#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 1:40:08 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
leslie farnel	Testifying for for for forgotten felines	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am in support of this bill to protect our reef systems. I owned a dive shop here for 20 years and have over 10,000 dives. I have personally seen the destruction of the reefs over the years. People have no right to prostitute our environment and ecosystems for money. That Hawaii has allowed this for so long is unconscionable. Please stop it now while there is still something left.



### To: Senator Mike Gabbard, Chair Senator Tim Richards III Vice Chair, and members of Agriculture and Environment Senator Lorraine Inouye, Chair and Brandon Elefante, Vice Chair and members of Water & Land

#### Feb 10, 2023, Room 224 2:00 pm

#### Testimony in Support of SB505 RELATING TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Aloha Senators and Members,

My name is Mendy Dant and my family owns and operates the oldest originally owned snorkel company in the state. We have been going to Kealakekua Bay since 1971. We have seen a devastating change to our coral reefs. The health of the reefs depend a lot on the health and number of herbivores.

There are many stresses in our oceans today, we can easily control some of these man made problems and stopping aquarium fish collection is a crucial activity to stop. We have seen the positive results in the increase in numbers of fish when stopping aquarium fish collection on the West Hawaii coastline.

Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit, because Hawai'i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide.

The majority of Hawai'i residents and communities have long called for a complete end to the trade, citing environmental, cultural, ethical, and economic concerns and the trade's numerous conflicts with local and cultural values.

Please support SB505.

Sincerely,

Mendy Dant Executive Vice President

78-6775A Makenawai Street, Kailua-Kona, HI 96740 ♦ Phone (808) 322-2644 Fax (808) 322-2913 email: <u>admin@fair-wind.com</u> ♦ website: <u>www.fair-wind.com</u>

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 5:29:07 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jeff Shattuck	Testifying for LoveBlue- Oceanamatica	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha Everyone,

I wish to submit testimony today in support of permanent protections for the non-food ssupply species and against the commercial aquarium trade collection in Hawaii.

As part of our work in the ocean ecology, we know and continue to prove that the protection of all oceans and its inhabitants has reached criticality some years ago. As we are well into extinction of various species around the planet, Hawaii is in a unique position to set and be an example for everyone that we are beyond conservation, these species need protection.

This bill allows the balanced use of the species, protecting them from mass harvesting which has plagued many a region. We see more and more Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) being formed as drastic measures are taken in some regions to protect what is left of species.

We cannot stand by quietly, or support the mass harvest of non-food species that are struggling today, and will be struggling to survive even more in the near future, for a really few greedy dollars.

Please do the pono thing for us and for the ones that follow in our steps, both in spirit and by generations!

With heartfelt mahalo,

Capt Jeff 'Hohonukai' Shattuck

Oceanamatica, "We Clean Oceans"

501c3 USA based Non-profit with global partners.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 11:40:49 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jeff Leicher	Testifying for Jack's Diving Locker	Support	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

Aloha, Honorable Senators, and DLNR. I am Jeff Leicher. I have been a resident and recreational scuba diver in Hawaii for 47 years. I have been employed in the recreational dive/visitor industry all of that time. I have seen changes to our reefs, (some good, some bad), over that time. I support SB505 as a citizen, as a business owner, as an environmentalist and as an animal-lover. It's amazing to me that the aquarium collection industry, which benefits very few, is even being considered. Our reefs, oceans, and planet need these fish much more than the mainland living rooms do. Our business alone employs almost 50 people, whose livelihood depends on a healthy eco-system. Our clients also rent cars, stay in hotels, eat in restaurants, etc., resulting in millions of dollars to the economy. There are hundreds of businesses like ours that have a similar impact. A few individuals who export millions of fish, many of which die in the process, have no such contribution. Economics should not be your only consideration, though. Much of the other testimony in support of this bill addresses the "pono" aspect of preserving wildlife for the good of the planet. Science tells us that a healthy ocean is needed for the survival of mankind. Our reefs face many threats. We should do what we can to control the things we can. Please do the right thing and support SB505. Thank you, Jeff Leicher.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 11:54:23 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Maki Morinoue	Testifying for HULI PAC	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha and mahalo for this opportunity,

## HULI PAC STRONGLY SUPPORTS <u>SB505</u>!

We must prohibit the collection of aquatic life for commercial aquarium pet trade purposes (with exemptions for the continued issuance of Special Activity Permits for public aquariums, research, education, recreational collection, and aquaculture).

It also allows us to further align with our native subsistence fishing practices. It follows the Hawai'i State Constitution by King Kamehameha III, a law that protects the Native Hawaiian Traditions and Customary Rights. Under Hawai'i law, the State and its agencies are obligated to preserve and protect the exercise of traditional and customary Native Hawaiian rights.

The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. Removing large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy symbiotic relationships.

Furthermore, the university of Manoa's study is grossly misrepresentative in data because it begins in the 1990s. In contrast, the aquarium trade desecrated our fish species from the late 1960s before I was born.

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations.

Growing up here as a multi-generational kama'aina, I am a direct witness and observer of the impact of this extractive behavior that has placed our reef's ecosystems into imbalance for many generations. Now we are faced with plankton and food collapse on the table for our near future. We must remember that plankton is responsible for 50% of the oxygen with every breath we take, that our coral reef is the foundation for biodiversity in the food chain, and that these herbivore fish are the protectors of this reef's health and ability to thrive.

Hawai'i County has removed chemical sunscreen on our store shelves to support the regenerative possibilities for the coral in our bays. Our kupunas told stories of identifying large—schools of yellow tang from elevation 1,400 along our bays in Kona. Kona Gold was the original phrase for our plentiful yellow tang that is more often in small schools of 5-10 now when I go snorkeling in areas that continue to be impacted by the aquarium trade. Imagine what we can do if we allow our herbivore fish to regenerate at the plentifulness it needs to be...like they used to.

Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems and ban this Statewide.

Mahalo for your time, Maki Morinoue HULI PAC| 96725



06th February 2023

#### Ref: SB505 Testimony Support for the West Hawaii fishery and EIS published 8<sup>th</sup> June 2021 – <u>Supportive</u> Testimony

Dear Sir

Tropical Marine Centre is Europe's largest and oldest importer of ornamental marine animals in the Aquarium trade. We have a long association with the Hawaiian ornamental industry and have been a strong supporter of a humane, sustainable, and ethical aquarium trade for over 50 years.

Tropical Marine Centre was a founding supporter, data provider and financial sponsor of UNEP –WCMC's Global Marine Aquarium Database (GMAD) as well as being a founding member of the Marine Aquarium Council (MAC) and became one of the first certified livestock operations in Europe. Tropical Marine Centre maintains a close relationship with our own Government's Department of the Environment and Rural Affairs and assists with the training of CITES Wildlife Inspectors in Europe in respect of identification and handling of CITES listed corals species.

Through the collecting operations in particular in West Hawaii which supplied Tropical Marine Centre, we strongly support the implementation of this initiative. The additional limits on collectors, species and collecting numbers ensure and promote a sustainable fishery in Hawaii and one that benefits and supports the livelihoods of people of Hawaiian descent.

Our industry further supports all efforts by the Hawaiian Ornamental Aquarium Industry to provide supporting evidence for continuing this sustainable and responsible trade in Hawaii, through Environmental impact studies and cultural assessments. The solution provided is well balanced and addresses any environmental concerns given in the past whilst still allowing the fishery to operate and held accountable.

It is important for all stakeholders to note that the Hawaiian marine collecting businesses supplying Tropical Marine Centre already conform to the highest standards of best practice in our industry, this is reflected in the very high quality and condition of collected Hawaiian fish and the low mortality both during transport and post transport to the UK. These mortalities are typically less than 0.3% for the long journey from the Pacific, the onward <u>longevity</u> in our aquariums, with our retailers, public institutes, researchers and with the hobbyist is very high.

We have supported many breeding initiatives throughout the world on over 200 different species being not only responsible for many world firsts in our hatchery but also supportive to various projects in various institutes and nurseries including species typically observed in Hawaii. Captive breeding is seen like a replacement to wild collection and a more sustainable approach, but we do firmly believe through empirical evidence over the last 5 decades that these must go hand in hand with short supply chain fisheries. The species this study targets are unique to Hawaii and should therefore be responsibly managed and any economic benefit as such should be retained by the people of Hawaii. Breeding initiatives are rarely commercially done at source and usually closer to where the market operates for logistical reasons. We truly believe it is important to respect local heritage and sustainable short supply chain establishment that offers a viable and ecologically responsible method of supplying our industry for decades and centuries to come in hand with development of science and aquaculture efforts.

The iconic status in our hobby of many unique species from Hawaii signposts not only the economic importance of Hawaiian species in our trade but also the love, appreciation and dedication to the keeping of these animals by a world-wide hobby that shares an investment with the people of Hawaii in sustaining their success and survival in both the wild and in captivity. In so doing the Ornamental Aquarium Industry keep these iconic animals in the consciousness of a much wider public audience and adds to the scientific knowledge so needed for their future survival, both in the wild and in aquariums, for future generations to enjoy.

Tropical Marine Centre already considers the aquarium fishery in West Hawaii to be one of the best managed and regulated of all the 42 collection areas we work with worldwide. The cessation of a sustainable and low impact trade of highly -valued marine animals from Hawaii will remove livelihoods from skilled people of Hawaii and focus trade away to other countries which do not benefit from the same level of scrutiny, oversight and regulation already applied to the collection of animals for the ornamental aquarium industry in Hawaii.

Yours sincerely Brian Schaff (Biotechnology Eng.) CEO

UK

Solesbridge Lane Chorleywood Hertfordshire WD3 5SX London

Call +44 **(0)1923 284151** Fax +44 (0)1923 285840 london@tropicalmarinecentre.co.uk

VAT no. GB945641603

#### Iberia

Rua Cidade de Paris 6 Parque Industrial do Arneiro 2660-456 São Julião do Tojal Portugal

Call +351 **219 739 140** Fax +351 219 739 141 iberia@tropicalmarinecentre.co.uk

VAT no. PT980387132

#### tropicalmarinecentre.co.uk

Registered Office:

Tropical Marine Centre Ltd., Solesbridge Lane, Chorleywood, Hertfordshire WD3 55X Registered in England no.06804160

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 11:24:24 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Christopher Dean	Testifying for Clean The Pacific	Support	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

Clean The Pacific supports SB 505. During our efforts to rid the ocean of commercial fishing tackle and plastic waste, the dire situation our oceans are in is painfully evident. Our reefs are dying from rising ocean temperatures, which will continue to rise for decades to come, even if we stop burning fossil fuel tomorrow. Over fishing, agricultural run off, pesticides and herbicides, thousands of chemical compounds, tourism, coastal development, plastics, industrial waste, industrial and military noise, recreational disruption, it's all too much. The last thing our fish need is for humans to come along and abduct them, fly them to an undisclosed location where they will serve a life sentence in a glass prison, or more likely just drop dead. We can't keep treating the other life forms on this planet with cruelty and indifference just to slake our own desires, it's immoral and foolish. These fish are an integral part of the web of life, which is already in tatters. 2/3 of all the animals that were alive in 1970 have been wiped out by humanity. 60% of all the mammals on Earth are livestock for humans to eat. Please, we need to stop, take a look at our behavior and make some major corrections. Banning the abduction of reef fish is a step in the right direction.

On a personal note, I'm a surfer and lover of the ocean. On occasion I like to go snorkeling because the underwater world is just so beautiful. Those fish these people are taking are my fish. They're your fish. They belong to everyone and no one. What right do these people have to take our fish? Think about it, before they take the fish, nobody owns them, but the second these few people scoop them up, suddenly they're able to say, "These are my fish." Those fish are not their fish. I was looking at those fish and now they're gone, sold to a pet store so someone in Des Moinse Iowa can look at them. If someone in Des Moines wants to see our beautiful fish, they can come here and go snorkeling. I don't snorkel anymore, I just can't do it. Every time I try it, it only makes me depressed, because I remember how it used to be. There were clouds of yellow tang everywhere, now you see a few strays here and there. The reefs are a sad remnant of what they once were back in the 1980s and I can only imagine how amazing it must have been a hundred years ago. The great dying is happening so slowly we don't notice and every generation that's born just thinks this is normal. It's not normal, it's a tragedy. We're facing a lot of difficult problems in the world today, but this is easy, permanently ban the aquarium fish trade.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:55:13 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Norman Barreira	Testifying for Normal Aquatics	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

SB 505 OPPOSED

Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

Say NO to this ban!

Norman Barreria

**Normal Aquatics** 

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:32:05 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jeff Johnston	Testifying for Reefluencer	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:38:41 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jeff Burden Vander Berg	Testifying for Blue Fish Aquarium	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose a fisheries ban as it takes jobs out of Hawaii and any company that would be dealing with Hawaiian fisheries!

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:53:04 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jim Gintner	Testifying for Eye Catching Coral, LLC	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

We are the largest land based coral aquaculture facility in the world. We are also import

wild coral that is sustainablly harvested with cites from all over the world. Wild fish are vital to our coral farm and aquarium systems. We rely on them to help keep our aquariums clean and proper. Our customers also rely on them to keep their aquariums clean. Yellow tangs and other wild aquarium fish are vital for our operations. We supply public aquariums and many private aquariums with coral. We employ 20 people in Ohio. Without these fish from your fishery our operations are in jeopardy. Do the right thing. Allow sustainable and legal proper harvest. We only support fair proper quota and sustainable legal harvest operations. Why would you allow fish to be harvest to kill and eat but not allow

them to be caught live for educational

aquariums and coral farm use? We have local schools who science classes have yellow tangs. They learn about Hawaii and the coral

reefs. Maybe someday they will want to help protect them BECAUSE of their exposure to them in person.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:47:05 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sandy Moore	Testifying for Segrest Inc	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

I oppose this bill as it does not support sustainable use, and thereby, environmental protection of the animals the writers are hoping to protect. Aquarium fisherpeople are more environmentally conscience than most, as their livelihood is based upon good numbers of fish over long periods of time, so there is great disincentive to be a poor steward of the environment and the population levels of the fish they are sustainably harvesting. They've self regulated to only trading in species high in demand and high in population to keep the divers and the fish populations safe and well documented. These fish are collected with the sole intention of keeping them alive, unlike any other use for the marine fish. Fish live longer lives in captivity than in the wild, so not allowing collection for aquariums has the opposite than intended effect. Hawaii is the best managed aquarium fishery in the world, and many other island nations are trying to emulate the governance over the fishery that has kept it best in class.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:33:21 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Rebecca Nickoles	Testifying for VIPets	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning fisheries.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:45:36 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ryan Rothwell	Testifying for Tropical Fish Emporium	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The aquarium fishery has been the target of activists for years. They have satisfied all of the requirements by DAR/DLNR and been scientifically proven as a sustainable fishery. Please stop attacking this industry and allow the local fisherman to get back to work and reopen our businesses. The state should support fisherman and MANAGE the fishery, not treat fisherman as criminals and shut them down.

Mahalo,

Ryan Rothwell

Tropical Fish Emporium

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:43:46 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
ONG JUNKAI	Testifying for Aquarium Iwarna Pte Ltd	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Trade bans should not be enforced based on emotions but rely on science. Is there any evidence that ornamental aquarium collection in Hawaii has been unsustainable? If so, for which species and how have populations decreased as a result? What population surveys have been done to determine unsustainable trade? If there is data available on this, then actions should be made based on available data. Evidence should always be required for something that has occured, not something that has not yet happened.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:15:49 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
wayne sugiyama	Testifying for wayne's ocean world, inc	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Dear Chair Gabbard and Committee Members,

I am opposed to SB505, as it's just another step towards a " feel good, we won ! " for the environmental activists. The State of Hawaii DLNR slammed our aquarium industry by invalidating all commerial aquarium fishing licenses when prior to that, the DLNR fish counts showed that fish numbers on the reefs were increasing while concurrently commercial aquarium fishing was being conducted. And after \$200,000.00+ was spent on the Environmental study for West Hawaii, the injunction was just lifted last week, and then SB505 shows up. Please do not hear SB505 and let the EIS work through the process. Its pitiful of the concessions that divers had to give up, now its 7 fishing licenses and 8 species of fish that can be caught if allowed. Is this possible that some of you may reciprocate to your constituents that donated to your fundraisers for election, with a bill like SB505 - with total disregard for small mom and pop family businesses trying to survive in Hawaii?



06 February 2023

I am a scientist and kama'aina community member who has worked in Hawai'i's forests and oceans and with its people for the last 20 years. I work closely with County, State, and federal agencies, the University of Hawai'i, and several other universities, as well as numerous non-profit (including native Hawaiian) organizations across the State to support natural resource management and community involvement. Today, I submit this testimony as a private citizen, but also as the president of the Hawaii Marine Education and Research Center, which was created to support communities and their natural resources.

I submit this testimony in strong support of SB505. Specifically, I support prohibiting the commercial collection of reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade from Hawaiian reefs for the following reasons:

- 1. Hawaii's reefs are invaluable to native Hawaiian culture, the environment, and the entire way of life in Hawai'i. Commercial collection of reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade goes against traditional and customary rights in Hawaiian culture which date back more than 1200 years. Yet, this harvesting has occurred for years with substantial reductions in species diversity, abundance, and biomass of herbivorous reef fish, directly impacting food fishers.
- 2. From an ecosystem perspective, harvesting reef wildlife for commercial purposes for the aquarium pet trade by any method will not allow for the recovery of herbivorous fish populations, some of which have experienced nearly eighty percent removal for the pet trade. These drastic reductions take time for the final impacts to be fully realized ecologically and may have yet unknown consequences as Hawai'i's reefs face increasing pressures from climate change.
- 3. From a governance perspective, prohibiting the commercial collection of reef wildlife for the aquarium pet trade is consistent with other Hawaii state constitutional laws upheld by the Department of Land and Natural Resources to protect the environment and preserve its natural resources such as the prohibition on taking coral, sand, rocks, soil, and others.
- 4. The proposed act substantially clarifies and upholds the rules and regulations that when followed will restore and protect Hawai'i's reefs and the natural resources for future generations.

Respectfully,

Ropen Morta

Robin Martin PhD President Hawaii Marine Education and Research Center

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 12:09:51 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Marian Hussenbux	Testifying for Animal Interfaith Alliance in Britain	Support	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

We refer to <u>SB505</u> Relating To Environmental Protection, the subject of a decision- making hearing by the Senate Committee on Agriculture and Environment on Feb. 10.

We understand that Hawai'i's reef fish are threatened by U.S. mainland consumer demand for aquarium fish. Companies outside of the state have outrageously blocked attempts to halt the harvesting of Hawai'i's wild animals so that they can continue to profit off the fish who manage to survive the journey from your reefs to their tanks.

This bill, which has the excellent Hawaiian Humane Society's support, prohibits the harvesting of aquatic life for commercial aquarium purposes, regardless of the method of collection.

We would endorse HH's serious concerns on this trade: capturing wild animals and transporting them thousands of miles in conditions that are often fatal is totally inhumane.

Viz:

Upwards of 40 percent of wild-caught fish bound for pet stores perish before they arrive on the sales floor.

Collection methods include cruel practices such as puncturing swim bladders to bring fish to the surface more quickly.

Fins and spines are cut before transport to enable the use of cheaper, thinner bags.

Fish are starved before shipment so they don't foul the water in the bags.

Animal Interfaith Alliance wrote on several occasions to your previous Governor, Mr. David Ige, on the depredations allowed on your precious reefs.

In Britain, in April 2022, we at last achieved formal recognition of the sentience of fishes, though we still have to see proper implementation of this decision.

We hope that action against the suffering inflicted on fishes will be minimised everywhere in due course.

We are therefore very relieved that you will be debating this Bill and we beg to endorse it.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:05:22 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Anders Matthesen	Testifying for Oceanreef	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

This will be really bad do to the aquarium hobby..

And the will have so littel impact on the fish whit the amout shippede for aquarium hobby



### TESTIMONY OF THE PET ADVOCACY NETWORK FOR CONSIDERATION OF THE HAWAII SENATE AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENT AND WATER AND LAND COMMITTEES IN OPPOSITION TO SB 505 To be considered February 10<sup>th</sup>, 2023

January 30, 2023

#### **Position: OPPOSED**

SB 505 is a job-killing and completely unnecessary bill. Sound science, sound safety practices, and common sense all dictate that SB 505 is nothing more than a renewed attack by environmental extremists on a small and easily targeted segment of the Hawaiian population; aquarium fishermen.

The Pet Advocacy Network appreciates the opportunity to offer our views regarding SB 505, a bill that would enact a complete ban on aquarium fishing without any scientific rationale for doing so. As the country's largest pet trade association, representing the interests of all segments of the pet trade throughout the United States, the Pet Advocacy Network counts among its members national associations, organizations, corporations and individuals involved in the commercial pet trade. More specifically, PIJAC represents the interests of fishers, pet stores, suppliers, distributors, pet supply manufacturers, breeders, retailers and pet owners throughout the state of Hawaii and across the country.

Let me start by saying that nobody cares more about healthy and safe pets than the Pet Advocacy Network and its members. We have for many years provided a well-respected animal care certification program that is widely utilized by not only persons in the commercial pet trade but shelters, humane societies and institutes of higher education as well. Our association has long been recognized as the voice for a responsible pet trade, and we routinely advocate legislative and regulatory proposals establishing governmental mandates where appropriate to advance the public interest and welfare of pets and the environment. We work closely with US Department of Agriculture and Department of the Interior to ensure effective enforcement of the federal Animal Welfare Act, management of threatened or endangered species and control of invasive species, and have since its inception. We regularly work with federal and state agencies as well as local governments to advance animal welfare and environmental interests.

The idea that the state of Hawaii would kill an entire trade and shut down Hawaiian businesses that have been responsibly operating for decades is unfathomable. To justify the killing of an entire industry, supporters of this legislation have abandoned even the attempts to cherry pick data to support an argument that the aquarium fishing is adversely impacting the environment. Advocates for a ban have realized that the data collected by the State over a period of 20 years, and is widely supported by the

1615 Duke Street, Suite 100 Alexandria, VA 22314 202.452.1525 | <u>info@petadvocacy.org</u> Petadvocacy.org

# Pet ADVOCACY NETWORK

scientific community, overwhelmingly supports the fact that the fishery is sustainable and are making one last, desperate, attempt to shut it down.

SB 505 asserts that the existence of the aquarium fishery is not in harmony with nature or sustainability. As several Hawaiian organizations have pointed out, and a mountain of scientific data demonstrates, this is not the case (see <a href="http://www.huntfarmfish.com/blog/">http://www.huntfarmfish.com/blog/</a>). Science has shown that the fishery operates in harmony with nature, and consistent with cultural values. The fishery operates sustainably and in close cooperation with state regulators to ensure that resources are not taken in a way that negatively impacts the ecosystem. Isn't this exactly what every industry in Hawaii should be doing?

We are also greatly concerned that the legislature is being encouraged to take this action at this time. Opponents of the aquarium fishery are well aware that in-depth environmental impact statement and cultural assessment have recently been completed for West Hawaii strongly demonstrating its sustainability and are being conducted for Oahu at this time to identify any bonified cultural issues arising from the fishery. They are concerned that, as with fish population data, the facts will not support their argument, and they are desperate to legislate this sustainable fishery out of business before those facts come out.

The responsible course of action is to withhold judgement of the impact of the Aquarium fishery until the studies have been completed. If there are legitimate conflicts between the fishery and Hawaii's practices, then the fishery is committed to addressing them and finding solutions.

Hawaii's aquarium industry is considered one of the best regulated near-shore fisheries in the world. The DLNR, pursuant to State law, submits a report every five years to the legislature entitled "Relating to the West Hawaii Regional Fishery Management Area." The 2015 Report found that the "The Hawaii marine aquarium fishery is currently the most economically valuable commercial inshore fishery in the State with FY 2014 reported landings greater than \$2.3 million." The regulatory mechanisms covering the Hawaiian aquarium fishery supports the tenets of the sustainable use of renewable natural resources supported in the IUCN's Policy Statement on sustainable use. The Pet Advocacy Network strongly opposes SB 505 and asks the Hawaii Legislature to side with science over unfounded accusations. We ask that you vote NO on SB 505.

Thank you for considering our comments and concerns.

Robert Likins Executive Vice President Pet Advocacy Network bob@petadvocacy.org

1615 Duke Street, Suite 100 Alexandria, VA 22314 202.452.1525 | <u>info@petadvocacy.org</u> Petadvocacy.org



February 7, 2023

Committee on Agriculture and Enviroment Committee on Water and Land Hawai<sup>•</sup>i State Capitol 415 South Beretania St. Honolulu, HI 96813

#### Re: Strong Support for Senate Bill 505, Relating to Environmental Protection



Welina mai Mr. Chair, Madame Chair and members of the AEN/WTL committees,

With over one thousand members and supporters, the Hawai'i Island Group of the Sierra Club of Hawai'i strongly supports SB505 which seeks to end the commercial taking of reef wildlife for ornamental uses.

As depicted in the photo above, the essential services that fish, such as the yellow tang (Lau'ipala) and gold ring surgeonfish (Kole), provide are part of nature's way of keeping an entire ecosystem healthy. Hawai'i's sea turtles aren't covered with barnacles and other parasites as in other places in the world where coral reefs have collapsed because coral reefs are the deep oceans' "cleaning stations".

In light of the many stressors and impending impacts due to climate change, the value of fish and other marine organisms on our coral reefs, both ecologically and economically, far exceeds any monetary gains that accrue to the few remaining collectors in the state. These fish are indeed, nature's own invaluable "tools" for reef health and recovery!

SB505 thoughtfully carves out reasonable exceptions for select 'takings' at the research, education, subsistence and even recreational levels. These user classes are made distinct and yet protected against the outsized impact of wholesale industrial style collecting operations that seek only to maintain a special profit-making privilege.

SB505 actually helps local fishers and their families. Current history supports this contention along with evidence that since the time that a de facto commercial ban was put in place, a return in abundance of heretofore targeted fish for the aquarium trade, such as the yellow tang, has taken place in areas previously depleted by collecting. Such dramatic improvement in numbers in the last five years puts a lie to the industry's claims that fewer fish were not a result of aquarium collecting in years past, because a similar increase has not occurred in areas long protected from collecting.

It's time to support nature's potential for resiliency. It's time to give reef wildlife the chance it desperately needs, and that we, the majority of Hawai'i's residents, have been asking for. It's time to end the commercial trade of our reef fish merely for ornamental purposes.

With climate change already causing harm to our essential and irreplaceable coral reefs, the rainforests of the oceans, we must take action now. Too much is at stake for the future health of our planet and children.

Please pass and support this long overdue measure.

Mahalo. Charles Flaherty Chair

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:25:27 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Craig Morton	Testifying for Aquarium Doctor Inc.	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

We oppose this bill

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 7:19:22 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Robert Tondre	Testifying for Robert's Reef	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Environmental impact is far less than human activity. Allowing this trade to continue would help tons of us business owners depending on livestock to sell. Please rethink this move.



### SENATE COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENT SENATOR MIKE GABBARD, CHAIR SENATOR HERBERT M. RICHARDS, III, VICE CHAIR

## SENATE COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND SENATOR LORRAINE INOUYE, CHAIR

SENATOR BRANDON ELEFANTE, VICE CHAIR

TESTIMONY IN <u>STRONG SUPPORT</u> OF SENATE BILL 505 PROHIBITING THE HARVESTING OF AQUATIC LIFE FOR COMMERCIAL AQUARIUM PURPOSES, REGARDLESS OF THE METHOD OF COLLECTION

> Friday, February 10, 2023, 2:00 p.m. State Capitol, Conference Room 224

Dear Chairs Gabbard and Inouye, Vice Chairs Richards and Elefante, and members of the Committee on Agriculture and Environment and the Committee on Water and Land:

Earthjustice is a public interest environmental law firm, with a Mid-Pacific office in Honolulu, that for more than a decade has represented Native Hawaiian fishers and other reef advocates in lawsuits seeking legally valid environmental review of the aquarium pet trade. We hereby submit testimony in <u>strong support</u> of Senate Bill 505. Please note that we attempted to submit this written testimony in advance of the January 30 hearing but were unsuccessful due to technical issues with the capitol.hawaii.gov website.

Commercial aquarium collection has been damaging Hawai'i's reef ecosystems for decades, and the failure to openly declare and analyze those significant environmental impacts has been the subject of four separate lawsuits over the last eleven years. In 2017, the courts prohibited the state Department of Land and Natural Resources from issuing aquarium permits to commercial collectors until the environmental impacts have been fully vetted under Hawai'i Revised Statutes chapter 343, also known as the Hawai'i Environmental Policy Act, or "HEPA."

The courts' early rulings brought promise that the trade, with public and government input, would develop a science-based plan for future extraction that would allow fish populations and the communities that rely upon healthy reefs to thrive. But the HEPA review processes for West Hawai'i and O'ahu quickly devolved into paper exercises that continually ignore commercial extraction's environmental damage and instead propose levels of catch that would maintain the status quo or, in some instances, would dramatically increase take. Committee on Agriculture and Environment; Committee on Water and Land February 10, 2023 Page 2

For example, for the West Hawai'i revised environmental impact statement ("EIS"), which is currently under review on appeal:

- The proposed take of nearly a *quarter million fish annually* from West Hawai'i reefs, totaling *1.23 million fish over the five-year period* covered under the revised EIS, rivals historical reported take;
- For seven of the eight proposed catch quotas, take levels are *higher than in most of the last 20 years*; and
- For Potter's angelfish and Thompson's surgeonfish, in particular, the proposed catch quotas represent *three and ten times* the average reported historical catch, respectively.

For the O'ahu EIS, which is currently being revised by the trade after having been rejected by the Board of Land and Natural Resources in October of 2021:

- The proposed take of more than *92,000 fish annually* from O'ahu's reefs (totaling more than *460,000 fish over the five-year period* covered under the EIS), is more than 20% greater than the average reported historical take of less than 72,000 fish annually;
- For 28 of the 31 proposed catch quotas, take levels are *higher than the average reported historical* levels, including for Yellow tang (35% higher) and Kole (18% higher); and
- The proposed take of more than 200,000 invertebrates, e.g., hermit crabs, annually (totaling more than 1 million invertebrates over the five-year period covered under the EIS), substantially exceeds the average reported historical take of around 165,000 invertebrates annually.

Thus, the trade has continually put forth extraction plans that would conserve and protect the aquarium pet trade instead of Hawai'i's public trust reef resources. Even after more than a decade of litigation and agency proceedings, there is still no environmentally sound plan in place to resume commercial extraction anywhere in the state. And with the trade driving the HEPA review processes, it is doubtful that any such plan will materialize, since the collectors that are financially backing environmental review are incentivized to maximize profits by maximizing extraction levels.

As trustee of public resources, the Legislature should step in and apply a precautionary approach by banning commercial aquarium collection now, before the courts and agencies reopen the trade for business as usual, and before it is too late for Hawai'i's reefs. A statutory ban would proactively protect marine life from overextraction, and conserve limited administrative and judicial resources that would otherwise be expended further scrutinizing the trade's perpetually flawed and environmentally destructive proposals.

For these reasons, Earthjustice strongly supports Senate Bill 505.

Committee on Agriculture and Environment; Committee on Water and Land February 10, 2023 Page 3

Sincerely,

M

Kylie W. Wager Cruz Attorney Earthjustice

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 4:28:45 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Alex Tyler Wilson	Testifying for AlexporaCorals	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

If they're not an endangered species then they should be collected.



# Environmental Caucus of The Democratic Party of Hawaiʻi

#### TO: COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENT Senator Mike Gabbard, Chair Senator Herbert M. "Tim" Richards, III, Vice Chair

#### TO: COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Brandon J.C. Elefante, Vice Chair

#### **CONCERNING SB505**

#### **POSITION: Unreserved Support**

## ALOHA Chairs Gabbard and Inouye and Vice Chairs Richards III and Elefante

Once again the Environmental Caucus stands in firm support for SB505. You have heard the facts, the science from **Kapu AQ Hui and Inga Gibson so** there is no need to repeat it.

However, why would you even listen to the vested interests of the Aquarium Pet Industry from the mainland or elsewhere overseas, who do not live here or care at all about the well-being of our islands, our Oceans, our sea life? They just want to make as much money as possible as fast and cheaply as possible and then get out of town.

They do not care if our reefs fall apart leaving the coastline completely unprotected from rising seas. They do not care if we have to desperately search for replacement stock for over fished reef wildlife. They don't care if the collected fish die in transit, they don't care if our eco-tourism suffers and they certainly don't care about Hawaiian cultural traditions or how their profiteering will affect those traditions when they have over harvested the reefs.

You are elected by local people to act in our interests, not in the commercial interests of the industry which supplies overseas rich self-indulgent collectors with a pretty display they can show off with. Leave the wild fish where they are doing what they were intended to do. It is always easier to take away and destroy than it is to repair the damage left behind.

Passionately

Martha Randolph DPH SCC Representative for the Environmental Caucus District 27 Precinct 2 Rep

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:36:35 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Edwin Watamura	Testifying for HFACT	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

This bill is not only fundamentally wrong, but sets an extremely dangerous precedent. The formation of this bill is a prime example of how political pressure put on by conservationist and environmentalist organizations overuled the science compiled by the State's own Department of Aquatic Resoures. Shutting down an entire fishery and all of the commerce attached to it is incomprehensible when the science of over 20 years confirms that this fishery is extremely sustainable. I urge you to not cave to the political pressure and display to the people of Hawaii where your loyalties are.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:12:18 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tish Rothwell	Testifying for The Pet Depot	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please oppose as there are many restrictions already in place.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 10:15:47 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dr Gerard Dericks	Testifying for Hawaii Pacific University Center for Entrepreneurship and Economic Education	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Dear Honorable Committee,

Economically Hawaii has a resource of marine fishes. Many of these fishes will sell for 5x-10x live as they do on ice in a shop. Governments role should be to help society make the most beneficial economic choices with our resources. As you are no doubt aware, the environmental assessments clearly demonstrate the long-term sustainability of aquarium fish collection. So it is not economically rational to ban its collection anymore than it would be to ban the collection of another functionally limitless resource like sunshine. Indeed if the government should ban anything, it should ban food fishing/spearing of the species sought by both groups (e.g. Kole Tang). Aquarium fish collectors could then train and employ these same fishermen to catch these fish live and thereby multiply the benefit of them to Hawaiian society. Of course, the banning of food fishing is not even called for, as there are enough of the target species to go around, but you see the point. Thank you for your considered deliberation.

Aloha,

Dr. Gerard Dericks (PhD, London School of Economics) Director Center for Entrepreneurship and Economic Education Hawaii Pacific University
#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 11:03:24 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Leonard K Yamada	Testifying for Aiea Boat Club	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

We oppose this bill. If science says the stock is okay we should be able to sustainably harvest.



January 9, 2023

Hawai'i State Legislature Hawai'i State Capitol 415 South Beretania St. Honolulu, HI 96813

Dear Senators:

I submit the following testimony pursuant to Senate Bill 505, "Relating to Environmental Protection." I offer a comparative assessment of the regulatory landscape of Hawaii's marine aquarium fishery under the Department of Land and Natural Resource (**DLNR**)'s management, and recommend a Vote of NO.

I am Dr. Paul Anderson, a Fisheries Scientist with the Coral Reef Aquarium Fisheries Campaign. The Campaign empowers sustainable coral reef aquarium fisheries that support biodiversity conservation, healthy coral reefs, and the livelihoods of fishers, traders, and others who depend on them across the global value chain.

As you know, judicial proceedings began in Hawai'i over 10 years ago that ultimately resulted in the closure of the commercial of the commercial marine aquarium fishery in West Hawai'i in 2018, forcing fishers and traders to find other means to support their livelihoods. These developments prompted stakeholders in Florida's marine aquarium fishery to engage with The Campaign to conduct a comparative assessment of the regulatory landscape of Florida's fishery and proactively offer this information to stakeholders. This work has been peer-reviewed and published in the journal Marine Policy (Anderson and Pomeroy, 2023).

In it, my colleague Fisheries Economist Dr. Bob Pomeroy and I offer a comparative assessment of regulatory frameworks for marine aquarium fisheries from around the world, including Hawai'i and West Hawai'i. Our assessment reveals that during its operation, West Hawai'i's fishery was regulated under a comprehensive fisheries management plan (**FMP**) for the fishery. An FMP is the cornerstone of a well-managed fishery. Of the 11 locales that we compared around the world, only Australia and Puerto Rico also operate their marine aquarium fisheries under the guidance of an FMP. Furthermore, the DLNR has conducted routine fisheries data analyses of the West Hawai'i fishery over more than a decade to monitor the fishery and understand the effects that its regulations have produced on the densities of species fished over time.

During its operation, the fishery imposed a broad array of conventional fisheries management measures to conserve the fishery. These included input controls: Regulating actors in the fishery by issuing permits to aquarium fishers, imposing gear restrictions and also anti-cyanide regulation (cyanide is a poison sometimes used to stun aquarium fish for easy capture). It also imposed a series of output controls: catch quotas, size limits, and prohibited the catch of certain species. It imposed spatial controls, including Marine Protected Areas (**MPA**s). Finally, trade regulations in place regulated wildlife import, export, and handling practices pertaining to the fishery.



Thanks to the comprehensive regulatory structure of West Hawai'i's aquarium fishery during its operation, the DLNR's routine fisheries data analyses of the fishery conducted over more than a decade demonstrated robust upward trends of densities for many of the most popular species fished in the fishery (<u>Walsh *et al.*</u>, 2019).

In many ways, West Hawai'i's marine aquarium fishery policy serves as a model for how other fisheries management agencies around the world can establish or build upon their own regulatory constructs for the marine aquarium trade, toward the goals of conserving coral reefs across the globe while simultaneously offering a means for fishers and traders who depend on the natural resources of their land to provide for their livelihoods.

We recommend the Senate vote NO on Senate Bill 505, and once again, offer this pathway for Hawai'i's people to make a living off the land under the guidance of the DLNR's sound fisheries management practices.

Sincerely,

Andlessen

Paul Anderson, PhD, CAPM Founder The Coral Reef Aquarium Fisheries Campaign panderson@aquariumfisheries.com www.aquariumfisheries.com

#### References:

Anderson, P.A., Pomeroy, R.S. 2023. Comparative assessment of the U.S. State of Florida's Marine Life regulations for its commercial marine aquarium fishery. Marine Policy 149: 105523.

Walsh, W.J., Cotton, S., Jackson, L., Kramer, L., Lamson, M., Marcoux, S., Martin, R., Sanderlin, N. 2019. Findings and recommendations of effectiveness of the West Hawai'l regional fishery management area (WHRFMA). Report to the Thirtieth Legislature, 2020 Regular Session by the Department of Natural Resources, Division of Aquatic Resources, State of Hawaii, in response to Section 188F-5, Hawai'l Revised Statutes.



February 8, 2023

Senator Mike Gabbard Senator Karl Rhoads And the Senate AEN, WTL & JDC Committee Members

**RE: SB505 RELATING TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION** 

Dear Senators Gabbard, Rhoads and Senate Committee Members,

Aloha mai Kākou! We would like to thank you for your time and consideration in hearing this measure again. Conservation Council for Hawai'i is the oldest environmental nonprofit organization in the state, and the Hawai'i affiliate of National Wildlife Association. Conservation Council for Hawai'l **strongly support SB505**. The health and vitality of our reefs and ocean ecosystem depend on all of its species. The practice of the unrestrained reef fish collecting in Hawai'i is brutal. The preparation for transport of the caught fish is barbaric and huge numbers do not survive the ordeal. It's further devastating that only 1% of Hawai'i's aquarium fish survive more than a year.

The quarter of a million fish (primarily herbivores) that the pet industry proposes to take in West Hawai'l Island is destructive to that ecosystem. These herbivores help to keep our coral healthy by eating the algae off the coral giving it access to sunlight and allow it to breathe. In the light of the climate crisis and biodiversity issues, t's imperative to help our reefs survive and thrive, for us today and for the future generations. Please don't wait until our ocean ecosystems are destroyed or endangered to make changes, do it now! We ask you to support SB505 to keep our ocean healthy.

Mahalo Nui Loa,

Jonnetta Peters Executive Director

Telephone/Fax: 224.338.6511 | email: info@conservehi.orgweb: www.conservehawaii.org | P.O. Box 2923, Honolulu, HI 96802President: Colleen Heyer | Vice President: Sunshine Woodford | Secretary: Karl MagnaccaTreasurer: Sunshine Woodford | Directors: Randall Bartlett, Steven Lee Montgomery, Bret Nainoa Mossman,<br/>Michael Nakachi, Lisa Hinano Rey | National Wildlife Federation Region 12 Director: Rachel Sprague<br/>National Wildlife Federation Pacific Region Associate Director: Les Welsh<br/>Executive Director: Jonnetta "Jonee" Peters

Kō Hawaiʻi leo no nā holoholona lōhiu – Hawaiʻi's voice for wildlife | State Affiliate of the National Wildlife Federation



Telephone/Fax: 224.338.6511 | email: info@conservehi.orgweb: www.conservehawaii.org | P.O. Box 2923, Honolulu, HI 96802President: Colleen Heyer | Vice President: Sunshine Woodford | Secretary: Karl MagnaccaTreasurer: Sunshine Woodford | Directors: Randall Bartlett, Steven Lee Montgomery, Bret Nainoa Mossman,<br/>Michael Nakachi, Lisa Hinano Rey | National Wildlife Federation Region 12 Director: Rachel Sprague<br/>National Wildlife Federation Pacific Region Associate Director: Les Welsh

Executive Director: Jonnetta "Jonee" Peters

Kō Hawai'i leo no nā holoholona lōhiu – Hawai'i's voice for wildlife | State Affiliate of the National Wildlife Federation



January 20, 2023

Dr. Suzanne Hammer, MD 410 Iana St Kailua, HI 96734

Dear Suzanne,

Aloha! We would like to thank you for your generous donation of \$100.00, check #1029 on 12/18/2022, to Conservation Council for Hawai'i. All donations benefit Hawai'i's native plants, animals, and ecosystems.

Conservation Council for Hawai'i, EIN# 99-019921, was founded in August 6, 1948, and became a nonprofit 501c3 September 19, 1980. Our mission is to protect Native Hawaiian plants, animals, and ecosystems for future generations. Your continued support allows us to accomplish this mission through educating and connecting people to nature, building coalitions to advocate for environmental causes, and to engage our members and partners here in Hawai`i and across the nation.

Your donations of time, talent and treasure promote conservation programs and increase our effectiveness, now and into the future.

Mahalo Nui Loa,

Jonnetta Peters Executive Director

#### Telephone/Fax: 224.338.6511 | email: info@conservehi.org

web: www.conservehawaii.org | P.O. Box 2923, Honolulu, HI 96802

President: Colleen Heyer | Vice President: Sunshine Woodford | Secretary: Karl Magnacca Treasurer: Sunshine Woodford | Directors: Randall Bartlett, Steven Lee Montgomery, Bret Nainoa Mossman, Michael Nakachi, Lisa Hinano Rey | National Wildlife Federation Region 12 Director: Rachel Sprague National Wildlife Federation Pacific Region Associate Director: Les Welsh Executive Director: Jonnetta "Jonee" Peters

Kō Hawai'i leo no nā holoholona lōhiu – Hawai'i's voice for wildlife | State Affiliate of the National Wildlife Federation



January 20, 2023

Glen Arakawa PO Box 91110 Los Angeles, CA 90009-1110

Dear Glen,

Aloha! We would like to thank you for your generous donation of \$100.00, check #12877008 from Fidelity Charitable on 12/09/2022, to Conservation Council for Hawai'i. All donations benefit Hawai'i's native plants, animals, and ecosystems.

Conservation Council for Hawai'i, EIN# 99-019921, was founded in August 6, 1948, and became a nonprofit 501c3 September 19, 1980. Our mission is to protect Native Hawaiian plants, animals, and ecosystems for future generations. Your continued support allows us to accomplish this mission through educating and connecting people to nature, building coalitions to advocate for environmental causes, and to engage our members and partners here in Hawai`i and across the nation.

Your donations of time, talent and treasure promote conservation programs and increase our effectiveness, now and into the future.

Mahalo Nui Loa,

Jonnetta Peters Executive Director

#### Telephone/Fax: 224.338.6511 | email: info@conservehi.org

web: www.conservehawaii.org | P.O. Box 2923, Honolulu, HI 96802

President: Colleen Heyer | Vice President: Sunshine Woodford | Secretary: Karl Magnacca Treasurer: Sunshine Woodford | Directors: Randall Bartlett, Steven Lee Montgomery, Bret Nainoa Mossman, Michael Nakachi, Lisa Hinano Rey | National Wildlife Federation Region 12 Director: Rachel Sprague National Wildlife Federation Pacific Region Associate Director: Les Welsh Executive Director: Jonnetta "Jonee" Peters

Kō Hawai'i leo no nā holoholona lōhiu – Hawai'i's voice for wildlife | State Affiliate of the National Wildlife Federation

# **ATTENTION:**

# These are all local customers of Coral Fish Hawaii (in Aiea) who strongly oppose <u>SB 505</u>

# Plse do not pass !!!!!!

I am submitting testimony today to voice my OPPOSITION to this bill or any bill like it.

KOHL KITAGAWA FL 2/5/2023

Year after year some big brain politician thinks they are going to save the world by banning aquarium fishing. Guess what, it is banned right now and has been for the last few years. Nothing has changed so why do you want to ban it? You guys go to Honolulu and forget you are there to support people and make lives better. This isn't gonna make anything better but hurt more families that are already struggling. Don't support this bill and focus on something that will do good like drugs in our schools and the homeless in our parks

ad

Darriann Pittmon 0210712023

#### Aloha,

To whom it may concern, I am strongly opposed to this bill for the following reasons:

- 1. It has no scientific evidence, citations, references, data, nothing backing up what is stated
- 2. I don't believe what is suggested is actually true
- 3. There are plenty of scientist that support the fishery
- 4. DAR supports the fishery
- 5. It has a good management system in place overseeing fishery
- 6. We need to add to, not subtract. Banning is not a solution
- 7. Aquariums are important to our community

STEVEN DEMPSEY DEMPSEY 1488@GMAIL. COM





4

Ø 2-6-23

Mac R. Kim Mac R. Kim 216/23

I fully support our fisherman and do not support this ban.

2/6/23

Kim, Dannis m. Om M. L

I fully support our fishenman and do not support this ban.

7/5/23



#### I am opposed to this bill and any other bill like it. Vote NO

BRANDON SHIMAMUR, Bartsom 2/7/2023

I am opposed to this bill and any other bill like it. Vote NO

PATRICE MATSULY Jun 1 12 2/7/2023

#### Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

2/06/2023

Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

Say NO to this ban!



2/6/2023

Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.



Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

Jobert Mano 2/6/23

Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

2/6/23

Water and AEN

Aloha, I read through this bill and do not agree with yellow tangs and kole tangs are going extinct! This is a crazy thing to say. I wonder if the person who wrote this bill has ever even been in the water here in Hawaii. Its nonsense. Listen to the experts. This bill is full of crazy things. Don't ban Aquarium collection.

DADDEN MATERINA 2/5/2023

Water and AEN

Aloha, I read through this bill and do not agree with yellow tangs and kole tangs are going extinct! This is a crazy thing to say. I wonder if the person who wrote this bill has ever even been in the water here in Hawaii. Its nonsense. Listen to the experts. This bill is full of crazy things. Don't ban Aquarium collection.

Mason Mateo mason mateo 2/5/23

Water and AEN

Aloha, I read through this bill and do not agree with yellow tangs and kole tangs are going extinct! This is a crazy thing to say. I wonder if the person who wrote this bill has ever even been in the water here in Hawaii. Its nonsense. Listen to the experts. This bill is full of crazy things. Don't ban Aquarium collection.

0 gp 00 kis 215/20

Water and AEN

Aloha, I read through this bill and do not agree with yellow tangs and kole tangs are going extinct! This is a crazy thing to say. I wonder if the person who wrote this bill has ever even been in the water here in Hawaii. Its nonsense. Listen to the experts. This bill is full of crazy things. Don't ban Aquarium collection.

CHERRAY ANALA Samal -

I oppose the passing of this bill banning the unique aquarium fishery. This fishery has been through an environmental review and passed the test. What other fishery has been scrutinized to this extent? Never heard of one besides this. Science and management is in support of this fishery and it would be a mistake to ban the fishery and take these fishermen's jobs. Please vote no or defer this bill.

K. Pelenar X. pelina 02/09/23

I oppose the passing of this bill banning the unique aquarium fishery. This fishery has been through an environmental review and passed the test. What other fishery has been scrutinized to this extent? Never heard of one besides this. Science and management is in support of this fishery and it would be a mistake to ban the fishery and take these fishermen's jobs. Please vote no or defer this bill.

Tring chiem 2/5/23

I oppose the passing of this bill banning the unique aquarium fishery. This fishery has been through an environmental review and passed the test. What other fishery has been scrutinized to this extent? Never heard of one besides this. Science and management is in support of this fishery and it would be a mistake to ban the fishery and take these fishermen's jobs. Please vote no or defer this bill.

Irvin Lin Dri R.C.-2/5/23

I oppose the passing of this bill banning the unique aquarium fishery. This fishery has been through an environmental review and passed the test. What other fishery has been scrutinized to this extent? Never heard of one besides this. Science and management is in support of this fishery and it would be a mistake to ban the fishery and take these fishermen's jobs. Please vote no or defer this bill.

JON AVALA

Senate Bill 505 AEN &WTL

I am submitting testimony today to voice my OPPOSITION to this bill or any bill like it.

Kenzie Hoang Kingerffor 2/5/23

Senate Bill 505 AEN &WTL

I am submitting testimony today to voice my OPPOSITION to this bill or any bill like it.

2/5/23 POWDEN MUMASAKI

Senate Bill 505 AEN &WTL

I am submitting testimony today to voice my OPPOSITION to this bill or any bill like

it. M. mit

2/05/23

Water and AEN

I oppose this bill in its entirety.

mahalo Ken 10

2/4/23
Water and AEN

I oppose this bill in its entirety.

mahalo

1000 216127

Water and AEN

I oppose this bill in its entirety.

mahalo

1-1 2/0/23

Water and AEN

I oppose this bill in its entirety.

mahalo

in Pruss  $2 \frac{16}{23}$ USA

Water and AEN

I oppose this bill in its entirety.

Olga an 2/04/23 mahalo

SB 505 or any companion bill or ban bill for aquarium collecting in 2023 legislature

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Do not ban the aquarium collection here in Hawaii. Makes no sense. Ban EarthJustice instead. HEWA!!

Mahalo for da time

MIGVER LIN 808 MAJE 2/4/2023

SB 505 or any companion bill or ban bill for aquarium collecting in 2023 legislature

AEN & WTL committee

Do not ban the aquarium collection here in Hawaii. Makes no sense. Ban EarthJustice instead. HEWA!!

Mahalo for da time

Etic Marte El

SB 505 or any companion bill or ban bill for aquarium collecting in 2023 legislature

AEN & WTL committee

Do not ban the aquarium collection here in Hawaii. Makes no sense. Ban EarthJustice instead. HEWA!!

Mahalo for da time

Taylo- Eibson 2-5-23

SB 505 or any companion bill or ban bill for aquarium collecting in 2023 legislature

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Do not ban the aquarium collection here in Hawaii. Makes no sense. Ban EarthJustice instead. HEWA!!

Mahalo for da time Vevin Truong WWW 72/5/23

MyDung Truong MDF. Feb. 5, 2023

Matt Campos light 2/5/2023

Natawut Liwivun 2-5-2023

The Nash

82/65-/23

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Aloha Senators,

I am reaching out today to voice strong opposition to this bill. Im not sure where this bill got its information from but it is clear that the bill has no facts to back up its assertions. The science that the State has accumulated for twenty years strongly goes against EVERYTHING suggested. I would recommend that you guys do your due diligence BEFORE banning a sustainable fishery that creates very good much needed jobs. If the scientist says its sustainable, why cant this fishery continue? No brainer

Um 0 Kellen Kushing

2523

#### OPPOSED

AEN & WTL committee

Aloha Senators,

I am reaching out today to voice strong opposition to this bill. Im not sure where this bill got its information from but it is clear that the bill has no facts to back up its assertions. The science that the State has accumulated for twenty years strongly goes against EVERYTHING suggested. I would recommend that you guys do your due diligence BEFORE banning a sustainable fishery that creates very good much needed jobs. If the scientist says its sustainable, why cant this fishery continue? No brainer

Mahalo,

Matt Miyashiro

SB 505

AEN & WTL committee

Aloha Senators,

I am reaching out today to voice strong opposition to this bill. Im not sure where this bill got its information from but it is clear that the bill has no facts to back up its assertions. The science that the State has accumulated for twenty years strongly goes against EVERYTHING suggested. I would recommend that you guys do your due diligence BEFORE banning a sustainable fishery that creates very good much needed jobs. If the scientist says its sustainable, why cant this fishery continue? No brainer

Tylev CHINI Re- 2-5-23

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Aloha Senators,

I am reaching out today to voice strong opposition to this bill. Im not sure where this bill got its information from but it is clear that the bill has no facts to back up its assertions. The science that the State has accumulated for twenty years strongly goes against EVERYTHING suggested. I would recommend that you guys do your due diligence BEFORE banning a sustainable fishery that creates very good much needed jobs. If the scientist says its sustainable, why cant this fishery continue? No brainer

Kelli Ching, 2/5/2023

## **OPPOSED**

AEN &WTL

Aloha committee members,

I respectfully request that you do NOT pass sb 505. Banning is not a solution and this isn't needed here in Hawaii.

Migwel Lim MigwelR 2/5/23

OPPOSED

AEN &WTL

Aloha committee members,

I respectfully request that you do NOT pass sb 505. Banning is not a solution and this isn't needed here in Hawaii.

DENVINUS RABAGO <u>ral</u> 2/5/23 <u>د</u>

OPPOSED

AEN &WTL

Aloha committee members,

I respectfully request that you do NOT pass sb 505. Banning is not a solution and this isn't needed here in Hawaii.

Enjoli O'Longhlin 2/5/23

#### OPPOSED

AEN &WTL

Aloha committee members,

I respectfully request that you do NOT pass sb 505. Banning is not a solution and this isn't needed here in Hawaii.

Angelou Barcelo 2/5/23

Senate Bill 505 OPPOSED

Aloha committee members,

Don't pass this bill, mahalo

Gerard Dericks 7/2

2/5/23

Senate Bill 505 OPPOSED

Aloha committee members,

Don't pass this bill, mahalo

Muit

2/5/23

Senate Bill 505 OPPOSED

Aloha committee members,

Don't pass this bill, mahalo

Mark Whitebek

2/5/23

SB 505

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Aloha Senators,

I don't support this bill at all. Leave the aquarium fishery alone

200 Ho Pol Ho 2/5/23

SB 505

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Aloha Senators,

I don't support this bill at all. Leave the aquarium fishery alone

•••

Matter Marsunoto 215/23

SB 505

**AEN & WTL committee** 

Aloha Senators,

I don't support this bill at all. Leave the aquarium fishery alone

Mahalo! Janae Mahuma Janae S Neiums 2/5/23

Every single year I have to send testimony on the same bills wanting a ban. Stop with the banning of this fishery.

If you gonna side with earthjustice and have decide what is good for our state then you part of the mainland problems. We need to keep big mainland money out of our state and start supporting our people. If you want to take jobs from our people maybe it time we start looking at taking your job and get a politician that work for us.

This is getting old, how much longer till you look at the facts that these guys just taking a few fish. They say there no fish but how guys post stringers of fish everyday on line if there no fish? Plenty fish on the side of the road and in markets and in the ocean.

Cody Bran

02/05/2023

Every single year I have to send testimony on the same bills wanting a ban. Stop with the banning of this fishery.

If you gonna side with earthjustice and have decide what is good for our state then you part of the mainland problems. We need to keep big mainland money out of our state and start supporting our people. If you want to take jobs from our people maybe it time we start looking at taking your job and get a politician that work for us.

This is getting old, how much longer till you look at the facts that these guys just taking a few fish. They say there no fish but how guys post stringers of fish everyday on line if there no fish? Plenty fish on the side of the road and in markets and in the ocean.

1/1/2023 Derry Gru

Every single year I have to send testimony on the same bills wanting a ban. Stop with the banning of this fishery.

If you gonna side with earthjustice and have decide what is good for our state then you part of the mainland problems. We need to keep big mainland money out of our state and start supporting our people. If you want to take jobs from our people maybe it time we start looking at taking your job and get a politician that work for us.

This is getting old, how much longer till you look at the facts that these guys just taking a few fish. They say there no fish but how guys post stringers of fish everyday on line if there no fish? Plenty fish on the side of the road and in markets and in the ocean.

Every single year I have to send testimony on the same bills wanting a ban. Stop with the banning of this fishery.

If you gonna side with earthjustice and have decide what is good for our state then you part of the mainland problems. We need to keep big mainland money out of our state and start supporting our people. If you want to take jobs from our people maybe it time we start looking at taking your job and get a politician that work for us.

This is getting old, how much longer till you look at the facts that these guys just taking a few fish. They say there no fish but how guys post stringers of fish everyday on line if there no fish? Plenty fish on the side of the road and in markets and in the ocean.

JESSIAH SILSBY 02107/23

Every single year I have to send testimony on the same bills wanting a ban. Stop with the banning of this fishery.

If you gonna side with earthjustice and have decide what is good for our state then you part of the mainland problems. We need to keep big mainland money out of our state and start supporting our people. If you want to take jobs from our people maybe it time we start looking at taking your job and get a politician that work for us.

This is getting old, how much longer till you look at the facts that these guys just taking a few fish. They say there no fish but how guys post stringers of fish everyday on line if there no fish? Plenty fish on the side of the road and in markets and in the ocean.

Linda Keovilathong - Silsby 02/07/7023

Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

215/23

Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

lisa Isano MOU DANO 5 Feb. 2023

Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

Taylor Isono CA 21512023

Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

Mahalo 2-5-23

Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

Christopher Kasai 02107/2023
Chair Gabbard and Chair Innouye,

I am writing to show strong opposition to SB505. The State of Hawaii has had a very rough few years with the Covid-19 shutdowns and slowed tourism through that time. We have much greater problems that a small fishery. Our streets are covered in tents from homeless, drug use is rampant, and the school classrooms are over crowded. Please focus on the real issues of our State and not a fishery that is already managed.

Mahalo Diane T. Kamakele 02/07/23 Diane T. Kamakele

We have a family fish tank and love going to get fish. My kids learn about the ocean and taking care of the fish we catch. It's a great educational experience and I would be truly disappointed if we can not have aquarium anymore. Please do not ban aquariums. Lots of people do aquarium services, have pet stores that sell fish, and this would severely impact them. Please vote to oppose this measure

217/23 Kaleia Valin Kaleia Walin

We have a family fish tank and love going to get fish. My kids learn about the ocean and taking care of the fish we catch. It's a great educational experience and I would be truly disappointed if we can not have aquarium anymore. Please do not ban aquariums. Lots of people do aquarium services, have pet stores that sell fish, and this would severely impact them. Please vote to oppose this measure

02/07/23 Blithi Cthinks

## Aloha Senators,

I strongly oppose this bill. Most of you ran your campaign on creating more jobs and a better economy. This does not support that.

We need to be supporting local industries that are not tourism related. This fishery is a prime example of a something you should be supporting that benefits local families.

Say NO to this ban!

Linh Nguyen 2/6/23

## Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Dallas Tumalo

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Robert B.Real Ret B.Real

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Chris Figiwan

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Lauren Ancheta Naruhaht ØGFEBZZ

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

PAND ASATO

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Travis Ancheta 7FEB22 Tran Ancheta

Aloha,

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable.

Do not ban any fishery

Jesse Sountaina Jesse h Zonto 2/7/23

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2023 9:42:19 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Beth Anderson	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Our coral reefs are at risk, many suffering from the effects of climate change/global warming and polluted runoff. Decreased health of coral reefs has resulted in a decrease in reef fish in the islands. Entire areas are barren. Until we have an abundance of healthy reefs teeming with fish no one should be harvesting them for aquariums. In addition, these fish don't belong in people's personal aquariums, they belong in the ocean and should remain there.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/3/2023 6:34:15 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Caroline Azelski	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Support. Thank you.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 7:57:44 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brian F. Funai	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this bill. The science shows that this is one of the most regulated fisheries in Hawaii and that it is a sustainable one.

Submitted February 4, 2023 Bruce A. Carlson, Ph.D. Former Director, Waikiki Aquarium

I oppose SB 505. I am submitting a 2009 testimonial letter below co-signed with 20 of my colleagues in the Hawai'i science community who recognize the West Hawaii Aquarium Fishery as one of the most thoroughly monitored and managed coral reef fisheries in the world, and with significant published evidence that the fishery is not having any detectable adverse environmental effects. By contrast, opponents to the fishery offer only anecdotal evidence with no long-term rigorous monitoring data comparable to that produced by DLNR biologists.

The 1998 law which established the West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area (WHRFMA) required the DLNR/DAR to present a report to the Legislature every five years on the effectiveness of the WHRFMA. To do so it was necessary to study how the new regulations were working. To accomplish this, DAR in association with the University of Hawai'i Hilo, established a rigorous, scientific monitoring program in 1999 to track changes in reef fish populations and coral reef benthic communities. Over the past 20 years, 82 survey divers have conducted over 2,100 underwater surveys for this monitoring project. Additionally, a number of other scientists have conducted research in West Hawai'i relating to aquarium issues and/or targeted species.

The monitoring data show that the regulations put in place have been very effective in managing aquarium collecting in West Hawai'i. The West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area is among the best studied and most effective fishery management efforts to date, and scientific data clearly show that management is working with population increases of the primary targets. For example, as noted in the 2019 DLNR/DAR legislative report, the populations of the two most heavily collected species of West Hawai'i aquarium fish, Yellow Tang and Kole, which collectively made up 92% of total aquarium catch in (FY17/I8), more than doubled over the past two decades. Their populations even increased in the areas open to collecting likely due to spillover from protected areas.

Concern expressed about the threat of climate changes such as coral bleaching on reefs warrants extreme caution in reviewing activities such as aquarium collecting. This concern over coral bleaching is certainly warranted but somewhat surprising given that the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) leadership has not implemented the 2017 Coral Bleaching Recovery Plan which was developed by DAR and the University of Hawai'i based on the input of over 100 scientists and resource managers from around the world. The goal of the Recovery Plan was to implement management actions to promote coral recovery after bleaching in Hawai'i and the scope of the Plan was much more comprehensive than just focusing on aquarium collecting.

As experienced Hawai'i marine science researchers with a direct/intimate understanding of this issue, we want to re-emphasize that the strong support we are expressing for the fishery is due entirely to the survey efforts and results of the DAR research team. There is a huge amount of data and other information showing that the aquarium fishery is sustainably managed and that

the system works. This type of science-based management should be a model for other fisheries in Hawaii.

William Walsh Ph.D. Ivor Williams Ph.D. Brian Tissot Ph.D. Leon Hallacher Ph.D. Bruce Carlson Ph.D. Charles Birkeland Ph.D. Jeremy Claisse Ph.D. Mark Christie Ph.D. Richard Pyle Ph.D. Leighton Taylor Ph.D. Randy Kosaki Ph.D. Cynthia Hunter Ph.D. Brian Bowen Ph.D. Brian Zgliczynski Ph.D. Jeff Ebel Ph.D. Alan Friedlander Ph.D. Kosta Stamoulis Ph.D. Delisse Ortiz Ph.D. Jan Dierking Ph.D. Rob Toonen Ph.D. Jim Beets Ph.D.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:25:07 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Randy Fernley	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha Committee Members,

#### I Strongly Oppose SB 505

As the past owner and advisor to Coral Fish Hawaii, I strongly believe that this bill is a slap in the face to all that enjoy viewing and maintaining aquariums throughout the state of Hawaii.

For those people who cannot go into the ocean to observe our local fish due to age, sickness or fear, this bill denys them the opportunity to enjoy our local fish species in both private and public aquariums. Such well known institutions such as the Waikiki Aquarium, Sealife Park, and the Maui Ocean Center would be unable to procure local fish species. If this bill were to pass, those people (and visitors) could only view those species in picture books.

#### Is that right ???

The small aquarium fishery in Hawaii is not only sustainable, but also considered a "model fishery" throughout the world. At least 20 **locally** renown scientists have stated their approval of the fishery in the last couple of years due to the extensive research that has been contucted.

#### This draconian bill needs to be killed immediately or deferred.

Randy Fernley / Aiea, HI

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:52:00 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mark Schacht	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I want to reaffirm my support for SB 505 in light of the partial opposition testimony I heard at the first hearing. Factually, I think it is irrefutable that whatever is the future \$\$ value of the literally millions of wild Hawaiian reef fish that will be harvested here, it will go out of the islands to mainland and overseas aquarium interests. Very few in Hawaii will share in these profits, while the rest of us will--again-- experience a slow, steady reduction in the absolute numbers and varieties of wild healthy fish on the reefs. Not only is this shortsighted in the extreme, but at a time when highly sought after Hawaiian reef fish can be bred for the Aquarium Trade it is foolish and unnecessary. I strongly urge a Yes vote on SB505.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:54:01 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Clay Tam	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

To whom it may concern,

I strongly oppose SB505 this bill, since based on scientific data collected by DAR which says that the this fishery is sustainable. When making these decisions we must trust sound scientific data. If there is a problem it is the lack of freshwater flowing into our ecosystem casued by irresponsiblie development and lack of foresight by regulators and planners. This is also known data collected by DAR Thank you for your time and concern in this matter.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:58:17 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Doug Fetterly	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I have attended BLNR meetings over the years and heard countless testimonies from locals against the removal of fish for aquariums. The aquarium trade has far outstipped the sustainability of these fish to survive. We need to stop this trade now. Mahalo.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 11:07:28 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sandra Stokes	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please, no more gathering fish for aquarium lovers on the mainland or other venues. There are quite enough fish available through "farming" for aquariums! Leave the wild....wild! Mahalo for listening to my concerns. Sincerely, Sandra Stokes, Hilo, Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 11:08:48 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Krista Cutter	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I have been a registered voter and resident of Hawaii, on the big island in Hawi town, for 22yrs now. I have swam these waters nearly daily. The varing water temperatures over the years has caused reef fluctation and a decrease in reef fish populations that do not fully recover. The variety and number need protection.

Please inforce strong regulations on fishing in general. Please end commercial AQ for the mainland pet trade by supporting SB505.

Thank you.

Aloha,

Krista Cutter

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 11:28:07 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
tlaloc tokuda	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha AEN/WTL Chair, Vice Chair & Committees, I support the ending of the AQ Collection for Pet Trade. We on the big Island have seen on the Hilo & Kona side of the island the perpetual harvesting of our tropical fish resources and the reckless steeling of fish when there was a moritorium of collecting the AQ trade.

The majority of Hawai'i residents and communities have long called for a complete end to the trade, citing environmental, cultural, ethical, and economic concerns and the trade's numerous conflicts with local and cultural values. Please put an end to this trade once and for all!

Mahalo for your consideration,

tlaloc tokuda

Kailua Kona 96740

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 11:35:09 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Madolin Wells	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

After so many efforts for so long to finally STOP HARVESTING FOR AQUARIUM TRADE, it is a horrendous betrayal by DLNR to allow the trade to start again. A law to prevent aquarium trade from stealing Hawaii's tropical fish could not be more needed than now. I urge legislators to support this bill.

Mahalo.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:00:59 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
MARY MORRIS	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As along time resident of Puako, I have seen the reef and it's fish population decline over the past twenty years. When aquarium collecting was stopped a few years ago, we had the yellow tang and other reef fish return and there are larger schools of fish. Not as good as it was in 2005, but better than a five years back.

Over the years I saw and talked in a friendly way to people collecting and sometimes half of the fish in their coolers were already dead by the time they left Puako. So, let's keep our reef clean and full of fish for the enjoyment of all and for the ecosystem in general. Thank you.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 11:39:53 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Meredith Miller	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I'm a Hawaiian resident and live on the Big Island, in South Kohala.

I have seen the reef recovering at Makaiwa Bay since the Aquarium trade was stopped. it would be a shame to deplete the reefs of their fish again.

I know that about 50% of the fish that were caught before, die in transit. That's no way to treat these beautiful reef fish. They deserve to stay in the reef where they belong, and contribute to the health of the reefs.

Thank you for your consideration,

Meredith Miller, M.A.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:09:27 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Larry O'Brien	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As an active water enthusiast living on the Big Island, I strongly support SB505 and the continued ban on aquarium collecting. Our reefs are, and will continue to be, under tremendous pressure. We've been fortunate to have been in a La Nina for the past few years, but the long-term trend for climate change is undeniable. The acute economic impact of banning the trade has already been absorbed, it would be profoundly stupid to re-open the trade, re-establish the very few jobs dependent on it, only to potentially reinstate it in when the pressures on our reef fishes increase due to climate change. Aquarium collecting is not good for the reefs, it doesn't provide many jobs, and there's no long-standing cultural aspect to it. Please make the ban permanent.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:13:24 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
jeanne wheeler	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly support this bill, to better protect our fish & reefs

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:21:01 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Maria Macias	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am a resident of the Big Island for 20 years and have applaud the recovery of our reef fish. Please continue to support banning the aquarium trade taking of fish. For those of us that enjoy the precious underwater world surrounding our islands please don't lift the ban. It's our part in keeping the balance.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:21:15 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Juan Chacin	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Dear Sir/Madam,

I write in support of SB505. As an avid scuba diver, I have seen the impact that the aquarium trade has on the reefs. Most of the species valued by collectors are also, not coincidentally, the most rare and at hence at risk of local extintion.

Please do not allow aquarium fish collection to resume. The ocean will not be able to sustain that practice anyway.

Respectfully,

Juan Chacin

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 12:31:27 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dawn Zierk	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

My family and I lived full-time on the Big Island for almost 7 years, but I've been going there for 30 years. I remember the first time I snorkeled there in the early 90's and there were so many fish!! Over the years, the decline in reef fish populations was obvious. When we lived in Kona, I learned that aquarium collectors could get a permit for \$50/year and take as many fish off the reef as they wanted! I was appalled to learn that most of them die on the way to stores! There was no limit to taking even the last fish off the reef. No wonder it was so hard to even find tropical fish when snorkeling. In the past few years, when swimming off Kukio Bay, the quantity of baby fish on the reef has risen tremendously due to the "Try Wait" bill. I'm so hopeful that this bill will pass - people should enjoy fish in their natural environment, not in an aquarium where they will die and not reproduce or be part of the important coral reef ecosystem. The reefs are dealing with pollution, ocean acidification, increasing ocean water temperatures, over-fishing, and aquarium fishermen....please keep Hawaii beautiful for its people and those coming to snorkel and enjoy it's beauty.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 1:08:03 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Katherine Fryer	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly support SB505's ban on aquarium fish collecting in Hawaiian waters. Marine species are already threatened by climate change and rising ocean temperatures, and commercial harvesting adds further pressure. A collecting ban would help preserve reef ecosystems for residents, eco-tourists, future generations, and most importantly for Indigenous Hawaiians who have historically relied on reef species.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 1:21:42 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Teresa Landreau	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly support prohibition of collecting fish from Hawai'ian waters for the commercial acquarium trade. Our legislature passed such legislation years ago only to have it vetoed by Gov. Ige. Let's get this passed again, and prevail upon Gov. Green to sign into law. The waste and harm done to our reef fish by for-profit mainland entities must stop.

Mahalo.

To: Honorable Chair's Gabbard and Inouye, Vice-chair's Richards and Elefante, and Senate Agriculture and Environment, and Water and Land Committee members, and others whom it may concern.

#### **RE:** Testimony in STRONG SUPPORT of SB505 (Relating to Environmental Protection)

Please accept this testimony in strong support of SB505 to prohibit the commercial take of Hawai'i's marine life for the national and international aquarium pet trade (with certain exemptions for public aquariums, research, education, and sustainable aquaculture).

In 2021, I co-authored and published a cost-benefit analysis (CBA) that specifically analyzed Hawai'i's marine aquarium fishery to provide necessary information to decision makers. This report was published in the peer-reviewed Marine Policy journal, and is entitled "*The Future For Hawai'i's Marine Aquarium Fishery: A Cost Benefit Analysis Compared to an Environmental Impact Assessment*" (2021).

Properly conducted CBAs are used in environmental impact studies to provide decision-makers the balance required in complex regulatory decisions. Our independently conducted CBA was undertaken to analyze the costs and benefits of Hawai'i's marine aquarium industry for various scenarios and their distribution across stakeholder groups. Four past, (then) current, and proposed management scenarios were explored and the CBA results were compared to the recommendations and conclusions of the FEIS published by the Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council, for the WHRFMA aquarium fishery (before its revision).

# Our CBA of the Hawai'i aquarium trade determined that ending the trade was the only option that yielded positive annual benefits, and negatively impacted the fewest stakeholders.

We found that the **annual net positive benefit of banning the aquarium trade was upwards of \$440,294,770** – factoring in potential costs, including on-reef tourism impacts to Big Island and O'ahu.

Proponents of Hawai'i's marine aquarium industry often site to its potential job creation and tax revenue incentives, however, our study discovered that the comparatively low market benefit of the aquarium trade in Hawai'i accrues only to a small group of collectors, wholesalers and dealers, whereas the majority of the population is subject to the lion's share of costs. Specifically (at the time of our study), 1,415,872 residents, 83% of whom want to see an end to the trade due to environmental, cultural, and ethical concerns with capturing marine life for the pet trade outside Hawai'i bore the losses.

Proponents who support the fishery also ignore the reality of the nature of its **export dynamics** and who is actually realizing the large market benefits of its perpetuation. At least 95% of the fish caught from our public trust resources are being exported and sold to mainland

**dealers who mark up the prices before selling the fish again to a retailer or a final consumer**. This market supply chain was analyzed in our CBA and we found that U.S. mainland dealers may have a 500% mark-up or higher. In the case of the Yellow Tang, a survey of online U.S. aquaria retailers revealed that Hawaiian Yellow Tangs are being sold for an average price of \$74.41 – a 1,374% mark-up from the \$4.29 base price that Hawai'i sellers retail them for. Even if Hawai'i fishers sell their Yellow Tang to the mainland for \$16, the number we used in our CBA, the mainland retailers may sell that same fish for \$74.41 - which still is a 465.1% mark-up.

<u>This larger market benefit never reaches Hawai'i's economy and accrues in the U.S.</u> <u>mainland states where the fish are resold</u>. Thus, outside stakeholder groups, such as the national and international pet industry retailers, are realizing the largest market benefits of all stakeholder groups. Again, the stakeholder groups who are losing the most are Native Hawaiians, residents of Hawai'i, and Hawai'i's tourist industry. <u>The bottom line is that this fishery is not</u> <u>equitable</u>. Furthermore, the inherent inequity of this fishery has been largely purposefully omitted by industry-led HEPA review.

For the aforementioned reasons, I strongly support SB505 and I urge all members of the legislature who consider this bill for passage to think about the inherent inequities that this fishery poses.

Mahalo nui,

Simf dehan

Siena I. Schaar

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 1:34:21 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Linda Wright	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As our ocean struggles to survive we must act to save our valuable life sustaining resources and the wildlife on the reef for our planet to be able to survive. Over the past 30 years I have witnessed the decline in Hawaii's reef sustainability personally. I support SB505 as a matter of conscience and conservation.

Sincerely,

Linda Wright
### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 1:40:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kevin Kelly	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Chairs Gabbard and Inouye, Vice Chairs Richards and Elefante, Members of the Committee,

I support the prohibition of the harvesting of aquatic life for commercial aquarium purposes, regardless of the method of collection. These fishery stocks are already depleted and the impact of commercial aquarium collecting on the nearshore ecosystem is not well understood. Please consider passing this bill.

Mahalo for the opportunity to testify.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 2:34:28 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Angel Seery	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha kākou,

I am submitting testimony in support of SB505. The tropical fish aquarium trade of Hawaiian fish that are traumatically taken from their native habitat is inhumane for the individual fish and degrades the cultural significance of the area. Hawai'i has strong connections to the ocean and the organisms that reside there. These fish should not be stolen and sold for profit miles away from their home. I could continue on about the horrorific statistics of how brutal the aquarium trade is and how significant these species are to place but, I will keep it short and just say these fish deserve to stay in their native waters and many in the community would agree with that statement.

Mahalo for supporting SB505.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 2:39:23 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Shayla Middleton	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am in full support of this bill. As an avid water woman, I have seen how impactful the ban on aquatic collection has benefited our reefs here on Maui the last few years. I would like this ban to be statewide and permanent to protect the lives of our Beloved fish. Aquarium fish collection has become like the cut flower industry. Wild fish collected for Aquariums die very quickly in captivity and more and more need to be collected to meet demand. This is unacceptable and we need to take a stand and do what is right thank you.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 2:52:56 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Vivian S. Toellner	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

A fish is too valuable a resource to be caught only once.

Hawaii's nearshore reefs annually generate about \$800 million in gross revenues -- nearly 10% of the total revenues contributed by tourism to the state's economy.

- Fish Replenishment Areas (FRAs) along the Kona coast have decreased conflicts between aquarium collectors and other reef users, and results show an increase in aquarium fishes in both the FRAs and unprotected areas, benefiting both the aquarium and snorkeling and diving industries.
- To keep Hawaii's economy viable and to maintain our quality of life in Hawaii, adequate funding must continue to be provided for the management and education of Hawaii's reefs.
- Take only what you need today. Leave tomorrow's catch in the water. Limit your take; don't take the limit. A fish is too valuable a resource to be caught only once. Fish for the fun of it, and release fish whenever possible.
- http://www.hawaii.edu/ssri/cron/reef\_facts/economics.shtml
- •

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 3:01:34 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tom Carey	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB 505. The time to stop AQ fishing has long passed, protect our resorces !!

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 3:06:20 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Frank Myers	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am a local recident in Kailua-Kona and strongely support this measure. Having a strong fish population is important for a healthy ocean and to the enjoyment by thousands of us that use the ocean for recreation and health. thank you

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 3:27:30 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
sherri woodford	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please protect our reef and the beautiful fish who live there. Mahalo!

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 4:04:53 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Karen Goard	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Having been a Hawaii Resident for over 30 years, I have seen the decline of our

fish and eels due to so many being removed from the reef system. Please let's keep our

precious resource here in Hawaii. We need to stand up to the collectors. Stop the reef rape.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 4:53:24 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kim Snuggerud	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

In general, I support legislation that protects Hawaii's natural resources. In this particular case, it seems Hawaii has already lessened its dependence on AQ and the reefs have benefited. Collection for public and local use would still be allowed. Seems like a win and certainly forward movement.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 4:54:55 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Linda Norrington	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a resident on Maui I urge support of this measure to protect Hawaii's reef fish. I loved to snorkel as a child living on Oahu and later as a visitor to Hawaii for many years. Living here again as a senior I once more enjoy snorkeling to view the amazing reef fish...but I see fewer fish.

The collectors say their work provides jobs but businesses that help tourists and locals enjoy our aquatic life employ more workers. Hawaii benefits from having abundant and beautiful reef fish and those who love them want our grandchildren to also see this natural treasure. The fish face threats from coral bleaching and the silting of our reefs, they should not be further diminished by harvesting for fish tanks where few survive. My brother once caught reef fish for Oahu's public aquarium but that should be the limit set on procurement of our precious fish.

Thank you for standing up to protect Hawaii's special and often endemic varieties of reef fish! Keep them here for our residents and visitors to enjoy and our waters to flourish with life.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 4:56:56 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Liz Lees	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am a full time Hawaii resident and daily ocean swimmer/snorkeler.

I have see first hand the decimation of the inshore reef fish prior to the ban and the gradual and encouraging return of many of the targeted species since the ban has been in place. The ocean is a PUBLIC resource. Commercial AQ collecting benefits almost no one, but impacts everone else negatively.

I support the continued ban on any commercial collecting for the AQ trade.

Thank you for protecting our ocean resources and save the fishes!

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 5:06:51 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Donna Valentine	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please do not allow cultivation of fish in Hawai'i for commerce. Mahalo!

Donna

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 5:07:17 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sandy Shimmon	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am a Hawai'i resident living on Oahu. Please stop the aquarium trade for good. Fish are diminishing fast around our island. It's no good for the present or the future.

Sandy Shimmon

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 6:06:37 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Allan Owen	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I have lived in Hawaii since December, 2014. Prior to that, I owned condominium(s) here since the mid 90's. One of the reasons I loveliving here is the tropical fish I can see on the reefs both from the shore and while snorlkling. thise fish were - and again will be - endangered by collectors gagther ing them for aquariums. Please vote yes on this bill and let's let everyone enjoy our beautiful fish, not just aquatrium owners. The VERY few jobs tha would exist by allowing collection is far outweighed by the importance of protecting our fish, the snorkiling industry and our beatiful reefs which are co-dependent with these fish

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 7:12:01 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Elisa Plauche	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I'm deeply saddened that mainland companies want to profit of our local fish for their aquarium trade and hugely disappointed that the DLNR supports this. Our coral reefs and the marine life it supports already struggle with the impact of injection wells. If people want to see our beautiful coral reef fish they should come here and snorkel and dive here in Hawaii, not kill a high percentage of them to see them in a tank! How awful!

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 8:21:03 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Thomas Milcarek	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

Thank you for creating this protection for our sealife and coral reefs. I have a deep concern about what is contributing to the death of our coral reefs. Toxic pesticides. I went to a meeting on Januarey 19th at Whitmore Village. It discussed the Very Toxic Pesticides being used in many North SHore areas. Pesticides that are Banned in 8 other countries. Pesticide that when used oin combinations as they are at times, have no science telling us what thexe toxic combinations will do to harm us or other life like Coral. They pesticide drift, are blown by the wind, come down in streams to the ocean and leech into groundwater which ends up in the ocean or in us as drinking water to give us Cancer and other health problems. They disrupt our endocrine function, therby disrrupting our immune system. Why are we allowing this when there ARE nontoxic ways to farm. These pesticide also kill the living Bacteria in the soil which allows the nutrients to be absorbed by the plants. They therefore give us substandard food as regards nutrition also. Pesticides are a LOSE LOSE Proposition. This is also very related to SB660 Again, there are alrternatives that work. I am available for questions and consultation on this. Mahalo There are people we could bring to the state who have worked on non toxic non chemical fertilizer agriculture, who have worked on this for 40 years, with success. Let's bring them to the state and teach our farmers, and help save the coral in the process, not to mention our health.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:06:25 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Henri Etta Schmitz	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am strongly in favor of this bill! There is no longer any need to decimate our supply of much needed fish to satisfy the aquarium trade. Please support SB505....you'll be doing our reefs and community a service and harming no one. Mahalo, Henri Etta Schmitz, Paauilo, Big Island

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/4/2023 10:43:03 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Natalie Brown	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

Please don't let the DLNR start up aquarium collecting permits again. Our reefs and fish are already disappearing at a rapid rate. We all know the beauty of Hawaii's reefs is NOT what it used to be.

All the gains made on the reefs these past 5 years could be lost because DLNRs decades-long support for the aquarium trade. Their support for this is at the expense of the health of the reefs. At any moment, DLNR could start down the path of issuing collection permits again.

Don't let them! Protect our oceans and reefs!

Mahalo from Pukalani, Maui.

Natalie Norberg

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 4:35:25 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Cathryn Sendak	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I do not support SB 505.

- Cathryn Sendak (Wahiawa, HI)

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 5:34:37 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Anne Borman	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

My family and I are long-time residents of Puako (Kamuela, Hawaii 96743). We are avid ocean swimmers, snorkelers and scuba divers.

We marveled at the plethora of reef fishes that drew us to Puako and Kohala decades ago and have witnessed first hand the decline of the fish population and degradation of our reef. The "Gold Coast" no longer exists! It is outrageous that the "mainland" Aquarium fishing industry has been allowed to deplete our natural resources. Shame on any politician who rationalizes their support of this irresponsible behavior and allows this to continue.

The stressors on our Hawaiian reefs are destroying a habitat that has sustained life in these islands for centuries. Some of them are too big to reverse i.e. over development, run off, acidification, warming sea temperatures, etc. Fish collecting, another stressor, is one we can easily control and by not doing so it basically says we don't care about the eco system that protects our Hawaiian coastline from erosion and sustains our tourism and economy. If commercial aquarium fishing is allowed to continue we can add our reefs and it's inhabitants to the long list of destruction this kind of unconscionable self destructive behavior causes.

As a high paying taxpayer and resident I am passionately in support of Bill SB505 to end the commercial harvesting of marine life once and for all. I urge all the lawmakers to support this ban SB505.

Thank you for your time and consideration. Anne Borman 69-1660 Puako Beach drive Kamuela, Hawaii 96743

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 5:34:59 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kally Goschke	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please support **SB505** to halt or slow the degradation I have seen of the reefs. We should be protecting reefs not extracting what is left - no matter what. There is much less reef fish than before.

-resident 2009-2016 Kolo

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 6:26:35 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Steven Ramos	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

### Comments:

I am writing to urge the BLNR and the state of Hawaii to adopt legislation and rules that allow for the harvesting of aquarium fish when done in a permitted, humane, sustainable, and accountable manner. I oppose SB 505.

My family and I have deep roots in Hawaii and the ocean that surrounds our island home. My father was born and raised in Honoka'a and went on to serve as an officer in the US Navy (serving as security chief at Pearl Harbor) and as a manager in the Hawai'i Health Department after his retirement. My six siblings were all raised and schooled in our hometown of Wahiawa. While some of us have since moved away, we will always call Hawai'i home.

I now live less than a mile from the Pacific Ocean in Fort Bragg, California, but I grew up on O'ahu and graduated from Leilehua High School and the University of Hawai'i at Manoa. While completing my degree in Speech Pathology and Audiology at UH in 1977, I became acquainted with the late Dr. John Craven in the oceanography department and was inspired by his pioneering research and conservation efforts. Recently, I was lucky enough to travel to the Mediterranean in the company of Jean Michel Cousteau. We spent hours talking story about the future of our oceans and the life they support. He convinced me to get my PADI diver certification in Hawai'i a few years later so I could experience our amazing underwater environment firsthand.

One of my first diving experiences in Hawai'i was watching local divers catch aquarium fish individually using humane methods that preserve the coral and ocean floor habitat. It's old-school for sure, and not without inherent risks to the divers. It is not for the faint of heart, the careless or the lazy. Fishing in this manner, with reasonable regulatory oversight, is what keeps the practice sustainable.

Over here, the Mendocino coast and Fort Bragg have relied on the bounty of the ocean for generations - from the native Pomo (and other) tribes to the small-vessel fishing operations that are run out of Noyo Harbor. We know that we can fish sustainably by applying sensible rules regarding the size of catch, the methods of fishing, locations for harvest and so forth. It is anything but a free-for-all. We can do this in Hawai'i as well, through research-based regulations that protect the environment while maintaining the ability of a managed number of fishermen/women to make their living fishing this way. We do not need a total ban to do the right thing, and to do things right

Mahalo for taking the time to listen to my story and thank you for your measured efforts to protect and preserve our environment while protecting the livelihoods of our local fishermen/women.

Steven Ramos

Fort Bragg, CA 945327

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 6:45:07 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jay lovell	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am strongly opposed to SB505

The fishery has complied with the requirements of HEPA. It's now time to let the permitting process go forward and reopen the fishery. please vote NO on SB 505

Sincerly Jay lovell

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 7:53:22 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Elisa Plauche	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am against the collection of fish for the aquarium pet trade. I believe I mistakenly submitted testimony against the bill via an account under my elisa8094@aol.com account . Elisa Plauche

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 8:14:23 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Christine Nylin	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Save the fish and our reefs ! Please

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 8:30:14 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Toni White	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please do not allow capture of our gorgeous Hawaii fish to be sold to aquariums. There have been no new jobs secured over this practice. So many of these gorgeous fish die either in tgeir way to aquariums or shortly thereafter. The stress these fish under-go and the specialized care they need in an attended aquarium is extensive. Most people do not know , or perhaps do not take the time to tend properly. Our oceans are being vastly scavangered and our supply of fish are dwindling. (Snorkeling used to be an incredible, abundant experience. Now it's rare to find significant numbers of fish.

Any excuse to allow this practice to continue in our already climate changing world is nothing less than insane. Do not be culpable in destroying our beautiful under-water world.

Thank you.

## 5 February 2023

I am a kama'aina science veteran of Hawai'i, with more than 800 scientific publications and a CV indicating decades of focused research on Hawai'i's land and ocean resources and its people. I work closely with County, State, and federal agencies, the University of Hawai'i and several other universities, as well as numerous non-profit (including native Hawaiian) organizations across the State. I submit this testimony as a private citizen, but also as someone well-known for our detailed, long-term monitoring and research across the eight main Hawaiian islands. I submit this testimony in support of SB505. Specifically, I support a permanent ban on commercial collection for aquarium use for the following reasons:

- 1. Fish populations in areas formerly open to collection, in general, remain less abundant than in areas that have been protected from the aquarium trade. So we can say that the recovery of a reef, even after nearly six years of the current moratorium (since 2017), is slow.
- 2. Commercial aquarium activity reduces the number of herbivorous fish in areas that are targeted for collection. Herbivores are critically important to resisting coral-to-algal regime shifts, and scientific data shows that appropriate herbivore management helps to retain reef resiliency during coral bleaching events, which have become much more common in our changed climate.
- 3. Removal of reef herbivore fish in the quantities proposed by the continuing aquarium collection industry threatens to harm the ability of Hawaii's reefs to withstand increases in algal cover, which in turn, diminishes reef biodiversity and reduces the food source that subsistence fisherman rely upon.
- 4. I have personally conducted thousands of dives monitoring coral reefs and reef fish in Hawai'i. At certain sites, I have observed what are known as aquarium collection "corrals," which are formed when collectors crush coral to create flat areas which make it easier for collectors to set their nets to extract greater quantities of fish. Creation of aquarium collection "corrals" has caused significant damage to coral reefs that remains visible for many years.

Very Respectfully,

Greg Asner PhD

Hilo HI 96720

## Opposed to SB 505 & HB 910

DATE: Friday, February 10, 2023 TIME: 2:00 PM PLACE: Conference Room 224 & Videoconference State Capitol 415 South Beretania Street TIMESLOT: AEN

## Dear Legislators,

Thank you for the opportunity to express my OPPOSITION to SB 505 and HB 910. As a retired teacher with the State of Hawaii D.O.E., who among other things taught Gifted students in a Sustainability-themed program, I find the supposition that the aquarium fishery is somehow damaging the environment and therefore needs elimination unfounded, and unconstitutional. Below are several reasons why lawyers agree this bill should not be passed. Sincerely, Mary Tubbs Retired Teacher/Diagnostician

Nationally Certified School Psychologist

State of Hawaii, Dept. of Education

# **Constitutional Problems with SB 505 and HB 910**

These bills would eliminate Hawai'i's near-shore aquarium fishery. The bill is a significant overreach, has several constitutional deficiencies, and should be returned to the Legislature. <u>Fundamentally, the closure is a hasty response to intense lobbying by outside tourist groups. It is not grounded in scientific consensus</u>, Hawaii Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) previously objected to similar bills based on the lack of any scientific basis, and the bill was introduced again in this form after pervious Legislative and Governor rejection. As a result, it is not well thought out and would create many constitutional headaches for the State, and potential litigation risk, as explained below.

## **States Role in Public Trust Fishery Management**

The State of Hawaii public officers' oath is to uphold the state's constitution. If decisions are made that are biased and not based in legal constitutional means, it violates that oath. It is unconstitutional (State, Federal and International Laws, UN resolution 2749) to shut out any ocean user group. Fishery management for sustainability, not closure is the government's role in fisheries. No one group can lay claim to any part of the ocean, it is a public trust. The court's decision for the aquarium fishery to do an environmental review was not based at all in science

but on legal interpretation. Now that <u>the fishery has completed its</u> <u>environmental review with approval makes it even more legally protected under</u> <u>the law, shut down Bills like SB 505 and HB 910 will more than likely be appealed</u> <u>on these grounds.</u>

# **Protections for Native Hawaiians**

The bill makes no carve-outs or provisions to protect native Hawaiians. The Hawai'l Constitution guarantees that the State will "protect all rights, customarily and traditionally exercised for subsistence, cultural and religious purposes and possessed by ahupua'a tenants who are descendants of native Hawaiians who inhabited the Hawaiian Islands prior to 1778...." Hawai'i Const. Art. XII, § 7. Hawaiians have relied on the islands' near-shore fisheries for centuries, and this bill does not take into account the impacts that a moratorium may have on native Hawaiian livelihood, culture, and way of life.

# **Public Access to Fisheries**

The bill also impermissibly restricts public fishing access. Under the Hawai'l Constitution, "[a]II fisheries in the sea waters of the State . . . shall be free to the public, subject to . . . the right of the State to regulate the same . . . ." Hawai'i Const. Art. XI, § 6. The Bills would eliminate an entire fishery, completely denying public access. This goes far beyond mere "regulation" of fisheries and would therefore violate the Constitution.1

# **Equal Protection and Due Process**

The bill also raises significant concerns under the equal protection and due process clauses of the United States Constitution, which are designed to protect against exactly this kind of arbitrary, unsupported government action. Even assuming the bill would be subject to only rational basis review (and setting aside for now the possibility that it would disproportionately impact native Hawaiians), there appears to be no rational basis for the proposed law. In fact, DLNR filed comments objecting to the bill because there is no scientific basis for it at all. The supposed benefits have not been studied, and there is no evidence that the moratorium will do anything to advance the State's purported interests. *See, e.g., Nehring v. Ariyoshi,* 443 F. Supp. 228, 239 (D. Haw. 1977) (concluding that there would be an equal protection violation under rational basis review where the State had not studied alleged environmental benefits and could produce no evidence to support their existence).

# **Dormant Commerce Clause**

SB 505, HB 910 also raises concerns under the Dormant Commerce Clause, which prohibits laws that unduly burden interstate commerce. The moratorium would severely disrupt the interstate aquarium trade supply chain. If the bill halted Hawaiian aquarium fish supply, industry would go to other countries for supply, some of which may tolerate environmentally destructive fishing practices like cyanide fishing. As such, the bill may violate the dormant commerce clause because it would burden interstate commerce in a manner that is clearly excessive in light of the purported (and highly dubious) environmental benefits. *See Hughes v. Oklahoma*, 441 U.S. 322, 337 (1979) (A state cannot "force those outside the State to bear the full costs of 'conserving' the wild animals within its borders . . . ").

# **Public Trust Doctrine and Takings**

The bill could also create legal complications related to the public trust doctrine (under which the State holds water bodies in trust for the people) and the takings clause (under which the State may not take property without just compensation). At this stage, it is not clear that the moratorium is consistent with Hawai'i's public trust obligations. Likewise, it is not clear to what extent compensation would be required for the "taking" of the right to transfer permits. Both of these issues could eventually cause significant hassles.

# Conclusion

I think this bill has enough constitutional deficiencies that it should be returned to the Legislature. It is in everyone's interest to pass a law that is based on sound science—not guesswork or lobbying pressure—and that is not vulnerable to constitutional attack. Indeed, if the State could simply prohibit public access to an entire fishery with no scientific basis (as it is doing here), the constitutional right to access public fisheries would have no meaning at all.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 11:43:06 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Miho Aoki	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, and thank you for this opportunity, The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships.** 

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations. Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Aloha

Miho Aoki

96725

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 12:16:02 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mary Spears	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a coastal swimmer who has been long-distance ocean swimming along the West Hawaii coast since 1989, I can attest to the dramatic changes in our reef and the ocean life that live there. The increase in water temperature and warming events have decimated the reef. And with it, the fish who used to live there. I object to collecting reef fish along our coast. They are already stressed and greatly reduced in numbers. Soon, we won't have to worry much about collecting of any kind because there won't be anything to collect other than algae. Thank you.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 12:27:24 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jacqueline Wikum	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

End the Aquarium Trade and keep Hawaii's reef fishes on our reefs where they belong.

I've been a paddler for 40 years. I've seen how the aquarium fishermen devastate a reef and vacuum up all fish. I've seen the dead fish they discard off the side of the road. There is NO valid reason for restarting the trade.

Thank you Jacqueline Wikum

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 12:29:01 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Janet Goodmanson	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am in total support of SB505. The constant collection of fish for the aquarium industry should cease immediately. The reefs cannot continue to flourish without the fish we have in our oceans around Hawaii.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 12:41:18 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Keith Neal	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## **Re: STRONG SUPPORT SB505: Relating to Environmental Protection**

Native Hawaiian, environmental, marine and animal protection organizations and businesses are in strong support of SB505, to prohibit the commercial capture of Hawai'ian marine life for aquarium pet trade purposes. Important exemptions should be included for public aquariums, research, education and aquaculture.

### This measure is urgently needed now because:

- Herbivores are critical to the survival of Hawai'i's coral reefs in the face of climate change, which, beginning in 2014, destroyed parts of our important reef ecosystems through a series of unprecedented ocean heat waves, and which is forecast to drive annual ocean heat waves as soon as 2030
- Polling has shown 83 percent of residents support a complete ban of the aquarium pet trade.
- The aquarium pet trade has taken millions of culturally significant and ecologically critical reef animals, primarily herbivores, from our reefs for sale to mainland pet stores and for home aquariums outside Hawai'i. This "pet trade" in our reef wildlife yields astronomical mortality rates that would never be tolerated for any other animals sold as pets
- Scientists agree that 70% of Hawai'i's coral reefs could be lost by mid-century from these increasing ocean temperature. Reef herbivores are key to keeping algae over growth under control on our coral reefs
- Hawai'i's food fishers are suffering impacts of the aquarium trade due to poor regulation See: DLNR 2020 report to the legislature and DLNR grant report to NOAA.
- The most heavily targeted species (mostly reef herbivores) on O'ahu reefs have been depleted by the aquarium pet trade by 90%, See; Grabowsky and Thornhill 2020

### **DLNR data show:**

• Herbivore abundance significantly increases once aquarium collecting stops. Aquarium collecting has been prohibited under court order in West Hawai'i since 2018, and statewide since January 12, 2021, given the decades long illegal issuance of permits and licenses for aquarium collecting without first requiring environmental review under Hawai'i's Environmental Policy Act (HEPA)
- The 2018 West Hawai'i aquarium collecting ban resulted in the largest increase in yellow tang herbivore abundance ever documented on those reefs (DAR data)
- Without aquarium collection, O'ahu's reefs stand to benefit with a gain at least 81,000 herbivorous and other fishes each year (based on historical catch reports)

## **Additional Benefits of SB505**

• SB505 Saves the public money:

- DLNR estimates it costs taxpayers upwards of \$500,000 annually to administer and manage the aquarium trade, not including enforcement costs, yet it only receives a mere \$23,480 in permit fees and taxes. Ending the trade would save taxpayers hundreds of thousands of dollars annually
- Independent peer-reviewed cost-benefit analysis shows ending the trade would yield both direct and indirect market value in reef tourism in the amount \$440,000,000 annually.

If the reef dies, the waves take the land!

I respectfully urge the passage of SB505.

Sincerely,

Keith Neal

Waimea, HI

<u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 1:42:00 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Will Caron	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505.

<u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 5:07:06 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Doere Ann Flanigan- Garcia	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I do not support SB 505.

Doere Ann Flanigan-Garcia

Waianae, Hawaii 96792

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 5:29:43 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Teri Leicher	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha and thank you for taking the time to listen to our testimony.

My Name is Teri Leicher,

I am a mother, and now Grandmother. I am an avid waterwoman and have been here in Hawaii since the 1960's. I am an owner and managing partner of Jack's Diving Locker for over 40 years now.

I am writing today in support of Senate Bill 505 relating to environmental Protection.

Decades ago My Father George A Wilkins, a retired Navy Scientist, Oceanographer and Advisor to Governors Burns and Ariyoshi ... advised that mining our ocean floor would have devistaing effects on our environment in Hawaii and potencially world wide. The disrutooin of the substratta and resulting siltation were not worth the risk. They listened to him.

There have been many studies through the UH Manoa. Even though they were done in the 1960's thru 1990's, they are still perteant.

Hawaii has some of the clearest waters in the Northern Hemispere. I ask that we keep it that way

Regarding Aquarium Fishing from our Reefs ... the reefs are stressed enough. We need the fish, the grazers to help keep the algae down so Coral can regrow. We need to not stress our ecosystem more than it has been. We lost soooo much coral during the bleaching events. They are barely starting to come back. We lost so many fish during that time as they lost much of their food source. They need to continue to recover.

Our Oceans are vital to the survial of our planet. With all the stresses we currently have with climate change, Acidification and polluntants from land and natural distasters...we need to do everything we can to protect our reefs, fisheries and the water itself.

Mining of minerals and fish is not in our planets best interest. We have found that we can reverse some of the destruction that humans have caused world wide over the last couple hundres years ... we can't stop now.

I do support Aqua culture and Captive Bred aquarium trades.

Mahalo,

Teri Leicher

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 6:09:33 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
janice palma-glennie	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

it's clear that the majoirty of peoplel who live in or visit hawaii do not want, nor do they benefit from, the ability of a handfull of aquarium fish traders to be able to continue plundering our reefs.

how many decades do We the People have to tell our elected officials that this industry isn't pono. it's not providing food nor is it a big employer (not that that would matter at this point). When i first moved to Kona in the '70s, the gold tangs were the reason this was called the Gold Coast. there were waves of these lovely creatures visible from under sea, boat and air. Now...very different.

there are so many reasons why this business should remain off the table including that some of the people in the industry rape and pillage the resource including poisoning the reef to extract what they see as "product."

enough already. please do your job by supporting this bill and even stronger legislation and enforcement to insure our reefs remain the necessary, sustenance-providing infrastructure they are to all of us.

Mahalo and sincerely,

janice palma-glennie

kailua-kona

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 6:18:55 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Abigail Rose	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

This is another idiculous attempt by hotel owners to squash sustainable local fishermen. The environmental impact studies have been done and there is zero evidence that this harms the fish population. This bill is a reerote of an earlier bill that was defeated. Let's not waste the representatives time.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 6:25:27 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
scott folsom	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a formal marine biologist with the University of Hawaii at Manoa, Hawaii Institute of Marine Biology (HIMB), I am strongly opposed to SB505.

Marine fish are the <u>most reproductive vertebrates</u> on the planet. Making fish the most renewable resource there is. The state has greatly ignored the potential the 100-billion-dollar a year pet industry could offer. The state allowed Tourists to shut down the fishery with lawsuits.

The State of Hawaii public officers' oath is to uphold the states constitution. If decisions are made that are biased and not based in facts it violates that oath. It is unconstitutional (State, Federal and International Laws, <u>UN resolution</u> 2749) to shut out any ocean user group. Fishery management, not closure is the government's role in fisheries. No one group can lay claim to any part of the ocean, it is a public trust. The court's decision for the aquarium fishery to do an environmental review was not based at all in science but on legal interpretation.

Leading scientist spoke out in objection to these decisions. To favor the huge ecology impacts of tourism over a proven sustainable aquarium fishery is unconstitutional, a miscarriage of justice and poor decision making. The lies perpetuated by anti-aquarium fishery groups were used in lawsuits and even earth justice lawyers spouts this misinformation, to knowingly lie under oath in court or legislative testimony is perjury. Yet even the new bills this year continue the lies. Science if read will give the truth but few bother to read the lengthy data, believing instead in biased for profit propaganda from who-tourist groups not scientists.

Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery has been studied more than any other fishery in the world. Both the 2,400 page Environmental Review of the West Hawaii fishery, and the Oahu Environmental Review, (links removed by state why? But available upon request) based in <u>State fish counts and reports covering nearly 20 years of data</u>, scientifically prove Hawaii's aquarium fishery is eco-friendly, having low environmental impact. The head of Hawaii Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) – Suzanne Case, stated Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery is a "Model Fishery". She later recanted this statement in favor of tourism. With many reef fish populations on the rise overall, Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery is the true definition of "Sustainability." Abundant small fish are taken leaving breeders to repopulate making the aquarium fishery a "Model Fishery".

Hawaii's <u>leading scientist speak</u> out in opposition to DLNR Land Boards decision not to approve the environmental review of the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery. This review was based on many of these scientist research and then they were not even questioned or consulted about the board decision. It was like the science did not matter.

Hawaii's top marine biologists William Walsh Ph.D., Ivor Williams Ph.D., Brian Tissot Ph.D.; Leon Hallacher Ph.D.; Bruce Carlson Ph.D.; Charles Birkeland Ph.D.; Jeremy Claisse Ph.D.; Mark Christie Ph.D.; Richard Pyle Ph.D.; Leighton Taylor Ph.D.; Randy Kosaki Ph.D.; Cynthia Hunter Ph.D.; Brian Bowen Ph.D.; Brian Zgliczynski Ph.D.; Jeff Ebel Ph.D.; Alan Friedlander Ph.D.; Kosta Stamoulis Ph.D.; Delisse Ortiz Ph.D.; Jan Dierking Ph.D.; Rob Toonen Ph.D.; and Jim Beets Ph.D. Thursday, June 25, 2020, all signed the letter condemning the BLNR land board decision not to approve fisheries environmental review. Why? Because the fishery is sustainable.

<u>Hawaii's aquarium fishery</u> is an important part of a <u>\$100-billion a year pet industry</u>. This fishery has the potential to sustainably provide millions of much needed revenue to the State of Hawaii. This is what the <u>State of Hawaii needs</u>, a <u>stable valuable industry</u>. For too long Hawaii has allowed other businesses to take a back seat to a vulnerable tourist industry which has a high carbon footprint.

The legislature should listen to scientific information when weighing in on fisheries. You have an agency tasked with providing this information and the information is clear. It is sustainable. Do not ban the aquarium fishery.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 7:28:31 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier</b> Position	Testify
Leonard Ong	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning fisheries

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 7:59:05 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Lisa Bunge	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

We need all of our reef fish more than ever to preserve the health of our precious resource - the coral reefs. We cannot survive without our reefs. Thank you for allowing us to opportunity to show support for this very important bill.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 8:15:14 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Pamela Dawn Sagar	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I've witnessed a local coral reef begin to thrive again in the bit since the aquarium traders were banned. This industry largely does not pay our local residents much for the initial nabbing of the animals, but instead makes a lot of money elsewhere by preying on our local wildlife and communities. I implore you to support SB505 to protect our reefs and our residents from these predatory actions. Let us please please practice Kuleana in the face of climate change and give these animals and the ocean every chance it has to be healthy.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 8:35:10 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
James Bouknight	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a Hawaii resident, I regularly enjoy snorkling and diving on our reefs. Even casual observation indicates that the reefs are stressed by bleaching and algea growth. Removal of reef fish by for profit aquaium specimen companies only adds more stress to the ecosystem, and it is completely inappropriate. Furthermore, I do not believe the DLRN has the resources to monitor export of collected specimens to ensure take limits would be observed. I fully support a law prohibiting collection of reef fish within the state of Hawaii.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 9:00:36 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Elizabeth Hansen	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, please support this bill.

The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships**.

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations.

Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo, Elizabeth Hansen, Hakalau HI 96710

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 9:04:10 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brian Schaff	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban on marine aquarium ornamental fishery in West Hawaii.

Scientifically it has been proved through the last EIS that the fishery is sustainable. It is quite evident that a well managed and restricted fishery will benefit the local community with a low volume, low impact and high value fishery unlike what we currently see since the ban.

Science cannot be disregarded in detriment to emotion when it can actually benefit local communities and people directly dependent on the fishery.

The argument that aquaculture are available is false. Very low numbers of fish are being tank bred and benefiting those companies in various countries around the world (Japan, Holland, Indonesia) and although there is one hatchery operating in Hawaii they have not managed to produce any relevant quantities. The operation also does not directly benefit the local communities and local fishermen who now turn to less sustainable practices in food fisheries on the same species or other activities in the island. Food fisheries often target the same species such as Achiles tang but in far greater numbers and lower income that aquarium fish fisheries.

The aquarium fishery in West Hawaii has always been one of the best managed and regulated in the world. It is by far a successful story of very low volume and high value fishery that directly benefits the people of Hawaii and ensures the value from its natural resources are maximized and distributed amongst the local community. Supporting the fishery will allow for the implementation of a well managed very small scale fishery that will be highly regulated and avoid focus of trade away to other countries of species that are part of Hawaii genetic heritage. This decision should be left to the DLNR who can closely manage the fishery.

Do not ban the Hawaii fishery on ornamental marine aquarium fish.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 9:51:12 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Rodger Hansen	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, Please support this bill.

The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships**.

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations.Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo, Rodger Hansen, Hakalau HI 96710

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/5/2023 11:42:40 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Lee Miller	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I wholeheartedly support SB505. As a Hawaiian resident who snorkels frequently in the reef, I've seen a return of many reef fish since SB505 was first enacted. Revoking that bill or amending it will result in the cruel practice of taking fish out of their natural habitat, and then shipping them for profit to some other place. More than 50% of the fish die in transit. I think it's a terrible idea to change or revoke SB505. Leave it in place so the reefs will continue to thrive.

Thank you for your consideration,

Lee Miller

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:46:24 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sebastian Alexander	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:43:31 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Robin Miyajima	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The commercial aquarium trade has led to extinction or endangerment of many species. This is why I'd like it to be banned in Hawaii, and why I support this bill. Hawaii has enough endangered native wildlife as it is. It doesn't need them to be stolen and sold.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:24:14 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier</b> Position	Testify
CHARLES W WALL	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Instead of penalizing highly sustainable fisheries and depending on highly destructive tourism; Hawaii needs to support and develop renewable resources. Fishery laws are being made with out proper studies and fish counts. Over regulation of renewable resource use is being done every year! Do fish counts on every Island. Manage stocks with science.

Fisheries are the solution not the problem!

Step back, review and promote sustainable agriculture, aquaculture, fisheries and look at Hawaii's renewable resources with a new perspective. The fate of the planet lies in the use of renewable resources and their sustainable use! More legislation against highly renewable resources is the worst thing Hawaii can do.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:51:03 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Arrick Lampkin	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:53:30 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Vincent Eeles	Individual	Comments	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:00:09 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Luke Ponio	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:21:43 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sara Maxwell	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Wild fish belong in the wild. As an aquarium hobbyist I only ever purchase captive-bred fish. Wild fish don't do well in captivity, I've seen it time & time again.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:37:29 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Anthony Mutti	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:46:39 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Bette Belanger	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support this measure to ban the collection of reef fish for aquarium use. Reef fish numbers are declining as a result of this practice. Fish belong in the ocean not tanks. Please do the right thing.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:58:49 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jean Jewell	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships.** 

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations. Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems. Mahalo Jean Jewell

96725

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:09:23 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Luke Bradshaw	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:23:35 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jaime Adams	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning ornamental aquarium fisheries in Western Hawaii.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:30:01 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tony Slotboom	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:07:49 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ashley Taliana	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hawaii's unique and gorgeous fish should be shared world wide. The bill should be opposed and would like Hawaiian fisheries reopened sustainably.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:18:45 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Elizabeth Roney deYoung	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Support bill SB505 this year immediately to save our reef ecosystems! Harvesting of reef fish for sale for pets or doctors offices on the mainland must stop now! It's absolutely incredible that this vanity industry is allowed to decimate our fish population.

Invasive fish such as Peacock Grouper also attack the reefs and ecosystems and other threats we spend millions to recover and regrow our reefs, while we allow the deliberate and non-essential harvesting of fish from the fragile ecosystem.

A 61 year old lifelong Hawaii Island resident, I have witnessed the change in our waters. I have snorkeled and dove extensively on Hawaii Island. Each of the venues features a different mix of fish. Yellow Tang at Puu O Honaunau beloved, while Richardson/Waiuli in Hilo have many Humuhumunukunukuapuaa. Puako features the black and yellow lauwiliwilinukuoioi. Waiopae and Kapoho fish nursuries are now gone. @Hookena I recall seeing my first crown of thorns seastar (starfish) that invasively eats and kills the reef when I was about 12. We spent millions to defend against this terrible threat. The area underwater looks nothing like it used to, with so many fish to see underwater.

Seeing vanity aquariums on the mainland in offices, homes and enterainment venues is sickening, when we see the wonder of our fish and the declining populations.

This law will not only protect our Fish - it will send a strong message to visitors that we are protecting our ecosystems and waters, and attract the pono visitors we want here.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:25:27 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Peter Gravis	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The ornamental collection has been shown to have minimal impact on the fishery and the ecosystems. Please listen to the scientists on this. I am fully committed to protecting our natural environment and understand the pressure that climate change is causing on our reef communities, however this is a separate issue that has shown to be negligible in its impact. Not everyone can visit the ocean and see these incredible fish, and without seeing and enjoying these fish, the next generation will be less likely to put the hard work in to save these ecosystems. thank you,

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:28:19 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jake Sandefur	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The Aquarium industry is credited with saving and perserving tons of fish and coral, both for fresh water and marine. To make the harvesting illegal in hawaii will do nothing but the following

-Eliminate a ton of jobs from Hawaii

-Endanger more fish and coral to illegal harvesting, which isn't regulated

Exporting fish and coral is a major industry for Hawaii, and it benefits everyone, including the fish and coral, to eliminate that will just cause more harm then good.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:30:56 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
David Lee	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I stongly oppose the SB 505 relating to stopping marine collection in HI waters. It is proven in the scientific studies that sustainible collection is possible and not detrimental, infact is beneficial to the local ecosystems. Not to mention it will eliminate livelihoods and jobs with HI.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:33:34 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ian Davis	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hawaiin state fisheries practice some of the world's most sustainable fish collection protocols. It is essential for the prosperity of these fish given how dramatic climate change has been over the last century, that we as tenders of the earth find a means to house and breed marine life in captivity. Completely removing marine fish collection will close the door to the potential for the further development of the husbandry of these animals that may not have a hospitable natural environment in the next century.
## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:41:54 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
noriko donna	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, and thank you for this opportunity, The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships.** 

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations. Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo

Noriko Donna

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:52:30 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Chih-Chun Chang	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:52:58 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Adrian Kwan	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am opposed to this bill being passed. The aqurium trade in hawaii is a huge business that supplies livestock to millions of people across the USA. This ban would destroy the business in hawaii that help to supply the rest of America.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:01:01 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Paul Hughes	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban on aquarium collection as the science proves this is sustainable industry and woke and emotion is getting the better if the situation. Research tells us that without aquarium collection we wouldn't know for example how to even breed these fish and recently captive coral spawning has taken place only because an aquarium industry exsists . Also from a financial perspective ,millions of dollars of tax and duty is being lost . With regard to the animals concerned , we wouldn't even be able to discuss these species without an undertaking of them . What's worse is the millions of tons of fish worldwide that are sold for a pittance into the food market , allowed to suffer and endure that process ( some of those species are traded in Hawaiian markets for a very low price ) vs the aquarium industry that actually values this commodity and pays hansomly for it enabling proper jobs and proper wages . Aquarium technology is leading the world in the understanding of this planets oceans . Hawaiis aquarium fishery is regarded as one of the best and sets an example to the rest of the world . mr Hughes

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:09:35 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Noah Winn	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban of a fishery without overwhelming evidence that it is not sustainable. All of the species involved are listed as Least Concern under IUCN guidelines.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:16:30 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dana Barnum	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hawaii reef fish need our protection through SB505. Our precious wildlife should not be exploited by the commercial aquarium suppliers. Our reef ecosystem is fragile and already in grave danger. Please support this important bill!

Dana Barnum

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:16:52 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Helen white	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Over the years snorkeling I have come across only a few flame angel fish. Unfortunately they have all disappeared. Now I never see them. I can only suspect they have been harvested and fear they have been fished to extinction in my regular snorkeling spots. People may think they are plentiful but they are not. " Oh I only take one or two and leave a few." They may say. Until the next guy comes and takes those remaining and then there are none. Leave our fish for us and our visitors to enjoy in their natural habitat.

police heavily those that harvest anyway as they are the unscrupulous.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:32:53 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Marshall Grams	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban of marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. As a marine aquarium enthusiast, and father of 3 young children in the upper midwestern united states. Educating my children through exposure to tropical fish and their habitat is something I can do to help bring big ocean impacts closer to home.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:34:57 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Thomas Reynolds	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

The Hawaiian fishery for ornamental fish is well regarded as one of the most well regulated and sustainable fisheries in the world. The animals being collected have a high degree of larval drift and produce large numbers of offspring frequently and MPAs are well enforced meaning any animals removed are rapidly replaced. Smaller animals are preferred for ease of shipping and removing a smaller animal from the environment has a much lower impact on the environment. Hawaiian fisherman in the ornamental fishery are well known for not using destructive fishing methods and people pay a premium for Hawaiian fish knowing that they were collected in an environmentally friendly manner. Removing the Hawaiian fish from the market forces people to buy their fish from countries with poor fishing practices and poor enforcement. The fish collected in Hawaii inspire preservation of the ocean and make people want to visit Hawaii to see them in their natural habitat. The ornamental fishery is a great economic opportunity for people living on an island with few other options. Displaced fishermen will be forced to turn to less sustainable options such as the all ready heavily pressured food fishery in order to support themselves. The fishery has few, if any downsides and is well supported. Opponents of the fishery base their dissent on feelings, not reality and are a vocal minority. The Hawaiian ornamental fishery is overwhelmingly good for Hawaii.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:51:28 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Harriet Burkholder	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I live in Honokaa and am a resident of Hawaii. I support SB505 especially since the aquarium trade can captive breed fish. At a time when the ocean is stressed, we need to protect it as much as possible. Thank you.

# OPPOSE SB505 and HB910

The assertions made in this bill are not backed by sound science. I strongly disagree that there is any need for a fishery ban. Numerous studies and numerous experts have demonstrated with clear scientific data that this IS a sustainable fishery.

Lee Ashford Captain Cook, Hawaii I oppose bills SB505 and HB910.

Sammy Byron Kona,Hawaii I oppose SB505 and HB910

O. Charles Byron Kona, HI

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:11:01 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Art Mori	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please, please, end the collection of Hawai'i fishes for the mainland aquarium trade once and for all. It is harmful to our reefs and the survival of these wonderful ocean creatures and serves no purpose other than to enrich a few thoughtless individuals.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:29:29 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Megan Rullier	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose banning fisheries. The aquarium trade and conservation efforts of marine species depends on fisheries.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:44:32 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Arthur John Tarsa. Jr.	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please pass SB505. WE need to protect our precious reef environment from depletion of species vis the aquarium trade

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:50:28 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Richard xie	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

#### SB 505 OPPOSED

Year after year some big brain environmentalists think they are going to save the world by banning aquarium fishing. In order to do that, they provided lots of non-scientific data and statements to prove their points. Guess what, it is banned right now and has been for the last few years. Nothing has changed so why do you want to ban it? The last several years, at least 50 local families had to apply unemployment benefit. It created more social issues and state tax pressure, and the ocean is the same.

Can the environmentalists ban all 50 states aquarium fish wholesale and retail business? At the Federal level, all transaction is legal. Even in the Hawaii state, importing other countries fish is totally legal. It is going to waste more taxpayers money in DNLR enforcement process. With bag limits and proper industry management, the industry-licensed dealers are the guards to assist DNLR to stop any illegal invaders .

You go to Honolulu and forget you are there to support people and make lives better. This isn't going to make anything better but hurt more families that are already struggling. Don't support this bill and focus on something that will do good like drugs in our schools and the homeless in our parks.

Thank you very much!

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:00:49 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier</b> Position	Testify
Greg Pope	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose banning fisheries. - Greg Pope

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:03:46 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Hiiaka Jardine	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

My name is Hi'iaka Jardine and I strongly support this bill that would protect our marine life. As a lifelong resident of Kahalu'u I have seen the changes in Kāne'ohe bay. I strongly believe that more protection is needed to allow the bay to recover from years of extractive practices. I strongly urge you to consider passing this bill for the protection of our natural resources and to strengthen our communities.

Mahalo,

Hi'iaka Jardine

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:18:09 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
haijiang peng	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

#### SB 505 OPPOSED

I oppose closing this fishery. There is no evidence of the claims in the bill. When you want to end an industry, you should at least have validated facts. Our state has more problems in drugs and homeless. Even in fishery, there is more issues in food fishing and recreation fishing. The aquarium fishery industry has been closed for a few years, lots of local divers families are surfer and need to apply unemployment. Are you pushing more people to be homeless?

Listen to the science on this becasue it is there. I urge you to oppose this bill and stand with science.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:29:47 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Michael Hennessy	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a life-long environmentalist, farmer, and aquatics enthusiast, I try to stay informed about significant legislative actions both on a State and National level. For some time I have followed the ongoing case of the regulation of the select Hawaii regional fisheries that have a significant history of sustainable, live capture (specimen) fishing in a well managed fishery resource, while at the same time experiencing constant political pressure adverse to this native industry regardless of the data and science. An unfortunate theme we seem to revisit too often in this day and age.

Hawaii is fortunate to have had the study into the native marine ecology over some time now. Consequently, it is one of the most intensively studied marine resources on the planet, monitoring regional populations over decades on select species of value to the ornamental fish trade. As such, it is also one of the most protected and managed resources as well. it would be unfortunate for this artisan industry, and the State of Hawaii to suffer closure of a native industry. It provides jobs for its people, and specimens in managed, sustainable quantities for the world to appreciate.

I oppose this bill

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:52:29 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
steven maletzky	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban on the ornamental fisheries

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:15:05 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Rebekah Kaufmann	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

My Name is Rebekah Kaufmann. I live and own a business in North Kohala, Hawaii.

I support SB505

Through my business Kohala Divers I employ 24 residents that rely on our ocean reefs being healthy and full of fish life to do our jobs as scuba instructors, divemasters and captains. We take great care to show the beauty of Hawaii to 1000's of visitors annually while educating them to make as little impact on the health of the reefs as possible. The scuba and snorkeling industry is a huge driver of positive healthy tourism and in the last few years is focusing heavily on sustaiablity and encouraging eco tourism where visitors interact with the ocean in a responsible way.

The industry of aquarium reff collection puts the dive and snorkel industry at risk as it quickly diminishes the diversity on the reef environment. Exportation of reef fish that primarily feed on agae (like the yellow tang) leads to unhealthy reef conditions and reduce the tourists wanting to choose Hawaii for their sustainable tourism choice.

We must protect of fragile ocean reefs and the posituve jobs that ocean tourism brings to Hawaii by continuing to not allow reef fish be caught and exported for the aquarium trade.

Thank you for your serious consideration on this matter.

Rebekah Kaufmann

Owner/ Operator Kohala Divers Kawaihae Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:45:06 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
marjorie erway	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha!

The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships**.

· There are no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i

• Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide

 $\cdot\,$  Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for future generations.

Please vote in support SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo for your consideration.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:51:54 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ethan foster	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban of fisheres in west Hawaii. The impact of the sm number of aquarium fish/corals taken from the vast ocean is extremely limited if any. There are many many concerns to the fish & corals of the ocean. The main one being that we are no longer able to preserve them, and actively try to breed new species in tanks. The fishing of ornamental fish from west Hawaii makes a lot of people care about the ocean & want to preserve it. Not the other way around.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:54:46 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jennifer Wood	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hawaii is one of the few places in America where tropical fish thrive. We need to protect our reef and its fish so that they can survive for future generations to enjoy in their true environment, and in nature. The practice of stealing Hawaii's fish for aquariums on the mainland must be stopped. So many fish die in the process, and live unhealthy lives in aquariums. Please save our reefs, and save our fish. Keep Hawaii special!

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:55:17 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Stephanie McLaughlin	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please support this important bill that can help and protect wild animals in Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 12:56:26 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Alex	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

I'm writing to show my opposition to the proposed prohibition of marine harvesting in the state of Hawaii. While I greatly appreciate the intent of the action and the protection of our beloved marine ecosystems, I believe this bill will do more harm than good. The revenue from the commercial aquarium trade supports the protection efforts of these ecosystems financially. It will increase pressure for poachers who will not be using sustainable methods of harvesting. The commercial industry props up the scientific research both directly and indirectly and this action will hurt this interaction and prevent further scientific progress. Finally I don't believe there is causative data support that marine harvesting has caused the decline of our marine ecosystems. I believe environmental and other man made impacts are a greater threat to these ecosystems. The revenue from the commercial trade can help protect these environments from these greater threats.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:04:33 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Peter Pedersen	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. 30 years of scientific data has proved unequivocally that there is no environmental impact. None of the collected fish are on any threatened or endangered lists, they are still there after 30 years of sustainable collection, and experts have told the State of Hawaii on the record that there are more fish after 30 years of collection than there were before.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:05:21 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
William siu	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

It's a healthy and beautiful hobby and industry. Please spend more efforts to drug and homeless problems.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:16:53 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Taurie Kinoshita	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

To the Committee,

I am writing in strong support of SB505. Upwards of 40 percent of wild-caught fish bound for pet stores perish before they arrive on the sales floor. Collection methods include cruel practices such as puncturing swim bladders to bring fish to the surface more quickly. Fins and spines are cut before transport to enable the use of cheaper, thinner bags. Fish are starved before shipment so they don't foul the water in the bags. Please pass this important bill and end this horrific cruelty and protect our oceans. Thank you for your consideration. Sincerely, Taurie Kinoshita

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:27:41 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Charlene Hara	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose SB505

Charlene Hara

Honolulu, Hawaii

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 1:27:54 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Natalie Graham-Wood	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:03:12 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Yehuda Pel-Or	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

It's ridiculous that this ban should be considered again. It makes no sense whatsoever.

ALL of the scientific evidence has shown that THE COMMERCIAL AQUARIUM FISHING INDUSTRY IN HAWAII HAS HAD **NO** NEGATIVE IMPACT ON THE ENVIRONMENT

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:10:51 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Susan Eubank	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505 to prohibit the harvesting of aquatic life for aquariums and trade, and prohibiting the cruel treatment of these beautiful aquatic creatures.

Thank you.

Susan Eubank

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:11:00 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Joey Ruchser	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this bill. Hawaii has and will always be a sustainable fishery. Doesn't make sense to allow people to kill and eat fish with no limits and not the sustainable collection of fishes.
#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:11:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
matt huizenga	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Marine aquarium fish are a valuable resource and not entirely useful in any other aspect. Things like flame wrasses are not large enough to be food fish, do not eat aglae, and are extremely valuable in the aquarium industry. Collecting them creates jobs and stimulates the economy. Banning aquarium collection is throwing a pebble at a tank

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:15:07 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Nick Slover	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The recreational aquarium industry in the state is tiny. This is Hawaii, where people are respectful of the culture and the lands. What proof is there that the recreational industry is harmful? In comparison, we pull next to nothing from the ocean. It's not logical to ban the hobby through illegalization of everything that makes it thrive. We are responsible and we police our own. Ban the commercial harvesters and the for profits, but allow the hobbyists access to inverts and fish.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 2:49:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Douglas Perrine	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Previous management of aquarium fish collecting failed to protect a number of small, rare, and endemic fish that are found only in Hawaiian waters - Hawaii's unique treasures. Current proposals for collecting licenses also target some of these species. Since there are no inspections on exports, it will be possible to also conceal protected species among the permitted species. Since the moratorium on collecting there has been a dramatic recovery of some of these species, proving that a total ban on aquarium collecting is the only way to protect Hawaii's treasures. This will also allow for a full recovery of herbivore species (the most collected) which will help our reefs recover from bleaching and other coral-killing events.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:17:11 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brian Miller	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:35:56 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tami Wilson	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning of collection of saltwater fish for the home aquarium.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:36:01 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Alex Macmillan	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. There is no peer reviewed evidence that ornamental fishing causes environmental damage.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:42:11 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Shannon Rudolph	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Support

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 3:42:14 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Burke McIntosh	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this as it will continue to hurt the salt water aquarium trade and everyone involved in it.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:13:20 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mia Larsen	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I do not support SB 505.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:17:52 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Alfred Gouveia	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am opposed to this. I feel the fishery can be managed. I am in the hobby as well as fish for food and teach my 6 children to fish as well.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:24:39 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Lisa Kart	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Besides the cruel methods used , all this for what, greed for \$ and to put them in some tank prison

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:28:25 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
JANE CARLILE	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Harvesting of tropical fish should be prohibited for commericial aquarium and "pet" purposes. It should be limited to licensed/regulated public aquariums that provide a public benefit and provide appropriate transport, maintenance, and treatment of the fish, and also be limited as to amount of fish taken, both in the individual public acquarium case and in the aggregate from specific ocean areas. This woud be an important step toward ensuring that these species survive to participate in healthy reef support and as part of the food chain and cleaning mechanisms in the open ocean. Please support this bill.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:49:12 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tana Jahangier	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:57:14 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
andy walters	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am opposed to sb505, I do not believe something should be banned because they do not like the idea, follow the science it is not a popularity contest

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 4:59:20 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
London Wimberly	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:03:26 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Matt Taylor	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:47:47 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ben Coleman	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

"I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

The very simple fact that 30 years of peer supported data shows that this is a complete waste of time

Allowing fish to be harvested for food without limits is like swallowing the poison pill. Adult, and therefore of breeding size and age fish being removed without limit, for the purpose of food for indigenous people or not, is asking for an unregulated decline in overall population of reef fishes.

The ornamental aquarium fish industry has shown, again with 30 years of documented peer reviewed research, to NOT have a detrimental affect to the population of the few species named in this bill.

I would humbly suggest that you look at scientific research and not the loud minority that has a self interest in passing this bill.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 5:47:54 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kim Koch	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

#### Oppose SB505

The 1998 law which established the West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area (WHRFMA) required the DLNR/DAR to present a report to the Legislature every five years on the effectiveness of the WHRFMA. To do so it was necessary to study how the new regulations were working. To accomplish this, DAR in association with the University of Hawai'i Hilo, established a rigorous, scientific monitoring program in 1999 to track changes in reef fish populations and coral reef benthic communities. Over the past 20 years, 82 survey divers have conducted over 2,100 underwater surveys for this monitoring project. Additionally, a number of other scientists have conducted research in West Hawai'i relating toaquarium issues and/or targeted species.

The monitoring data show that the regulations put in place have been very effective in managing aquarium collecting in West Hawai'i. The West Hawai'i Regional Fishery Management Area is among the best studied and most effective fishery management efforts to date, and scientific data clearly show that management is working with population increases of the primary targets. For example, as noted in the 2019 DLNR/DAR legislative report, the populations of the two most heavily collected species of West Hawai'i aquarium fish, Yellow Tang and Kole, which collectively made up 92% of total aquarium catch in (FY17/18), more than doubled over the past two decades. Their populations even increased in the areas open to collecting likely due to spillover from protected areas.

Concern expressed about the threat of climate changes such as coral bleaching on reefs warrants extreme caution in reviewing activities such as aquarium collecting. This concern over coral bleaching is certainly warranted but somewhat surprising given that the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) leadership has not implemented the 2017 Coral Bleaching Recovery Plan which was developed by DAR and the University of Hawai'i based on the input of over 100 scientists and resource managers from around the world. The goal of the Recovery Plan was to implement management actions to promote coral recovery after bleaching in Hawai'i and the scope of the Plan was much more comprehensive than just focusing on aquarium collecting.

As experienced Hawai'i marine science researchers with adirect/intimate understanding of this issue, we want to re-emphasize that the strong support we are expressing for the fishery is due entirely to the survey efforts and results of the DAR research team. There is a huge amount of data and other information showing that the aquarium fishery is sustainably managed and that the system works. This type of science-based management should be a model for other fisheries in Hawaii.

William Walsh Ph.D.	Cynthia Hunter Ph.D.
Ivor Williams Ph.D.	Brian Bowen Ph.D.
Brian Tissot Ph.D.	Brian Zgliczynski Ph.D.
Leon Hallacher Ph.D.	Jeff Ebel Ph.D.
Bruce Carlson Ph.D.	Alan Friedlander Ph.D.
Charles Birkeland Ph.D.	Kosta Stamoulis Ph.D.
Jeremy Claisse Ph.D.	Delisse Ortiz Ph.D.
Mark Christie Ph.D.	Jan Dierking Ph.D.
Richard Pyle Ph.D.	Rob Toonen Ph.D.
Leighton Taylor Ph.D.	Jim Beets Ph.D.

.

Randy Kosaki Ph.D.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:15:24 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tim Jernberg	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I believe this bill will prevent unjustly prevent fisherman from maintaining their jobs. The collection of marine species has been deemed to be sustainable by an environmental review so this ban is unwarranted and goes against our best scientific evidence of the fishery. Furthermore, the marine trade helps to educate people about the oceans and we need to continue to support sustainable sources such as the Hawaii fishery. Thank you for your time.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:26:11 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Luke Nagasako	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENT Senator Mike Gabbard, Chair Senator Herbert M. "Tim" Richards, III, Vice Chair COMMITTEE ON WATER AND LAND Senator Lorraine R. Inouye, Chair Senator Brandon J.C. Elefante, Vice Chair

RE: SB505 RELATING TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION.

In Support Dear Senator Gabbard, Senator Richards, Senator Inouye, Senator Elefante, and members of the committees,

I am an elementary school student living in Honolulu.

I think that this bill is important because the methods by which aquatic animals are caught are not humane.

This shows in how 40% percent of wild-caught fish perish before reaching the sales floor.

These inhumane methods include hurting the fish by puncturing swim bladders, and cutting off fins and spines to save a buck.

Another method is to starve the fish which is cruel and very inhumane.

I urge you to support this bill.

Thank you, Luke Nagasako

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:34:16 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brian Nishihara	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this bill as a responsible aquatic hobbyist.

We already have a limited resource for this hobby.

We are not in this hobby for profit but only as an enjoyment for the hobby.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:42:13 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Damon Jones	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Why should it be legal to fish with the intent to kill the animals that are caught for human consumption, but not for the sake of a hobby where they will be loved and cared for? This bill not only hurts an industry and takes away jobs from people, but if responsible fishing practices are enforced, then there is no reason to ban fishing altogether. There is nothing wrong with restricting fishing for the sake of sustainability. Take for example, the Clarion angelfish. It is endangered, but each year a restricted number are allowed into the aquarium trade with permits in order to prevent overfishing. Banning fishing altogether is not only annoying for hobbyists, it is altogether wrong and costs people their jobs

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 6:43:03 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jodi Mercier	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

My name is Jodi Mercer and I am a resident of Kealakekua, Hawaii. I strongly support SB Bill 505 as Hawai'is tropical fishes are critical to the health of the coral reefs. These reefs are invaluable to our residents in terms of helping to protect the land from erosion and environmental damage. They also help clean pollutants from the water.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify and I hope that you support SB505.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:03:17 PM

Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ashley Wilcox	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please support this bill

Thank you,

Ashley Wilcox, Napili

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:31:29 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Matt Pedersen	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

We are at a point in this debate where these bills need to just stop being submitted. The battle over Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery is far from fair and balanced. The agency tasked with managing this fishery has done an exemplary job, employing sound scientific management practices with positive results. There is now a documented history of endless attempts to close Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery with year after year of ban bills, yet every last one has failed when coming up against the test of science and logic. We're talking over a decade at this point. I would ask all who are considering this bill to look back to all the prior attempts to close this fishery, and all the commentary and evidence submitted at that time. The fishery and those who manage it have endlessly proven their side, while those opposed have failed to do so.

However, when years of attempts to legislate the aquarium fishery out of existence failed, those looking to scapegoat the trade turned to the courts, arguing successfully that the fishery was somehow subject to laws requiring environmental impact statements. As a result, the fishery was hampered and then closed, while fishermen did the required homework to meet this latest challenge and obstacle to their livelihoods. **Meanwhile, no other comparable fishery in the state has been held to this high standard. Other fisheries that target the same fishes, such as spearfishing, were allowed to continue uninterrupted. And during all this the Marine Ornamental Aquarium Fishery actually successfully** *passed the test, and is slated to reopen, while confronted with endless attempts to stop it.* 

And now, with fishermen ready to return to their livelihoods, the judicial backdoor ultimately proving ineffective, those opposed have just returned to the same annual parade of trying to legislate a proven-sustainable, "gold standard" fishery out of existence. Why?

I can only presume at this point that it's easier to scapegoat a small, well-managed fishery, for all the problems one might find on Hawaii's coastal waters, rather than examining anyone else. Hawaii's fishermen were simply an easy target...particularly if you need to turn a blind eye to coastal pollution and development.

I'd ask everyone tasked with considering this bill to ask one simple question. If Hawaii's fishermen must successfully defend their trade year after year, with no end in sight, while those opposed must only win once to enforce their will on the little guy, is this a remotely fair fight? At what point do we say "enough is enough" and end the relentless attempts to close a fishery and put fishermen out of work, when the science and data say there is no reason to do so?

I am all for a well-managed, sustainable fishery. Some point to the idea of captive propagation and aquaculture as suitable alternatives, but we seldom ask whether these practices are actually truly BETTER than the sustainable, managed harvest of what is naturally produced on the reef. In some cases, aquaculture may actually have a larger, negative impact on the environment, particularly if contrasted against a small-scale, well-managed, sustainable fishery.

If Hawaiii's marine aquarium fishery is to be legislated out of existence, it will be abundantly clear that sound science and logic are being thrown out as well. Hawaii's legislators ought to put a moratorium on the re-raising of this issue, and focus on dealing with actual problems, not on the scientifically proven, well-managed fishery that is controlled by the states DLNR / DAR.

It is high time that legislators ask the hard questions of those who oppose this fishery, yet turn a blind eye to all the other LARGER impacts that actually may be negatively affecting Hawaii's reefs? This endless debate is clearly one of ulterior motives and scapegoating, as one must ignore all the science and data to make the argument that the fishery on the whole is being mismanaged or is detrimental.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 7:40:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jonathan Groelz	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I'm opposed to closing the aquarium fishery in Hawaii. It is easily possible to maintain a sustainable commercial fishery for many species here.

I have years of schooling in fisheries and a degree in aquaculture from UH-Hilo. I'm fine with reporting and regulation of the catch, size limits as informed by scientific biological studies, but to shut it off entirely based on public disinformation would be criminal.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:50:45 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Shyanne Hirata-Freitas	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this bill. Sound factual science over "feelings." This industry is sustainable.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 8:59:51 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brandon Wolfinger	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

SB 505 OPPOSED AEN & WTL committee

Aloha Senators,

I am reaching out today to voice strong opposition to this bill. Im not sure where this bill got its information from but it is clear that the bill has no facts to back up its assertions. The science that the State has accumulated for twenty years strongly goes against EVERYTHING suggested. I would recommend that you guys do your due diligence BEFORE banning a sustainable fishery that creates very good much needed jobs. If the scientist says its sustainable, why cant this fishery continue? No brainer

Mahalo,

Brandon Wolfinger

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:25:13 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sunny Goold	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. I support sustainable collection of fishes, particularly for ones that put a high value on the fish. I believe sustainable collection in Hawaii set a high standard worldwide and that it encourages collection in other countries that is sustainable and good collectors protect the reefs from overfishing for food and dynamite.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:29:31 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Stanford Wong	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

To whom it may concern. I am strongly opposed to SB505.

I have been fascinated with and have kept marine organisms for nearly 50 years. I'm also very interested in aquaculture and have spent many years learning fish behavior and how to get them to pair up. I would like to work with Hawaiian fish which would help to ease some of the "pressure" of collecting wild specimens. A good example of that is the Yellow Tang, which Hawaii is known for. They are now being captive bred at Oceanic Institute of Hawaii in partnership with the Biota Group.

Page 2, lines 6-10 does not tell the whole story. It says that DLNR estimates that it costs the taxpayers \$500,000 a year to manage, yet it generates only \$25,000 in revenue for the State. That \$25,000 is probably just General Excise taxes paid by fish collectors. But for the economy it creates much more through the fishing industry infrastructure (e.g. Fish Collectors, Pet stores, Wholesalers, Shippers, Airlines, Aquarium Maintenance Services, etc.). The fish exports also brought in out-of-State money. We need other industries in Hawaii besides tourism.

I disagree with page 2, lines 11-17 saying that prohibiting commercial fish collecting would be consistent with prohibiting the taking of sand, rocks, etc. The sand comes from the eroding corals, coral rubble, etc. Fish propagate every year. When fish are collected that opens space for the next generation. I believe fish can be a manageable renewable resource.

Page 3, lines 3-14 allows for permits for non-commercial use. However, this does not really help me get the specimens that I need. I would have to become SCUBA certified, buy or rent SCUBA gear, buy fish collecting gear, buy or rent a boat, find a dive partner, etc. It is not very practical. Fish collecting is a skill that is learned over years. I don't want to spend years of my time learning that, just to get the fish that I want. Then I would have to find out where and when to collect them. Having people collect their own fish will most likely create more diving accidents and deaths with novice divers. I would want someone skilled in fish collecting to be able to safely collect and deliver healthy specimens. I wouldn't know how to decompress a fish when bringing them up from deeper waters.

Banning fish collecting is not a good answer. We need to compromise, I believe this can be a well managed industry.

Please vote to oppose this measure.

Thank you for your time.

Sincerely,

Stanford Wong

Honolulu, HI

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 9:35:49 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Gladys Butac	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am strongly against this

<u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:06:31 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
ROY C CLENDANIEL SR	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 10:52:00 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Josh Frey	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.
# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:12:05 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sheldon	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:49:02 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Sam Hawkins	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

To all concerned,

I have worked with in the aquatic industry for many years and I have seen many different areas within in the industry. I have seen how animals are collected from the sea and how delicatly and carefully these animals are treated. These animals are the divers lively hood, it has always been in their interest to collect and preserve these animals, as if they do not their business and lively hood would fail.

It is heart breaking to see many of the species that would be collected for the aquarium trade caught indescrimmently for food with liitle care and consideration taken for the animals environment.

As with any industry you get good and bad companies, but the Hawaiian fisheries is small and can be easily monitored to make sure you only have compaines working with the best practises.

I belive that permits should be offered for the collection of Fish for the aquarium market, the fisheries can be monitored as it always has been, this will show that it is a sustainable fisheries.

Yours sincerly

Sam Hawkins

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/6/2023 11:50:11 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Nina Potter	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. Scientific studies have clearly shown that the last 30 years of ornamental trade have not had a detrimental impact on fish quotas, if anything. Levels remain high and the trade brings jobs to the local economy and locals are respectful of quotas which suggests good management and respect for the trade.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 12:00:06 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jolanta Hanstein	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am against the Hawaiian fishery ban.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:36:25 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tony Alaniz	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:37:08 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Shane McCarthy	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban as it has already been proven that it's not having an environmental impact. We've been through this before and it's time to stop wasting money. Instead put that money to DLNR for enforcement of what has already been approved from the last case for the 8 species.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:29:17 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brenton Wehber	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in Hawaii. Scientists have proven that responsible fisheries work. The solution to issues are not outright bans, but responsible management. Compromise is the key to successful governance.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 4:12:37 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Samuel Lucas	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hello, i would like to start by saying that I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii, based on the fact that the is 30 years of data that shows there is no environmental impact as shown by previous testimony. If there is a limit on how many can be caught then there is no issue. If locals can catch and eat (kill), then what is the difference between that and catching them to be put in an aquarium where they will get to live. You have many people all over that love these creatures and want to take care of and be able to see them everyday. Please block this ban it isn't necessary. Yes conservation is a big priority right now but none of these fish are endangered or even threatened, nor are they at risk of either. Again I plead with you to stop the ban before it even starts. Thank you

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 4:17:18 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Christopher John Krollage	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the ban on ornamental fish collection. Aquarium hobbyists have done great work to help improve the fisheries and environment. Replenishing corals and fish in areas damaged from misuse of our resources.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 4:20:16 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Michael Rydzik	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 4:46:39 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Daniel Taggart	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I do not support banning the responsible commercial collection of wild marine fish in Hawaii. Scientific data does not show any harm to fish populations as a result of responsible commercial collection. Therefore, there is no logical basis for the ban.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:12:40 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brad V Bellomo	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

There is no credible evidence aquarium collection is harmful. Sustainable economic benefit from the reefs provides motivation to protect our environment. Aquarium collection is being scapegoated to ignore real threats which have larger economic implications and require greater action.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:18:50 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Regiane Santos	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning fisheries.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:51:03 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Keiko Gonzalez	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

I am in strong support of SB505 to prohibit aquarium collecting for the continent's pet trade. Our reef fish are an essential, integral part of our reef ecosystem. No reef fish, no healthy reef. The food chain would also be even more disrupted than it already is, which affects not only life in the ocean but our own sustenance and wellbeing as people.

Reef fish support the visitor industry. Tourists want to swim with fish. They don't want to see a dead reef with no fish.

Also, there haven't been any aquarium collecting jobs in Hawai'i for years. And Hawai'i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide.

So unless you want to support mainland and international pet dealers who are profiting from our reef wildlife at the expense of our visitor industry, our livelihood, and our Hawai'i, please vote yes on SB505. Show your support for Hawai'i, for the people who live here, and for our future.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 6:00:25 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Trish Triplett	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I'm a diver and I have seen a decline in the amt of fish since I moved here 11 years ago. I support this ban

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 6:07:17 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Matthew B Caldwell	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. There has been virtually zero impact from the sustainable fishing practices of collecting fish for aquariums. Allowing aquarium owners like myself to own fish spreads awareness of our oceans beauty as seen in the waters off of Hawaii. It makes people aware of how important it is to protect our oceans from climate change caused by the burning of fossil fuels.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 6:18:44 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Chris Sturgis	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:12:37 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
grant rakowski	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I feel that if we want to protect the reef and natural environment than there is needs to be a ban on all collecting weather it comes from fishing or aquarium collecting. Commercial fishing and building of new docks and allowing cruise liners to come into Hawaii waters has caused unkown amounts of damage to the reef and its inhabinites. At lease when it comes to aquarium collecting the fish are treated with best way possible and live long lives in an aquarium that could be used as a teaching tool to school childern or some cases even help a disabled vetern over come depression and PTSD.

The effects of interacting with fish in aquariums on human health and well-being: A systematic review - PMC (nih.gov)

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:27:46 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jon Riggs	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The trade of ornamental reef fish and other wildlife should be regulated to ensure sustainability, but should never be fully banned. The aquarium trade industry has proven vital to research and conservation for various fish, coral, and invertebrate marine animals. Marine aquarium enthusiasts are deeply concerned with conserving our reefs around the world, and eliminating trade from any of the reefs is detrimental. Certain species that inhabit the reefs in Hawai'i that can only be found there, will be vulnerable to local environmental disasters, including climate change, and could become extinct. The aquarium trade propagates these species world wide, lessening the chance of extinction and creating a more resilient breed of these animals.

If you are truly concerned with the conservation of the reefs, please consider regulating, not eliminating, export of marine wildlife.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:31:55 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Stephenie Waller	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

I am very passionate about conserving and protecting our oceans, reefs and its inhabitants. It is a topic that resonates very deeply within my person. I would like to point out I am very supportive of a limited fishery, however I am completely against a Full Ban.

Hawaii and its reefs are one of the world's true gems, the fisherman and collectors also believe this. The fisherman and collectors typically follow regulations and laws as it is in their best interest to uphold the sustainability of the reef. It is possible to have a limited fishery, there are examples of it found around our country. Limited opens and further regulations to protect the habitats and fisheries. I believe these should be explored and given the opportunity to succeed before a full ban is implemented. Not just the fisherman and collectors will be financially impacted but a domino effect will ripple throughout the aquarium industry.

In our current hour not just Hawaii, but the world needs (more than ever) awareness of our reefs. One of the ways to gain people's full support is by education outreach, which I am sure you are aware of. The ornamental fish collected in Hawaii are a huge contributor to this via the aquarium trade and hobby. These awe inspiring fish intrigue young minds and old alike with their beauty. From new people entering into the aquarist hobby, to the veteran fish keeper, to the tourist attending a local aquarium or waiting for your next dental cleaning. Viewing these animals presents the opportunity to begin conversations, spark interests and ask questions,

A lot of aquarist keep ongoing records/logs of their tank(s) of which gets shared onto an open forum with fellow fish keepers and reefers. All of this data and documentation has Already been used by scientists and politicians to further their purpose. Considering the lack of governmental funding provided to further our education in this field, I believe this is a crucial free source of information.

If this ban is passed it will be negatively impacting our opportunity to spark interest or read the latest discovery via the forum. It will hurt our fisherman and collectors ability to make an income, which impacts the local economies. Overall I do believe there is a better way forward other than a full ban.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:40:01 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jens Kallmeyer	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii as it contradicts scientific data that clearly show that ornamental fishery over the last 30 years has not caused any reduction in population sizes. Hawai'i already has the one of the most regulated ornamental fishery industry in the world and if could set a wonderful example of how a natural resource can be utilized sustainably due to good governance.

Seeing endemic Hawai'ian fishes in aquariums around the world is also a great way of advertising the unique beauty of these islands.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:53:21 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John Hoover	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly support ending collection of Hawaii's wild fish and other marine animals for the commercial aquarium trade. It's completely unnecessary. Many of these fish can be artificially bred in Hawaii now and this creates more jobs than the collecting of wild animals. Let's support this approach. The oceans of the world are under enough stress already due to human activities. Let's not add to the exploitation.

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:57:10 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
James P Cavanaugh	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 7:59:12 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
jose serrano	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hello. First, I want to thank you for hearing me out. I am part of the marine aquarium hobby industry. I know from lots of talks and research that we are a sm fish when it comes to taking from the ocean. Plenty of studies conducted by priviate and public companies have shown that fishing, cruise companies, and pollution are the culprits of the reduction of animals. In the aquarium hobby, we are striving to become more and more sutatainable by breeding, culuring, and growing our animals in our homes, small businesses, ... But to do this, we do need access to these animals. I hope this helps, and the sentiment of care and understanding was felt.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 8:38:12 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jun James Sogi	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505. Private business should not be allowed to rape the reef and take fish. I surfed dive hete for 69 years and since they stopped vacuuming tangs now there are plenty. They vacuum them and send them to mainland to die. Not pono.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 8:45:14 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jeff turner	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

The tropical marine life fishery in Hawaii is a historical fishery with very limited effect on historical data as has been thoroughly documented by the State of Hawaii's regulatory agencies. Limited entry marine life fisheries, such as what is in place in the State of Florida and East and West Australia, are prime examples of well managed tropical marine life fisheries with size and quantities limits that are monitored and managed by their respective governmental authorities. There are extensive restricted access areas in Hawaii where the collection of marine life is off limits and offer replenishment zone where all marine life is protected, just like in Florida and vast areas of Australia.

The commercial collection of tropical fish in Hawaii can be, and should be, an extremely beneficial limited entry fishery that can easily be managed with a limited entry fishery. Please open the fishery back up in a responsible manner to responsible and licensed marine life collectors.

thank you

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 9:35:00 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dave Botwin	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

Hello, I'm a citizen of California but have a vacation home on Oahu. The waters of the Hawaiian Islands are important to me. I am also someone who has been involved with every aspect of the Aquarium Trade for almost 4 decades. I have seen fisheries come and go. I have seen millions of fish shipped into the United States. To this day I weekly see the import of multiple shipments of fish and corals from around the world.

In reading some of the support of this bill I was absolutely stunned by how people threw statistics into their writings, without any support or proof. Decimation, Annihilation, Extinction - All words that were used by one person or another - Against one of the best regulated and monitored fishing industries in the world.

Statistics about how much of the catch dies before reaching the mainland are absolutely false. Hawaii is the shortest and easiest flight to the mainland. This makes it the easiest trip for fish to make to the United States. The least amount of places for fish to get mishandled. And the shortest time any Pacific tropical fish spends in a bag to be transported. The numbers being reported from annonymous sources are just not fact.

I personally keep an aquarium with Hawaiian fish in it. I have 4 fish that are going on 14 years of living with me. And they seem quite happy (and very much alive).

The aquarium hobby is not just a box of water with ornamental fish. Caring for these fish takes an education. And teaching children how to maintain such environments within their own control is one of the best means of educating them as to how they can control what happens within their own environment they live in. How critical maintaining an environment is within an aquarium is only a window as to what it takes to maintain an environment for human life to thrive.

Post pandemic the cost of the livestock for the aquarium industry has almost tripled due to transportation costs and supply chain issues. Hawaii being the closest location for Pacific Tropical fish to the mainland makes it one of the least expensive to ship from there by making the costs of the livestock more affordable. Now, I fully understand that the arguement for this bill - Having less expensive livestock is pretty low. But as for making the aquarium hobby available to this generation and the next it provides a reasonable means of acquiring and caring for livestock to maintain their own private eco systems.

I am not endorsing a fishing free for all, with unlimited collection. But a regulated, permitted, catch tally system with limited fishing areas is a sustainable fishery that can be to the benefit of everyone - everyone interested in the ornamental fish trade - from collector, to shipper, to wholesaler, to Local Fish Store, to Happy Hobbyist. After all the data that has been legitmately gathered in the past 4.5 years regarding the fishery statistics - both before collection was halted and after collection was halted - has shown that Hawaii has one of the most healthy and sustainable fisheries. Please don't close this fishery based on a barrage of people citing non-specific sources with outrageous statistics that doesn't match the data that has been submitted to the Hawaiian courts on this issue.

Thank you for your time.

Dave

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 9:51:04 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
David Mayman	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 10:59:29 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tal Sweet	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose SB505 and urge legislators to follow real-world science and fact when making their decision.

Marine fish are the <u>most reproductive vertebrates</u> on the planet. Making fish the most renewable resource there is. The state has greatly ignored the potential the **100-billion-dollar a year pet industry** could offer. The state allowed Tourists to shut down the fishery with lawsuits. Opah Moon Fish produce 300 million eggs a year, many other reef fish produce tens of thousands to millions of fry per spawn per pair. We need to support a managed sustainable fishery to create a more sustainable society.

The State of Hawaii public officers' oath is to uphold the state's constitution. If decisions are made that are biased and not based on facts it violates that oath. It is unconstitutional (State, Federal, and International Laws, <u>UN resolution</u> 2749) to shut out any ocean user group. Fishery management, not closure is the government's role in fisheries. No one group can lay claim to any part of the ocean, it is a public trust. The court's decision for the aquarium fishery to do an environmental review was not based at all on science but on legal interpretation.

Leading scientists spoke out in objection to these decisions. To favor the huge ecological impacts of tourism over a proven sustainable aquarium fishery is unconstitutional, a miscarriage of justice, and poor decision-making. The lies perpetuated by anti-aquarium fishery groups were used in lawsuits and even earth justice lawyers spout this misinformation, to knowingly lie under oath in court or legislative testimony is perjury. Yet even the new bill this year continues the lies. Science if read will give the truth but few bother to read the lengthy data, believing instead in biased for-profit propaganda from who-tourist groups, not scientists.

Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery has been studied more than any other fishery in the world. Both the 2,400-page Environmental Review of the West Hawaii fishery, and the Oahu Environmental Review, (links removed by state why? But available upon request) based in State fish counts and reports covering nearly 20 years of data, scientifically prove Hawaii's aquarium fishery is eco-friendly, having a low environmental impact. The head of the Hawaii Department of Land and

Natural Resources (DLNR) – Suzanne Case, stated Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery is a "**Model Fishery**". She later recanted this statement in favor of tourism. With many reef fish populations on the rise overall, Hawaii's Aquarium Fishery is the true definition of "Sustainability." Abundant small fish are taken leaving breeders to repopulate making the aquarium fishery a "Model Fishery".

Hawaii's <u>leading scientists speak</u> out in opposition to the DLNR Land Boards' decision not to approve the environmental review of the West Hawaii Aquarium fishery. This review was based on much of this scientific research and then they were not even questioned or consulted about the board decision. It was like science did not matter.

Hawaii's top marine biologists William Walsh Ph.D., Ivor Williams Ph.D., Brian Tissot Ph.D.; Leon Hallacher Ph.D.; Bruce Carlson Ph.D.; Charles Birkeland Ph.D.; Jeremy Claisse Ph.D.; Mark Christie Ph.D.; Richard Pyle Ph.D.; Leighton Taylor Ph.D.; Randy Kosaki Ph.D.; Cynthia Hunter Ph.D.; Brian Bowen Ph.D.; Brian Zgliczynski Ph.D.; Jeff Ebel Ph.D.; Alan Friedlander Ph.D.; Kosta Stamoulis Ph.D.; Delisse Ortiz Ph.D.; Jan Dierking Ph.D.; Rob Toonen Ph.D.; and Jim Beets Ph.D. Thursday, June 25, 2020, all signed the letter condemning the BLNR land board's decision not to approve fisheries environmental review. Why? Because the fishery is sustainable.

Since Honolulu is the most remote city in the world and our economy is <u>Hawaii imported</u> 179 million dollars in goods and exported only 24 million in goods. Hawaii is too dependent on tourism, imports, overseas food supplies, and nonrenewable resources.

Hawaii's leading exports are Iron steel scrap, aircraft parts, aluminum waste, and copper waste from goods that were imported. Only one renewable export made the top ten export list, shrimp aquaculture. Aquarium aquaculture is a must for a sustainable Hawaii. Aquaculture and many other businesses depend on the aquarium fishery.

# Hawaii's major problem we face is that "Every day 30,000 tourist flying to Hawaii creates more Global Warming CO2 gas emissions than if you drove your car for 13,000 years".

1. Tourism is the most unsustainable business activity with the highest carbon footprint produced. 80% of tourists also do ocean activities and create huge ocean impacts much more so than any Hawaii fishery. Tourism is also too vulnerable to be depended on, just look at what happened during covid and 911. Tourism crashes will happen again and may take many years to recover.

For Hawaii to become sustainable we must change to sustainable, low-carbon footprints, and concentrate on renewable resources used for Hawaii's major exports and businesses.

In ancient Hawaiian culture in order to survive with the only resources available on these tiny islands <u>you had to be sustainable</u>, or you were dead. A major part of that renewable resource survival was fishing! Sustainable fishing is historically an important Hawaiian resource! Many Hawaiians and their families are supported by the aquarium fishery.

Ocean tourist groups have complained that there are no more fish at their dive and snorkeling sites. <u>News article</u> discusses the loss of fish in tourist areas. <u>Recent studies</u> showed the return of fish to Hanauma bay when tourism stopped due to covid. Now that tourism has returned to the bay, more research showed <u>fish are disappearing</u> again! The large groups of tourists have scared the fish out of these areas. Huge tourist snorkel and dive groups greatly impact fish feeding and reproduction behavior affecting fish populations. Unlike tourists, Fishermen do not go to the same areas day in and day out in large numbers, fishermen rotate their sites to prevent overfishing. Are tourism impacts being used to blame the aquarium fishery? Aquarium fishermen do not go to tourist areas, but more and more tourists are coming into and taking aquarium fishing areas away from fishermen. The 20 years of FRA fish replenishment aquarium fish <u>fish counts</u> off West Hawaii show an increase in overall fish populations so why are tourist areas having fewer fish and why is the proven sustainable fishery closed?

Thank you, Tal Sweet

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 11:26:15 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Carole R. Richelieu	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Capturing wild animals and transporting them

thousands of miles in conditions that are often

fatal is not humane.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 11:38:03 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Monica Dunse	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505.

The tropical fish have more value in the ocean than in an aquarium on the mainland.

Thank you, Monica Dunse

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 11:50:57 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Valerie Barnes	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please pass SB505. The number of jobs the aquarium trade provides doesn't come close to outweighing the loss and waste of our reef fish or the damage their loss does to our reef ecosystems. We should leave SOMETHING for our children.

Mahalo

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 12:17:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Naomi hamilton	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

We implore you to look at the scientific evidence available fishing for aquarium trade is sustainable if done properly and with the plans proposed.
Hello, To Whom It May Concern, And And To The Native Citizens Of Hawaii.

I Strongly Oppose This Motion To Ban The Import Of Select Native Hawaiian Fish. There Are A Few Aspects To This Situtation That Need To Be Thought About And Addressed. One Of Those Being That Of The 30 Year History Of Import Of Select Species Starting And Stopping There Is Firm Scientific Evidence That Now Today There Are Even More Populations Of These Fish Then There Were In Past Years And Decades And None Of The 8 Species That Those Who Oppose This Bill Want To Import Are Anywhere Near Being On A Threatened, Or Endangered List. Now That Being Said There Needs To Be A Point Made That These Fish That Are Being Imported Are Not Being Made Into Tuna Sandwiches, And Vastly Over Fished To Make A Fast Dollar. These Fish Are Being Imported By Multi-Millionaire Companies That Have Invested Money For Decades In The Safe And Stress Free Transport Process, Why? Because They Care About These Fish. They've Also Given Back Financially And In Other Ways To Conserve Reefs And Protect Other Endangered Species And Helped With Ocean Clean Up Projects As Well! And Those Buying Them? Care Even More. What I Mean Is That I Have Kept Saltwater Aquariums In My Home In California For Over 15yrs And I Have A Yellow Tang That Is 11years Old Now Named Sun Ray, Or Ray For Short. Ray Has Been Fed Like A King And Kept In A Almost 350g Pristine Aquarium With Over \$10,000 Of Eauipment All Geared Towards A Pristine And Healthy Enviorment For Him. He Is Literally A Member Of My Family And All My Hawaiian Fish Are. They've Been With Me Through House Moves, Job Changes, And They Even Watched Me Marry My Wife At Our Home. If That Doesn't Explain The White Glove Care And Love These Imported Animals Woild Recieve And Why It Should Be Allowed But Closely Controlled? I'm Not Sure What Will. There Is A Community Amongst Us "Reefers" Called The "Tang Police" And It's The Idea Of Spreading Awarness Of What These Beautiful Fish Require To Be Kept Happy And Thriving In A Home Enviorment. This Way People Who Are New To The Hobby Of Fish Keeping Are Not Buying A Tank Too Small And Trying To Have A Tang. It Just Doesn't Happen. JpSo That Being Said, I'd Like To Make It Clear That The Fish That Are Imported, Not Only Are Loved And Treated Like Family By Us All, But They Also Live Long And Happy Lives And Are Practically Idolized In This Hobby. I Would Also Argue That They Live Longer And Healthier Lives With My Example Of Ray The Yellow Tang, Who Has Also Had Many Wives Himself And Have Bred Multiple Times. With Successful Offspring Of His Being Donated To The San Diego Aquariums And Others Local To Me. So Please Understand That We Share Common Love, Views, And Restraint When It Comes To The Catch And Import Of These Amazing Fish And Not Allowing This Bill To Pass Would Be The Right Thing For Everyone. The Natural Course Of These Fish Would Not Be As Abundant As It Is Now If They Werent Closely Watched And Helped With The Population Controlled But Protected And The Public Educated About. And Not To Mention If Left Alone Most Never Make It Adulthood I Believe Because Of Natural Preadators And The Circle Of Life, And Other Population Decreasing Avenues. Letting These Fish Be Harvested Brings More Of These Fish Into Existence And Wether They Stay In A Home Aquarium Or A Public One Or Re-Leased Back Into The Wild It Only Helps More Of These Beautiful Fish Be Born And The Populations Grown. Thank You For Your Time. Sincerely And Vigalantly Yours, Stuart Millan

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 12:59:13 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Naomi Cox	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Honorable Senate,

I have watched in horror at our reef fish and coral life dwindling before my very eyes over a short period of time. Yellow Tang can live 50 years in the wild and yet 50% of them die a cruel fate in transport and the rest will live only 2 years in a tank.

NELHA is a proven example of a sustainable aquarium trade and viable jobs here and in the future. Let's build a sustainable industry for our Keiki and keep our wild fish on Hawaiis reefs for MANY generations instead of allowing the decimation of our wild creatures for the benefit of the few.

Mahalo. Susan Naomi Cox

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:08:45 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Anne ('Antu') Harvey	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha A&E Chair Gabbard, W&L Chair Inouye and Members of these Committees,

Thank you for this opportunity, The aquarium trade poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral by destroying the healthy **symbiotic relationships**.

Benefits of Passing:

- Stops further depletion of counts and species diversity, already under assault from pollution, climate change, etc.
- Stops a purely profit motivated extractive practice that benefits a few instead of the value these fish and our coral contribute to the ecosystem, residents and even tourists (no fish, no coral, no tourists)
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide. Unlike wild catch, aquaculture farming is sustainable and can provide business opportunities and jobs in Hawai'i.

Ban the extractive harmful aquarium trade. Protect our ocean and preserve its biodiversity for future generations. Please **pass SB505** to provide time and opportunity for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo Anne ('Antu') Harvey - 96725

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:11:18 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Steven Lombardi	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:21:08 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jan Wizinowich	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha Kakou;

Our reefs and ocean environment are under siege and need every protection possible. Allowing a few aquarium collectors to collect and sale fish to do nothing more than be a display in the living rooms of hobbyist is a terrible waste of our natural resources and will cause permanent damage to our reefs and ocean ecosystems. Please pass SB505 and protect our vulnerable reefs. To preserve our natural world, we have arrived at a time when it is necessary to change the way we live and how we use resources. Will Hawai'i lead the way to creating a healthier planet? I hope so. Mahalo, Jan Wizinowich

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 1:50:57 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Chris Clevers	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this action given Hawaii's fisheries are some of the best in the world and for decades have allowed fishing for aquarium fish without causing degradation of the population.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:12:57 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Christopher Lucia	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Strongly **opposed** to SB505

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:17:00 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kealoha Sugiyama	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Humans have become the destroyers of Mother Earth by polluting the streams the air and the vast oceans for the sake of money. Harvesting these fishes for ornamental reason is selfish and greedy by harvestors and patrons. Vote No

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:17:21 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Randy Cheung	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Mismanagement of our own resources and taxpayer dollars is not a good justification for shutting down the entire industry and forcing the industry to rely on imported fish or more likely destroying the industry all together. What is the total ecomonic value and impact for the people of Hawaii, the commercial aquarium trade, and local pet stores? Prohibiting all commercial take of aquarium fish does not benefit the people of Hawaii, I oppose.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:29:55 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Karyn Clay	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

The aquarium trade has done enough damage to our reefs, our tourism and Hawai'i's culture. It is my understanding that captive-bred fish are readily available, so I strongly believe that our wild fish should remain right where they are, enhancing our underwater reef systems and boosting our tourism so their natural beauty can be truly enjoyed.

Mahalo for your consideration,

Karyn Clay

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 2:55:57 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Belinda pate	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

As a resident of Kailua-Kona, we must not only prohibit the collection of our precious reef fish, but enforce these laws. We leave enforcing the laws up to persons who turn a blind eye. This is not acceptable.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 3:11:05 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Joyce Barbarich	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The loss and waste of thousands of reef fish and the damage to the reef ecosystems caused by the aquarium trade far outweigh the relatively few jobs that harvesting provides. Please pass SB505 to end reef fish harvesting!

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 3:39:17 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Anthony J Doermann	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the banning of marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii due to the evidence of backed scientific data that they pose no environmental risk.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 4:00:00 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Diann Wilson	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The loss and waste of thousands of reef fish and the damage to the reef ecosystems caused by the aquarium trade far outweigh the relatively few jobs that harvesting provides. Please pass SB505 to end reef fish harvesting

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:23:15 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Vadim Shmah	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose it. You are trying to destroy hobby that teach millions of kids how to enjoy and respect nature. Kids with aquariums will preserve natural habitat, compare to other who does not have that nature connection.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:52:16 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Virginia Tincher	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Chair Gabbard, Vice Chair Richards and Senate Committee on Agriculture and Environment members

Chair Inouye, Vice Chair Elefante and Senate Committee on Water and Land members

Mahalo Senator Gabbard and Senator Rhoads for introducing SB505 to end the destructive pet trade in our reef wildlife which must happen now.

We must protect Hawaii's reef fish.

I am in strong support of this bill.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 5:58:39 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Brian Hirner	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. It has clearly been stated that after 30 years of industry self conservation, the numbers of fish have actually increased.

I oppose SB505 and HB910. There is no scientific data to support a need for this ban. Fishery management works. This is where attention and efforts could be focused, rather than trying to pass bills that make claims with no scientific basis. Time and again, the data continue to clearly show a sustainable fishery.

Thank you,

Luci Price Ocean View, HI RE: SB505 - HB910

Oppose. I do not support a ban of this fishery.

Chris Sacorro Honolulu I oppose SB 505 and HB910. The data proves this is a sustainable fishery. There is no reason for a ban when management has been so effective.

C. Han Hilo

# Oppose SB505 and HB910

Sam Price Ocean View, HI I am submitting testimony in opposition to SB 505 and HB 910. Mahalo.

Z. Seale, Hilo, Hi

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 8:26:54 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Nina Monasevitch	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am a resident of Kauai for over 40 years. I have been Scuba diving, snorkeling, ocean swimming and boating during that time. I have witnesed first hand the catastropic decline of fish, reefs and nearshore ecosystems. Stop the aquarium trade! You can not do business on a dead planet. Thank you for your consertation of this very important matter.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/7/2023 9:28:48 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Suman Lal Mukherjee	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

These beautiful fishes can be reasonably sourced and we can enjoy them both in the oceans and in our tanks. There is always a legalized way of doing it to maintain harmony with nature.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 4:38:11 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jose Blanco	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I strongly oppose SB505. The collection for the aquarium trade has been proven to be sustainable and has passed an environment study. If this bill is to pass, it will adversely affect many people who participate in this wonderful hobby and our community.

Jose Blanco

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:08:05 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
David	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the banning of fisheries.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:25:10 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dan Bzdyl	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I submit opposition to this SB505 bill. I also believe that all bills submitted under "emotion" versus fact should be dissolves upon submission. I work extremely hard with hundreds to thousands of people in the aquatic industry that work passionately to not only sustain, however, build a much better future for these and other fishes all over the world. It's a bigger waste of resources fighting emotional groups that only put their finances into creating these bills and not into building the future like restoring natural habitats that have been de estates by natural disasters. Where's the funding on their end for that is my question. Regulations are good, eliminating because they don't like it is not. Follow facts.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 7:06:21 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Robert A Bray	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I have been keeping fish, including many species from Hawaii forover 25 years now. I feel that Hawaii's aquarium fishery has been expertly managed for 30 years, and fish populations have been sustained over this period of time. It is likely one of the most sustainable fisheries in the world and many of the marine fish sold in the industry come from this outstanding example of proper fish management.

Pet Advocacy Network and the aquatic committee have proven time and time again that this is an emotional issue rather than one based on fact.

For more information please visit tropicaltruth.com.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 8:00:46 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kate Mahjoubian	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

To those hearing testimony today:

As an avid scuba diver, lover of the sea, all sea creatures and resident of Maui County I strongly support, and I urge YOU to support the ban on taking reef fish for sale or personal aquarity.

Not only is this a cruel practice where many creatures do not live, it depletes our oceans and reefs of the life it needs.

The ban needs to be permanent to give our reefs and oceans time to recover

Mahalo Kate Mahjoubian

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 9:28:45 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier</b> Position	Testify
Peter deVries	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please pass his bill

## **SB 505 OPPOSED**

#### Aloha,

To whom it may concern,

I am strongly opposed to this bill. This would severely impact fishers, aquarium service companies, and pet stores. Banning is not a solution and there is no scientific evidence that these activities have a negative impact on reef fish. Furthermore, DAR supports the fishery & has a good management system in place overseeing fishery.

Please vote to oppose this measure.

Robert H. Armstrong Honolulu, Oahu

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 10:31:23 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Terri Ainsworth	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I wholeheartedly support banning marine aquarium fisheries in West Hawaii. The aquarium fish trade is absolutely impacting our oceans in a unrecoverable way. We will without a doubt regret allowing this trade to continue operating.

Many fish are traumatized and die unnecessarily from their inhumane practices. Not to mention the additional damage to our eco system caused by their fishing.

Furthermore, greed is the only reason these type of organizations want to continue. Making money on the lives of our aquatic friends.

Please do not allow it to continue.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 11:03:40 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John Welsh	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose this bill. The salt water tropical fish industry in Hawai is a well established and sustainable industry. The worlds aquarium industry depends on the local fish from Hawai's deverse and abundant supply.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 11:08:39 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Selene Mersereau	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

## Please protect our ocean and beautiful inhabitants.

Thank you, Selene - Kailua

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 11:10:42 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
ALAN KODAMA	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

SB 505 OPPOSED

Aloha,

To whom it may concern, I am strongly opposed to this bill for the following reasons:

- 1. It has no scientific evidence, citations, references, data, nothing backing up what is stated
- 2. There are plenty of scientist that support the fishery
- 3. DAR supports the fishery
- 4. It has a good management system in place overseeing fishery
- 5. We need to add to, not subtract. Banning is not a solution
- 6. Aquariums and ponds are important to me
- 7. This would severely impact fishers, aquarium service companies, and pet stores

Please vote to oppose this measure.

Alan Kodama

Honolulu, Hawaii
#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 12:33:18 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Steve Roy Kaiser	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

#### Aloha Senators

I am in opposition to SB 505 and question so many of the false statements listed in this bill. First lets talk about the blame for being laid on reduced species diversity, abundance and biomass on the aquarium industry. And the idea of an 80% reduction in certain areas blamed soley on the aquarium industry is completely false. And fact is the science cant in anyway link the aquarium industry for the decline in any species. Instead as a resident of Kohala the loss of reef habitat in many areas in west Hawaii is well documented and not related to the aquarium industry. One such area Puako is well documented on the sewage released from residentual properties. Where flush to ocean is hours in many areas and those nutrients have overwhlemed and killed nearly 100% of near shore corals. And yet the solution to this will be decades in a solution. And then we have the over use of many of our nearshore waters by tourism which is well documented by Covid and its impacted.

Next is the false statement of costs to the state and lack of revenue. \$500,000 to manage the pet trade? ON what basis is this even reasonable. What multiplier is being used to inflate this number? And certainly only \$25,000 in revenue? Clearly no multiplier is being used for employess, retail stores, shipping companies and supplies.

Lets be clear this bill in not about money or science. Its about a group of individuals that are against fish as pets as clearly stated in the bill. Well many are against our cattle industry, Dairies, and even egg farms. In fact many groups are against riding horses or having any pets. They are against hunting. Lets not allow these radical groups push science or business to close simply because they dont want fish as pets. I have had conversation with some of these individuals and they are not in favor of even captive breeding of fish or stocking fish ponds for eating. And many dont want any take of fish for any reason. So in their testimony clearly ask them is they support the taking of fish for consumption. Ask them is support aqua culture for the pet trade. Ask them if they support the dispaly of fish at institutions such as the Waikiki Aquarium. That will tell you if they are corrupting science and business to suit a radical ideaology that would if they had the power to outlaw anyone keeping animals

Steve Kaiser Hawi Hawaii

ph8088891570

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 3:09:50 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kevin Kohen	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hawaii's aquarium fishery was considered the best regulated and most sustainable near-shore fishery in the entire world, generating millions of dollars in revenue.

Of all the pressures that can have a negative effect on the health of Hawaii's reefs and marine life, fishing for the aquarium trade has the lowest impact. The DNLR's work to complete an EIS (Environmental Impact Statement) which was accepted by the Land Board, and the Environmental review was supported in the scientific community and by the state's own DAR/DAR.

A complete ban on commercial aquarium fish collection should NOT be considered based on sound scientific study and data, showing aquarium fish collection is not only a sustainable fishery, but the most regulated fishery in the state.

Thank you.

Kevin Kohen

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 4:57:10 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John Van Ornum	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB505.

John Van Ornum

P.O. Box 168, Kualapuu, HI 96757

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 5:30:45 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
LI	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Support

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 5:42:43 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Eric Koch	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha chairs and fellow senators,

i am here before you today once again to strongly oppose this bill. I am a commercial fisherman on the west coast of the Big Island. I've participated in almost all the known fisheries in Hawaii. Of all of them, without question, the aquarium fishery is the most unique, the most sustainable, and the most scrutinized. This fishery isn't a top down fishery where you take out the largest fish, it's a bottom up where the smallest recruits are caught in small numbers. This is key. The juvenile fish come in massive waves continually throughout the year and they come in numbers that overload the reefs...we are talking about millions upon millions arriving constantly. As they drop in on the reefs they are being consumed, displaced and overflow into places they will not even make it. Taking a small amount from these massive recruitments is inconsequential to say the least and the science reflects that. Other fisheries catch the largest fish, the lucky ones that made it though the struggle of life. These mature fish are in much smaller numbers. Conventional fishing and aquarium fishing have totally different approaches but AQ fishing truly is unique, and has a natural resiliency factor built in unlike any other fishery

My family and my fellow fishers have been through Hell these last few years. Our fishery was forced into an environmental review which we did. We got put under a spotlight and scrutinized like no other fishery EVER has. We've spent all of our savings to pay legal fees because we believe in this fishery, we believe in the truth. Our families and our lives have been seriously impacted by all of this .For years this has been going on and we haven't even been allowed to fish....it's been kapu. Now that the land board and the courts have confirmed that what we claim to be true actually is, the legislature is going to ban us? Make this make sense. This is the most sustainable and well managed fishery in the state of hawaii bar none. Our opposition is misguided and unwilling to listen to opinions that differ from theirs. They will not accept the facts or what is right. They will not listen to the scientists and experts that oversee this fishery and study it. Hopefully the legislature will. Please do not ban us, listen to the scientists and allow this long process to play out.

Mahalo for the time,

Eric Koch commercial fishermen

West Hawaii

<u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:03:14 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
LEE	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Oppose

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:40:56 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Amy King	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am opposed to SB505 for many reasons, but I will try and keep this relatively short.

Hawaii is already one of the most regulated fisheries in the world. It has been scientifically proven that there has been no negative environmental impact, and that none of the collected fish are on any threatened or endangered species lists. This bill will essentially cripple the saltwater industry and people like myself, who depend on it. Stating that's its not ok to own these fish as pets, yet it's ok to fish them for food, for lack of better words, makes no sense. You have an argument for the ban stating "environmental impact." Well, the two go hand in hand.

I have spent my entire life around fish. While I'm not always good at putting words on paper, I am good with fish. I love what I do. Have you been to an aquarium trade show? Have you met the people working behind the scenes? If not, I'd suggest you go before making any decisions. Meet the people whose entire lives are centered around their love for the ocean. Talk to people like me, who will set a million alarm clocks in the middle of the night, just to make sure a new fish isn't struggling during the QT process. Believe it or not, we on the hobby side of things, care. We care a lot. There were so many programs I wasn't even aware of until I became involved in the hobby. Programs whose sole purpose is to save our oceans. Programs I now support because I joined the saltwater aquarium hobby.

To sum things up, I do not support this bill. I think about all of the great things the saltwater aquarium industry has brought to me and countless others, and I just cannot. I have read through the data.I am huge into conservation and protecting our planet. Data doesn't lie. The punishment simply does not fit the crime.

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 6:50:50 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Keynin	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the full closeure of any industry without undisputed factual evidence . So I oppose sb505

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 7:00:23 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tina Casen	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The Yellow Tang is the most respected aquarium fish. When the ban was first made, stores began to sell them at over 800%, and no one could afford them. I am 100% disabled, and my marine aquarium is excellent therapy for me. My all-time favorite Tang is the Yellow Tang, for its beauty and stunning personality.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 7:08:22 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Marc Levenson	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I care very much for the fish and wildlife in the surrounding waters. I feel that divers (who have permits) can collect fish for the aquarium trade should be acceptable, providing work for them, and helping the Hawaiian economy. By following the commercial guidelines, they can do this without damage to the fish population based on what I've read. Please look at the reports rather than caving in to emotional arguments.

I oppose SB505 and HB910. Maria Tiongco Pahala, HI Aloha, I oppose SB505.

G.H. Tiongco Pahala Big Island

# Oppose SB505 and HB910

I'm testifying against these bills as they don't demonstrate the need for a ban with accurate data. Scientific data gathered from studies done over the years do support that this is a sustainable fishery.

Thank you, Maile Steele, Hilo Aloha, I do not support bill SB505. Fisheries need good management! This calls for a full ban with no credible scientific evidence to prove it is necessary. No bans, no on SB505. Mahalo, Jaye Tiongco Big Island

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 7:35:31 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jon	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose SB505.

The coral reefs are important and vulnerable, but prohibiting the aquarium fisheries will not help them. There are countless real significant threats to the reefs (such as CO2 emissions, micro plastics, and oil spills), but the minute amount of fish taken for the aquarium hobby make no significant impact. It is extremely well documented that the aquarium fishery is sustainable and properly managed.

The aquarium hobby also allows millions of people in the rest of the world to see the see, learn about, and gain respect for these beautiful animals. I believe this exposure leads countless individuals to want to take real action like reducing climate change to help the reefs.

Closing the sustainable, well managed, and transparent aquarium fishery would do more harm to the coral reefs than help them.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 8:22:11 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mary Tubbs	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am Strongly OPPOSED to SB 505:

1. The bill is based on made-up stuff, not facts. Jim Crow laws were also quite popular too, it didn't make them right.

2. Fish produce millions of fry per spawning, and are the most renewable vertebrates on the planet. For example, the head of Waikiki Aquarium said "Yellow Tang produce 1 million fry/spawning and spawning 3 to 5 times a year." If only 1% of Yellow Tang fry survive per year, that's 3000 to10,000 Yellows produced per pair!

3. Aquarium divers are needed to catch the brood stock to make aquaculture work.

4. Without Aquariums divers, people around the world who don't swim will NEVER be able to see Hawaiian fish in public or private aquariums.

5. Hawaii's aquarium industry is a sustainable, model fishery as evident in Kona's Environmental Impact Study. Aquarium divers have a right to their jobs. Judges in past cases on this issue agree.

Please VOTE NO on SB 505

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 9:00:47 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Rufus Kimura	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am strongly opposed to SB 505. Born on molokai and raised in Waianae I have spent 30+ years as a commercial fisherman/diver and have first hand knowledge of the marine waters and sealife of Hawaii. This bill undermines the countless hours of scientific research already dedicated to the management of the aquarium industry. It is also an unfair move to issue a blanket ban against an industry that has done its best to comply with the already stringent EIS requirements demanded of it. Leave science to the scientists and management of Hawaii's nearshore waters to the officially appointed steward which is DLNR.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 9:05:18 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kyler	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Many of our food fishes are also prized possessions for aquarium use. The aquatic life taken from Hawaii's coral reefs are often shipped off across the globe. The fishes will end up in someone's tank that has zero knowledge on its cultural importance to Hawaii.

The people of Hawaii utilizes our ocean to put food on the table, so allowing the take of aquatic life for aquarium purposes puts increased pressure on our wild populations.

With Hawaii's growing problem of food security I would much rather see the fish on a dinner table rather than in a tank thousands of miles away.

Lastly, the take of marine life for aquarium purposes has different regulations than the ones taken for home consumption. If the fishermen can't use certain gear, why can the aquarium industry use it?

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 9:05:22 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Noelle Lindenmann	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The decimation of our reef fish is detrimental to tourism and to the food chain. We must protect the fish, as apex predators.

We would do well to encourage the breeding of reef fish in captivity, versus harvesting from the wild.

In addition, as a diver, not seeing as many reef fish makes it hard to encourage respectful and responsible diving friends to come here and visit.

Thank you.

Noelle Lindenmann, resident of Kailua-Kona and avid scuba diver

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 9:34:56 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kishor Patel	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose the continued closure of the Hawaiin fishery for the collection of Ornamental Aquarium fish. The multiple scientific surveys and reports presented over many years support the continued collection for Ornamental Fish, with no obvious detrimental effect to populations.

Therefore it does not make sense to continue the closure.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 6:52:37 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Steve Turner	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The taking of reef fish for the aquarium industry only supports and bennifits a limited few permittees of hawaiis population but negatively effects the many residents and tourist and fish species that appreciate the natural underwater world. This inconsiderate practice damages our reef ecosystems and should be shut down permanently with major fines imposed and jail time for offenders. When will enough be enough for the completely negative human impact and exploitation on this important underwater ecosystem. Shut it down.

Captain Steve Turner

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 10:28:58 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Johnny Isham	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hello my name is Johnny Isham and I Strongly Oppose this bill.

This bill has no scientific data and only relies on lies and misinformation to scare people so one group of people can have free reign over our oceans.

thank you

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/8/2023 11:43:07 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Stefano Mongiusti	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 12:44:00 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Dr. Christopher P. Jury	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

I strongly oppose this bill. The marine aquarium fishery in Hawai'i is one of the best-regulated and most sustainable fisheries on the planet, and by far the best-regulated and most sustainable fishery within the state. This fishery has little to no effect on our reefs, and banning the collection of marine organisms for aquariums will have essentially no positive effect on the health or condition of reefs in Hawai'i.

Instead, I belive that this bill would ultimately be seriously detrimental to our reefs, and to the people who depend on them. A substantial fraction of the marine scientists that I know and work with (myself included) became inertersted in the ocean because we kept marine aquariums when we were younger. Many of us would not be working on ocean conservation, sustainability, and other issues critical to the people of Hawai'i if we did not have the experience of keeping aquariums. Hence, a well-regulated and sustainable aquarium fishery in Hawai'i, like the one that we have had for decades, is critical for training the next generation of scientists.

I oppose this bill because it would only cause harm and no tangible benefit. The aquarium fishery in Hawai'i is already exceptionally well-regulated and sustainable (indeed, it is a model for the world about how to do things well). Beyond that, it would take away the educational opportunities that I enjoyed when I was younger by keeping marine aquariums from the next generation. These interests led me to complete a PhD in oceanography at UH Manoa, and I have been working on issues related to coral reef health for the last 14 years. We should not stifle the capacity of our keiki by removing these opportunities.

I urge you, do not infringe upon coming generations by removing their ability to keep Hawaiian reef fish in an aquarium. Do not destroy their inspiration to study marine science. Do not let a vocal minority outweigh the science which shows the sustainability of this fishery. Supporting this bill would be to the detriment of all of us.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 3:04:05 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Gregg Gruwell	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Gregg Gruwell Resident: Kamuela, HI

I most strongly support SB505!!!

I started snorkeling Kona in the 1980's and live there today.

Tragically, 70-80% of the reef fish are gone. You used to be able to stroll along Ali'i Drive and see countless schools of Yellow Tang. Those fish are gone and I never see a Puffer or Boxfish in the wild anymore.

Employment? A number of collectors make \$ millions while the few employees make minimum wage or paid under the table.

We don't have a job shortage but the very existence of these beautiful creatures, native to Hawaii is threatened!

The citizens of this State overwhelmingly oppose aquarium collection. I urge our elected officials to pass SB505!

# <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 4:10:43 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Ivan	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments: I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii

<u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 7:29:32 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Lee Cuccia	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Strongly support

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 7:36:41 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jerry Isham	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Opposed to Senate Bill 505

Aloha Senators,

My name is Jerry Isham and I am opposed to SB 505. I am a fisherman aquarium and food fisherman. Animal right groups drafted this bill with the excuse to battle climate change however over half of aquarium fish caught are not herbivores. So why ban all aquarium fish? Also, right now as a fisherman 1 yellow tang alive is worth about \$60-\$100 compared to \$2 a pound for Manini or kala. That means If an average manini is 1 lb. I would have to catch at least 25-40 manini to make the same money. This would put 250%-400% more pressure on the reefs. Fisherman are fisherman and If you ban this fishery aquarium fisherman will just move to another fishery having to fish per pound vs per piece, which totally defeats the purpose of this bill.

This is a bad bill please do not pass!

Mahalo!

Jerry Isham

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 7:44:06 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Mary Marvin Porter	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha Senators,

I support SB505 which prohibits the harvesting of aquatic life for commercial aquarium purposes, regardless of the method of collection. Over the last 25 years I have been snorkeling all around the island, I have seen significant decrease in the reef fish and also death of the coral. We are in planetary crisis and need to protect our resources and the fish that are an important part of our food chain.

Please support SB505.

Mahalo,

Mary Marvin Porter

Island Eyes Video

Kea'au Hawai'i

808-082-9100

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 7:46:34 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kelly Isham	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hi My name is Kelly Isham and I appose SB505

The same Lobbyist who introduced this bill forced the industry to complete and EIS well let it play out. There is currently nobody collecting tropical fish so there is currently no threat to wildlife whatsoever. Not a single species of fish is in danger we in any way. I have invested my life savings into completing this EIS please atleast slow us to finish it.

mahalo

Kelly Isham

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:13:13 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Theresa. Isham	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Hi My name is Theresa Isham and I am a fisherman's wife.

I appose Senate bill 505

There is no difference in spearing and killing a fish to feed my family or catching a fish and selling it alive to an aquarium to take the money and buy food or shelter with the \$. If anything the fish being able to live the rest of its life compared to being killed for food sounds like a win win in my book.

please kill this bad bill!

mahal

Theresa Isham

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:16:17 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Nick R.	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose SB505 and HB910.

Hawaii's aquarium fishery has been proven to be a sustainable and well managed fishery. The DLNR reports on the West Hawaii Regional Fishery Management Area show an increase in population for species of aquarium fish. Bill SB505 and HB910 falsely state that fish species caught for aquarium in Hawaii have declined in population by 80% and are near extinction. The aquarium fishery has given local people jobs that they use to support their families. Bill SB505 and HB910 would harm a number of people in Hawaii who would have those jobs. People who dislike Hawaii's aquarium fishery blame the aquarium trade for reef environmental damage when most of the environmental damage is caused by the tourist industry and snorkeling.

Nick R.

Kailua-Kona, Hawaii

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:16:33 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tanya Pomerinke	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

It is my understanding that environmental studies have been done and there is little or no impact. We have so many other issues that impact the environment of Hawaii waters that we should be concerned about. This has taken the lively hood of aquarium fishermen away. What's next? Do we destroy the lives of all fisherman which has been a way of life for many years in Hawaii.

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:30:49 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Melanie Kim	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support this bill to reduce the risk of harm and unnecessary deaths of capturing wild marine life only to be placed in water cages in which they spend the rest of their lives.
#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:38:45 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Kilihea Inaba	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, and thank you for this opportunity, the aquarium trade especially here in Hawaii where we are dependent upon the foods and resources in our oceans surrounding us, poses a significant threat to marine ecosystems and biodiversity. The removal of large numbers of fish and other species from their natural habitats can disrupt the delicate balance of these ecosystems, lead to declines in population numbers, and impact the health of our coral with the lack of healthy **symbiotic relationships.** 

- There is no aquarium collecting jobs to lose in Hawai'i
- Aquaculture breakthroughs by O`ahu researchers and businesses mean that Hawai`i's most desired and beautiful fishes are now captive-bred and available to consumers worldwide
- Hawaii's reefs, residents, taxpayers, and fishers no longer have to lose, so the mainland aquarium pet trade can profit

Given these impacts, which do not benefit our financial economy as well, it is crucial to ban the aquarium trade to protect our oceans and preserve their biodiversity for FUTURE GENERATIONS. This is not just for today, but for all the tomorrows to come. Please pass SB505 to provide space for rehabilitating our ecosystems.

Mahalo,

Kilihea Inaba (Kaloko, Kona, Hawaii)

### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:40:36 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Justin Becker	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 8:46:17 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
James T Lovell	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Please oppose this bill.

This bill is full of lies, misinformation and defamatory statements. The Aquarium Industry is not depleting the resource. The facts, truth and peer reviewed scientific data clearly shows the resource numbers are increasing not going down.

Voting "Yes" or "with reservations" indicates that you support this kind of false facts that make up the premise of this bill.

This industry that has been proven to be sustainable, renewable and non-polluting and brings millions of dollars into the state using a resource that is otherwise just wasted (83% die in the first year and 99% die before reaching adult stage.) It provides jobs that provides a livable wage to local fishermen.

Do not destroy jobs, and livelihoods of local people.

Vote "NO" on this bill.

Mahalo

Jim Lovell, local fisherman for over 40 years

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 9:13:09 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Lynley Dows	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support a full ban on collection of marine wildlife to preserve the unique environment and biodiversity of Hawaiian waters.

We do not allow the collection of native birds for sale, or the collection of native plants for removal and sale outside of the state of Hawaii for pleasure. Why do we allow our state waters to be degraded and the balance of our ecosystem to be skewed and damaged parasitically by this kind of harvest.

We need to create more jobs to protect and promote sustainability of our priceless and irreplaceable environment not bend to the pressures of those few that abuse and irrevocably destroy what they say they cherish. There is no going back once we lose natural balance and diversity.

Pass this bill without looking back and start planning for more conservation efforts and actions. Invite those that would financially suffer to join in protecting these species and create jobs and oversight to make sure that this law is abided.

Act now! We have already lost so much! as a diver, paddler, snorkeler, I have witnessed a severe and sad decline in tropical fish populations over the last 25 years that I would not have expected in 100 years.

Pass this bill!

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 9:15:16 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jennifer Chiwa	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha Chairperson Gabbard and Chairperson Inouye and Members of the Committees on Agriculture and Environment and Water and Land.

I am Jennifer Chiwa, have lived on Oahu my whole life and currently reside in Makiki.

Please support SB 505 which would prohibit harvesting of aquatic life for commercial aquarium purposes. It's my understanding that aquatic life forms collected for commercial aquarium purposes are often treated inhimanely and that removal of these aquatic life forms is detrimental to Hawaii's reefs. Please support this bill for the welfare of aquatic life forms and for the protection of the environment,

Thank you for this opportunity to testify and for your consideration in support of SB 505.

Jennifer Chiwa

Makiki

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 9:31:58 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Charles Jay Clifford	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

The exploitation of the sea needs to stop. Harvesting wild sea life for entertainment is not acceptable. Please pass SB505 now before our reefs are damaged beyond repair. This issue impacts the fish, the reef and sets the mental precedent that people think it is ok. It is not ok to take healthy wild creatures and put them in a cage, tank or any environment that is not their natural habitat.

Mahalo for your consideration

## <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 10:11:57 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Theodore Karcher	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning fisheries

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 10:12:19 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Tina Owens	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

To: Chairs Inouye and Gabbard and members of the AEN/WTL Committees

Re: Testimony in OPPOSITION of Senate Bill 505

RELATING TO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Submitted by: Tina Owens, Kona, Hawaii on behalf of herself

To be heard: on February 10th, 2023, at 2:00 PM in the conference Room 224

The bill you are hearing today (SB 505) to ban the aquarium industry from the State of Hawaii, would have been appropriate 25 years ago. At that time there were virtually no rules or regulations from DLNR and local citizens were seeing dive sites crushed and mangled, barren of fish. There was a dumpster of dead yellow tangs and other ocean creatures, the sight of which infuriated the local people. Threats were made on both sides. I myself was threatened.

# However, this bill is totally uncalled for now. The problems and issues that made the topic so controversial then have almost totally been remedied.

In those 25-ish years good people from many different ocean interests worked together as the West Hawai'i Fisheries Council, an advisory body to DLNR. We would listen to concerns that came up and try to find a reasonable solution. We would then vet the proposal throughout various communities to see if there was enough support that DLNR would take it into their rule-making process. Everything that we proposed ended up being put in Hawai'i Administrative Rules. Some things that were accomplished:

- Establishment of nine Fish Replenishment Areas (FRAs), comprising more than 35% of the shoreline along the Kona Coast, where aquarium collecting was forbidden.
- Appropriate markings for AQ boats; gear restrictions when in an FRA, etc.
- Brokered a deal between a local community and the aquarium collectors to swap FRAs due to public antagonism. In the long run the aquarium collectors graciously gave up their section
- No spearfishing at night anywhere along the Kona Coast.
- Net size restrictions on lay gill nets. This proposal went on to become effective statewide.

• Assistance to the Ka'upulehu Marine Life Advisory Council as they put together a proposal to present to DLNR for a no-take zone in their ahupua'a. Help with drawing up the document and taking it out to local communities for input.

There are many more. The scientific data taken and compiled for these long years show that the populations of the most heavily collected fish are rising and the management plan is working. This is one of the most highly regulated fisheries in the state and the most successful.

#### It is safe to say that the AQ industry today is not the same industry it was 25 years ago.

Please don't waste the legislature's time and effort. The problem has already been resolved.

Tina Owens,

Original director of the LOST FISH Coalition

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 10:15:25 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Michael Frame	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I oppose banning harvesting marine aquarium ornamental fisheries in West Hawaii. As has been presented, over 30 years of scientific data has proved unequivocally that there is no environmental impact of the responsible collection of the listed species . None of the collected fish appear on any threatened or endangered lists. After 30 years of sustainable collection these species remain unthreatened, and in fact some experts have told the State of Hawaii on the record that these species populations are greater now after 30 years of collection than there were before.

Ornamental fish continue to serve as ambassadors of marine life, instilling apprecation and awareness of these fish and where the come from.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 10:53:16 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jessica Ferracane	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Commercial aquarium fishing for the trade needs to be banned outright in Hawai'i. It is not sustainable and it is for the entertainment of the wealthy hobbyist. Hawaiian fish are Hawaiian and intrinsic to Hawaiian culture, and need to stay on Hawaiian reefs, not extracted to serve as pleasurable distractions for the rich. Too many fish die for what? Not to feed anyone but to entertain them. Shameful.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 11:13:27 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Jim Stauff	Individual	Comments	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support continued environmental protection and banning fish collecting on our reefs permanently here in west Hawaii.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 11:34:34 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John Gavelek	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha, I am writing to voice my support for SB505. I am for a complete ban on fish collection for the ornamental aquarium trade. I have witnessed in the last 30 years how the population of our reef fish have drastically declined. I remember seeing a wash of gold due to the yellow tangs in the breaking waves. No more and it saddens me how our ocean's health has been decimated due to a very few making a profit. Please help our ocean thrive and don't pass SB 505. Respectfully, John Gavelek, Holualoa, HI

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 11:41:33 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Debra Gavelek	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I support SB 505 as I support a ban on commercial collection of our reef fish for ornamental purposes or the acquarium trade. Honolulu Civil Beat reported that in the last three years, half a million tropical fish were stolen from Kona shores and between 199 to 2010, collectors took over 750,000 fish annually...that's 2,000 a day. Raping our reefs prevents our ocean from thriving as a complete, healthy ecosystem and ruins the snorkeling experience for both visitors and residents alike. I humbly ask that a ban on the commercial collecing of our reef fish for ornamental purposes be implemented ASAP. Thank you, Debra Gavelek, Holualoa, HI

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 11:44:25 AM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Amy Jewell	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

Aloha,

I am not in support of collection of fish or other marine life for the aquarium trade. The coral reef ecosystem is a delicate one that relies on all it's members to maintain a healthy balance. Removal of any creatures can disrupt that balance. The coral reef is not only a beautiful and special part of Hawaii that should be preserved for its own sake but also a vital resource for our economy.

Mahalo, Amy Jewell BS in Environmental Science <u>SB505</u> Relating To Environmental Protection - Testimony in Support of the Bill To be heard on **Friday, Feb. 10 at 2:00 pm** 

Senate Committee on Agriculture and Environment Senator Mike Gabbard, Chair Senator "Tim" Richards III, Vice Chair

Testimony/Anne Forshey/annejforshey@gmail.com/Ewa Beach, HI 96706

I am so appreciative of the Committee's interest and action on this important subject. I fully support the intent of this bill. I honestly had no idea that such inhumane practices continue to exist in our state and in our waters. It is definitely time for our legislature to put an end to the harvesting of Hawai'i's beautiful, aquatic life commercial aquarium purposes.

First, we should allow these creatures to thrive in their natural habitat. More importantly, we must take a firm stand against the mean, cruel practices employed to capture and transport them.

Why have we let these barbaric activities continue? It is inconsistent with our state motto, "Ua mau ke ea o ka aina i ka pono" and with our nature as a people.

I hope the entire Committee is moved to take action, today, and set us on the right path with respect to protecting our marine life. Mahalo for your time.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 12:16:16 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
David Lum	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am against this bill for the following reasons:

- It is not scientifically based. Well-respected, environmentally responsible, and prominent marine scientists such as Dr. Bruce Carlson, Dr. John Randall, and Dr. Howard Pyle have written and spoken in support of commercial aquarium fish collecting in Hawaii. They found it to be the best studied fishery in the world, sustainable in the long-term, and of low impact to the bigger marine environment.

- The marine aquarium hobby provides a direct way for citizens of all demographics to learn what is needed to maintain the health of marine life and to advocate for reasonable measures to protect the larger marine environment.

- "Out of sight is out of mind," as the adage goes. With a reduced presence of marine life in home aquaria for people to enjoy and learn from, concern for the health of our marine environment would likely diminish.

- Keeping aquarium fish encourage young people to pursue science. It happened in my case and has greatly enriched my life. I now work to educate others on marine science and do scientific work on marine biodiversity.

- A lack of presence of aquarium fishes from Hawaii, which have been, in general, collected using very high standards, will result in collecting in areas of the world where collecting practices are very poor, to include use of such poisons as bleach and cyanide. This would cause greater harm on fish populations and the greater marine environment worldwide.

- Commercial tropical fish collecting focuses on younger animals because they are more adaptable to an aquarium setting and hobbyists want animals that can live for more years in their tanks. Most of these young fishes would not survive in the wild due to predation and disease, so the relatively few that are taken for the aquarium hobby make little impact on wild populations. What needs greater protection are large adult individuals with high reproductive capacity and these are the specimens not targeted by tropical aquarium fishermen.

- Many reef species are incredibly fecund and breed regularly, some almost daily, so population replacement rate is high, as long as large, mature fish are protected.

- There have been examples of fish handling abuse in Hawaii, but those have been rare and blown out of proportion in terms of prevalence. Regulations need to be in place to penalize abusers, but responsible tropical fish collecting needs to be sustained.

- I implore decision makers not to be swayed by purely emotional appeals to ban commercial tropical fish collection and trade from Hawaii. This decision must be done with objectivity and a balanced perspective.

Thank you.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 12:24:47 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Velvet Replogle	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

#### Comments:

I am giving testimony in support of Bill SB505.

I am against the collection of our reef fish for aquarium usage. They belong in our ocean. When I first came here in 1987 there was an abundant number of fish as well as a diversity that is no longer there. I have seen over the years an amazing dwindling of reef fish that should be preserved for all to enjoy not shipped off to far off lands to languish in an unnatural environment. Not all of the fish collected even make it alive to their destination. I voted against it many years ago when it came up and I feel the same now. There was to be collecting only in certain designated areas but unfortunately there was no oversight or monitoring. It's important that we monitor and protect this important resource for the generations to come. Thank you for your attention to this matter. Aloha

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 12:50:10 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
John R Replogle	Individual	Support	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

I am testifiing in support of SB-505 to put an end to fish collecting from our Hawaiian reefs. We are the most isolated place on the planet and with global climate change taking place we need to be thinking of our own well being in terms of our Natural Resources and how well we manage them for our survival on these Islands. All the living creatures on our reef are crucial to our having a healthy reef and Aina. The Hawaiian people understood the connection between the Ocean and the land and the need to Malama (care for) all life. The profits extracted by a hand full of people for their personal enrichment at the expense and detriment to these Hawaiian Islands must not be allowed to happen.. Hawaii is regared as Paradice on Earth by people all over the world. This is so because we have everything a paradice needs to exsist. The taking of our reef fish is a crime against nature and the people of Hawaii. Our reefs, fish, Mountains and all of Hawaii Nei are our Heritage not to be given away for anything.

THE FOREST WAS SHIRNKING BUT THE TREES KEPT VOTING FOR THE AXE. FOR THE AXE WAS CLEVER AND CONVINCED THE TREES THAT BECAUSE HIS HANDLE WAS MADE OF WOOD HE WAS ONE OF THEM.

#### <u>SB-505</u> Submitted on: 2/9/2023 1:37:09 PM Testimony for AEN on 2/10/2023 2:00:00 PM

Submitted By	Organization	<b>Testifier Position</b>	Testify
Nick Foti	Individual	Oppose	Written Testimony Only

Comments:

My name is Nick Foti and I am writing to oppose SB 505.

I consider myself a man of conservation based on scientific data and information gathered from the field by myself, peers, and professionals involved in ocean related activities.

The fishermen involved with the West Hawaii aquarium trade have jumped over every hurtle thrown at them in order to provide a EIS that will support a fishery for years to come. What many fail to understand is that the fishermen want conservation, it is in the best industry for the environment, the resource, and hobby and the future of all tropical fish. The refusal to listen to science and make judgment based on emotion has put many people out of business. I myself used to be a diver in the industry but was forced to find new alternatives to making a living because of the multiple road blocks set up by Earth Justice. They have founded their argument based off of biased emotions to the trade. The EIS that has been recently approved in court should satisfy the environmental concerns. IF SB505 had true merit, such concerns would have been brought up in the EIS review phase, to which it has not. Instead it is a blanket bill set out to crush more livelihoods for no scientific reason. Please don't let this bill go forwards. Let these fishermen proceed and get back to making a living.