DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR OF HAWAII





SUZANNE D. CASE CHAIRPERSON BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA

M. KALEO MANUEL DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT ESGINEERING FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE HISTORIC PRESERVATION KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION LAND STATE PARKS

STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

POST OFFICE BOX 621 HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

Testimony of SUZANNE D. CASE Chairperson

Before the House Committee on JUDUCIARY & HAWAIIAN AFFAIRS

Wednesday, February 16, 2022 2:00 PM State Capitol, Conference Room 325, Via Videoconference

In consideration of HOUSE BILL 1653, HOUSE DRAFT 1 RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES

House Bill 1653, House Draft 1 proposes to establish a tiered administrative fine system for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or injured; establish a criminal fine structure on a perspecimen basis for violations involving aquatic life; authorize the Department of Land and Natural Resources (Department) to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when a person is ordered to perform community service in lieu of a fine; and authorize the Department to recommend to the court that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found. The Department supports this measure and offers the following comments and suggested amendments.

A critical component of effective resource management is ensuring that management agencies have the appropriate suite of enforcement tools and penalties to encourage compliance with aquatic resource laws and to ensure just and reasonable punishment for violations.

<u>SECTION 2 – Tiered administrative fines system for each specimen of aquatic life</u> Section 187A-12.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS), authorizes tiered administrative fines for aquatic resource violations (i.e., higher fines for repeat violations)¹ and additional non-tiered

¹ Section 187A-12.5, HRS, provides in relevant part:

⁽b) For violations involving threatened or endangered species, the administrative fines shall be as follows:

⁽¹⁾ For a first violation, a fine of not more than \$5,000;

⁽²⁾ For a second violation within five years of a previous violation, a fine of not more than \$10,000; and

fines for each specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken.² House Bill 1653, House Draft 1 proposes to establish tiered administrative fines for each specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken. The Department does not have reason to believe that existing non-tiered per specimen fines are inadequate. However, having tiered per specimen fines provides greater flexibility to pursue higher per specimen penalties for repeat violations if warranted. Therefore, the Department supports SECTION 2 of the bill as written.

SECTIONS 3, 4, 5, and 6 – per specimen criminal fine structure

Sections 187A-13, 188-70, 189-4, and 190-5, HRS, set forth criminal penalties for violations of these chapters and rules adopted thereunder. Criminal cases are prosecuted by City or County Prosecutors' Offices and adjudicated by the Judiciary, typically at the State District Court level. Prosecutors typically pursue one criminal count per violation, even if the violation involves the unlawful take of multiple specimens of aquatic life. This often results in penalties that are disproportionately low in relation to the value of aquatic life unlawfully taken. For example, a defendant who has unlawfully taken five specimens will often receive the same minimum penalty (\$100) as a defendant who has unlawfully taken a single specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken, but this process is rarely utilized. Currently, when a case involves multiple specimens, some prosecutors will request a higher fine to reflect the take. However, the results vary widely, and resulting sentences remain inconsistent. Amending existing criminal penalty sections to expressly authorize per specimen criminal fines would make it easier for prosecutors to seek penalties proportionate to the violation.

SECTIONS 3, 4, and 6 – Authorize the Department to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged

Three existing aquatic resource penalty sections (Sections 187A-13, 188-70, and 190-5, HRS) authorize the court to require a defendant to perform community service in lieu of paying a monetary fine. SECTIONS 3, 4, and 6 of the bill propose to add language to allow the Department to recommend to the court community service that benefits the resource that was damaged. While this language is okay, it may not achieve the intended result. The court is already authorized to use resource-based community service as a sentencing tool, and the

- (1) For a first violation, a fine of not more than \$1,000;
- (2) For a second violation within five years of a previous violation, a fine of not more than \$2,000; and
- (3) For a third or subsequent violation within five years of the last violation, a fine of not more than \$3,000.

² Section 187A-12.5, HRS, provides in relevant part:

(d) In addition to subsection (b), a fine of up to \$5,000 may be levied for each specimen of threatened or endangered aquatic life taken, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any rule adopted thereunder.

(e) In addition to subsection (c), a fine of up to \$1,000 may be levied for each specimen of all other aquatic life taken, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any rule adopted thereunder.

⁽³⁾ For a third or subsequent violation within five years of the last violation, a fine of not more than \$15,000.

⁽c) For all other violations the administrative fines shall be as

follows:

Department already has the ability to make specific community service recommendations. However, the Judiciary has a list of approved community service work sites where Defendants may be referred. The issue is that there may not be an available community service location where work performed would benefit the resource damaged. To achieve the goal of having defendants perform community service that benefits the resources damaged, more community service opportunities need to be identified and established. Legislation is not necessarily required for this.

SECTIONS 3, 4, 5, and 6 – Authorize the Department to recommend that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas

The Courts have the existing discretionary authority to sentence a defendant to a term of probation pursuant to Chapter 706, HRS. Section 706-623 provides guidance on the period of probation for various levels of crimes. Section 706-624(2) sets forth a list of discretionary conditions that the Court may utilize in sentencing a defendant to probation. This list includes conditions that the defendant "refrain from engaging in a specified occupation, business, or profession bearing a reasonably direct relationship to the conduct constituting the crime," "refrain from entering specified geographical areas without the court's permission," and "satisfy other reasonable conditions as the court may impose."³ Despite this existing authority, these types of probationary sentences are extremely rare for aquatic resource violations. The Department supports the language in the bill that expressly authorizes the Department to recommend a geographical restriction. However, the Department believes this language can be strengthened by citing specifically to the existing probation statute and adding additional types of probationary conditions consistent with existing authority, such as restrictions on engaging in fishing or restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing certain types of fishing gear or boating equipment. The Department has attached a proposed House Draft 2 (the Department's proposed changes highlighted in yellow).

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this measure.

³ See HRS § 706-624(2)(f), -(m), and -(t).

1653 H.D. 1 Proposed H.D. 2

A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

| 1 | SECT | ION 1. The legislature finds that Hawaii's aquatic |
|----|-----------|---|
| 2 | resources | are of significant economic, ecologic, cultural, and |
| 3 | aesthetic | importance to agriculture, tourism, food production, |
| 4 | and fishe | ries in the State. The legislature recognizes the |
| 5 | importanc | e of managing and conserving Hawaii's aquatic resources |
| 6 | and ecosy | stem for present and future generations. Careful |
| 7 | stewardsh | ip and protection of Hawaii's aquatic resources are |
| 8 | essential | to the well-being of our island state. |
| 9 | The | purpose of this Act is to strengthen the penalties for |
| 10 | violation | s of the State's aquatic resources law by: |
| 11 | (1) | Establishing a tiered administrative fine system for |
| 12 | | each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or |
| 13 | | injured; |
| 14 | (2) | Establishing a criminal fine structure on a per- |
| 15 | | specimen basis for violations involving aquatic life; |
| 16 | | and |
| | | |

| 1 | (3) | Authorizing the department of land and natural |
|----|-------------------------------|---|
| 2 | | resources to recommend community service that benefits |
| 3 | | the resource damaged when a person is ordered to |
| 4 | | perform community service in lieu of a fine; and |
| 5 | (4) | Authorizing the department of land and natural |
| 6 | | resources to recommend to the court that defendants be |
| 7 | | restricted from entering specific geographical areas |
| 8 | | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 9 | | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams. |
| 10 | SECT | ION 2. Section 187A-12.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 11 | amended b | y amending subsections (d) and (e) to read as follows: |
| 12 | "(d) | [In addition to subsection (b), a fine of up to |
| 13 | \$5,000] <u>A</u> | fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) may |
| 14 | be levied | for each specimen of threatened or endangered aquatic |
| 15 | life take | n, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of |
| 16 | title 12 | or any rule adopted thereunder $[-,]$ as follows: |
| 17 | (1) | For a first violation, up to \$5,000 or the retail |
| 18 | | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 19 | (2) | For a second violation, up to \$10,000 or the retail |
| 20 | | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |

| 1 | (3) For a third or subsequent violation, up to \$15,000 or |
|----|--|
| 2 | the retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 3 | higher. |
| 4 | (e) [In addition to subsection (c), a fine of up to |
| 5 | $\frac{1}{1000}$] A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (c) may |
| 6 | be levied for each specimen of all other aquatic life taken, |
| 7 | killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any |
| 8 | rule adopted thereunder $[-,]$ as follows: |
| 9 | (1) For a first violation, up to \$1,000 or the retail |
| 10 | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 11 | (2) For a second violation, up to \$2,000 or the retail |
| 12 | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 13 | (3) For a third or subsequent violation, up to \$3,000 or |
| 14 | the retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 15 | higher." |
| 16 | SECTION 3. Section 187A-13, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 17 | amended to read as follows: |
| 18 | "§187A-13 General penalty; community service. (a) Any |
| 19 | person violating this chapter or any rule adopted thereunder for |
| 20 | which a penalty is not otherwise provided, shall be guilty of a |

| 1 | petty mis | demeanor and, in addition to any other penalties, shall |
|----|---------------------|--|
| 2 | be fined | not less than: |
| 3 | (1) | \$250 for a first offense; |
| 4 | (2) | \$500 for a second offense; and |
| 5 | (3) | \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. |
| 6 | (b) | A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (a) |
| 7 | may be le | vied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, |
| 8 | <u>or injure</u> | d in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted |
| 9 | thereunde | r as follows: |
| 10 | (1) | For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market |
| 11 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 12 | (2) | For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market |
| 13 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 14 | (3) | For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the |
| 15 | | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 16 | | higher. |
| 17 | [.(d)] |] <u>(c)</u> The court may require the defendant to complete |
| 18 | an aquati | c resources educational class administered by the |
| 19 | departmen | t in addition to or in lieu of paying all or any part |
| 20 | of any mo | netary fine authorized by this section. |

| 1 | [(c)] <u>(d)</u> The court may direct the defendant to perform |
|----|--|
| 2 | community service as administered by the department in lieu of |
| 3 | paying any monetary fine authorized by this section[\pm]; provided |
| 4 | that if community service is ordered pursuant to this section, |
| 5 | the department may recommend to the court community service that |
| 6 | benefits the resource that was damaged. |
| 7 | (e) The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 8 | defendant be <mark>[restricted from] sentenced to probation with</mark> |
| 9 | probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
| 10 | 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 11 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 12 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 13 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams $[-;$ |
| 14 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 15 | activities; and |
| 16 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 17 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 18 | SECTION 4. Section 188-70, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 19 | amended to read as follows: |
| 20 | "\$188-70 Penalties. (a) Any person violating any |
| 21 | provision of or any rule adopted pursuant to this chapter, |

H.B. NO.

1 except sections 188-23, 188-39.5, and 188-40.8, is guilty of a 2 petty misdemeanor and, in addition to any other penalties, shall 3 be fined no less than: 4 \$100 for a first offense; (1)5 \$200 for a second offense; and (2) 6 \$500 for a third or subsequent offense. (3) 7 (b) A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (a) 8 may be levied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, 9 or injured in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted 10 thereunder as follows: 11 (1) For a first offense, up to \$100 or the retail market 12 value of the specimen, whichever is higher; 13 (2) For a second offense, up to \$200 or the retail market 14 value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and 15 (3) For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$500 or the 16 retail market value of the specimen, whichever is 17 higher. 18 [(b)] (c) Any person violating section 188-23, is guilty 19 of a class C felony and shall be sentenced pursuant to chapter 20 706; provided that the environmental court, in addition to any 21 term of imprisonment or any other terms and conditions of

H.B. NO.

1 probation, shall order the defendant to pay a fine of not less 2 than \$1,000. Notwithstanding section 706-669 and any other law 3 to the contrary, any person in violation of section 188-23(b), 4 as a first offense, shall be sentenced to a mandatory minimum 5 period of imprisonment without possibility of parole of thirty 6 days. Repeat offenders shall be sentenced pursuant to chapter 7 706.

8 [-(c)-] (d) The environmental court may require the 9 defendant to complete an aquatic resources educational class 10 administered by the department of land and natural resources in 11 addition to or in lieu of paying all or any part of any monetary 12 fine authorized by this section.

13 [(d)] (e) The environmental court may direct the defendant 14 to perform community service as administered by the department 15 of land and natural resources in lieu of paying any monetary 16 fine authorized by this section [-;]; provided that if community 17 service is ordered pursuant to this section, the department may 18 recommend to the environmental court community service that 19 benefits the resource that was damaged. 20 (f) The department may recommend to the environmental

21 court that the defendant be [restricted from] sentenced to

H.B. NO.

| 1 | probation with probationary terms and conditions consistent with |
|----|--|
| 2 | sections 706-623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 3 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 4 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 5 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams[-]; |
| 6 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 7 | activities; and |
| 8 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 9 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 10 | SECTION 5. Section 189-4, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 11 | amended to read as follows: |
| 12 | " §189-4 Penalties. (a) Any person violating any of the |
| 13 | provisions of this chapter for which a penalty is not otherwise |
| 14 | provided, or any rule of the department adopted thereunder, |
| 15 | shall be guilty of a petty misdemeanor and punishable as |
| 16 | provided in subsection (b); provided that in the case of a |
| 17 | corporation violating any of the provisions $\underline{\prime}$ only the fine shall |
| 18 | be imposed, but any officer of the corporation who wilfully |
| 19 | procures or permits the violation of the provisions by the |
| | |

 $20\,$ corporation shall be punishable as in the case of an individual

21 violating the same.

| 1 | (b) | The punishment, in addition to any other penalties, |
|----|------------------|--|
| 2 | shall be | a fine of not less than: |
| 3 | (1) | \$250 for a first offense; |
| 4 | (2) | \$500 for a second offense; and |
| 5 | (3) | \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. |
| 6 | (C) | A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) |
| 7 | may be le | vied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, |
| 8 | injured, | or sold in violation of this chapter or any rule |
| 9 | adopted t | hereunder as follows: |
| 10 | (1) | For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market |
| 11 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 12 | (2) | For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market |
| 13 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 14 | (3) | For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the |
| 15 | | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 16 | | higher. |
| 17 | [(c) | $\frac{(d)}{(d)}$ The fines specified in this section shall not be |
| 18 | suspended | or waived. |
| 19 | (e) | The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 20 | defendant | be [restricted from] sentenced to probation with |

H.B. NO.

| probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
|---|
| 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams $[-];$ |
| (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| activities; and |
| (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| SECTION 6. Section 190-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| amended to read as follows: |
| " §190-5 Penalty. (a) Any person violating this chapter, |
| any rule adopted pursuant thereto, or the terms and conditions |
| of any permit issued under section 190-4, shall be guilty of a |
| petty misdemeanor and punished as provided in subsections (b) |
| [and (c).], (c), and (d). |
| (b) The punishment, in addition to any other penalties, |
| shall be a fine of not less than: |
| (1) \$250 for a first offense; |
| (2) \$500 for a second offense; and |
| (3) \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. |
| |

Page 11

H.B. NO.

| 1 | (c) A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) |
|----|---|
| 2 | may be levied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, |
| 3 | or injured in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted |
| 4 | thereunder as follows: |
| 5 | (1) For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market |
| 6 | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 7 | (2) For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market |
| 8 | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 9 | (3) For a third of subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the |
| 10 | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 11 | higher. |
| 12 | [(c)] <u>(d)</u> The court may require the defendant to complete |
| 13 | an aquatic resources educational class administered by the |
| 14 | department of land and natural resources in addition to or in |
| 15 | lieu of paying all or any part of any monetary fine authorized |
| 16 | by this section. |
| 17 | $\left[\frac{(d)}{(d)}\right]$ (e) The court may allow the defendant to perform |
| 18 | community service as administered by the department of land and |
| 19 | natural resources in lieu of paying any monetary fine authorized |
| 20 | by this section $[-,]$; provided that if community service is |
| 21 | ordered pursuant to this section, the department may recommend |

| 1 | to the court community service that benefits the resource that |
|----|--|
| 2 | was damaged. |
| 3 | (f) The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 4 | defendant be <mark>[restricted from] sentenced to probation with</mark> |
| 5 | probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
| 6 | 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 7 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 8 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 9 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams[.]; |
| 10 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 11 | activities; and |
| 12 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 13 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 14 | SECTION 7. This Act does not affect rights and duties that |
| 15 | matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were |
| 16 | begun before its effective date. |
| 17 | SECTION 8. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed |
| 18 | and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. |
| 19 | SECTION 9. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2050. |
| | |

1653 H.D. 1 Proposed H.D. 2

Report Title:

Aquatic Resources; Intentional Violations; Penalties; Fines

Description:

Establishes a tiered administrative fine system for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or injured. Establishes a criminal fine structure on a per-specimen basis for violations involving aquatic life. Authorizes the department of land and natural resources to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when a person is ordered to perform community service in lieu of a fine. Authorizes the department of land and natural resources to recommend to the court that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found. Effective 7/1/2050. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.

DAVID Y. IGE GOVERNOR OF HAWAII





SUZANNE D. CASE CHAIRPERSON BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

ROBERT K. MASUDA

M. KALEO MANUEL DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT ESGINEERING FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE HISTORIC PRESERVATION KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION LAND STATE PARKS

STATE OF HAWAII DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

POST OFFICE BOX 621 HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

Testimony of SUZANNE D. CASE Chairperson

Before the House Committee on JUDUCIARY & HAWAIIAN AFFAIRS

Wednesday, February 16, 2022 2:00 PM State Capitol, Conference Room 325, Via Videoconference

In consideration of HOUSE BILL 1653, HOUSE DRAFT 1 RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES

House Bill 1653, House Draft 1 proposes to establish a tiered administrative fine system for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or injured; establish a criminal fine structure on a perspecimen basis for violations involving aquatic life; authorize the Department of Land and Natural Resources (Department) to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when a person is ordered to perform community service in lieu of a fine; and authorize the Department to recommend to the court that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found. The Department supports this measure and offers the following comments and suggested amendments.

A critical component of effective resource management is ensuring that management agencies have the appropriate suite of enforcement tools and penalties to encourage compliance with aquatic resource laws and to ensure just and reasonable punishment for violations.

<u>SECTION 2 – Tiered administrative fines system for each specimen of aquatic life</u> Section 187A-12.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS), authorizes tiered administrative fines for aquatic resource violations (i.e., higher fines for repeat violations)¹ and additional non-tiered

¹ Section 187A-12.5, HRS, provides in relevant part:

⁽b) For violations involving threatened or endangered species, the administrative fines shall be as follows:

⁽¹⁾ For a first violation, a fine of not more than \$5,000;

⁽²⁾ For a second violation within five years of a previous violation, a fine of not more than \$10,000; and

fines for each specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken.² House Bill 1653, House Draft 1 proposes to establish tiered administrative fines for each specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken. The Department does not have reason to believe that existing non-tiered per specimen fines are inadequate. However, having tiered per specimen fines provides greater flexibility to pursue higher per specimen penalties for repeat violations if warranted. Therefore, the Department supports SECTION 2 of the bill as written.

SECTIONS 3, 4, 5, and 6 – per specimen criminal fine structure

Sections 187A-13, 188-70, 189-4, and 190-5, HRS, set forth criminal penalties for violations of these chapters and rules adopted thereunder. Criminal cases are prosecuted by City or County Prosecutors' Offices and adjudicated by the Judiciary, typically at the State District Court level. Prosecutors typically pursue one criminal count per violation, even if the violation involves the unlawful take of multiple specimens of aquatic life. This often results in penalties that are disproportionately low in relation to the value of aquatic life unlawfully taken. For example, a defendant who has unlawfully taken five specimens will often receive the same minimum penalty (\$100) as a defendant who has unlawfully taken a single specimen of aquatic life unlawfully taken, but this process is rarely utilized. Currently, when a case involves multiple specimens, some prosecutors will request a higher fine to reflect the take. However, the results vary widely, and resulting sentences remain inconsistent. Amending existing criminal penalty sections to expressly authorize per specimen criminal fines would make it easier for prosecutors to seek penalties proportionate to the violation.

SECTIONS 3, 4, and 6 – Authorize the Department to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged

Three existing aquatic resource penalty sections (Sections 187A-13, 188-70, and 190-5, HRS) authorize the court to require a defendant to perform community service in lieu of paying a monetary fine. SECTIONS 3, 4, and 6 of the bill propose to add language to allow the Department to recommend to the court community service that benefits the resource that was damaged. While this language is okay, it may not achieve the intended result. The court is already authorized to use resource-based community service as a sentencing tool, and the

- (1) For a first violation, a fine of not more than \$1,000;
- (2) For a second violation within five years of a previous violation, a fine of not more than \$2,000; and
- (3) For a third or subsequent violation within five years of the last violation, a fine of not more than \$3,000.

² Section 187A-12.5, HRS, provides in relevant part:

(d) In addition to subsection (b), a fine of up to \$5,000 may be levied for each specimen of threatened or endangered aquatic life taken, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any rule adopted thereunder.

(e) In addition to subsection (c), a fine of up to \$1,000 may be levied for each specimen of all other aquatic life taken, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any rule adopted thereunder.

⁽³⁾ For a third or subsequent violation within five years of the last violation, a fine of not more than \$15,000.

⁽c) For all other violations the administrative fines shall be as

follows:

Department already has the ability to make specific community service recommendations. However, the Judiciary has a list of approved community service work sites where Defendants may be referred. The issue is that there may not be an available community service location where work performed would benefit the resource damaged. To achieve the goal of having defendants perform community service that benefits the resources damaged, more community service opportunities need to be identified and established. Legislation is not necessarily required for this.

SECTIONS 3, 4, 5, and 6 – Authorize the Department to recommend that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas

The Courts have the existing discretionary authority to sentence a defendant to a term of probation pursuant to Chapter 706, HRS. Section 706-623 provides guidance on the period of probation for various levels of crimes. Section 706-624(2) sets forth a list of discretionary conditions that the Court may utilize in sentencing a defendant to probation. This list includes conditions that the defendant "refrain from engaging in a specified occupation, business, or profession bearing a reasonably direct relationship to the conduct constituting the crime," "refrain from entering specified geographical areas without the court's permission," and "satisfy other reasonable conditions as the court may impose."³ Despite this existing authority, these types of probationary sentences are extremely rare for aquatic resource violations. The Department supports the language in the bill that expressly authorizes the Department to recommend a geographical restriction. However, the Department believes this language can be strengthened by citing specifically to the existing probation statute and adding additional types of probationary conditions consistent with existing authority, such as restrictions on engaging in fishing or restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing certain types of fishing gear or boating equipment. The Department has attached a proposed House Draft 2 (the Department's proposed changes highlighted in yellow).

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this measure.

³ See HRS § 706-624(2)(f), -(m), and -(t).

1653 H.D. 1 Proposed H.D. 2

A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAII:

| 1 | SECT | ION 1. The legislature finds that Hawaii's aquatic |
|----|-----------|---|
| 2 | resources | are of significant economic, ecologic, cultural, and |
| 3 | aesthetic | importance to agriculture, tourism, food production, |
| 4 | and fishe | ries in the State. The legislature recognizes the |
| 5 | importanc | e of managing and conserving Hawaii's aquatic resources |
| 6 | and ecosy | stem for present and future generations. Careful |
| 7 | stewardsh | ip and protection of Hawaii's aquatic resources are |
| 8 | essential | to the well-being of our island state. |
| 9 | The | purpose of this Act is to strengthen the penalties for |
| 10 | violation | s of the State's aquatic resources law by: |
| 11 | (1) | Establishing a tiered administrative fine system for |
| 12 | | each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or |
| 13 | | injured; |
| 14 | (2) | Establishing a criminal fine structure on a per- |
| 15 | | specimen basis for violations involving aquatic life; |
| 16 | | and |
| | | |

| 1 | (3) | Authorizing the department of land and natural |
|----|-------------------------------|---|
| 2 | | resources to recommend community service that benefits |
| 3 | | the resource damaged when a person is ordered to |
| 4 | | perform community service in lieu of a fine; and |
| 5 | (4) | Authorizing the department of land and natural |
| 6 | | resources to recommend to the court that defendants be |
| 7 | | restricted from entering specific geographical areas |
| 8 | | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 9 | | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams. |
| 10 | SECT | ION 2. Section 187A-12.5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 11 | amended b | y amending subsections (d) and (e) to read as follows: |
| 12 | "(d) | [In addition to subsection (b), a fine of up to |
| 13 | \$5,000] <u>A</u> | fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) may |
| 14 | be levied | for each specimen of threatened or endangered aquatic |
| 15 | life take | n, killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of |
| 16 | title 12 | or any rule adopted thereunder $[-,]$ as follows: |
| 17 | (1) | For a first violation, up to \$5,000 or the retail |
| 18 | | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 19 | (2) | For a second violation, up to \$10,000 or the retail |
| 20 | | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |

| 1 | (3) For a third or subsequent violation, up to \$15,000 or |
|----|--|
| 2 | the retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 3 | higher. |
| 4 | (e) [In addition to subsection (c), a fine of up to |
| 5 | $\frac{1}{1000}$] A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (c) may |
| 6 | be levied for each specimen of all other aquatic life taken, |
| 7 | killed, or injured in violation of subtitle 5 of title 12 or any |
| 8 | rule adopted thereunder $[-,]$ as follows: |
| 9 | (1) For a first violation, up to \$1,000 or the retail |
| 10 | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 11 | (2) For a second violation, up to \$2,000 or the retail |
| 12 | market value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 13 | (3) For a third or subsequent violation, up to \$3,000 or |
| 14 | the retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 15 | higher." |
| 16 | SECTION 3. Section 187A-13, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 17 | amended to read as follows: |
| 18 | "§187A-13 General penalty; community service. (a) Any |
| 19 | person violating this chapter or any rule adopted thereunder for |
| 20 | which a penalty is not otherwise provided, shall be guilty of a |

| 1 | petty mis | demeanor and, in addition to any other penalties, shall | | | | |
|----|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | be fined not less than: | | | | | |
| 3 | (1) | \$250 for a first offense; | | | | |
| 4 | (2) | \$500 for a second offense; and | | | | |
| 5 | (3) | \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. | | | | |
| 6 | (b) | A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (a) | | | | |
| 7 | may be le | vied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, | | | | |
| 8 | <u>or injure</u> | d in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted | | | | |
| 9 | thereunde | r as follows: | | | | |
| 10 | (1) | For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market | | | | |
| 11 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; | | | | |
| 12 | (2) | For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market | | | | |
| 13 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and | | | | |
| 14 | (3) | For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the | | | | |
| 15 | | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is | | | | |
| 16 | | higher. | | | | |
| 17 | [.(d)] |] <u>(c)</u> The court may require the defendant to complete | | | | |
| 18 | an aquati | c resources educational class administered by the | | | | |
| 19 | departmen | t in addition to or in lieu of paying all or any part | | | | |
| 20 | of any mo | netary fine authorized by this section. | | | | |

| 1 | [(c)] <u>(d)</u> The court may direct the defendant to perform |
|----|--|
| 2 | community service as administered by the department in lieu of |
| 3 | paying any monetary fine authorized by this section[\pm]; provided |
| 4 | that if community service is ordered pursuant to this section, |
| 5 | the department may recommend to the court community service that |
| 6 | benefits the resource that was damaged. |
| 7 | (e) The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 8 | defendant be <mark>[restricted from] sentenced to probation with</mark> |
| 9 | probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
| 10 | 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 11 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 12 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 13 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams $[-;$ |
| 14 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 15 | activities; and |
| 16 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 17 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 18 | SECTION 4. Section 188-70, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 19 | amended to read as follows: |
| 20 | "\$188-70 Penalties. (a) Any person violating any |
| 21 | provision of or any rule adopted pursuant to this chapter, |

H.B. NO.

1 except sections 188-23, 188-39.5, and 188-40.8, is guilty of a 2 petty misdemeanor and, in addition to any other penalties, shall 3 be fined no less than: 4 \$100 for a first offense; (1)5 \$200 for a second offense; and (2) 6 \$500 for a third or subsequent offense. (3) 7 (b) A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (a) 8 may be levied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, 9 or injured in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted 10 thereunder as follows: 11 (1) For a first offense, up to \$100 or the retail market 12 value of the specimen, whichever is higher; 13 (2) For a second offense, up to \$200 or the retail market 14 value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and 15 (3) For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$500 or the 16 retail market value of the specimen, whichever is 17 higher. 18 [(b)] (c) Any person violating section 188-23, is guilty 19 of a class C felony and shall be sentenced pursuant to chapter 20 706; provided that the environmental court, in addition to any 21 term of imprisonment or any other terms and conditions of

H.B. NO.

1 probation, shall order the defendant to pay a fine of not less 2 than \$1,000. Notwithstanding section 706-669 and any other law 3 to the contrary, any person in violation of section 188-23(b), 4 as a first offense, shall be sentenced to a mandatory minimum 5 period of imprisonment without possibility of parole of thirty 6 days. Repeat offenders shall be sentenced pursuant to chapter 7 706.

8 [-(c)-] (d) The environmental court may require the 9 defendant to complete an aquatic resources educational class 10 administered by the department of land and natural resources in 11 addition to or in lieu of paying all or any part of any monetary 12 fine authorized by this section.

13 [(d)] (e) The environmental court may direct the defendant 14 to perform community service as administered by the department 15 of land and natural resources in lieu of paying any monetary 16 fine authorized by this section [-;]; provided that if community 17 service is ordered pursuant to this section, the department may 18 recommend to the environmental court community service that 19 benefits the resource that was damaged. 20 (f) The department may recommend to the environmental

21 court that the defendant be [restricted from] sentenced to

H.B. NO.

| 1 | probation with probationary terms and conditions consistent with |
|----|--|
| 2 | sections 706-623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 3 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 4 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 5 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams[-]; |
| 6 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 7 | activities; and |
| 8 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 9 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 10 | SECTION 5. Section 189-4, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| 11 | amended to read as follows: |
| 12 | " §189-4 Penalties. (a) Any person violating any of the |
| 13 | provisions of this chapter for which a penalty is not otherwise |
| 14 | provided, or any rule of the department adopted thereunder, |
| 15 | shall be guilty of a petty misdemeanor and punishable as |
| 16 | provided in subsection (b); provided that in the case of a |
| 17 | corporation violating any of the provisions $\underline{\prime}$ only the fine shall |
| 18 | be imposed, but any officer of the corporation who wilfully |
| 19 | procures or permits the violation of the provisions by the |
| | |

 $20\,$ corporation shall be punishable as in the case of an individual

21 violating the same.

| 1 | (b) | The punishment, in addition to any other penalties, |
|----|------------------|--|
| 2 | shall be | a fine of not less than: |
| 3 | (1) | \$250 for a first offense; |
| 4 | (2) | \$500 for a second offense; and |
| 5 | (3) | \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. |
| 6 | (C) | A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) |
| 7 | may be le | vied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, |
| 8 | injured, | or sold in violation of this chapter or any rule |
| 9 | adopted t | hereunder as follows: |
| 10 | (1) | For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market |
| 11 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 12 | (2) | For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market |
| 13 | | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 14 | (3) | For a third or subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the |
| 15 | | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 16 | | higher. |
| 17 | [(c) | $\frac{(d)}{(d)}$ The fines specified in this section shall not be |
| 18 | suspended | or waived. |
| 19 | (e) | The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 20 | defendant | be [restricted from] sentenced to probation with |

H.B. NO.

| probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
|---|
| 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams $[-];$ |
| (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| activities; and |
| (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| SECTION 6. Section 190-5, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is |
| amended to read as follows: |
| " §190-5 Penalty. (a) Any person violating this chapter, |
| any rule adopted pursuant thereto, or the terms and conditions |
| of any permit issued under section 190-4, shall be guilty of a |
| petty misdemeanor and punished as provided in subsections (b) |
| [and (c).], (c), and (d). |
| (b) The punishment, in addition to any other penalties, |
| shall be a fine of not less than: |
| (1) \$250 for a first offense; |
| (2) \$500 for a second offense; and |
| (3) \$1,000 for a third or subsequent offense. |
| |

Page 11

H.B. NO.

| 1 | (c) A fine in addition to the fine under subsection (b) |
|----|---|
| 2 | may be levied for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, |
| 3 | or injured in violation of this chapter or any rule adopted |
| 4 | thereunder as follows: |
| 5 | (1) For a first offense, up to \$250 or the retail market |
| 6 | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; |
| 7 | (2) For a second offense, up to \$500 or the retail market |
| 8 | value of the specimen, whichever is higher; and |
| 9 | (3) For a third of subsequent offense, up to \$1,000 or the |
| 10 | retail market value of the specimen, whichever is |
| 11 | higher. |
| 12 | [(c)] <u>(d)</u> The court may require the defendant to complete |
| 13 | an aquatic resources educational class administered by the |
| 14 | department of land and natural resources in addition to or in |
| 15 | lieu of paying all or any part of any monetary fine authorized |
| 16 | by this section. |
| 17 | $\left[\frac{(d)}{(d)}\right]$ (e) The court may allow the defendant to perform |
| 18 | community service as administered by the department of land and |
| 19 | natural resources in lieu of paying any monetary fine authorized |
| 20 | by this section $[-,]$; provided that if community service is |
| 21 | ordered pursuant to this section, the department may recommend |

| 1 | to the court community service that benefits the resource that |
|----|--|
| 2 | was damaged. |
| 3 | (f) The department may recommend to the court that the |
| 4 | defendant be <mark>[restricted from] sentenced to probation with</mark> |
| 5 | probationary terms and conditions consistent with sections 706- |
| 6 | 623 and 706-624 including, but not limited to: |
| 7 | (1) Restrictions on entering specific geographical areas |
| 8 | where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean |
| 9 | waters, estuaries, rivers, and streams[.]; |
| 10 | (2) Restrictions on engaging in certain or all fishing |
| 11 | activities; and |
| 12 | (3) Restrictions on handling, operating, or possessing |
| 13 | certain fishing gear or boating equipment." |
| 14 | SECTION 7. This Act does not affect rights and duties that |
| 15 | matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were |
| 16 | begun before its effective date. |
| 17 | SECTION 8. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed |
| 18 | and stricken. New statutory material is underscored. |
| 19 | SECTION 9. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2050. |
| | |

1653 H.D. 1 Proposed H.D. 2

Report Title:

Aquatic Resources; Intentional Violations; Penalties; Fines

Description:

Establishes a tiered administrative fine system for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or injured. Establishes a criminal fine structure on a per-specimen basis for violations involving aquatic life. Authorizes the department of land and natural resources to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when a person is ordered to perform community service in lieu of a fine. Authorizes the department of land and natural resources to recommend to the court that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found. Effective 7/1/2050. (HD1)

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.



ON THE FOLLOWING MEASURE: H.B. NO. 1653, H.D. 1, RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES. BEFORE THE: HOUSE COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER PROTECTION AND COMMERCE DATE: Wednesday, February 16, 2022 TIME: 02:00 p.m. LOCATION: State Capitol, Room 325, Via Videoconference TESTIFIER(S): Holly T. Shikada, Attorney General, Melissa D. Goldman, Deputy Attorney General.

Chair Nakashima and Members of the Committee:

The Department of the Attorney General provides the following comments.

This bill establishes a tiered administrative fine system for certain aquatic resource violations, authorizes the Department of Land and Natural Resources (Department) to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when community service is ordered in lieu of a fine, and also to recommend to the court "that the defendant be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found, including ocean waters estuaries, rivers, and streams" as stated in section 3, page 5, lines 7–10; section 4, page 7, lines 15–18; section 5, page 9, lines 8–11; and section 6, page 11, lines 5–8.

The bill's wording authorizing the Department to recommend that the defendant be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources are found was added by the House Committee on Water and Land following its hearing on the measure. We advise that this Committee clarify the added wording by specifying that the Department is authorized to recommend that a defendant be restricted from entering specific geographical areas within the "waters of the State," over which state courts may exercise jurisdiction.

Under the Submerged Lands Act of 1953, 43 U.S.C. section 1301, *et seq.*, the federal government has recognized states' title to submerged lands within three geographical miles of their coastlines, with a few minor exceptions. 43 U.S.C. section 1312; *see also, e.g.*, 16 U.S.C. section 1856(a)(2)(A) (explaining that states' boundaries

are the same as the United States territorial sea, as established by the Geneva Convention on the Territorial Sea and Contiguous Zone—three nautical miles). Hawaii courts have likewise ruled that the State's waters extend three nautical miles from the low water mark on shore, *Dettling v. United States*, 983 F. Supp. 2d 1184, 1201 (D. Haw. 2013) (citing *Civil Aeronautics Bd., et al. v. Island Airlines, Inc.*, 235 F. Supp. 990, 1007 (D. Haw. 1964), *aff'd Island Airlines, Inc. v. Civil Aeronautics Bd.*, 352 F.2d 735 (9th Cir. 1965), with the possible exception of channels between the islands, *see, e.g., In re Application of Island Airways*, 47 Haw. 1, 89–91 (1963) (discussing whether the channels were within the boundaries of the State); *compare Island Airways, Inc. v. Civil Aeronautics Bd.*, 363 F.2d 120 (9th Cir. 1966) (holding channels were not part of the Territory or the State). No matter the precise boundaries, it is clear that state courts do not exercise jurisdiction over *all* waters.

In order to prevent confusion, we recommend that the measure be amended to specify that the Department of Land and Natural Resources may recommend that the defendant be restricted from entering certain "waters of the State," to ensure that state courts have jurisdiction over the waters a defendant might be prohibited from entering following an aquatic resources violation case. *See generally* section 339-1, Hawaii Revised Statutes (defining "waters of the State" as "any stream, river, ocean, canal, harbor, bay, or the like located within the territorial limits of the State.").

For the above reasons, we respectfully ask that this bill be amended.

HB-1653-HD-1 Submitted on: 2/15/2022 9:05:05 AM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|----------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Damien Kenison | Kauhako Ohana Association | Support | No |

Comments:

Aloha no, I am submitting this testimony in support of HB 1653

DOCARE already has difficulty enforcing the Hawaii fishing rules and regulations due to inadequate staffing and the few commercial fishers who have no respect for our subsistence fishing communities have taken advantage of that. Although many of our commercial fishers are law abiding and respectful the "bad apples" have put a stain on that industry and turned subsistence fishers against them all.

Those bad apples take as much as they can and move on because they have no connection to our fishing communities and do not care if the resource is depleted. Sadly, although we are experiencing difficult economic times because of the pandemic and the high cost of living in Hawaii, there are also a few locals who have forgotten the values taught to them by kupuna and placed money above their integrity.

This proposed tier system will enable all fishers to understand and abide by our fishing rules without being overly chastised for their first violation, regardless of whether it was intentional or not. Continued violations will determine someone's intent to knowingly harvest fish illegally and punish them accordingly. This bill will put some "teeth" into enforcement efforts without causing undue harm to those who are not familiar with the rules and regulations and abide by them..

I am a part of the Lawai'a Pono Initiative sponsored by KUA and rejoined the West Hawaii Fishery Council last year to be a positive influence on marine resource conservation here in our West Hawaii Regional Fishery Management Area which my home, Ho'okena, is a part of. My determination to represent the families of this district has prompted me to participate in the activities of the Legislature and support proposals that will protect our i'a and perpetuate our cultural practices. Please pass HB 1653 which will help DOCARE to protect our marine resources from illegal harvesting.

Mahalo nui,

Damien Kenison

Kauhakō Ohana Association

PO Box 38, Honaunau, HI. 96726



Mālama Pūpūkea-Waimea Post Office Box 188 Hale'iwa, HI 96712

Board of Directors

Denise Antolini Anne Chung Sydney Covell Bob Leinau Jacqueline Leinau

Advisory Council

Athline Clark John Cutting Dr. Alan Friedlander Debbie Gowensmith Maxx E. Phillips Bill Quinlan Palakiko Yagodich

<u>Staff</u>

Jenny Yagodich, Director of Educational Programs & Makai Watch Coordinator

Federal Nonprofit Organization 501(c)(3) FEIN 27-0855937 www.pupukeawaimea.org info@pupukeawaimea.org February 15, 2022

Re: **STRONG SUPPORT** for **HB1653 HD1**: Relating to Aquatic Resources

Aloha Chair Nakashima, Vice Chair Matayoshi, and Members of the House Committee on Judiciary & Hawaiian Affairs,

Mālama Pūpūkea-Waimea (MPW) is a Hawai'i non-profit organization founded on the North Shore of O'ahu in 2005 that cares for, educates about, and protects the Pūpūkea Marine Life Conservation District (MLCD) one of only three on O'ahu and eleven statewide.

We are proud to have been the first (and are currently the only) State of Hawai'i Makai Watch program on O'ahu, a collaborative statewide program where citizens and NGOs become directly involved with the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) in the management of marine resources through promoting compliance to rules, education, and monitoring.

We collaborate closely with the Division of Conservation and Resources Enforcement (DOCARE) and rely on their ability to respond to violations and enforce the rules and regulations protecting our marine resources. We are in **support of HB1653 HD1** which would establish a much-needed tiered administrative fine system for each specimen of aquatic life taken, killed, or injured. It would also establish a criminal fine structure on a per-specimen basis for violations involving aquatic life, would authorize the Department of Land and Natural Resources to recommend community service that benefits the resource damaged when a person is ordered to perform community service in lieu of a fine, and would authorize the Department of Land and Natural Resources to recommend to the court that defendants be restricted from entering specific geographical areas where aquatic resources may be found.

In addition, we recommend including into HB1653 HD1 specifications that any violation occurring within an established Natural Area Reserve, Marine Life Conservation District, Fishing Management Area or any other Marine Protected Area be applied to the highest tier.

Mahalo nui for your consideration of HB1653 HD1,

nny Gagodich

Jenny Yagodich Director of Educational Programs & Makai Watch Coordinator Mālama Pūpūkea-Waimea



February 16, 2022, 2pm

To: Chair Nakashima and House Judiciary Committee members

Re: SUPPORT with Amendments HB 1635; Relating to Aquatic Resource Violations

For the Fishes, dedicated to the protection of coral reef wildlife, supports HB1635, which proposes to raise fines and penalties for certain aquatic resource violations, including creating a new criminal penalty and clarifying that each violation constitutes a separate offense, with the below amendments to the House Draft 1.

DOCARE states that illegal fishing and other aquatic resource violations are the most challenging offenses to enforce, given they occur on and/or under the water, and often at night, where DOCARE lacks adequate resources, equipment (boats) and staffing. DOCARE relies heavily on tips and information from the public, including from boaters, fishers and other ocean users.

The penalties for such offenses must be commensurate with the retail sales values of the reef wildlife illegally captured, to serve as any deterrent for future violations. Otherwise, fines and penalties for aquatic resource violators simply become the "cost of doing business." In addition, violators should have their CML and any other permits/licenses revoked upon conviction.

AMENDMENTS:

- Threatened & Endangered species do not have a "retail market value" thus on <u>Page 2, lines 17-</u> 20 and Page 3, lines 1-3 strike reference to "or the retail market value of the specimen, whichever is greater"
- 2. For proposed amendments to sections 187A-13, 188-70, 189-4, 190-5, the addition of "up to \$250 for the first offense" is not adequate..." given:
 - a. The courts may already fine up to \$1000 per offense but are not doing so
 - b. A mandatory minimum fine is needed
- 3. Similar to criminal theft of property statutes, **a retail market value must be set to trigger fines that are 2 to 3 times the retail market value of the specimen.** For example, if the retail market value of the marine resources illegally taken exceeds \$750, the fine shall be 2 times the retail market value, if the retail market value exceeds \$1500, the fine shall be 3 times the retail market value.
- 4. A person convicted of violating these sections **must be subject to revocation of their Commercial Marine License**. While DLNR currently has this discretion, this same discretion must be provided to the courts and mandatory for DLNR, as they have not done so.

To exemplify the need for upgraded fines and penalties commensurate with value and revocation/suspension of CML's, in 2020 alone, tips from the public led to the investigation and subsequent arrest of three large-scale aquarium poaching operations involving 8 individuals in West Hawaii. Below is a summary of the charges, animals poached, fines, retail value and CML status of defendants.

| DEFENDANT | NO. OF AQUARIUM POACHING CHARGES | NO. OF ANIMALS TAKEN | <mark>CRIMINAL</mark> FINE | RETAIL VALUE OF ANIMALS | CML STATUS |
|---------------------|---|----------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| TERAZONO- NEWMAN | 11 | 550 | 5500 | \$37,466 | <mark>NEVER</mark> SUSPENDED |
| HOWARD- TORIYAMA | 252 | 235 | BENCH WARRANT ISSUED | \$24,730 | NO CMLS |
| BEEVERS | 344 | 336 | \$4000 | \$36,484 | <mark>NEVER</mark> SUSPENDED |
| TOTALS | <mark>607</mark> | <mark>1121</mark> | <mark>\$9500.00</mark> | <mark>\$98,680.00</mark> | |

Thank you for your consideration of the above amendments if the intent of this legislation is to serve as an adequate deterrent and penalty for violators.

Sincerely,

Inga Gibson, For the Fishes Policy@FortheFishes.org

Submitted on: 2/15/2022 1:59:06 PM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM

| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|-----------------|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Zachary LaPrade | Ocean Tourism Coalition | Oppose | Yes |

Comments:

Dear Chair, Vice Chair and Members of the Committee

The Ocean Tourism Coalition ("OTC") represents over 300 ocean tourism businesses statewide.

OTC's greatest concern with HB1653 HD1 is that the term "intentional" was removed from the original version of HB1653 for the portions of the bill that imposes "criminal" penalties.

A violation that could result in criminal charges should include an "intentional" requirement. There should not be the same penalties for someone who intentionally takes marine life versus someone who loses their boat in a storm through no fault of their own.

Thank you for the opportunity to submit testimony and we look forward to testifying in person.

Ocean Tourism Coaltiion.

LATE *Testimony submitted late may not be considered by the Committee for decision making purposes.

HB-1653-HD-1

Submitted on: 2/15/2022 4:19:56 PM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM



| Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|--------------|---------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Kevin Chang | Kua'aina Ulu 'Auamo | Support | No |

Comments:

Aloha,

Aplogies for this late testimony but we generally support this bill.

Mahalo

Kevin



January 30, 2022



Rep. Mark M. Nakashima, Chair Rep. Scot Z. Matayoshi, Vice Chair COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY & HAWAIIAN AFFAIRS

DATE: February 16, 2022 TIME: 200PM

Regarding: HB 1653, HD1 RELATING TO AQUATIC RESOURCES.

Support HB1653 HD1

HFACT is a not-for-profit, IRS 501c(5) organization, that advocates for small boat commercial, non-commercial, and recreational fishermen throughout Hawaii. HFACT board members sit on a number of federal fisheries management and endangered species advisory committees as well as state marine and coastal zone advisory committees; and, HFACT is thoroughly familiar with and participates in ocean and marine resource management in Hawaii and the central Pacific.

HFACT supports HB 1653 HD1.

HFACT fully supports the provision of performing community service in lieu of a fine.

However, the section regarding the per-specimen basis of the tiered administrative fine system is flawed and requires an addition of categories of aquatic life. Not all aquatic life is equal in its ecological value. For example, uhu (parrotfish) provides a valuable ecological service of cleaning algae off of coral. Gravid (carrying eggs) Kona crab provides the valuable ecological service of providing hatchlings. In comparison, retaining an undersized (less than 10 inch) papio (jack) or kumu (goatfish) has significantly less ecological impact. (It should be noted that under spearfishing conditions, with magnification condition of a mask and water, it is very difficult to estimate the size of a fish prior to spearing, especially for young beginners.)

The over-simplified per-specimen rules would be difficult to apply to a violation of limu take (limu cannot be harvested when reproductive nodes are present).

Therefore, HFACT asks the addition of provision to allow the Division of Aquatic Resources to create categories of aquatic resources. The tiered fine system may apply to some aquatic resources, but not to others. Additionally, multiple tier schedules may be necessary to have higher fines for certain (high value ecological service) resources, and lower tier schedules for other aquatic resources.

Hawai'i Fishermen's Alliance for Conservation and Tradition, Inc. 75-796 Hiona Street, Holualoa HI 96725

Finally, the effective date of this bill should be January 1, 2024, to give the division sufficient time to create categories and vetting the categories by consulting with the fishing communities, and to notify and educate the public prior to implementation.

HFACT thanks the chair, vice-chair, and committee members for this opportunity to provide comment and to assist in providing food to the people of Hawaii and to assist in the conservation of Hawaii's natural resources.

Sincerely and Aloha,

Emanda

Phil Fernandez President

Submitted on: 2/14/2022 7:12:53 PM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM

| _ | Submitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|---|----------------|--------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| | Darrell Tanaka | Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

I am a lifelong fisherman and I support this measure...we have too many problems with repeat offenders, we need dlnr to have better tools to manage our reefs...we need this bill to pass, thank you.

Submitted on: 2/15/2022 9:39:04 AM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM

| Submitted B | y Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|-------------|----------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Maki Morino | le Individual | Support | No |

Comments:

Aloha

My name is Maki Morinoue and I am a 4th generation kama'aina from Holualoa. Growing up our shoreline was and still is our main playground and food source. Only in my son's generation have we lacked the care and now face infectious diseases as a daily precaution when going to our shorelines due to over development, sewage and brown water runoff.

I have observed the massive change in land use that directly impact our ocean as well as sea life of overharvesting with NO rules and regulations strong enough to keep our reef fish safe from vital herbivorous fishes that keep our coral reef healthy and invite other fish in a dance of an ecosystem we call the circle of life.

Please support and pass HB1653 which will increase penalties for illegal fish harvesting and other marine conservation legislation.

Today is the day to malama via modern legislative methods to ensure revitalization and protections from offshore investors from damaging our land and ocean ecology. Mahalo for your time and I look forward to following this bill till the end and hope Ways and Means will support this important and necessary bill that impacts food security and overall ecology.

Maki Morinoue Holualoa 96725

Submitted on: 2/15/2022 12:38:41 PM Testimony for JHA on 2/16/2022 2:00:00 PM

| Sut | omitted By | Organization | Testifier Position | Remote Testimony Requested |
|-----|------------|--------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Mil | ke Nakachi | Moana Ohana | Support | No |

Comments:

Please support DLNR in protecting our resources with the bill