 [such] the person's alleged professional negligence, or for 15 rendering professional services without consent, or for error or 16 omission in [such] the person's practice[7] shall be brought 17 more than [two years] one year after the plaintiff discovers, or 18 through the use of reasonable diligence should have discovered, 19 the injury, but in any event not more than [six] three years after the date of the alleged act or omission causing the injury 20 21 or death. This [six-year] three-year time limitation shall be

tolled for any [period during which the person has failed to

HB HMIA 86-2007

1	disclose any act, error, or omission upon which the action is
2	based and which is known to the person.] of the following:
3	(1) Upon proof of fraud;
4	(2) Intentional concealment; or
5	(3) The presence of a foreign body that has no
6	therapeutic or diagnostic purpose or effect in the
7	person of the injured person.
8	(b) Actions by a minor shall be commenced within [six]
9	three years from the date of the alleged wrongful act except the
10	actions by a minor under the age of $[ten]$ \underline{six} years shall be
11	commenced within [six] three years of manifestation of injury or
12	[by] prior to the minor's [tenth] eighth birthday, whichever
13	provides a longer period. Such time limitation shall be tolled
14	for any minor for any period during which the parent, guardian,
15	insurer, or health care provider has committed fraud or gross
16	$\operatorname{negligence}[_{\mathcal{T}}]$ or has been a party to a collusion in the failure
17	to bring action on behalf of the injured minor for a medical
18	tort. The time limitation shall also be tolled for any period
19	during which the minor's injury or illness alleged to have
20	arisen, in whole or in part, from the alleged wrongful act or
21	omission could not have been discovered through the use of
22	reasonable diligence."

1	SECTION	3.	In	codifying	the	new	sections	added	bv	section	1
---	---------	----	----	-----------	-----	-----	----------	-------	----	---------	---

- 2 of this Act, the revisor of statutes shall substitute
- 3 appropriate section numbers for the letters used in designating
- 4 the new sections in this Act.
- 5 SECTION 4. This Act shall not apply to any cause of action
- for which a complaint has been filed prior to its effective
- 7 date.
- 8 SECTION 5. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed
- 9 and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.
- 10 SECTION 6. This Act shall take effect on January 1, 2008.

11

12

INTRODUCED BY:

JAN 1 9 2007

Report Title:

Medical Torts; Reform Medical Malpractice Suits

Description:

Amends the law relating to medical torts to improve patient access to health care services and provide improved medical care by reducing the burden the liability system places on the health care delivery system in Hawaii.